



**IPCC WGII  
Fourth Assessment Report  
Climate Change Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability  
*Government and Expert Review of Second Order Draft***

**Specific Comments**

**EXPERT REVIEW COMMENTS**

**Chapter 13**

**August 2006**

**Organization of the review comments file**

Comments are organized as follows:

- (a) First are the comments from the Co-Chairs and TSU. These:
  - (i) track the development of the ZOD and FOD, and your responses to review comments on each of these drafts, and then
  - (ii) present comments on the Second-Order Draft
- (b) Second are the comments from the Expert Reviewers, organized in the same format as your FOD comments file.

**Government and Expert Review of Second Order Draft  
Confidential, Do Not Cite or Quote  
August 2006**

## Discussion of expert review comments and record keeping

IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT:

- AUTHORS BEGIN WORK ON THE COMMENTS IMMEDIATELY. SUBSTANTIVE COMMENTS NEED TO BE SEPARATED FROM NON-SUBSTANTIVE, AND THE TWO SHOULD BE TREATED DIFFERENTLY
- CONTACT IS MADE BETWEEN AUTHORS AND THEIR REVIEW EDITORS IN AUGUST

### Substantive comments

- The chapter writing team should discuss all substantive expert review comments, by email and/or at Cape Town.
- Substantive comments require full and proper consideration. The *Principles Governing IPCC Work* state that:
  - genuine controversies should be reflected adequately in the text of the Report and
  - it is the role of the Review Editors to advise the lead authors on how to handle contentious/controversial issues
- You must record the outcome of these discussions in this document, under the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'.

### Non-substantive comments

- For non-substantive comments, a very brief entry should be made in the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'. The following terms are acceptable:
  - Addressed
  - Not applicable
  - Text removed
  - A tick to denote a comment has been addressed (somewhere on the document this should be stated)

### General

- The record should be kept in this document, ideally electronically.
- The document becomes part of the traceable account of the Working Group II Fourth Assessment. When completed to the satisfaction of the Review Editors, a copy should be returned to the TSU by the **8<sup>th</sup> December 2006**.

## Chapter 13

Comments from the Co-Chairs/TSU are laid out as follows: first we comment on whether the SOD addresses the comments we made on the ZOD; second we comment on whether the SOD addresses the comments we made on the FOD; our concluding comments on the Second-Order Draft are at the end.

	Chapter 13 ZOD comments from Co-Chairs and TSU	Has this been addressed in the SOD?	Author responses:
13.Z1	The authors have followed the Plenary agreed outline.		
13.Z2	Section 13.1 should <u>summarise</u> TAR conclusions in less than 1 page, we suggest using bullet points.	This section is ~1.5 page. Not clear that it is a summary of TAR findings and authors need to make this clear by using opening statement which says: 'The principal findings of the TAR were:' and then follows with a bulleted list of points. Too much detail in present version – why define what ENSO is when this isn't a TAR finding? Reduce to 1 page.	CG S OK. SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITED
13.Z3	Section 13.2 need not exceed 2 pages, especially if you avoid inclusion of effects that should more properly be in Section 13.4. Section 13.3 could also be limited to 2 pages if you: a refer largely to Chapter 2 for the climate futures b use a table to describe projected numerical values for population, income, etc. (from SRES or elsewhere).	Not accepted. Section on current sensitivity/vulnerability in the SOD is 10 pages. Section 3 is in better shape and size though (now 4 pages). Authors need to be aware that if they have nothing new to say, there is no problem with their chapter being under-length, although they could take the opportunity of any space saved to do a lot more with figures.	ALL S GN: Tabla 13.1 reducir y comparar con periodos anteriores ARM: Reducir salud 13.2.2(10r) 8-23,27 trends? DONE
13.Z4	The above economies would enable you to expand Section 13.4, which is the core of the assessment, to about half the overall chapter length. Authors need to get to the heart of the matter much sooner. The ZOD does not reach Section 13.4 until page 27 - too far late.	SOD reaches Section 13.4 on page 23 so some improvement. Section 13.4 is 8.5 pages, which is still rather short, especially as 3 of these pages are tables.	ALL S Similar z3 The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
13.Z5	We suggest you use tables in Section 13.4 to summarize the projected effects (thus saving pages). For example, the TAR had Table 14.5 on estimated yield effects. Perhaps the new literature exists to allow you to update this table and add others for effects on water, forestry, etc.	Accepted, SOD has table 13.4 on Future Impacts in the agricultural sector and 13.5 on Future impact and vulnerability to climate change and variability in Latin America coastal systems.	The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
13.Z6	Can threshold effects be identified for projected impacts, which can later be picked up in Chapter 19?	Table 13.4 presents range of impacts on yields considering different CO2 concentrations and temperature ranges. However, no thresholds (e.g., for dangerous climate change) are identified.	ALL S GM THERE IS NO INFORMATION

13.Z7	<p>Can you add subsections on:</p> <p>a impacts under El Niño, and therefore how the changing frequency of El Niño due to climate change will have impacts</p> <p>b impacts under stabilization scenarios (if no published material then you should inform the reader)</p> <p>c impacts under different development pathways (e.g. under different SRES scenarios)</p>	<p>a. 'Effects under El Niño' is in section on current sensitivity/vulnerability. A brief section could be added in 13.4 on what the literature has to say about how the frequency of El Niño is expected to change in the future. However, the WG1 TS isn't very helpful. The only statement is:  <i>A majority of models show a mean El Niño-like response pattern in the tropical Pacific, with the central and eastern equatorial Pacific sea surface temperatures warming more than the western equatorial Pacific, with a corresponding mean eastward shift of precipitation. Future changes of ENSO interannual variability differ from model to model. Some models that show increases more successfully simulate present day characteristics of ENSO, though the large inter-model differences in future changes of El Niño amplitude, and the inherent century-timescale variability of El Niño in the models, preclude a definitive assessment. [10.3]</i></p> <p>b. Section 13.4.5 on Health contains some information on stabilization but is the only example.</p> <p>c. In 13.4, water and agriculture use SRES examples</p>	<p>ALL S  CN  Not applica</p>
13.Z8	<p>Regarding the next draft (FOD), we suggest that the writing team should evaluate the main emerging conclusions and how these differ from the TAR, as well as which are more policy relevant. Then, authors should make space for these items and present the conclusions in terms of whether they i) confirm TAR, or ii) require revision of TAR conclusions.</p>	<p>No, the authors haven't gone through these steps.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• They haven't evaluated the new literature in terms of whether it contradicts or confirms TAR.</li> <li>• They haven't sifted new findings in terms of their policy relevance, but this step isn't really necessary given that there isn't that much new literature.</li> </ul>	<p>ALL S</p>
13.Z9	<p><b>LENGTH</b>  The number of printed pages allocated to Chapter 13 is 30. The ZOD has already exceeded that number (see Doc 3 in Blue Book), and yet it is still to be completed. The sections and subsections which still need to be added will take the chapter well beyond its page limit.</p>	<p>The SOD is under-length by 1 text page. It could easily be shortened by a further 3-4 pages (there is no need to be exactly to length), but this space could be used in part by adding figures (especially maps).</p>	<p>ALL S  DONE</p>

13.Z10	<b>BALANCE</b> This chapter is rather unbalanced. Some countries and topics are dealt with in great detail and some are largely ignored (e.g. the Altiplano countries). Mexico, for example, gets a great deal of attention. The authors need to work hard to achieve a more even geographical balance. If necessary, CAs should be used.	There is more information on Altiplano countries and Central American countries.  But, still only 3 CAs – seems like a lost opportunity	ALL S TWO CAs WERE ADDED
13.Z11	There are too many TAR references - the authors need to concentrate on new knowledge.	Some TAR references still but less than in the FOD.	ALL S ACCEPTED
13.Z12	There is repetition, for example, the material on urban growth on page 42, lines 40-45, is appearing for the fourth time.	Addressed	
13.Z13	The ZOD has an additional shortcoming: a good portion is presented in Spanish and this does not show the required internal coordination with the rest of the Chapter.	Addressed	
13.Z14	<b>CONTENT</b> There is too much general material (non-specific to Latin America) and too much WGI-type material (page 7) and WGIII-type material (page 49 line 30 and following). The chapter starts with a geography of the region, which is inappropriate (pages 5-14).	The regional geography has been removed. There is still too much general material, and this is pointed out in the line-by-line comments, but WG1 and WG3-type material is not excessive.	ALL S CN, ARM, CG Ricardo Zapata CA See Ch 7  DONE
13.Z15	In Section 13.4 the authors have looked first at future vulnerabilities and second at future impacts, in separate sections, written by different people. This is a very inefficient use of the allocated space and it is not clear that the vulnerability sections are always relevant.	Addressed - the SOD is in better shape in this sections.	
13.Z16	The treatment of agriculture throughout is very well done and could be a model to other authors working in the chapter. Section 13.4.2.2. in particular reads very well and the use of the table to summarize the results from a number of authors, which are then discussed in the text, could be usefully followed in other chapters.		
13.Z17	Some references are contradictory; for example, with deforestation rates, different figures are given in different sections.	Addressed - the figures on deforestation are more consistent in the SOD.	
13.Z18	Some sections include references to Island States, which are not part of this IPCC Region.	References removed.	
13.Z19	The ZOD misses linkages with WG1 regarding extreme events and the cryosphere. There is no information on land tenure, technology, arid and semi-arid areas and deserts and information on desertification is poor.	References to WGI chapters 03 and 11 are contained in the subsection on extreme events. The comment on desertification, land tenure and technology has not been addressed.	ALL S

13.Z20	Reference to indigenous communities, particularly those along the Andes Cordillera, the Altiplano, its valley or yungas and the mountain forest, is missing together with a more focused reference on biodiversity wealth and its traditional uses and potential modern applications.	Accepted - now there is a case study on altiplano techniques for adaptation.	
13.Z21	Information on the effects of critical impoverishment of large human groups, like the indigenous groups and farmers/workers from the arid/desert areas, displaced to increasingly marginal urban settlements, needs also to be assessed.	Not assessed	ALL S
13.Z22	More coordination with sectoral Chapters is suggested. This will help to reduce overall length.	There are no cross-references to the sectoral chapters (indeed there are no cross-references to any other chapters in the WG2 AR4).	ALL S Accepted
13.Z23	Text in Spanish: this text includes references from the IUCN, WWF, UNEP and FAO, but misses MEA. Newspaper references do not identify the country of origin.	Work still needed in the reference section.	DC - S The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
13.Z24	The effects of climate change on important agro-industries (case of Central Western Argentina and Central Chile), with important economic value (e.g. wine and olive oil production, horticulture and fruit production) should be assessed.	This is done for grain crops, but not for wine, olive oil, horticulture, fruit. Is there a literature?	GM S I can't find this information
13.Z25	Reference to LA water management practices; as reported by ECLAC, would be opportune (pages 36 , line 10 to page 37, line 40). Authors should ensure that they liaise with Ch 3 on this.	No reference to WG2 Chapter 3. Water management practices are mentioned in Case Study on Indigenous Adaptation Practices (page 38).	JCG S
13.Z26	The next draft should include Section 13.7: Key uncertainties, confidence levels, gaps and priorities. This section should include critical deficiencies arising from lack of sufficient geophysical, social and economic information.	13.7 now present. The existing text is too general and requires work to address the priorities for Latin America, possibly, for example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Impacts on key environments (Amazon, Pantanal wetlands)</li> <li>• Impacts on rapidly growing urban, mostly coastal, environments, with pockets of poverty.</li> </ul>	ALL S DONE
	<b>Chapter 13 FOD comments from Co-Chairs and TSU</b>	<b>Has this been followed in SOD?</b>	<b>Author responses:</b>
13.F1	<b>Comments from Osvaldo Canziani:</b> FOD has improved substantially the ZOD. However, as shown in the specific comments, there is a tendency to generalize concepts, developments and other inputs without taking care of the heterogeneity of the socio-economic and cultural levels of the national communities	The SOD has improved and these sections have been revised. Certainty estimates appear to be given where they are available, although the authors need to check to make sure they haven't overlooked any. There is over-precision in,	ALL S

	in this Latin American ethnological plurality. Some sections of this Chapter, which happily are very few, using probably non fully checked information, assume that references on draft laws, regulations, procedures, plans and projects are implemented when by experience and facts they or the installations and services on which they should be based, are non-existent. The chapter does not include certainty estimations.	for example, the rice column of Table 13.4.	
13.F2	<b>Comments from Carla Encinas:</b> The chapter is a bit too long and would be easy to be reduced in 2.2 pages.	It's now under-length by 1 page. See also comment 13.Z9	
13.F3	The number of contributing authors is not the ideal (04) half of them from one country.	This comment still true for the SOD, which only has 3 contributing authors – one of the Argentinean authors has been dropped.	ALL S Accepted
13.F4	Headings: the introduction is missing.	The authors have used the PAO headings rather than the Reduced Form Headings.	Ok
13.F5	There are only two figures in this Chapter, both of which are in the case studies. This is a missed opportunity. For the readership of the AR4, which is mainly non-specialist decision- and policymakers, the best way to reach them is through figures and tables which summarize information.	SOD contains two figures, two boxes and six tables. It still would be good idea to increase the number of tables (one is needed at least for Section 13.4.3) and figures (more maps to help the reader).	ALL S OK
13.F6	The Executive Summary does not pull out the key findings and highlight the material from the TAR, as it should. Again, this is a missed opportunity It would be worth trying to arrange the bullet points under sub-headings, to see whether you have the balance right, and how many are new since the TAR. There are five on present climate trends, two on current adaptation, one on future climates, five on future impacts and one on vulnerability. Nothing on adaptation to future climate changes.	The Executive Summary is too long and has too many points – it doesn't make clear (a) what are the key vulnerabilities of the region (b) which are the really important impacts for Latin America (c) what it might be possible to do about these. At the moment it's a rather boring list of 13 points. There should only be a maximum of 7 -8 if you want to hold the attention of the target policymaker readership.	CG S OK
13.F7	Some summarizing/synthesising tables and figures could be added. Good examples are Ch 4 Table 4.5 (impacts for increments of global temperature change) and Ch 11 Table 11.11 (Impacts at future timeslices under different SRES scenarios). If Chapter 13 could do something like this, it would be great material for the SPM/TS, and would give the chapter much more punch. For examples of the kind of figures we are looking for, I would refer you to Chapter 4 Fig. 4.9 (map of global impacts for three different temperature changes) and 4.10. Fig 4.10 is a sectoral burning embers diagram, but could be easily adapted for the regional case.	The SOD has 6 tables which summarizes information. At least one should be added for water resources (the information is in the text). There is no regional burning embers diagram.	JCG ALL S OK

	Chapter 13 SOD comments from Co-Chairs and TSU		Author responses:
13.S1	<b>LENGTH:</b>	Slightly under-length	
13.S2	<b>ARE PAO HEADINGS PRESENT?</b>	Yes. Follows PAO rather than reduced-form headings. Please follow the reduced form headings, as other chapters do, so that readers can cross easily between chapters.	ALL S OK
13.S3	<b>HAVE MOST GENERAL COMMENTS OF ERs FROM ZOD AND FOD BEEN COVERED?</b>	No. Authors need to make sure they have properly taken on board some of the very useful FOD comments from reviewers, which would greatly improve their draft.	ALL S
13.S4	<b>ARE REFERENCES BROADLY COMPLETE?</b>	No, many references are missing and without the standard format.	ALL S OK
13.S5	<b>IS THERE LINE-OF-SIGHT TEXT → ES AND TEXT+ES → TS+SPM?</b>	Yes, ES links back to text, and statements in SPM and TS link back satisfactorily.	
13.S6	The chapter takes a long time to get going. Section 13.4 doesn't start until page 23. The chapter lacks emphasis as a result. It has an important message to get across, but this is diluted by taking to so long to get to the points. It should be possible to do some shortening in the earlier text, especially in the first 6 pages of 13.2.1.		ALL S OK
13.S7	The English and other editing aspects need to be improved considerably to have a homogeneous text.		ALL S
13.S8	Lots of extra work needs to be done for the references.		ALL S add aCA trosts
13.S9	Section 13.2.5 on Current Adaptation has been well developed. However, in 13.2.5, it's really not clear how many real examples of weather and climate forecasting actually exist. On page 16, the references on lines 10-14 are often partial. From lines 16-32, the language implies that the description is all about potential and not actual, i.e., the text shouldn't be in a section on Current Adaptation, which should deal only with actualities.		CN GM GN ARM JCG Seguros CostaRica Accepted  ACCEPTED THE TEXT HAS BEEN CHANGED
13.S10	Authors need to focus more on the needs of their readership. This isn't a huge issue, but they need to remember that their target audience is policymakers, and not just in Latin America. So they need to think more about: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• helping by defining terms such as Chacos and Paramos.</li> <li>• using maps to show us where places are that they refer to (and what is important about them)</li> <li>• thinking about iconic species and locations, and emphasising these. Amazonia is certainly an iconic location, and it is good to see it as a case study. It is a shame that the picture of the Chacaltaya Glacier has gone (it is in Chapter 1, but you don't cross-refer to it). The picture of Amazonian deforestation, which has also been removed, should be restored.</li> <li>• emphasising the key findings of the chapter – there is no feel for what the authors think of as the most important results of their work.</li> </ul> It would be nice if the authors could be a bit more inventive in thinking about how they present their material – there are too many lists here.		ALL



13.S11	<p><b>The authors need to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Make clear what are the key results since the TAR, and which of these reinforce TAR results and which contradict them</li> <li>• Sort out their references</li> <li>• Make sure they have properly addressed the FOD review comments.</li> <li>• Restore some of the illustrations from the FOD, and insert some new ones to give the chapter more impact.</li> <li>• Improve Section 13.7 to make specific to Latin America. At present it is far too general.</li> <li>• Improve section on Gaps and Uncertainties (13.8) to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ target more specifically on Latin America</li> <li>○ say less about WG1-related issues (i.e., climate model predictions)</li> <li>○ give more support and advice appropriate for policymakers.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	ALL S
13.S12	<p><b>Further comments from Dr Osvaldo Canziani</b></p> <p>The authors have made a plausible progress with respect to the FOD. This positive action is recognized fully, but there are sections of this chapter still requiring revision. Although these sections do not darken the valuable portions, which are in large majority., it would be another opportunity to improve the whole chapter, with the TOD version</p> <p>Regarding the unfitted segments, it should be noted that the present text includes repetitions and some contradictions as well as references on projects and programmes which are only promising ideas or uncoordinated plans, which, at most, are in their early development state.</p> <p>A search made show that the large majority of such promising developments have not reached an operational status. However, there are, some exceptions, as shown in the cases of actions in some sectors or regions (like in the Amazon River Basin and the Central American Isthmus)) undertaken by governments. There are other projects, in smaller scale, undertaken, mainly NGOs, supported by some European countries..</p> <p>Therefore, the generalization of these actions, as projects in the implementation phase, may generate confusion to potential donors and financing groups, which may be ready to cooperate with the countries in a region characterized by its conjuncture ´s solutions and excessive enthusiastic planning actions, which end up earthen in the bureaucracy and corrupted practices of many public officers. The very case of the lack of implementation of basic observation systems and the very poor surface and upper air information, as mentioned in recent research work (see further specific comments) demonstrates that the lack of geophysical information is a serious, if not grave, drawback for the safety of the Region ´s communities and the safeguard of its renewable resources. The necessity for external financing stems out from some 14 projects,in the portfolio prepared by the EWD III- Third International Conference on Early Warning (Bonn, March 2006), of the ISDR..</p> <p>In addition the lack of coordinated socio-economic, cultural and behavioral information, this last regarding the comportment of indigenous communities, prevents any serious understanding even of the current climate of the whole LA Region. Further, it is unconceivable that countries which largest income comes from agriculture, forestry and fishing resources are still developing their activities taken little care of the implication of the region environmental change, the climate change included.</p> <p>In respect to the urgent need to improve the national climate observation networks, it should be noted, and make this evident to decision making, that the WMO GCOS Office has very recently started a renew action oriented to bring the GCOS Observation Network to effective implementation (note that only about 35 % of the recommended GCOS stations are installed and that very few of them fulfill the observation</p>	<p>ALL S</p> <p>Falta financiacion para observacion y aplicaci3n</p> <p>GEOSS</p>

<p>requirements in the three climate domains - atmospheric, terrestrial and oceanic, In other sections, the misinterpretation of the objective of some afforestation efforts, analyzed with a completely partial approach, in this case around the CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration by trees, and avoiding a truly integral approach (see section 13. ), presents such a development as a positive action, but failing to take into account the very nature of the ecosystem being adversely impacted (both terrestrial and aquatic), and classifying this particular development as a sustainable one.</p> <p>This case, as well as other tending, in a way or another, to mask the unequal treatment that multinational enterprising give to the environment defense, is one example of the partiality of some international reports in favor of the transfer of polluting activities to developing countries (as it was denounced in the Brutland 's report).</p> <p>It is also necessary to point out that various segments of this chapter are made from transcription of different international institutions, some of which develop their report with a definitive bias to justify their own existence.</p> <p>Finally, there is a pity that no word is included, regarding the need to enable the valued brain and working capacities available in Latin American countries, to obtain financing to develop their necessary observation networks, monitoring and watching systems, as well as the basic research activities, all these for the sake of the regional and global communities.</p> <p>The specific comments will refer some particular situations.</p>	
---	--

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-1	A	0				<p>Tourism is substantially dealt with in CH 1,4,6,7,9,11,12,13,14,16 . This is a significant change compared to TAR. Overall this is done in a satisfactory manner , in particular since the regional chapters do focus on regional issues without losing space on general aspects. What is missing though, is a critical assessment of the literature quoted (even though this literature is peer reviewed), not an individual assessment of papers but a critical overview of the mainstreams of methods that have been used these last years (though it must be recognised that these works have shed some light on what is a very important issue). This concerns both qualitative and speculative approaches and quantitative research. As regards the former, these confront current tourism behaviour and requirements regarding climate to the futures envisaged by scenarios. What is the degree of reliability of this kind of work knowing that the expectations of tourists regarding climates can evolve significantly, as they already have done in the past? There is at least a need for research to explore the range of possible evolutions in behaviours and introduce that into the analyses. Also, to what extent are econometric analyses concerning modifications in tourist flows (the more seducing as they yield figures...) robust and reliable? Is it, for example, acceptable to use a unique climate for the US as it is done in a paper quoted in several chapters? If it is, the coarseness of the results should be mentioned. In short, I believe that there should be in some place in the report, a caveat on the difficulties research on this topic encounters (uncertainties on future behaviours, shortcomings regarding statistics etc.) and their consequences on the results.</p> <p>(Jean-Paul Ceron, CRIDEAU (Université de Limoges-CNRS-INRA))</p>	ALL GN incluir poco considerando mercado MC, RZ 13.2.2
E-13-2	A	0				<p>This second review followed the questions and issues raised in the first review phase. The chapter followed the suggested structure of subheading titles and maximum number of pages. Still recognizing the difficult in terms of the diversity and complexity of the major ecosystems in Latin America as well as social, political and economic aspects, synthetic statements are lacking in some sections. However the Executive Summary that is critical to provide the readers with an overview of the document was improved in the current version of the document. Comments of the first review that were not addressed in the current document are presented again.</p> <p>(Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)</p>	ALL
E-13-3	A	0				<p>There is a problem with the references in this chapter: a lot of references are incomplete, or there are not in the reference list, or what is listed in the references has not been cited in the text. There is a mismatch between author names, year, publication name, etc.</p> <p>(Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)</p>	ALL Accepted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-4	A	0				The Chapter: 2 CLA, 4LA, 3CA, 2 RE, 11 in total. Almost 79% of Authors from only 4 countries, no one from Caribbean Islands, although with Venezuela and Costa Rica representation from Caribbean region. References: About a total of 240, 43 from international organizations, Internet, and newspaper. From about a total of 197 other references ( with out the 43 ones) , 46% from developed countries and 54% from developing ones ( including shared by authors from developed and developing countries). From the total, 71% in English language and only 29% in Spanish and Portuguese, 1 reference in French. I recognize that many authors in LA publish in English language but in local and national publishers there are a lot of scientific material in Spanish and Portuguese languages. Review of National Communications mentioned as references is weak ( Bolivia, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Guatemala, Guyana ( which one) Panama, Peru, Uruguay). (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	<b>Not applicable</b> It was not accepted
E-13-5	A	0				The Chapter on Latinamerica has to stregh the necessity and importance of developing and supporting scientific research from local scientists on all climate change issues, including natural systems and human systems and their interactions. Many scientific unknowns constraint the capability of establishing adaptaption measures and plans. Such research has to include measurements, diagnostic and modeling studies. Some examples include tropical rainfall at different time-space scales, the interactions between land surface-atmosphere feedbacks, Pricing of Carbon sequestration in tropical forests, Economic valuation of Services of natural systems, etc. There is a need to show better linkages between this IPCC IV report and the findings and conclusions of the Millenium Ecosystem Report (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	The document was peer – reviewed and accepted. ALL S Accepted 13.8  AV Milenium 2r para 13.7
E-13-6	A	0				style of chapter is possibly too catastrophic and judgemental, I would expect a more dispassionate discussion of data and models. For example, p4 14: an extinction is an extinction, what is a 'catastrophic extinction'? P4 129 'erroneously', unless this is specified it sounds merely like an unfounded judgement. Same for 'wrong' on p11, 125. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	ALL PARECEN COMENTARIOS DEL FOD <b>Not applicable</b> <b>Comments based on FOD</b>
E-13-7	A	0				soya is mentioned several times in the chapter. A major development in soya is the accelerated implementation of large areas with transgenic soya which allows for higher use of herbicides and the consequences thereof. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	It was not accepted DCGM Looks like FOD comments
E-13-8	A	0				Since most of comments I have already made for previous drafts have been already incorporated in the SOD, I have no further comments concerning the whole chapter	

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						besides some minor issues such as checking along the chapter the use of °C, US dollars and of Region/region (most of them are marked below). (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	
E-13-9	A	0				Overall, the Chapter is well organized, nevertheless, some issues concernig what is distinctive in LA in terms of climate (variability and observed changes) or climatic stresses are not well described or partially covered. Some of the specific comments below are mostly focused on improving this aspect. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN S Accepted
E-13-10	A	0				In any of the three sections which mention the COAST it should be cited the study about the Río de la Plata made by AIACC, LA26. 2005. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN LA 26 results and cites are already included and others were added. Accepted
E-13-11	A	0				I see no mention in this chapter of the important work of people studying the recent climate changes. These provide estimates of mean temperature changes for the Andes superior to those given in Table 13.2a and through text. They should be referenced. E.g. Vuille, M., Bradley, R.S., Werner, M. and Keimig, F., 2003. 20th century climate change in the tropical Andes: observations and model results. Climatic Change, 59. Vuille, M., Hardy, D.R., Braun, C., Keimig, F. and Bradley, R.S., 2001. Climate variability on intraseasonal to interannual timescales on the Bolivian Altiplano with special emphasis on the Nevado Sajama region. Ecología en Bolivia, 35, 17-40. Thompson, L.G. et al., 1998. A 25,000-Year Tropical Climate History From Bolivian Ice Cores. Science, 282, 1858-1864. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	GM CN ADD REFERENCE Accepted
E-13-12	A	0				Compared to the first draft, the second draft is a much improved document overall. Sections 13.2.4.3 and 13.3 are excellent additions. Some sections, primarily sections 13.1 and 13.2 require careful editing with regard to grammar, spelling and punctuation. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	
E-13-13	A	0				combination of economic, climatic and environmental stresses are pushing highland agriculture in two directions: reduction of agrobiodiversity (monocultures) along main highways and close to cities; and moving toward higher altitudes, with consequent needs for adaptation to different conditions, as glaciers retreat, temperatures increase, frost frequency decreases, and competition for land increases (e.g. Halloy, S.R.P., Seimon, A., Yager, K. and Tupayachi Herrera, A., 2005. Multidimensional (climate, biodiversity, socio-economics, agriculture) context of changes in land use in the Vilcanota watershed, Peru. In: E.M. Spehn, M. Liberman Cruz and C. Körner (Editors), Land Use Changes and Mountain Biodiversity, 2005.	GM ADD REFERENCE Accepted Pedir capitulo

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						CRC Press LLC, Boca Raton FL, USA, pp. 323-337. Halloy, S.R.P., Ortega Dueñas, R., Yager, K. and Seimon, A., 2005. Traditional Andean Cultivation Systems and Implications for Sustainable Land Use. Acta Horticulturae, 670, 31-55.) (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	
E-13-14	A	0				Chapters 11 and 13: style and subjects should be more in line and comparable. I tried to compare specific information between chapters and this was not possible. For example, Chapter 13 doesn't mention confidence levels and uncertainty, and Chapter 11 doesn't cover the same statistics. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	ALL Accepted
E-13-15	A	0				Chapter should include a more thorough discussion of the impacts of climate change to the paramos (see current IDEAM and World Bank projects). (Lara Hansen, WWF)	DC S Accepted
E-13-16	A	0				A review of the SOD was made as you requested, it maintains the first frame as proposed; so the contents and depth of the chapter show the recent advances in climate changes research. The different sections from the corresponding chapter are well balanced, although it is evident that some of them have more information than others; as expected, not all countries from Latin America have recent information about climate change topics. In this second review, I have a general comment and a doubt: It is recommended to make a deep revision on citations, because many errors were observed on the text as well as on the reference list (e.g. the years are different or simply the publication year does not appear, among others). Finally, I want to congratulate the authors by they great effort made in elaborating this chapter. (Oralia Oropeza, Ciudad Universitaria, Mexico)	ALL Accepted
E-13-17	A	1	0			COMMENT: The executive summary needs a full paragraph ot two on the risks to Amazonia (covered already in some places in the ES but not consonant with the significance of the risk or with the coverage in the chapter eg the case study in 13.6 (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	CN
E-13-18	A	1	0			COMMENT: The chapter overall does not conclude with a categorization of risk which one finds Chapter 11 and 12 for example where the authors attempted to summarize their assessment and associate the risks with different global mean changes in climate. The chapter would benefit very much from such an effort (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	ALL GN ste y reacomodar entre todos Hacer circular rapido
E-13-19	A	1	1	1		The Title COASTS appears in the section 13,4,4, but although it is used into the text at other sections (13,5,1,4 and 13,2,5,4) it is not detailed at the Index. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN OK. For CLAs

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-20	A	3	0	3		The Introduction section is missing. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ALL Accepted despues de ES
E-13-21	A	3	1	3	39	Authors need to make clear what is new since the TAR, and what makes Latin America distinctive - what is special about Latin America which means that it is worth having a regional chapter for it in the AR4? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL S
E-13-22	A	3	3	3	8	Why not to include a mention on the occurrence of severe drought in Amazon basin from July to October 2005 (as cited in table 13.1) (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	ALL S ADD REFERENCE Se arreglara la tabla 13.1
E-13-23	A	3	3	3	8	This bullet misses the important extreme events sequence flooding 8 million Ha in the Pampas, during 2000 -2002. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ALL ADD REFERENCE
E-13-24	A	3	3		8	Can this be phrased differently? It seems that there would be high confidence that extreme events have affected the region, but what is really of interest is whether these events have increased or have the impacts increased or is this variability increasing? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN Partially accepted. The impacts have increased, but perhaps with the exception of increase frequency of intense hurricanes over the last 30 yers, one cannot say the frequency of other events are clearly changing
E-13-25	A	3	5			What is meant by "unexpected"? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN Highly unusual
E-13-26	A	3	11			SLR and other acronyms (eg. TAR). Define these acronyms the first time they are used in the chapter, unless there is a table of acronyms included in the whole document. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM CG OK
E-13-27	A	3	15			what is meant by increase in the rate of SLR? This term is used frequently in the chapter and suggests that previously SLR was much slower than at present -- this previous rate is important to know in order to evaluate the change in the rate of rise. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN S OK-Addressed (present rate vs past rate compared) at summaries and table13.2a Accepted Cross reference
E-13-28	A	3	15			°C (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-29	A	3	19			"indicates" instaed of "shows" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-30	A	3	20	3	20	Rather than use a term like "affecting" it would be better to add a sense of directionality and signficance to this statement. At present it conveys little useful sense to policy makers. (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	JCG accepted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-31	A	3	20	3	20	Glacier retreat also affects important high Andean ecosystems known as "paramos". (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	JCG accepted
E-13-32	A	3	23	3	28	All of the points in this para are useful but I think they would be better located with text dealing with each of the issues that would put climate change stresses in the context of these other pressures mentioned here. In relation the points on deforestation it would be worth drawing the potential linkages with the climate change problem (increased fire risk etc). (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	DC CN Partially accepted
E-13-33	A	3	23		25	Here there is a conflation of land degradation and drought. Perhaps the relation between degradation and drought (and other climate factors) should be made more explicit both here an in the text (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC CN ACCEPTED
E-13-34	A	3	27			As a matter of fact, the tropical Andes are the most important hotspot for biodiversity ion Earth, meaning the fastest rates of biodiversity loss on the planet, due to land use change and deforestation (Myers et al., 2001) . (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	The document was peer – reviewed and accepted. DC CN
E-13-35	A	3	30	3	40	This bullet needs revision because it is not so definitive that such a reaction before extreme events has became a generally accepted one by all the Governments of the Region. A recent publication “La Situación Ambiental Argentina 2005” (Fundación Vida Silvestre, 2006), clearly states that, in spite of the constitutional right calling for protected environmental conditions and sustainable development goals, no effective action has been taken in Argentina. Further, as a matter of facts, it looks like an excessive optimism to speak about vulnerability when there are no sufficient basic observations, their reliability is rather poor and hydrometeorological monitoring is poor or inexistent. Moreover, as mentioned in other sections, there is not sufficient interlinked social, economic and cultural information on which to base the different degrees of vulnerability stemming from the same weather/climate stimuli, on different socio-economic and cultural recipient media. This comment does not mean the complete inexistence of these community safety and welfare systems; however they are no so generally adopted and implemented as this bullets transpires. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ALL S Add in 13.8
E-13-36	A	3	37	3	38	change 'low economic growth' by 'bad socio economic performance' ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-37	A	3	38			change 'decrease' by 'negatively affect'? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-	A	3	39			hindering?	CG



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
38						(Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	It has been changed to “hampering”
E-13-39	A	3	42	3	43	This sentence is unclear and perhaps it would be better co located with the text on page 4 lines 3-8 which covers projected losses to ecosystems and biodiversity. (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	DC Accepted
E-13-40	A	3	42	3	45	A search regarding the current operational condition of the Corredor Verde de Misiones (see page 37, line 15), as well as the action taken in regard to the Iniciativa Corredor de los Humedales del Litoral Fluvial de la Argentina, indicate that there is still a long way to assure, at least in these two cases, that they are fully implemented and in regular operation, as stems out from this bullet.. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC S Accepted
E-13-41	A	3	42		45	Again the relation between climate change and the proposed corridors could be made more explicit (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC S
E-13-42	A	3	44			"To counteract thesebased on conservatio...". A word is missing. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-43	A	3	48	3	48	The temperature lacks of the symbol "degree": ° (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-44	A	3	48			°C (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>done</b>
E-13-45	A	3	50	4	1	It would be better, since it is the realm of Central America, as an important integrating part of Latin America, to replace Caribbean Basin or Caribbean Sea, in the place of North Atlantic. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-46	A	3	51	3	51	Please read the sentence like: ... " extremes will be likely to increase..." (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-47	A	3	51			...will likely increase... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-48	A	4	3	4	8	The risk to biodiversity and ecosystems needs to be strengthened here to give examples from the chapter in these areas. (William Hare, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK))	CN
E-13-49	A	4	6			It is not clear in 13.4.1 that the savannization of the Amazon sufficiently certain to merit "high confidence" (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN Accepted. Changed to midium confidence.
E-13-	A	4	8			50% of agricultural lands where? "in many areas" seems a bit vague given the	DC

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
50						specificity of 50% (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	Agregar zonas y revisar referencia
E-13-51	A	4	11			this speaks of reduction in precipitation whereas p3 148 speaks of substantial increases for the same areas, and p4 143-44 says there is no trend. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	“?”
E-13-52	A	4	12			"the response to climate change" instead of "the behaviour" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-53	A	4	19	3	21	In Colombia, malaria is more temperature-dependant than rainfall dependant. Thus, an increase of mean temperature will be associated with increasing malaria transmission rates. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ARM S Incluir en texto TAR INFORMATION
E-13-54	A	4	23			"incidence" instead of "areas" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM <b>done</b>
E-13-55	A	4	26	4	39	The last two bullets in these lines should be compared with those in page 3 (between lines 30 and 45) to better consolidate repeated information (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GM GN OK
E-13-56	A	4	26			SLR (Spell it out) (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	GN OK Addressed
E-13-57	A	4	27			"lead to flooding in low lying areas" instead of "loss of..." (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GN OK Addressed AV DONE
E-13-58	A	4	29			include "coastal aquifer degradation and pollution". (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	GN S but lack of citation..?Included in other place AV: the paragraph was re-edited
E-13-59	A	4	31	4	31	Flood in productive areas of Bahía Samborombón, Buenos Aires, Kokot y Codignotto in Barros et al (2005) (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN No...there is no place here AV: the paragraph was re-edited
E-13-60	A	4	33	4	39	The parragraph is not clear enough. I suggest to clarify what we are refering to with the word "rehabilitation" (rehabilitation from human impact? Or mitigation from Climate Change impact?). (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN OK Addressed AV: the paragraph was re-edited
E-13-61	A	4	35			"selection of adated crop cultivars" instead of "improvements in crop cultivars" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM <b>done</b>
E-13-62	A	4	36			Add the word "Protection" before "measures" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GN OK Addressed
E-13-	A	4	41			I would suggest mentioning the possibility of human migratory movements brought	ALL

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
63						about by Climate Change. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	Accepted, RZ,ARM DONE
E-13-64	A	4	44			this should be referenced. I am aware that precipitation has increased in the low foothills of the Andes in Northwestern Argentina, however the opposite seems to have happened in the higher elevations where glaciers are rapidly retreating, lakes are drying up and peat bogs (ciénagas) show dying off from drought. The overall trend in this area is clearly drying. Halloy, S.R.P., 1985. Climatología y Edafología de Alta Montaña en Relación con la Composición y Adaptación de las Comunidades Bióticas (con especial referencia a las Cumbres Calchaqués, Tucumán), #85-02967. University Microfilms International publ.(UMI), Ann Arbor, Michigan, 839 pp. and others (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	It was not accepted.
E-13-65	A	5	1	6	17	This section reads oddly - because in presente tense not clear that it's summary of material that appeared in 2001. Better if begins " the principal findings in the TAR were : " plus then uses bullet points. Too much detail here eg. Why define what ENSO is - this isn't a TAR finding. Reduce 1 page. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-66	A	5	3	5	10	The description of observed trends in LA, summarized from TAR is not clear. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-67	A	5	4	5	4	Authors need to be careful with the measure units. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG OK
E-13-68	A	5	4			°C (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-69	A	5	5	5	6	°S? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-70	A	5	6	5	6	What Is meant by "consistent"? It doesn't appear to mean that there is the same trend over the whole region, apparently, so what does it mean? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-71	A	5	6			clarify: an increase in temperature would clearly increase EVT. The reduction postulated must be based on something else (deforestation?) (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-72	A	5	12	5	12	Insert "data" after "proxy". (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CG OK
E-13-73	A	5	13			specify coastal Peru, el Niño is related to drought in the highlands of Peru (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-	A	5	14			pose a danger for' by 'endanger'?	CG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
74						(Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	
E-13-75	A	5	15			Include "ecosystems functioning" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG
E-13-76	A	5	17			...mainly in the Amazon (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-77	A	5	20			change 'El Nino' by ENSO? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-78	A	5	23	5	23	Clarify that ENSO operates mostly at interannual time-scales. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CG
E-13-79	A	5	27			explain: more rain in most areas lead to more yields (e.g. soya P4 123-24) so more food. Say why you think this is different here. Same applies for next paragraph which now states decreased yields are predicted (even though this is a partial representation of the data shown in tables, which show a large range of estimates from decreases to increases, so why decreases are stressed here should be explained), this should be explained. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-80	A	5	29			...during the cold phase (la Nina) effects... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-81	A	5	31	5	33	In LA many diseases affecting an important number of people are weather and climate related ....like malaria and dengue. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-82	A	5	32			change "because the number" for "due to the high number" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG OK
E-13-83	A	5	34			Replace "El Niño" for "both phases of ENSO" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG OK
E-13-84	A	5	39	5	40	....activity representing in average 10% of the GDP. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-85	A	5	40			Delete the coma after "While". (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-86	A	5	41		41	What % of households in LA are subsistence farmers? Or is there a figures for the PEA in agriculture across the region? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CG
E-13-87	A	5	49	5	50	delete: that tropical forests will be permitted to occupy these new areas (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-88	A	5	51			Please replace "tropical savannas" by "savanna-like ecosystems" as the savannization process will not generate a true tropical savanna with all biodiversity but a degraded ecosystems with a grass-shrub layer	CG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	
E-13-89	A	5				here and in chapter in general the monsoon Chaco dry sclerophyll forests are insufficiently mentioned, despite having been identified as key conservation and biodiversity areas. E.g. Grau, H.R., Gasparri, N.I. and Aide, T.M., 2005. Agriculture expansion and deforestation in seasonally dry forests of north-west Argentina. Environmental Conservation, 32, 1-9. Kessler, M., Bach, K., Helme, N., Beck, S.G. and Gonzales, J., 1998. Floristic diversity of Andean dry forests in Bolivia - an overview. In: S.-W. Breckle, B. Schweizer and U. Arndt (Editors), Results of worldwide ecological studies. Proceedings of the 1st Symposium of the A.F.Schimper-Foundation est. by H. and E. Walter. Günter Heimbach, Stuttgart, Hohenheim, Germany, pp. 219-234. Parker, T.A., Gentry, A.H., Foster, R.B., Emmons, L.H. and Remsen, J.V., 1993. The Lowland Dry Forests of Santa Cruz, Bolivia: a global conservation priority. RAP Working Papers, 4. Conservation International, FAN, Santa Cruz, Bolivia, 104 pp. S.D. Davis, V.H. Heywood, O. Herrera-MacBryde, J. Villa-Lobos and A.C. Hamilton (Editors), Centres of Plant Diversity - A guide and strategy for their conservation. WWF, IUCN, Cambridge, UK. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CG LACK OF SPACE
E-13-90	A	6	1			add "and could be" between ecosystems and damaging. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-91	A	6	6	6	6	Does the Amazon really have the highest deforestation rates worldwide? According to FAO (2005), deforestation rates are ca. 5% in Togo and Burundi. This data is from: FAO (2005): Global Forest Resources Assessmet 2005. FAO Forestry Paper 147. Rome 2005. (Stephan Glatzel, Landscape Ecology)	The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-92	A	6	7			replace erosion by demise or deforestation (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-93	A	6	16	6	16	Insert “available” before “studies” (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CG SECTION HAS BEEN REWRITEN
E-13-94	A	6	24	6	36	there are NO citations for this paragraph... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN This is a general description of the main climatic features of Latin America.
E-13-95	A	6	24	7	6	In general and 13.2, 13.2.1 p.6. Starting with r. 24 what do you mean by “Latin America”? If the concept is “ Latin America/ Caribbean Region ” then the chapter is not sufficient for an assessment review. Suggest to clarify at the beginning of the chapter ( 13. 2.1 ) if Caribbean region is included in Small Islands Chapter. It’s understood that LA is mainly, from population point of view, Brazil, Mexico and	CN Latin America in this chapter does not include the Caribbean Basin.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Argentina, Colombia and Peru, but please do not forget integration efforts within LA (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	
E-13-96	A	6	27	6	30	The paragraph is confusing. It would be clearer to describe separately North America, and South American Monsoon systems. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN Partially accepted. Improved text for South America Monsoon System.
E-13-97	A	6	30		31	Low level Jets in South America east AND WEST of the Andes (Poveda and Mesa, 2001) Reference: Poveda, G., and O. J. Mesa. On the existence of Lloró (the rainiest locality on Earth): Enhanced ocean-atmosphere-land interaction by a low-level jet". Geophysical Research Letters, Vol. 27, No. 11, 1675-1678. June 1, 2000. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN Reference added
E-13-98	A	6	31		32	Inter-Americas Seas? Is this a common usage? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN Yes, it is common use.
E-13-99	A	6	33			replace organized by concentrated (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-100	A	6	35	6	35	After this meteorological description, it would be worth describing why northern Chile is dry. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN The problem in here is text length. If we are to explain the main characteristics of the climatic features, the text would be 3 times as long.
E-13-101	A	6	35			northeastern (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN It is more commonly referred and Northeast Brazil
E-13-102	A	6	38	6	45	When it comes to describe impacts on a ecosystem (e.g. tropical glaciers) sometimes authors just mention this ecosystem and the impacted countries and others not. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-103	A	6	38	6	45	Since this paragraph has been extracted from the Technical Paper V: Climate Change and Biodiversity, this information is purely the one included in TAR. Therefore it is no new information and should be included under section 13.1. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC S see Ar government c THE TEXT WAS REMOVED
E-13-104	A	6	39	6	39	Define Andean Paramos. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC glossary
E-13-105	A	6	41			more appropriate or additional references on biogeographic richness would be Dinerstein, E., Olson, D.M., Graham, D.J. and al, e., 1995. Una Evaluación del Estado de Conservación de las Ecoregiones Terrestres de América Latina y el Caribe. WWF, Banco Mundial, Washington, D.C., 135 pp. S.D. Davis, V.H. Heywood, O. Herrera-MacBryde, J. Villa-Lobos and A.C. Hamilton (Editors),	DC THE TEXT WAS REMOVED

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Centres of Plant Diversity - A guide and strategy for their conservation. WWF, IUCN, Cambridge, UK. Hueck, K., 1978. Los Bosques de Sudamérica. GTZ. Cabrera, A.L. and Willink, A., 1973. Biogeografía de América Latina. Monografía, 13. OEA, Washington, D.C., 120 pp. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	
E-13-106	A	6	43	6	43	Where are these 7? What is their current status? Their projected future? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC Accepted THE TEXT WAS REMOVED
E-13-107	A	6	43	6	45	Please mention critical places and endemic species. (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	DC Accepted THE TEXT WAS REMOVED
E-13-108	A	6	44			...suffering from their.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC THE TEXT WAS REMOVED
E-13-109	A	6	46	6	46	Worth moving definition of "El Niño" from setion 13.1.2 to here. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-110	A	6	47	6	51	References: Trenberth et al, 2004; EPA, 2001; are not in the Reference list. References: Haylock et al, 2005; Vincent et la, 2005; Alexander et al, 2005; are incomplete in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-111	A	6	49	6	46	The reference EPA, 2001 is not registered in the chapter ´s reference bibliography (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GM OK
E-13-112	A	6	49	6	49	Which other increased climate extremes? It's quite hard to see how this paragraph relates to the next one. Which is about hurricanes plus droughts but is in a different section. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Table 13.1 illustrates some of the other climatic extremes. The paragraphs will be redrafted.
E-13-113	A	6	51			Include "health epidemics" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ARM DONE
E-13-114	A	6	51			human systems" Please verify the suitability of this term (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	CN I am happy with that, but it can be changed to social systems
E-13-115	A	7	1	7	6	Reference: BID, 2000, is not in the Reference list. GEO 2003 appears in the Reference list as GEO 2000; GEO YEAR BOOK 2003, pp19; and GEO-LAC, 2003..... Which is the right reference? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM JCG  JUAN CARLOS GIMENEZ
E-13-116	A	7	1		3	Vulnerability is also being driven by unregulated urban growth, poor investment in infrastructure and problems in intersectoral coordination (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM JCG ACCEPTED
E-13-117	A	7	2			Edit "...rural migration, with the poorest communities being among the most..." (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	ARM JAG DONE

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-118	A	7	7			BID 2000 is not in reference list (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	ARM JUAN CARLOS GIMENEZ
E-13-119	A	7	9			Section 13.2.2: Perhaps a sentence is warranted to the effect that much of the research relating human systems to climatic factors has focused on the ENSO phenomenon given its importance as a driver of variability... Since most of the research summarized relates to ENSO teleconnections and relationships (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-120	A	7	9			Section 13.2.2 Weather and climate stresses: with respect to impacts on health, it would be important to also include the impacts caused by Heat Waves, particularly on children under the age of 5 years and on the elderly over the age of 60 years. In Peru, a study has revealed that the rise in extreme temperatures generates greater risks of contracting illnesses among children, especially in communities with significant rates of chronic malnutrition. Among others, these illnesses include hyperthermia, which is caused by heat waves and has the following symptoms: a high fever, diarrhea, respiratory and neurological problems. Hyperthermia can cause death, particularly among children under 5 and among elderly people over 60. This risk is increased when the heat waves occur together with relatively high humidity rates. These were precisely the conditions in the summer of 1998 in some areas of the northern coast of Peru: the minimum environmental temperature recorded positive anomalies of up to 7°C. Moreover, according to the same study, a rise of 2 to 4° C in the environmental temperature may represent a four-fold increase in the mortality risk (Samalvides, 1999). For example, infant mortality rates due to acute diarrheic illnesses doubled in Piura during the 97-98 El Niño occurrence. (Lenkiza Angulo Villarreal, Soluciones Prácticas-ITDG)	ARM DONE
E-13-121	A	7	11			13.2.2 Is there any analysis of the frequency of these extreme events in comparison with TAR? Perhaps using data from La Red? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL CN Agregar Trabajo MC centro america
E-13-122	A	7	15	7	15	Reference TAR(2001) is not in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>done</b>
E-13-123	A	7	16			... desolated? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG desolated
E-13-124	A	7	20	7	21	Table 13.1. I do not find the reference of La Nacion 2004 (10th line) at the References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	JCG I don't have this reference. It's not mine that figure and reference.
E-13-125	A	7	20	7	20	Please verify that the literature in this table is considered in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM OK



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-126	A	7	20			Table 13.1: Extreme events and their impacts. It is assumed that this Table will be completed with information on the extreme events registered in 2006/7, until the completion of this IPCC Fourth Assessment Period (AR4) (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GM YES
E-13-127	A	7	20		21	Colombia: September–November 2005 rainy season. 70 deaths, 86 injured, 6 disappeared, and 140,000 flood victims. El Tiempo, 2005. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	GM ADD REFERENCE
E-13-128	A	7	20			citations in the table are not in the references // In Heavy rains Venezuela: heavy landslides? // in Drought Argentina: Agriculture losses estimated....? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM OK
E-13-129	A	7				Table 13-1. References: SINAPRED, 2006; Fundacion Desc, 2005; CENAPRED, 2005; NOAA, 2006; Cunha, 2004; are not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM ACCEPTED
E-13-130	A	7				table 13.1 could mention the remarkable July 2002 snowstorm which dumped record levels of snow all the way from Santa Cruz and Valdivia in Argentina and Chile, through Bolivia and Peru, killing tens of thousands of camelid livestock and a number of people. In this table, is there a mixup between the entries for Bolivia 2002 and 2001? Damages should be expressed in a single currency, or at least both the local and a uniform currency. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	NOT APPLICABLE LACK OF SPACE
E-13-131	A	7				Table 13.1 and elsewhere in the chapter ---\$USD not U\$D. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM Done
E-13-132	A	8	1	8	8	there are No citation for this paragraph... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN Paragraph will be deleted.
E-13-133	A	8	1	8	8	Parapgraph out of syn with the rest of text. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	CN S Paragraph will be deleted.
E-13-134	A	8	1	8	8	Delete (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Paragraph will be deleted.
E-13-135	A	8	2			...interactions not only in the tropical.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN Paragraph will be deleted.
E-13-136	A	8	7	8	7	AAM refers to the Antarctic Anular Mode (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN Paragraph will be deleted.
E-13-137	A	8	8			Please provide reference at the end of line (Poveda et al. 2006), whose reference is: Poveda, G., P. R. Waylen, and R. Pulwarty, Modern climate variability in northern South America and southern Mesoamerica. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, & Palaeoecology. 234, 3-27, 2006. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN Paragraph will be deleted.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-138	A	8	10	8	27	References: Kovacs, et al, 2001; La Marca et al, 2005; Roth, 1997; Conde, 2001; Meagan et al, 2004; are not in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	AV and CG
E-13-139	A	8	10	8	27	It would be interesting to see whether it would be possible to get information on the increasing sea water acidification due to large CO2 concentrations in the atmosphere. This would be of interest regarding corals and mangroves. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	AV The most recent scientific event related with this theme (June 2006, see the condensed attachment about it) pointed that several gaps, research needs and misconceptions about the effects of acidification on coral reefs around the world. No mention about Latin America studies, except for the Caribbean no latin countries (NCER). Maybe this event could add some recent data for latin america related with this controversial point. <b>THIRD INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL MARINE ECOSYSTEMS MANAGEMENT SYMPOSIUM:</b> ITMEMS-3 will be held from 15-20 October 2006, in Cozumel, Mexico. ITMEMS is a major activity of the International Coral Reef Initiative. ITMEMS-3 aims to provide an opportunity for marine and coastal managers and stakeholders to exchange experiences and knowledge, and define future action for the management of tropical marine ecosystems
E-13-140	A	8	16	8	16	Insert 'areas' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	AV DONE
E-13-141	A	8	16		21	Are there data to illustrate the vulnerability of mangroves in the different locations? What does "mangrove-up and interface" mean? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	AV Schaeffer et al, 2002 show responses of mangrove species to sea level raise in diferrent geomorphological settings along Atlantic (Brazil) and Caribbean (Venezuela) coasts, but no support conclusions about the specific species response due the fact that mangrove species are very adaptative to

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
							<p>several substrates or physiographic settings. Predicted responses of mangroves to sea level rise vary from little adverse impact to collapse. It is likely that responses of mangroves to sea level rise will be influenced also by other factors, such as sediment supply/flux (interface between land and sea on low-lying coasts where sediment loads determine the optimal substrate for mangrove colonization), presence of suitable substrate, stand composition and status, and tidal range. Mangrove communities may be able to migrate in response to seal level rise, but only where there exists adequate sediment supply and substrate and if sea level rise is not too rapid. Sufficient sediment delivery is required for vertical accretion to some mangroves species (<i>Avicennia</i>, <i>Laguncularia</i>, <i>Conocarpus</i> in Caribbean coast of LA) to protect them from inundation by seawater. Tidal (vertical) accretion is known to track sea level rise, such that the inundation of the marsh surface is not likely to be a major concern. However, in some areas, sea level rise may be too fast for accretion to keep up.</p> <p><b>Alicia: Esta respuesta es muy difusa y no veo la respuesta a: What does "mangrove-up and interface" mean?</b></p>
E-13-142	A	8	18	8	18	Roth, 1997 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	AV OK DELETED
E-13-143	A	8	19	8	19	Meagan et al., is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	AV DONE INCLUDED
E-13-144	A	8	20	8	21	What is the 'mangrove-up and interface'? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	AV see response in E-13-141
E-13-145	A	8	21	8	21	comma after biodiversity (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	AV DONE
E-13-	A	8	21		22	It is important to remind the other causes are also implied in the decline of	DC

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
146						amphibian populations (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	The document was peer – reviewed and . accepted
E-13-147	A	8	23			"Disappearing" is s trong word. Is the evidence strong enough to suggest that species are disappearing. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-148	A	8	24	8	24	define 'Atelopus' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-149	A	8	24	8	23	define 'anurans' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-150	A	8	25	8	27	Sentence is unclear (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-151	A	8	25	8	25	La Marca et al., 2005 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-152	A	8	25	8	27	I don't understand the last sentence in this paragraph (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-153	A	8	26			...into elevation of range...? Not clear (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC SENTENCE DELETED
E-13-154	A	8	30	8	30	Reference: IPCC, 2001; is missing in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM ADD REFERENCE
E-13-155	A	8	32			define 'fructification' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-156	A	8	33		34	"Increases in plant diseases"? In extent? Frequency? Severity? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-157	A	8	36			Delete "environmentally" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-158	A	8	36			...environmental (?) humidity.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-159	A	8	40			animals were not able... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>Done</b>
E-13-160	A	8	42	8	45	Split sentence into 2 sentences. Begin a new sentence at "Almost 13.9 % of LA poluplation....(IBD, 2004)" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG The sentence was moved to 13.4.3..

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-161	A	8	42	8	44	"By 2000" is incorrect. We are already in 2006. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Not accepted. The sentence was moved to 13.4.3..
E-13-162	A	8	42	9	11	Although the issue of water quality is dealt with in another section, it would be opportune to have some cross-reference both of natural insidious pollution cases (Ar, F, Pb, U) and that resulting from sanitary pits, dispersal of agrochemicals and industrial pollutants. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Accepted
E-13-163	A	9	1	9	12	References: Maza et al, 2001; Poveda et al, 2003; are missing in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-164	A	9	1	9	1	Maza et al, 2001 is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Done
E-13-165	A	9	3			cause (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-166	A	9	5			shows high vulnerability (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-167	A	9	5			After (IDEAM, 2004) please add : "Consequently, soil moisture and vegetation activity are strongly reduced (augmented) by El Niño (La Niña) in Colombia (Poveda et al. 2001)", whose reference is: Poveda, G., A. Jaramillo, M. M. Gil, N. Quiceno, and R. Mantilla. Seasonality in ENSO related precipitation, river discharges, soil moisture, and vegetation index (NDVI) in Colombia. Water Resources Research, Vol. 37, No. 8, 2169-2178, 2001. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	JCG Done
E-13-168	A	9	5		5	55% losses of what to what? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Done <b>In mean flow</b>
E-13-169	A	9	8		9	Poveda et al. (2003) is not included in the reference list. Please include: Poveda, G., O. J. Mesa, and P. R. Waylen, Non-linear forecasting of river flows in Colombia based upon ENSO and its associated economic value for hydropower generation. En: Climate and Water: Transboundary Challenges in the Americas, H. Diaz and B. Morehouse (eds.), Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, 351-371, ISBN 1-4020-1529-1, 424 p., 2003. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	JCG Done
E-13-170	A	9	10		11	The lack of investments in infrastructure was also one of the causes of the breakdown of electricity in Brazil in 2001 (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	JCG Not accepted
E-13-	A	9	11			change 'caused' by 'contributed with'	JCG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
171						(Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	<b>Not changed</b>
E-13-172	A	9	13	9	18	It would be usefull to cite the study of Barros et al. 2005. (it is written at References but I could not find it cited at the text) (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-173	A	9	13	9	18	Flood / inundation conditions are not only dependant of extreme events an sea level rise. In the River Plate estuary the changing dynamic conditions have exacerbate the so called sea-land winds (landward circulation) with the result of larger flooding effects and more persistent inundation situations. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GN S OK- Addressed / considered in several places.  Same Ar gov
E-13-174	A	9	13		18	Perhaps in this section less reference to potential SLR impacts and more information on current flooding or storm damage or habitat loss on the coast? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN S OK. We tried to give more emphasis to Clim. Variability and extremes than to current SLR...especially in tables. Ok (added by AV: are among the most vulnerable to extreme hydro-meteorological events, <b>accounting losses close to 10,000 M \$USD during 2005</b> and enhanced by sea level-rise (SLR). NOTE: I calculated the \$USD losses adding the losses from the cases referred in table 13.1 during 2005.  ok
E-13-175	A	9	18	9	18	References: OECD, 2004; Kokot, 2004c are not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed AV: deleted OECD, 2004
E-13-176	A	9	18	9	18	OECD 2004, Kokot 2004 are not in the references. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN OK OECD was changed: Agrawala et al., 2004 AV: deleted OECD, 2004
E-13-177	A	9	18	9	18	OECD 2004 and Kokot 2004c. No cited (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN OK AV: deleted OECD, 2004
E-13-178	A	9	20			alter the transmission (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-179	A	9	22	9	25	Two conflicting phenomena - droughts and flooding - are discussed in one sentence. Edit text to remove conflict. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-180	A	9	23	9	24	Too many pre-TAR references (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM S NEW INFORMATION, EACH REFERENCE CORRESPONDS TO

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
							DIFFERENT COUNTRY
E-13-181	A	9	23	9	25	these lines sound contradictory... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM EXPLAINED
E-13-182	A	9	24	9	24	William et al., is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-183	A	9	24	9	24	William et al, 1997; is not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-184	A	9	24		25	Land use changes are also associated to the increase in peri-domestic rodents. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-185	A	9	25	9	25	Add , after “flooding” a coma plus “ and forest/rangeland fires” (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM DONE
E-13-186	A	9	25			flooding in surrounding.... (sentence incomplete) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM DONE
E-13-187	A	9	28	9	37	PAHO, 2003; is not listed; Gagnon, 2002 should be Gagnon et al, 2002? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-188	A	9	28	9	37	In Peru, during the 97-98 El Niño, the rise in temperature, the exceptional increase in rainfall (which generates water pools and vector nesting), and the deterioration of sanitary conditions caused a significant increase in the incidence rates of malaria and cholera. Malaria cases had a five-fold increase while cholera cases had a 45-fold increase in comparison with the number of cases recorded in 1997. According to studies carried out in Peru, the 2°C rise in the average environmental temperature produced by El Niño in 1998 brought about a four-fold increase in the population of malaria vectors in endemic areas (Samalvides, 1999). (Lenkiza Angulo Villarreal, Soluciones Prácticas-ITDG)	ARM TAR INFORMATION
E-13-189	A	9	29	9	40	Could use bullet points (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM LACK OF SPACE
E-13-190	A	9	30	9	30	PAHO 2003, is not in the references. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-191	A	9	30		31	"People in risk face...." .. The meaning is not clear. Poverty, etc exacerbate the risks of malaria transmission and challenge its control. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-192	A	9	32	9	37	Sentence is unclear (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-193	A	9	32			Rua et al, 2005 is not an appropriate reference to illustrate this. Instead, please cite Poveda et al. (2001), whose complete reference is: Poveda, G., W. Rojas, I. D. Vélez, M. Quiñones, R. I. Mantilla, D. Ruiz, J. Zuluaga, and G. Rua, Coupling	ARM DONE

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter-Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
						between Annual and ENSO timescales in the malaria-climate association in Colombia. Environmental Health Perspectives, 109, 489-493, 2001. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	
E-13-194	A	9	32		33	explain this paragraph, it is unclear (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	ARM DONE
E-13-195	A	9	33		35	Does malaria increase or decrease with El Niño in Venezuela? The first sentence suggests that incidence increases, the second that it decreases. Do all instances where the term El Niño is used refer to warm events? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM S ACCEPTED
E-13-196	A	9	39	9	40	This sentences needs references. Which climate driven fluctuations? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-197	A	9	41	9	41	Instead of “country level”, read “county / state /province level” (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM NOT ACCEPTED
E-13-198	A	9	41		42	"dengue was not significant, but the lack of association is likely because the disease data ... (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM DONE
E-13-199	A	9	44		45	what is the relationship between migration and visceral leishmanisis? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM ILL PEOPLE MIGRATE FOR LABOUR TO AREAS WITH TRANSIMSSION CONDITIONS
E-13-200	A	9	50	9	50	SOI should be explicit at least once in the chapter that stands for Southern Oscillation Index (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-201	A	9	50			SOI? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM SOUTHERN OSCILLATION INDEX DONE
E-13-202	A	9				Several river and lake amphibians of the genus Telmatobius are dying off in what is thought to be a combination of effects triggered mostly by climate change, but of which a major symptom is infection by Chytrid fungi. Ron, S.R. and Merino, A., 2000. Amphibian declines in Ecuador: overview and first report of chytridiomycosis from South America. Froglog, 42, 2-3. Díaz-Páez, H. and Ortiz, J.C., 2003. Evaluación del estado de conservación de los anfibios en Chile. Revista Chilena de Historia Natural, 76, 509-525. DeVries, T.A., Hoernig, G., Sowell, P., Halloy, S.R.P. and Seimon, A., 2005. Identification of Chytridiomycosis in Telmatobius marmoratus at 4,450m in the Cordillera Vilcanota of Southern Peru. In: E.O. Lavilla and I. de la Riva (Editors), Studies on the Andean Frogs of the Genera Telmatobius	??



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						and Batrachophrynus. Asociación Herpetológica Española, Monografías de Herpetología, Valencia (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	
E-13-203	A	9				has Chagas been considered? It is one of the major diseases in central and northern South America (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	ARM DONE
E-13-204	A	10	2	10	3	Why might it re-emerge? Would it have climate-driven links? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM EXPLAINED
E-13-205	A	10	2		3	Why is chagas disease re-emerging? What is the link to climate? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM EXPLAINED
E-13-206	A	10	12	10	12	Change 'northeastern' to 'North-east' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-207	A	10	17			1. . Section 2.3 Non-climatic stresses, Comment. I consider under this section should be good to introduce two problems of the region: the poverty and skew ness in the wealth distribution. They are fundamental to explain the land use changes, demographic pressures effects, over exploitation of natural resources and many pollution processes of the region. I.e. on UNEP GEO Outlook for Latin America and the Caribbean 2003 (pages 36-37) estimate based on data from CEPAL 2003 that region poor population was 225 millions of persons, 43.9 % of the total, and 100 millions were natives (indígenas). (Avelino G. Suarez Rodriguez, Ecology and Systematic- Cuban Environmental Agency)	ALL
E-13-208	A	10	19		31	Demographic pressures might also include the expansion of agricultural settlements into forested areas (Amazon) and concentration of populations on coastal areas with growing interest in tourism, particular ecotourism? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC GN ...it is true. There is no much place to include text..... AV: DONE The rapidly expanding tourism industry is also driving much of the destruction, paving the way for resorts, marinas, and golf courses (WWF, 2004)
E-13-209	A	10	21	10	50	UNEP, 2003; UNCHS, 2001; Canziani, 2005; UNEP, 2000; CIDAS, 2003; Yañez-Arancibia et al, 1998; are not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN ARM References for ARM and AV DONE AV DONE: deleted Yañez-Arancibia et al, 1998; CIDAS was replaced by OAS-CIDI, 2003
E-13-210	A	10	21	10	24	There seems to be a discrepancy between the statement that 75 % of LA population live in urbanized region and statements (P 8 , L43-45) that 63 % of LA population live in rural areas. Reconcile statements.	GN Not me...perhaps ARM...however the cited 63% refers to the percentage with no access to safe water...There is no

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	discrepancy. AV: NO discrepancies: the statement in pag 8 is referred to the 63% of the 13,5% without acces to water, not to the total population living in rural areas in LA
E-13-211	A	10	23	10	23	Include Brazil after Argentina, (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	GN OK- Addressed
E-13-212	A	10	24	10	28	The text in these lines sound a bit arbitrary. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM NOT ACCEPTED
E-13-213	A	10	24			70% of what?, population, area? (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	'?
E-13-214	A	10	26		28	There is a significant problem of urban poverty where malnutrition, poor quality water and services prevail -- increasingly the line between urban and rural in many parts of LA is becoming blurred, particularly around large urban areas (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM JCG ACCEPTED
E-13-215	A	10	28	10	28	Insert "sewage / sanitary" before services (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM DONE
E-13-216	A	10	31	10	50	Canziani 2005 dos not appears at References section (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	ARM DONE
E-13-217	A	10	33		46	Over exploitation is also resulting in competition for scarce resources, particularly water, between sectors and users and growing social conflict over water allocation and management (e.g, privatization) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG That´s true. But the sentence will not be changed because the concept is collateral to CC
E-13-218	A	10	36			what is meant by "wrong management"? Are all these factors related to overexploitation? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG GN Addressed
E-13-219	A	10	36			"mismanagement" not "wrong management" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG GN OK.... Addressed
E-13-220	A	10	37	10	37	UNEP 2000, is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN to be added or deleted AV: included
E-13-221	A	10	37	10	37	suggestion: replace impose for have imposed (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN OK Addressed AV: done
E-13-222	A	10	38	10	42	Too many pre-TAR references (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN AV S OK... Addressed ...task for AV AV: OK up dated
E-13-223	A	10	38	10	38	GEO-3? The reference is incomplete. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Geo-outlook 2003 AV: completed

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-224	A	10	38	10	38	CIDAS 2003, is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN ...OK ..To be added or deleted AV: deleted
E-13-225	A	10	44	10	46	The round brackets need to close. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Accepted
E-13-226	A	10	46	10	46	The large city in the Province of Buenos Aires suffering seriously from underground water nitrification is the City of La Plata. In the city of Buenos Aires, fresh water services are provided from the River Plate estuary surface waters. Further, some district of the Great Buenos Aires, surrounding the Federal Capital suffer from pollution of many nature (organic, industrial and from wastes lixiviation ) critically affecting the Puelche 's aquifer, extending below the Northeastern portion of the Province of Buenos Aires. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Done
E-13-227	A	10	49			Is FAOSTAT the appropriate citation here? This is a database and no data are cited. Has the expansion of agricultural land been quantified for th eregion? How much deforestation has it caused? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC It was not accepted
E-13-228	A	10	50	10	50	Canziani 2005 dos not appears at References section (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	DC
E-13-229	A	10		14		Organizationa Issues: What is the difference between 13.2.3 and 13.2.4.2. It would be better to put them together. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC CN GM S Yes, it was done The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-230	A	10				river transportation should be mentioned. Major rivers are key highways for social and economic connectivity through the Paraná-Paraguay, Amazon and Orinoco. These are vulnerable to droughts, floods and development initiatives such as dams, bridges, etc.. (e.g. Hamilton, S.K., 1999. Potential effects of a major navigation project (Paraguay-Parana Hidrovia) on inundation in the Pantanal floodplains. Regulated Rivers, 15. CEBRAC, 1994. Hidrovia Paraguai-Paraná - Quem Paga a Conta? - Análise da viabilidade Econômico-Financiera do Projeto da Hidrovia Paraguai-Paraná. Fundação Centro Brasileiro de Referência e Apoio Cultural, Instituto Centro de Vida, WWF, Brasilia, 92 pp. Halloy, S.R.P., Seimon, A., Sandbu, M. and Franco, G. (Editors), 2005. Estudio Puerto Busch - Opciones para la ubicación de un puerto soberano de Bolivia en el Sistema Paraguay-Paraná. WWF, Earth Institute at Columbia University, New Zealand Institute for Crop and Food Research, Santa Cruz de la Sierra, Bolivia, 161 pp.)	JCG? Not accepted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	
E-13-231	A	11	1			What is meant by "blindness"? What evidence is there that agricultural expansion has affected drought frequency or impacts? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC GM Paragraph changed
E-13-232	A	11	4	11	4	UNEP, 2000; is not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-233	A	11	4	11	4	UNEP 2000, is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-234	A	11	6	1	6	Change 'trough' to 'through' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-235	A	11	6			through forest fires (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-236	A	11	7	11	8	that threatens biodiversity (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-237	A	11	10		22	This section could include the study cases of Hg contamination due to land use changes by riverine communities in the Tapajós region (Belém, Pará, Brazil). The studies were conducted by the group led by Marc Lucotte from the University of Quebec (Montreal) (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	JCG Not considered
E-13-238	A	11	10		22	The symbol (F) appears after heavy metals. What does it mean? It can be confounded with fluoride that is not a heavy metal. What is the Bel-ville syndrome? (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	JCG Done. Changed by “fluorine”
E-13-239	A	11	12	11	13	Bell Ville syndrome es an ancient name of present HACRE disease. HACRE is an acronym of Chronic Regional and Endemic Hydro Arsenisism in Argentina. It includes multiple manifestations as 1) Hyperhydrosis, 2) Hyperqueratosis in the palm of hands and foot, Melanodermis, multiple Epiteliomas, Bowen disease or Hutchinson disease (cancer), and cancer in different organs. (Susana Isabel Curto, Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Cientificas y Tecnologicas (CONICET))	JCG Done
E-13-240	A	11	13	11	14	Define "(F) and +K19" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Done
E-13-	A	11	13	11	13	Between brackets it shall read Arsenic and Fluor, proliferating in the soils of central	JCG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter- Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
241						Argentina.. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	Done
E-13-242	A	11	13	11	13	(F) Is this right? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Accepted. Fluorine
E-13-243	A	11	13			(F) ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	JCG Accepted. Fluorine
E-13-244	A	11	14	11	14	Which is the meaning of "+K19" ? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Accepted. It's a typing error
E-13-245	A	11	14	11	14	Delete +K19 (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Accepted. It's a typing error
E-13-246	A	11	14			death+K19 ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	JCG Accepted. It's a typing error
E-13-247	A	11	16	11	18	References needed to Pilcomayo Basin sentences. What is the influence? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG
E-13-248	A	11	16	11	16	Please replace SE by Southeast (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Done
E-13-249	A	11	18	11	18	Please change affect for affets (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Done
E-13-250	A	11	18		22	The implications of flooding for human health is an underresearched area that perhaps should be highlighted as an area of future work (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG S Not mine. Ana Rosa
E-13-251	A	11	19			Here and elsewhere in the chapter. Latin name of plant/animal species should be in italic or underlined (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Done
E-13-252	A	11	20	11	20	Add the following text to this sentence: " As a result of the of the Salado del Norte (Argentina) river flood of 2003 which covered more than one third of the urban section, ....." (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-253	A	11	22			recognized ??? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	JCG
E-13-254	A	11	22			Add "as a result" after officially recognized. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Done
E-13-255	A	11	24			areas in the region ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-256	A	11	25	11	25	Please read as follows: main source of pollution in Lima, Quito and La Paz (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-	A	11	26			by electricity production through thermoelectric plants ?	ARM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
257						(Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DONE
E-13-258	A	11	27	11	27	PAHO, 2003; is not listed. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-259	A	11	28	11	29	Need a post - TAR references for this sentence. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-260	A	11	28	11	28	Before "ozone" insert "surface". The short living surface ozone is the rare gas creating health hazards in many large cities of the world. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM DONE
E-13-261	A	11	29	11	29	Please, close round brackets (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-262	A	11	37			Is there an overall pattern to the direction of the precipitation and temperature trends that can be explained by the physical geography of the region? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN Rarely one can provide a clear explanation of the trends. For precipitation trends, some are linked to variations of ENSO interdecadal variability. Temperature trends can be of local origin associated to urbanization processes, but the large scale features are better explained by global warming
E-13-263	A	11	40			southeastern ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM DONE
E-13-264	A	11	41		43	is SLR increasing at a rate of 2-3 mm/yr or is the total average rate of SLR 2-3mm/yr over the last 10-20 years? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN Addressed SLR is increasing at a 2-3 mm/y rate over the last 10-14 ys...against 1-2 mm in the recent past. Explicated in the text and tables.
E-13-265	A	11	48		49	What is meant by the "contribution of wet days is increasing?" How is this trend compatible in Central America with the observed decline in precipitation? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN GM Those are observational results and the references are cited. Even when precipitation is decreasing overall, days with higher precipitation totals can be increasing, that is fewer rainfall events throughout the year, but with larger amount of rain per event.
E-13-266	A	11	50	12	2	It would be good to see a more systematic description of impacts rather than this "human health" examples based on a single reference which is not Latin-American specific. This comes more successfully in the next paragraph, so I suggest you link the two. The ones which come first are not the most important. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM GM DONE ACCEPTED
E-13-	A	12	4			Is the 10% increase referring to flood frequency?	GM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
267						(Hallie Eakin, University of California)	YES IT WAS ADDED
E-13-268	A	12	6		7	It would be helpful here to have some historical data on flood frequency and related mortality/losses to illustrate trends. Perhaps La Red has this data. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM DONE
E-13-269	A	12	7	12	8	Ministry of Sustainable....., 2000; is not in the Reference list. Should be "Bolivia, 2000" instead? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-270	A	12	8		11	Increased precipitation intensity may have negative effects for soil erosion and soil conservation -- is there evidence of this? Also AIACC-LA27 is not an appropriate citation ... is there a report that can be cited? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM ACCEPTED
E-13-271	A	12	13	12	14	Douglas, 2005; Smith et al, 1999; are not listed in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed To be included only one recent cite. Or deleted
E-13-272	A	12	13	12	14	Delete if there is only a pre TAR reference. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN Addressed ....old references...not needed to be included without new ones.
E-13-273	A	12	13		14	Sentence is unclear (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GN OK...see above...to be deleted
E-13-274	A	12	13			Again, is it an increase in the rate of SLR or simply SLR that is causing the problem? Are there other areas that SLR has been noted (e.g., Rio Plata basin? SE South America?) Perhaps an additional sentence is warranted that summarizes some of the implications mentioned in the cases documented in Table 13.2a (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN Addressed Sentence deleted due to old references. SLR is not causing real big problems yet....will certainly ...in the future.....next sections...
E-13-275	A	12	16	12	21	This is more like ta ecosystem impact than climate trend, or should be rephrased in order to have a better link to climate trends presented in this sections. Therefore Table 13.2b would read more fluent in this section. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG
E-13-276	A	12	16		21	another concern related to glacier melting is the potential for catastrophic damage from the collapse of glacier dams and the implications for the populations who live near the base of glaciers and have depended on glacier lakes for their livelihoods. There have already been cases of loss of life in the Andes. the population affected is small but highly vulnerable. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG
E-13-277	A	12	19	12	21	"Leiva et al, 2003" is incomplete; "Geology News, 2001"; "Mendoza and Francou, 2004" are not lited in the References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM JCG OK
E-13-278	A	12	21	12	21	Is important to agregate part of this information: La mayoría de los glaciares pertenecientes al Campo de Hielo Patagónico Sur presentan tasas de retroceso	JCG Not accepted.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter- Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>destacables. Una excepción a este comportamiento lo constituye el Glaciar Perito Moreno, el cual presenta su frente estable. Los restantes glaciares retroceden en forma dispar, destacándose el Glaciar Viedma entre los que retroceden muy lentamente y el Glaciar Upsala, que lo hace de una forma notablemente acelerada. Las tasas de retroceso de este glaciar se describen a continuación.</p> <p>El glaciar Upsala fluye desde el Campo de Hielo Patagónico Sur, el que configura un resto de una extensión mayor de hielo, localizada sobre parte de la Cordillera Patagónica Austral. La misma, durante las glaciaciones mas importantes que ocurrieron en esta región, llego a ocupar la totalidad de los lagos Argentino y Viedma, además de gran parte de sus valles emisarios.</p> <p>La característica fundamental que presenta este glaciar, además de su tamaño, es el rápido retroceso de su frente a partir del desprendimiento de témpanos, eventos que en algunos casos tienen el carácter de excepcionales. Este comportamiento en la dinámica glaciaria se debe a que el frente del glaciar Upsala no esta totalmente apoyado sobre el sustrato rocoso del fondo del lago. Por el contrario, tiene la mayor parte su sección terminal en flotación, situación que da lugar a severas tensiones en la zona distal de la lengua de hielo, las que finalmente se resuelven mediante la fracturación de la misma y el consiguiente desprendimiento de témpanos, proceso este ultimo denominado calving</p> <p>Malagnino y Strelin, 1992; Malagnino, 1993; Malagnino y Strelin, 1996; Malagnino et al, 1997; Malagnino et al, 1998 y Malagnino 2006 establecieron que el retroceso del frente del glaciar Upsala durante los últimos 206 años, entre 1800 y principios de 2006, fue el siguiente:</p> <p>Desde el año 1800 hasta 1931, el glaciar retrocedió a una tasa promedio de 50 m/año, haciéndolo como un glaciar de descarga pero con la base apoyada sobre el fondo del brazo Upsala.</p> <p>Entre los años 1931 y 1981, si bien la tasa de retroceso promedio se mantuvo estable, el comportamiento dinámico vario substancialmente ya que el retroceso del glaciar no fue el mismo a lo largo de todo su frente. Por ejemplo, mientras la margen derecha experimento un retroceso neto de 2 km y la central otro de 2.5 km, lo que dio lugar a una tasa de retroceso de 40 y 50 m/año respectivamente, la margen izquierda se mantuvo en una posición estable, e incluso avanza varias decenas de metros. La explicación de esta ultima anomalía se relaciono con a la aparición (entre 1978 y 1980) de un curso fluvial subglaciar que humedeció la plataforma de hielo, lubricándola y dando lugar a un fuerte resbalamiento glaciar local, el que sumo este movimiento al que ya tenia la totalidad de la lengua.</p>	



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter- Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>Entre 1981 y 1990 se produce un notable cambio en la tasa de retroceso general ya que el frente del glaciar experimento un repliegue inédito, el que tampoco en esta oportunidad fue regular a lo largo de todo su frente.</p> <p>Por ejemplo, mientras que la margen derecha retrocedió una distancia neta de 1 km, con una tasa de retroceso de 110 m/año, la margen central lo hizo una distancia total de 2.5 km., con una tasa de retroceso mayor a los 270 m/año. Pero la que se destaco fue la margen izquierda, la que se replegó una distancia neta de 7 km, con una tasa de retroceso mayor a los 770 m/año. Estos valores representan incrementos mayores a dos, cinco y catorce veces en la tasa de retroceso que este glaciar había tenido desde 1931 hasta 1981.</p> <p>La causa de este singular repliegue se debió a que a partir del año 1981 el glaciar Upsala comenzó a estar en flotación posibilitando el desprendimiento de témpanos a partir de la acción del calving. El retroceso fue mayor en la faja izquierda del glaciar porque esa había sido la zona que durante el periodo previo había reavanzado a partir del deslizamiento basal. Al hacerlo, sin haber mediado un aporte extra de masa de hielo, toda esta faja que había resbalado basalmente se adelgazo, permitiendo así que una gran parte de ella entrara en condición de lengua flotante. Esto facilitó el desprendimiento local de témpanos por calving. La ablación selectiva de esta faja de la lengua dio lugar a la formación de una ensenada angosta, la que posibilito que la zona distal del glaciar dejara de estar confinada a los laterales del brazo Upsala y por lo tanto comenzó a expandirse lateralmente, en forma progresiva desde este borde hacia la margen Oeste.</p> <p>El resultado de esta última condición dinámica se tradujo en un gradual adelgazamiento de la lengua distal, el que progreso desde el Este al Oeste dando lugar a que cada zona alcanzada por este efecto comenzara a flotar y a presentar desprendimientos mediante calving.</p> <p>Entre los años 1990 y 2006 el glaciar Upsala retrocedió de manera irregular con periodos en los cuales el repliegue fue menos acelerado (entre 1994 y 1996) y notablemente rápido (entre 1990 y 1994 y a partir de 1997). En el lapso de los 16 años transcurrido entre 1990 y 2006, el frente del glaciar se replegó aproximadamente 3.790 metros conservando la ensenada situada en la margen izquierda de la lengua.</p> <p><b>BIBLIOGRAFIA</b>  MALAGNINO, E. C. 2006. Evaluación de Estabilidad de pendientes y Geología Ambiental General Relacionada con los Proyectos de Represamiento sobre el Río Santa Cruz, Cóndor Clift y Barrancosa, Provincia de Santa Cruz. Gobierno de la Provincia de Santa Cruz. Inedito.  MALAGNINO, E. C., J. A. STRELIN y D. A. GAGLIARDINI, 1998. Uso de la</p>	

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter-Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
						<p>información espacial para determinar el retroceso reciente del frente del glaciar upsala, provincia de santa cruz, argentina. Jornadas Argentinas de Teleobservación. CONAE. Buenos Aires. Resumen.</p> <p>MALAGNINO, E. C., D. A. GAGLIARDINI, J. A. STRELIN, 1997. Resbalamiento basal y calving, causas convergentes en el retroceso reciente del frente del glaciar Upsala, Provincia de Santa Cruz. Argentina. International Seminar on the Use and Applications of ERS in Latin America. Resumen.</p> <p>MALAGNINO, E. C. y J. A. STRELIN, 1996. Oscilaciones del Englazamiento en el Brazo Norte del Lago Argentino y Península Herminita Desde el Holoceno hasta la Actualidad. E.C. Malagnino y J.A. Strelin. XIII Congreso Geológico Argentino, Vol IV: 289-308</p> <p>MALAGNINO, E. C., 1993. Geología de la Provincia de Santa Cruz, Argentina y Aysen y Magallanes, Republica de Chile. BHP Petroleum Argentina. Inédito.</p> <p>MALAGNINO, E. C. and J. A. STRELIN, 1992. Variations of Upsala Glacier in southern Patagonia since the late Holocene to the present. In: Glaciological Researches in Patagonia 1990, 61-88. (R. Naruse Edit). Japanese Society of Snow and Ice.</p> <p>(Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)</p>	
E-13-279	A	12	21	12	21	<p>A recent paper by Bradley et al, Threats to water supply in the Tropical Andes (Science, 23 June 2006, Vol 312, N° 5781, pp1755-1756, analyses the increase in temperature in the lower troposphere and mentions its impact on glaciers. Further, it refers to the lack of meteorological observations to test the model results.</p> <p>(Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)</p>	JCG To be considered. Sentence redrafted
E-13-280	A	12	21	12	21	<p>A paragraph highlighting the overall regional consistent patterns of observed trends should be included, indicating those areas with significant signal for different parameters (precipitation, minimum and maximum temperatur, mean temperatur, streamflow and sea level rise) in order to have a clear picture of the spatial distribution of the observed trends. Though precise information is on the table, a paragraph summarizing the observed trend would be very useful.</p> <p>(Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)</p>	GM PUT A MAP? A MAP WAS ADDED
E-13-281	A	12	22			<p>Please include the trends in temperature and other climatic variables,as well as shifts in the phase of aannual cycle identified for Colombia. Reference: (Perez et al., 1998): Pérez., C.A., G. Poveda, O. Mesa, L. F. Carvajal, and A. Ochoa, Evidences of climate change in Colombia: Trends and changes in phase and amplitude of annual and semi-annual cycles (In Spanish), Bulletin Institute Francaise d' Etudes Andines, 27 (3), 537-546, 1998. <a href="http://www.unesco.org/uy/phi/libros/enso/indice.html">http://www.unesco.org/uy/phi/libros/enso/indice.html</a>.</p> <p>(Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)</p>	GM OLD REFERENCE

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-282	A	12	23	12	23	In Table 13.2.a (firts line) the change in precipitation for the Amazonian /Southern region is -23% to +18%. It is not clear what the spread means, an increase or a decrease in precipitation. Moreover, precipitation changes in Uruguay are shown separately from precipitation changes in other regions of LA. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	GM Changes between increases and decreases. It was an error
E-13-283	A	12	23	13		In Table 13.2a: Current Climatic Trends incorporate information about trends in Colombia as following: Precipitation Colombia; Period: 1961-1990; Differentiated by regions; rate between -4% and +6% / Pabón, 2003b Mean Temperature Colombia; Period: 1961-1990; 0.1-0.2°C / Pabón, 2003b Sea Level Rise Colombia Period 1961-1990 +1 to +3 mm Pabón, 2003a THE FULL REFRENCE FOR Pabón, 2003b IS: Pabón J.D., 2003b: El cambio climático global y su manifestación en Colombia. Cuadernos de Geografía, v XII (1-2), pp. 111-119 THE FULL REFRENCE FOR Pabón, 2003a IS: Pabón J.D., 2003a: El aumento del nivel del mar en las costas y área insular de Colombia. En: El Mundo marino de Colombia investigación y desarrollo de territorios olvidados Red de Estudios del Mundo Marino – REMAR, Universidad Nacional de Colombia. (José Daniel Pabón, National University of Colombia)	GM GN ADD REFERENCE  GN- Addressed SLR Colombia ...to be added in table 13.2a Pabón 2003a. Thanks to Silvina Solman...the first data contribution...on SLR  DONE
E-13-284	A	12	23			Table 13.2: The data for the change in Maximum temperature is difficult to interpret. There appears to be inconsistencies in the trends reported for Brazil, for example. Is this a difference in methodology? In data sources? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM MARENGO ACCEPTED
E-13-285	A	12	23			In 13.2.4.1 Climate trends, table 13.2.a: Current climatic trends, the Mexican situation is not mentioned, in this particular case, there are not studies that show which are the trends? (Oralia Oropeza, Ciudad Universitaria, Mexico)	CN MARENGO Graciela: I am not familiar with the Mexican studies. What about asking <b>Carlos Gay</b> to help?
E-13-286	A	12	29			as above, specify which regions of a country. Andean countries are subject to distinct climate regimes on coast, highlands and eastern slopes, thus a decline or increase of precipitation in one area may go parallel with the opposite trend in the other area. (Stephan Halloy, Instituto de Ecología, Universidad Mayor de San Andrés)	Estos comentarios no coinciden con la version SOD, y son muy similares a los comentarios del FOD.
E-13-287	A	12		12		Table 13.2a section Precipitation, for Amazonia, Entire. What is the period? Is it the same as 1949 - 1999? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-288	A	12		12		Table 13.2.a Las line in Maximum Temperature in Argentina, Patatogina. Please add a ; between (DJF) and 0. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE
E-13-289	A	13	1	13	6	References: Chen et al, 2005; Costa et al, 2003; Miller et al, 2005; Barros et al, 2003; Smith et al, 1999; are missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN OK- to be included or deleted.
E-13-290	A	13	2	13	2	Chen et al. 2003 is not in the reference. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM OK
E-13-291	A	13	4	13	4	The Marengo and Camargo, 2005 reference has the 2006 as year in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM OK
E-13-292	A	13	5	13	15	Smith 1999 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed To be deleted
E-13-293	A	13	5	13	5	Douglas, 1995 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN
E-13-294	A	13	6	13	6	Miller et al. 2005 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN already commented by others... OK to be included or changed by a better one
E-13-295	A	13	9	13	9	In Table 13.2.b . Argentina , Malagnino , Malagnino et al, Malagnino y Strelin (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	JCG
E-13-296	A	13	9			The table on glacier retreat trends can be updated with references from the CONCORD meeting (Mendoza, Argentina, April 4-6, 2006). See we pageof the Mountain Research Initiative; <a href="http://mri.scnatweb.ch/content/category/7/44/66/">http://mri.scnatweb.ch/content/category/7/44/66/</a> (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	JCG
E-13-297	A	13		13		Continuation of Table 13.2a: The change for precipitation in Uruguay is -0.23%? Shouldn't be in the first section on precipitation? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE
E-13-298	A	14	1	15	49	Criteria about socio-economic issues when explicitly ( excluding ECLAC) announced in text are almost from foreigner's authors, Michael Walton 2004 , Evelyn Huber and Fred Solt, 2004 and in English language ( Page 14. 13.2.4.3 and Page 22., 13.3.3.2 , Page 23, rows 11-17) thus perhaps credible but not sufficient. Although this is not the main point of the chapter it would be good to provide more references from Latin American authors. I suggest that latest trends towards integration and changes in MERCOSUR and also ALCA should be mentioned related to development and socio-economic scenarios. (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG Please provide references. We believe that ECLAC provides an adequate, objetive and general overview of the region. We think that the papers of Walton and Huber and Stolt provide an external and complementary view of socioeconomic conditions in the region.
E-13-299	A	14	3		39	This section needs to be more developed. Agriculture intensification is an important trend in Latin America and deforestation is meant as clear-cut but selective logging	DC GM The document was peer – reviewed and

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						plays an important role. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	accepted.
E-13-300	A	14	3		39	Aside from the Amazon, perhaps mention here the loss of coastal mangrove forests and cloud forest ecosystems? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	AV DC AV: DONE. Added part of this text.  Rio Negro-Rio San Sun mangroves (Nicaragua then extending to the border of Coata Rica and Panama). Deforestation in the upper watershed has resulted in drainage and sedimentation problems. Also associated with these problems are the acceptable management practices used on banana plantations. The redirection of surface water flow as a result of dam construction is changing the mangrove habitat by either adding or removing the natural amount of freshwater inflow to the ecoregion. A list of other threats includes land use changes as a result of unplanned settlements, illegal hunting, development of an international port, plans for another canal between the Caribbean Sea and the Pacific Ocean, gold mining on the Nicaraguan side of the border, sewage contamination from towns, runoff of agricultural chemicals, and erosion. For lack of a unified management plan, these threats appear to vary depending on the side of the border and are more acute in Costa Rica  20% of the world's mangrove forests have disappeared since 1980 according to a new study by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO, 2006).  In parts of Central America, the rate of destruction is alarming (has lost 75% of its

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
							mangroves since the 1950s). Mangroves are cut faster than the tropical rainforest, then filled and used as new land for construction.
E-13-301	A	14	10	14	23	In figure 13.1 It´s no clear. Need References (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GM DONE
E-13-302	A	14	10	14	26	Deforestation rate is % of what? Source of data? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM <b>DC aclarar porcentaje de que</b> <b>OK</b>
E-13-303	A	14	24			Figure 13.1 the first y axis refers to a "rate" (e.g., unit/unit of time) the second axis is not a rate but rather a total amount -- unless the percentage is in terms of annual loss. % deforestation appears to refer to total loss. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM DONE
E-13-304	A	14	29		31	Illegal crops in Colombia (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-305	A	14	32	14	36	References: FAO, 2005; Kaimowitz, 2004; INPE-MMA, 2006; are missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-306	A	14	34			Again, the term rate is used here in a way that confuses the reader. The data is not presented in terms of rates of deforestation. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC CN In fact, the data is presented as area deforested/time (year). That is a temporal rate of deforestation.
E-13-307	A	14	36			Delete "up to date" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	DC CN ACCEPTED
E-13-308	A	14	39	14	39	After Amazonia, replace a coma in the place of the dot and add “ and neighboring countries, with the related health implications ( see “Areview of factors affecting the human health impacts of air pollutants from forest fires, Malilay J.- Health Guidelines for Vegetation Fire Events, Lima, Peru, October 1988.: Also Scientific Studies on Health Effects of Woodsmoke and Particular Matter Air Pollution, 2004) (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC CN ARM DONE The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-309	A	14	39			Reference is needed to support the statement. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	CN Accepted.. <b>Andreae et al., 2004. Science.</b>
E-13-310	A	14	41		48	This section could be strengthened by moving the discussion of biodiversity trends from page 8 22-27. Another characteristic of Latin American traditional agriculture is the high agrobiodiversity often found in smallholder plots, particularly in agroforestry systems such as coffee. These systems are threatened by changes in	DC GM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						agriculture and economic policy giving preference to larger-scale commercial production. Also the importance of migratory birds in Latin America -- the Smithsonian Institute Migratory Bird Program may have some information on trends in the habitat and migration patterns of birds, and perhaps some evidence of changes in migration patterns has already been reported. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	
E-13-311	A	14	42	14	43	Observed environmental trends are being described and summarized in this subsection, then, future projections should not be mentioned at this point. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	DC
E-13-312	A	14	42	14	42	It would be better to stress the disastrous effects of deforestation. This is, no doubt a change in land use; however, it is a very drastic one regarding landscape fragmentation and habitat loss for many species, not only amphibians and birds. In this respect, it would be better to say "landscape fragmentation" or "ecosystem fragmentation", instead of "biodiversity fragmentation" (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC
E-13-313	A	14	43	14	43	IUCN, 2000; should be IUCN, 2001? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-314	A	14	44	14	44	IUCN, 2001; should be IUCN, 2004? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-315	A	14	47	14	47	GEO3; is GEO 3, 2003? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-316	A	14	50	15	10	Here again, a reference to the CO2 increasing sea water acidification would be necessary. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	AV AV please see previous response to this point
E-13-317	A	14	51	15	10	Useful information but paragraph requires careful editing. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	AV <b>AV: I appreciate very much if somebody from Chapter 13<sup>th</sup> help me to improve the English of this paragraph</b>  <i>Deforestation threatens the cradle of reef diversity WWF, 2004.</i> As understanding of how tropical coastal ecosystems are functionally linked grows, conservation efforts will increasingly aim to protect corridors containing mangroves, seagrass beds, and coral reefs. Data shows time and again how networks of marine

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
							protected areas, including these three habitats, boost fish abundance on reefs, benefit local fishing communities, and contribute to sustainable livelihoods. A study on the Mesoamerican reef has revealed that there are as many as 25 times more fish of some species on reefs close to mangrove areas than in areas where mangroves have been cut down.
E-13-318	A	15	6			transporting (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	AV DONE
E-13-319	A	15	12	15	49	Are we dealing with socio.economic issues in isolation. It would be good to show some interlinkages / inter-connections to make evident how these factors are influenced / affected by climate change. For the above mentioned reason, the paragraph in lines 31 to 35 seems more a policy statement than one of a climate change one which, either as an action or a feedback, is related to such socio-economic questions. Please clarify the issue as well as the integrated sense of this whole sub-section. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CG  This section’s objective is to give the LA socioeconomic context in which climate change and policy making are taking place. Please provide some references on the observed climate change-economy relationship in LA. It has been added: The effects of climate change on national economies and official development assistance have not been considered in most vulnerability assessments. The impact of climate change in Latin America’s productive sectors is estimated to be of a 1.3% reduction of the region’s GDP for a change of 2C in global temperature (Mendelsohn et al., 2000). If no structural changes in economic policy are made to promote investment, employment and productivity, economic and social future scenarios for the region do not hold the economic growth needed for its development,. unless a uncommon combination of external positive shocks occur (Escaith, 2003).



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-320	A	15	12	15	49	A well written section presenting useful information (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	Thanks
E-13-321	A	15	14	15	35	From 1950 to the end of the 1970's LA benefited from a GDP growth of an average of 5% annual (ECLAC, 2003), based on the Import Substitution Model. However, this model was not capable to develop a competitive industrial sector and had negative consequences for other sectors, particularly agriculture. In the 1980's the region faced the 'great' debt crisis forcing countries to make efforts to implement rigorous macroeconomic measures regarding public finances and to liberate the economies. Inflation control and public deficit became the main targets for most governments. Deterioration of economic and social conditions among the population, increasing unemployment and the expansion of the informal economy and poverty characterized this decade.(ECLAC, 2005; Huber and Solt, 2004) (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-322	A	15	14	15	35	Delete (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG It would fail to provide the region's socioeconomic context
E-13-323	A	15	14		49	This section is much improved from the previous version and reads very well. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CG Thanks
E-13-324	A	15	15	15	15	ECLAC, 2003 is missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG Escaith, Hubert, Tendencias y extrapolación del crecimiento en América Latina y el Caribe. (2003). NU. CEPAL. División de Estadística y Proyecciones Económicas.
E-13-325	A	15	23	15	29	1. Specific comment. On this paragraph the authors discussed the problem of the regional external debt in the 80's. Would be good to add some information from GEO LA and C. 2003 (page 33) "the external debt for the region amount at the end of 2001 US\$ 726.00 millions (CEPAL 2001), and the payment of the their services amount 45 % of the regional good and services exportation (FMI 2001) " currently the external debt persist as a pressure against the economy of the region. (Avelino G. Suarez Rodriguez, Ecology and Systematic- Cuban Environmental Agency)	CG Please provide full references
E-13-326	A	15	23	15	23	"The lost decade" CEPAL. (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG Please provide full references
E-13-327	A	15	29	15	29	ECLAC, 2005 is missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG Solimano, Andrés and Raimundo Soto.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
							Economic growth in Latin America in the late 20th century: Evidence and interpretation. February 2005, Macroeconomía del Desarrollo (series) No. 33, 44pp. ECLAC.
E-13-328	A	15	31	15	35	Controversial please provide references and countries..... (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG Huber and Solt, 2004
E-13-329	A	15	31	25	33	Specific comment. Here the citation lacks to support the assessment and counter balance the Huber and Solt, 2004 citation at the end of the paragraph. I am not sure that the process of liberalization of the economies in the LA attained a "greater economic growth". On page 22 line 44, Huber and Solt (2004) stated that during the liberalization process there was a lack of economic growth. On page 22, the authors cited analysts of the World Bank (2006) "that the per capita income GDP for LA has had very low growth, about 1.3 % average during 1999 to 2000 period, but for the future (2006 -2015) would rise... I think there is a contradiction and probably Huber and Solt (2004) were correct. (Avelino G. Suarez Rodriguez, Ecology and Systematic- Cuban Environmental Agency)	CG "more liberalized economies attained greater economic growth <b>than</b> less liberalized economies" The interpretation of economic liberization, and therefore the possible forecasts, are contradictory. There is no clear consensus and therefore both views are included.
E-13-330	A	15	34	15	35	" recurrent crises, poverty and increasing inequality. The governments have failed to create strong social safety nets to ameliorate the deterioration in the social conditions ....." (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-331	A	15	37		39	Illustrate this point through the Gini Index of some countries (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG Due to space restrictions, a more general overview was adopted.
E-13-332	A	15	39	15	39	World Bank, 2004 is missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG Ferroni, Marco Social Cohesion in Latin America: The Public Finance Dimension Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) <a href="http://www.inwent.org/imperia/md/content/bereich1-intranet/efinternet/lateinamerika/ferroni_engl.pdf">www.inwent.org/imperia/md/content/bereich1-intranet/efinternet/lateinamerika/ferroni_engl.pdf</a>
E-13-333	A	15	40			services, justice, and credit access affects development possibilities, reducing investment and extending poverty. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter-Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
E-13-334	A	15	41	15	45	What is the time frame for these GDP predictions? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG 2015
E-13-335	A	15	41	15	41	Reference should be CEPAL (2002) (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-336	A	16	3	16	3	The topic of weather and climate forecast gets lost a bit in the text, also references must be stronger to keep the text as it is. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN
E-13-337	A	16	3	16	3	Suggest change the heading to "weather and climate variability forecast" (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM DONE
E-13-338	A	16	3	17	7	It is unclear in this section how much forecasts are actually being used in decision-making or whether much of the expected utility is still unrealized. Some of the literature cited in the discussion on agricultural use refers to academic exercises on potential utility, not actual documented use. It might be helpful here to focus on those cases where forecasting systems have been successfully integrated into decision-making and emphasize the attributes that have made these cases work well. The potential expansion of forecast and earlywarning systems might also be presented with the challenges to making these systems work -- e.g., availability of climate data and monitoring, the decline in public investment in agricultural research and extension, the dicotomy between large and smallholder farm systems, the need to understand other climate drivers (e.g., the monsoon, the canícula etc). (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM S Current use of climate forecast was added  This was added as a constrain
E-13-339	A	16	3	17	7	very interesting but needs improvement. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-340	A	16	4	16	14	References need firming up (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-341	A	16	4	16	4	IRI is not in the Reference list (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN GM ACCEPTED
E-13-342	A	16	4	16	32	Are all about El Niño? Some explanation on how these forecasting systems work , and how succesful they are, and what the lead times are would be very helpful. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN ALL ACCEPTED
E-13-343	A	16	8	16	8	....., .....lack the ability to correctly predict the onset of some El Niño and La Niña..... (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-344	A	16	8			to corrctly predict the onset... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-345	A	16	9	16	14	This is not a sentence. Please edit. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	CN ACCEPTED

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-13-346	A	16	9		14	Include "to malaria control and hydropower generation in Colombia" (Poveda et al. 2003). (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ARM JCG DONE
E-13-347	A	16	10	16	10	Complete de reference Lagos,??? (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-348	A	16	10			...;for subsistence... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-349	A	16	11	16	11	Complete de reference Funceme,??? (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-350	A	16	11			...;for the prevention of.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN Text was rewritten.
E-13-351	A	16	12			...; streamflow prediction.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN Text was rewritten.
E-13-352	A	16	13	16	14	Tucci et al, 2004; Suares-Sanchez, 2004; severov et al, 2004; IRI, 200? Are missing in Refrences. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-353	A	16	13			...; for fisheries in.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN Text was rewritten.
E-13-354	A	16	14	16	32	Numbers presented as avoided damages seem that are estimated from other studies not actual avoided damages. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM A paragraph was added with this information
E-13-355	A	16	14	16	14	Complete de reference IRI,200? (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	ARM JUAN CARLOS GIMENEZ
E-13-356	A	16	16	16	32	You say these yield savings could be achieved but don't really provide evidence of what actually is achieved. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM A paragraph was added with this information
E-13-357	A	16	16	16	32	Maybe add some information on the potential of use ENSO-based climate forecast to plan a fire prevention system for regions with planted or native forests and crops productions (see system implemented by INPE in Brazil; see also Nepstad et al. Global Change Biology (2004) 10: 1–14). (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	GM OK
E-13-358	A	16	24	16	25	I think it is impossible to change crops (from maize to oats): because maize is a summer crop and oat is a winter crop (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	GM <b>Yes, It is posible because it is a change in the crop, and not a substitution.</b>
E-13-359	A	16	24	16	24	After the bracket read "from", no form (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GM DONE
E-13-	A	16	25	16	25	Please change form for from	GM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter-Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
360						(Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DONE
E-13-361	A	16	26			Begin a new sentence after "...event(Conde and Eakin, 2003)" (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM DONE
E-13-362	A	16	29			References needed (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-363	A	16	34	16	36	supporting references needed. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM? DONE
E-13-364	A	16	34	16	34	Referring to "weather forecats increase..." means increase or improve? (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-365	A	16	34	16	34	Please change whether for weather. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE
E-13-366	A	16	34	16	50	Not clear what kind of weather forecast are being talked about here. What are the lead times? What variables are being predicted? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-367	A	16	34	16	41	It would be opportune to re-draft this whole paragraph taking into account that from planning to full implementation Hydrometeorological Monitoring and Watching Systems, aiming at early warning and risk advices, looks very good on paper, but rather foggy when looking for their effective implementation. This situation is reflected in the many flaws registered even with minor events, like the flooding under moderate precipitation events, or, as it happened in the City of Santa Fe, in 2003, when a large portion of the city, practically all the slums areas, located in the margins of the Salado River, in an flooding event, which progression was observed from satellite images. However, there was no early warning nor risk advisories neither effective reaction from the corresponding authorities, during the previous phase, during the flood and after it. All this happened with a formal national system (SIFEM- Sistema Federal de Emergencias (Federal Emergency System) and a Hydrological Forecast Unit, located in the same City. The lost of more than 59 lives, the losses in cattle and crops and the pot-inundation adverse health effects, shows that words are no facts. Although reiterative, our preoccupation should rest with the different shortcomings we have to face in developing regions, basically, the lack of sufficiently dense observation networks with monitoring capacities, the poor communication systems, the excessively slow reaction from the authorities and the people affected because of defective instruction and education standards and, worse of all, the tendency to express that all is under control when only conjuncture measures are adopted during each critical event and, a few days after the event, left aside, without evaluating the associated risks. If USA-FEMA, failed during Wilma and Katrina events, we must investigate the reliability of "virtually existing"	JCG S

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						systems before reporting any progress, very particularly under the potential effects of heavy storms, tornados and other extreme events, exacerbating and expanding, under the Earth 's warming (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-368	A	16	34			Change 'whether' to 'weather' (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM DONE
E-13-369	A	16	38	16	41	Ministerio de Medio ambiente Colombia, 2002; Magaña and Vasquez, 2005; Comunidad Andina, 2004; Magaña, 2004; are missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-370	A	16	41	16	41	IRDB? (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	ARM WORLD BANK
E-13-371	A	16	43		50	The growth of the disaster prevention community in Latin America is impressive and this illustrates a capacity for regional collaboration, information dissemination and science-policy integration. Perhaps these disaster management networks could serve as a model for enhancing capacity to address other threats from climate change (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-372	A	16	47	16	50	CIFEN 2005; CPPS, 2005; ITDG, 2005; are missing cites. Andreson, cited.....; is incomplete (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG ARM DONE
E-13-373	A	17	1	17	7	These don't look like a forecasting system. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL TIENE RAZON
E-13-374	A	17	4	17	4	INE, 2006 is not in the references (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ALL
E-13-375	A	17	4	17	4	INE, 2006 is missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ALL
E-13-376	A	17	9	17	31	Regarding this whole section, it would be opportune to report that, in opposition to te apparent positive actions in defense of the natural ecosystem, the expansion of agricultural frontiers to crop more grains, in particular soy bean is seriously affecting the natural ecosystems, the fresh water resources, etc. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC GM ACCEPTED
E-13-377	A	17	9	17	31	Need to state that these adaptation strategies for natural ecosystems are also an adaptation to present day climate change and variability, and why this is true. Otherwise why have this sentence? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-378	A	17	12	17	12	Please change extinctions for extinction (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter-Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
E-13-379	A	17	13	11	13	What does it mean “A significant number of such corridor, etc”, please check and give confirmed figures. Being convinced, for the above mentioned reasons and because of more than 30 years experience in the region, I consider that we may be misleading decision makers and, which is more preoccupying, potential external assistance programmes, aiming to assist Latin American countries to undertake the necessary adaptation measures will give up their intentions, even knowing that such descriptions are false. This comment is made without negating some really valuable and effective steps undertaken by some countries, in certain regions of their territories, as it is observed, for instance, in Brazil and Central America.. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC ALL The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-380	A	17	15	17	15	CBD, 2003; is missing (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-381	A	17	20	17	20	Santilli et al, is 2004 or 2005? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-382	A	17	29			In Brazil "ProAmbiente" is an environmental credit program from.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-383	A	17	31	17	31	MMA, 2004 is missing (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-384	A	17	31			Propose addition as following: after ".their forest (MMA, 2004)." include: Another initiative to implement adaptation measures in high mountain regions have been developoing in Colombia and other andean countires (Vergara, 2005) THE FULL REFERENCE FOR Vergara 2005 IS: Vergara W., 2005: Adapting to climate chnage.Lessons Learned, Work in Progress, and Proposed Next Steps for the World Bank in Latin America. Sustainable Development Working Paper No.25. World Bank. Washington. (José Daniel Pabón, National University of Colombia)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-385	A	17	35	17	50	Could mention the new initiatives involving Brazilian soy producers (in Mato Grosso State) and their good practices in favor of environment and water conservation (see < <a href="http://www.aspeninstitute.org/atf/cf/%7BDEB6F227-659B-4EC8-8F84-8DF23CA704F5%7D/GOVERNINGTHEFORESTS.PDF">http://www.aspeninstitute.org/atf/cf/%7BDEB6F227-659B-4EC8-8F84-8DF23CA704F5%7D/GOVERNINGTHEFORESTS.PDF</a> > and Nepstad et al Globalization of the Amazon Soy and Beef Industries: Opportunities for Conservation. in press Conservation Biology). (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	GM +R

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

<b>Chapter- Comment</b>	<b>Batch</b>	<b>From Page</b>	<b>From Line</b>	<b>To Page</b>	<b>To line</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Notes of the writing team</b>
E-13-386	A	17	35		50	Irrigation is mentioned as a possible adaptation strategy but the negative impacts of this practice should be also taken in to account. See, for example, page 25, lines 2 to7 and line 20 (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	GM It is for future conditions, and it is mentioned in section 13.4.2 and 13.4.3



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-387	A	17	35		50	Economic diversification in rural areas has long been a strategy for managing risk (both climatic & market) and has increased in recent years. While not a direct adaptation to climatic change, this diversification is diminishing the dependence of farmers on agricultural income and enabling greater flexibility in managing environmental change (Eakin 2005 world development; de Janvry & Sadoulet world development, Nigh 1997...). Some adaptations at level of farm household may increase overall sensitivity to climatic risk -- for example, irrigation does not liberate farm systems from climatic sensitivity but rather enhances their dependence on auxiliary water for maintaining their production systems -- this can make them more susceptible economically to sudden shocks in water availability. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM +R IRRIGATION  There are not sufficient references for this statement.
E-13-388	A	17	35		50	An additional point: Perhaps mention should be made of the increased attention to private sector insurance schemes -- these are being promoted by development agencies in many Latin American countries, including Mexico, as part of a private-sector / public-sector collaboration to reduce the cost of agricultural losses and to encourage farm-level risk management (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM DONE
E-13-389	A	17	45	17	47	reference needed. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM DONE
E-13-390	A	17	48	17	48	I suggest not to include irrigation as an actual adaptation strategy. It is mentioned as a possible one but less than 5% of the farmers are actually using irrigation. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM <b>Not applicable. That's not true in several regions</b>
E-13-391	A	17	50			...to cope with climatic hazards, however increasingly costly particularly for smaller farmers (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM DONE
E-13-392	A	18	1	18	13	Are these adaptations to climate change/variability? Need to justify inclusion of this material. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	AV AV: These type of projects, programs and legal frames were established prior to considering CC, but at this time represents a very good measurement to coupling with CC. All of them represent adaptation strategies for natural ecosystems and also an adaptation to present day climate change and variability. Except Uruguay (was eliminated from text), all countries cited like an examples have specific forestry laws with much more restrictions to manage their forest. The later no means that these laws are enforced plenty, but almost represents some limitations to many problems associated with deforestation and fires and more recently

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

							those related with indigenous territories which now are more protected by specific laws (Venezuela and Bolivia, for example).
E-13-393	A	18	4	18	4	Bolfor, 1998 and Tomaselli 2001 are not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	AV AV Tomaselli included
E-13-394	A	18	4	18	4	BOLFOR et al, 1998; Tomaselli, 2001; are missing in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	AV AV Tomaselli included
E-13-395	A	18	15	18	41	Being floods, mudflows, huacos, and other hydrometeorological critical events, only conjuncturely treated in x some countries in this region, in addition to the first sentence in this sub-section, this situation needs to have an expression here. Further, the word current should be replaced to say the “poorly implemented adaptation of socioeconomic systems, etc. It would be also useful to inform decision making on the innovative measures to improve the fresh water use, like it is the case of introducing the concepts of irrigation efficiency and water productivity (Postel S and A. Vickers: Boosting Water Productivity, in The Worldwatch Institute, State of the World 2004, and FAO: Crops and Drops, Rome 2002, section on a study for the Mediterranean region) In line 36, it would be better to say: The plan aims to supply drinking water in arid, drought-prone regions, to one million etc.. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Accepted Sentence redrafted
E-13-396	A	18	17		41	In Hermosillo, Mexico stakeholder consultation on adaptation to climate change in the water sector resulted in recommendations for water conservation in residential settings, the capture of rainwater in peri-urban areas and improved housing design to enhance energy conservation. A report of this project is available from V. Magaña or J. Martínez in INE, SEMARNAT. An article describing the participatory exercise will be published this year in MITI. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Not accepted. Lack of formal references
E-13-397	A	18	23	18	27	This odd, because the authors begin by saying that natural systems can adapt, but then they give an example from the rural economy, and not a natural system. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG Accepted Sentence redrafted
E-13-398	A	18	23	18	27	Start by saying natural systems can adapta, but hen give an example fro the rural economy. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG Accepted Sentence redrafted
E-13-399	A	18	27	18	27	Pejerrey (odontessthes bonareriensis): The correct is (Odontessthes bonareriensis) (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	JCG Done
E-13-400	A	18	27	18	27	Odontesthes bonariensis should be written in italics (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-	A	18	27	18	27	"Odontesthes bonaerensis must be in italic"	JCG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

401						(Susana Isabel Curto, Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Cientificas y Tecnologicas (CONICET))	Done
E-13-402	A	18	34	18	34	What does ASA stand for? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG
E-13-403	A	18	41	18	41	Please change Bazan for Basan, as in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Done
E-13-404	A	18	45	19	2	This section is a bit weak. It would be stronger with some specific examples of coastal management programs that have been designed to address climatic or SLR risks. The trends of concern that have been mentioned previously relate to losses in the coral reef system, urban development on the coast, frequency of coastal storms... is there evidence of change in urban planning in coastal areas? new hurricane early warning or prevention programs? change in infrastructure design? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN AV Not too much to say...new Adaptation implementation is still poor in LA. AV: (CEDERA; 2003) In Belize and Guyana: early warning systems and better forecasting; land-use planning and zoning; adjusted building codes; better disaster mitigation strategies (including floodplain and other hazard mapping); inventories of resources (such as water); the use of water-saving devices and watershed management; the inclusion of traditional knowledge, especially in agriculture; and the integration of climate change considerations into the day-to-day management of all sectors.  (GEF, 2003) In Belize and Guyana: Strengthen norms for infrastructure Development Revamp land use planning, coastal zone management  Most fishing countries in the region have regulations governing access to their main fishing grounds, and several countries have legislation to control illegal open sea fishing. A number of agreements have also been signed by specific countries at regional level (Ecuador in these smaller areas) on matters such as protecting the marine environment, prevention of pollution from marine or terrestrial sources, and the management of commercial fisheries. Mechanisms tere now used to regulate access include the issue of licences (limiting, for example, the total

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						<p>number of vessels or of fishermen), the declaration of closed seasons, and the control of inputs (such as limiting engine size) Guyana, Peru, Argentina and Chile. Other GEF projects in LA related with CC:</p> <p>Chile Sustainable Transport and Air Quality for Santiago World Bank 14.77 MUS\$          Costa Rica National Off-grid Electrification Programme Based on Renewable Energy Sources, Phase I UNDP 2.05MUS\$          Mexico Action Plan for Removing Barriers to the Full-scale Implementation of Wind Power UNDP 11.81MUS\$          Mexico Large-scale Renewable Energy Development Project World Bank 272.85MUS\$          Nicaragua Off-grid Rural Electrification for Development (PERZA) UNDP/World Bank 35.67MUS\$          Peru Lima Urban Transport World Bank 134.28MUS\$          Uruguay Energy Efficiency Project World Bank 81.34MUS\$</p>	
E-13-405	A	19	2		<p>To add after "Venezuela (MARN,2005)" el texto: ..y Colombia (INVEMAR, 2005) THE FULL REFERENCE FOR INVEMAR, 2005 IS: INVEMAR, 2005: Building capacity for improve adaptability to sea level rise in two vulnerable points (Tumaco-Pacific coast and Cartagena-Caribbean coast) with special emphasis on human populations under poverty conditions, in the Colombian coastal areas -NAL II. Web page <a href="http://www.invemar.org.co">http://www.invemar.org.co</a> (José Daniel Pabón, National University of Colombia)</p>	<p>GN AV Addressed citation INVEMAR 2005 DONE</p>	
E-13-406	A	19	6	19	25	<p>Some of the current adaptation in human health mentioned in this subsection are those related to climate change, but this section should be focused on current adaptation strategies in response to extreme climatic events. I suggest to avoid referring to projected climate change at this stage, instead, refer to extreme climatic events that triggered the adaptative practices described. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)</p>	<p>ARM ACCEPTED</p>
E-13-407	A	19	6	19	33	<p>Reading this sub-section it seems that there is no need for any further vulnerability and adaptation study. However, the examples given do not embrace all health</p>	<p>ARM S ACCEPTED</p>

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						problems in the different countries Some cross-reference with other sections / sub-sections would provide information to be considered by decision making to tackle public health problems. The general statement backed by the PAHO is good; however, the examples with cases in three countries – Bolivia, Colombia and Peru looks insufficient. In line 6, write “may” in the place of “can” In lines 30 and 31, it is suggested to insert, after “risk” the word “warning” Some other regional diseases, like the trypanosomiasis americana or chagas disease, affecting a more than 20 million people should be mentioned. A recent work., studying the Chagas disease in children (Seroprevalencia de la enfermedad de Chagas en 17 parajes del Monte Impenetrable, de la Provincia del Chaco, By Biancardi M.A et Al, Revista Medicina, Buenos Aires April 2003, indicates the importance given to this endemic disease. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	THE TERM IS RISK COMMUNICATION NOT RISK WARNING
E-13-408	A	19	6			not sure I agree (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DELETED
E-13-409	A	19	6		33	Could one say that there is a generalized concern about this issue in Latin America or these are isolated initiatives? (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	ARM ISOLATED INITIATIVES
E-13-410	A	19	7	19	16	Delete - not appropriate for a chapter on regional climate change. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM NOT ACCEPTED
E-13-411	A	19	8	19	8	PAHO, 2002 is missing reference (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-412	A	19	8	19	8	Ministry of Sustainable Development and Environment 2000 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-413	A	19	16	19	16	Ministry of Sustainable....., 2000; should it be Bolivia, 2000? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-414	A	19	18	19	25	Interesting and worth giving more detail - why not tell us when it will start/what has been achieved to date, how it is funded? Does the programme explicitly link to climate change? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-415	A	19	21	19	21	Delete "worldwide" (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-416	A	19	25	19	25	Colombian Ministry....., 2001; should it be Colombia, 2001? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-417	A	19	27	19	33	Unless more detail is provided, these examples are just too vague and generalized. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-418	A	19	40	20	29	This sub-section calls for some complementary information as well as for the necessary redrafting. Regarding socio-economic scenarios, the important developments reported by the TIGNES (Task Group on New Emission Scenarios) making clear the convenience to notice that FAO, WB, MEA and other groups have their scenarios other than the SERS ones, suggest the convenience to say, after SRES, in line 43, “ is the adopted	CN ACCEPTED

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						method for the AR4 assessment. Further, decision makers shall also learn on the important work undertaken by the IPCC-TGCI, developing impact models in various sector of natural and human activities, with the participation of experts from different regions, including LAs. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-419	A	19	40	21	20	A well written section. Information presented is upto date and relevant. A few typo errors noted. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	OK
E-13-420	A	19	42	19	48	IPCC TAR, 2001; IPCC, 2000; are not listed in References. Chapter 11, WGI should have a cite in the text and in References. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN It is already cited in the text..
E-13-421	A	19	42	20	29	The sections Climate change scenarios and Changes in the occurrence of extremes were improved in comparison to the former version of the document. The issue of downscaling GCMs was well addressed. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	CN OK
E-13-422	A	19	42	20	29	Authors need to look at chapter 2 to see if they could save space by cross referencing. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN We did that and there is not much way to save space.
E-13-423	A	19	45			I thought GCM refers to General Circulation Model, not global climate model... (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN In this context, it is Global Climate Models.
E-13-424	A	19	47	19	47	Please, include IPCC, 200 in the list of reference. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-425	A	20	1	20	3	Give source. Do these relate properly to tables in chapter 2? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Accepted. The projections were based on the tables provided to us.
E-13-426	A	20	2	20	2	Ruosteenoja et al. 2003 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-427	A	20	11			Uncertainty? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN YES
E-13-428	A	20	21	20	29	There are tow main strategies or methodologies to downscale global climate scenarios. Statistical techniques and dynamical approaches, Statistical techniques have been developed in many studies over several regions in LA and projections of climate change at regional or local scale were generated. Nevertheless, the most robust methodology to produce high resolution scenarios of climate change is the dynamic methodology, which consist in performing simulations with a regional climate model driven by a global climate model. The authors may refer to WGI (Regional climate chapter) to improve the description of the state-of-art tools used to generate regional scenarios of climate change. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-429	A	20	21	20	29	<del>There are tow main strategies or methodologies to downscale global climate scenarios. Statistical techniques and dynamical approaches, Statistical techniques have been developed in many studies over several regions in LA and projections of</del>	

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						climate change at regional or local scale were generated. Nevertheless, the most robust methodology to produce high resolution scenarios of climate change is the dynamic methodology, which consist in performing simulations with a regional climate model driven by a global climate model. The authors may refer to WGI (Regional climate chapter) to improve the description of the state of art tools used to generate regional scenarios of climate change. (Silvina Solman, CONICET – UBA)	
E-13-430	A	20	25	20	25	Solman et al. 2005a is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN
E-13-431	A	20	25	20	26	Solman et al, 2005a, 2005b; Nuñez et al, 2005; eslava and Pabon, 2001; Conde, 2003; Morales, 2002; are not listed in References. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN
E-13-432	A	20	25	20	25	Nuñez, 2005 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN
E-13-433	A	20	26			To add after "...for Colombia (Eslava and Pabón, 2001)" citation Pabón et al, 2001 : The text could be: "...for Colombia (Eslava and Pabón, 2001; Pabón et al, 2001), ..." THE FULL REFERENCE FOR Pabón et al., 2001 IS: Pabón J.D., Cárdenas I., Kholostyakov R., Calderón A.F., Bernal N., Ruiz F., 2001: Escenarios climáticos para el siglo XXI sobre el territorio colombiano. Nota Técnica Interna del Instituto de Hidrología, Meteorología y Estudios Ambientales (IDEAM), Bogotá, D.C., Colombia. (José Daniel Pabón, National University of Colombia)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-434	A	20	26			Eslava and Pabón, 2001 not appears in the list of references at the end of the Chapter. THE FULL REFERENCE IS: Eslava J.A., Pabón J.D., 2001: Proyecto "Proyecciones climáticas e impactos socioeconómicos del cambio climático en Colombia". Meteorología Colombiana, N° 3, pp. 1-8. (José Daniel Pabón, National University of Colombia)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-435	A	20	26			(Conde et al? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-436	A	20	31	21	19	Strong references to the WGI, not with a clear conclusion though. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN That is the state of the art.
E-13-437	A	20	33	20	33	After "extreme" insert "events" (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-438	A	20	34	20	36	Implies that because trends in extremes exist at present, they are likely to continue into the future. This isn't necessarily true. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN That is not what is said. It refers to future trends. In fact, it has been difficult to document consistent trends in extreme events in the present for Latin America.
E-13-439	A	20	35	20	35	After "windstorms" insert "tornados", a meteorological event becoming more frequent and intense in extra-tropical latitudes, in South America. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CN ACCEPTED

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-440	A	20				Table 13-3. I think that the change in precipitation for 2080 for Central America, wet season, should be -30 to +5 instead of 30 as it is written (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-441	A	21	1	21	1	Barros et al (2005) (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	CN <b>Which Barros et al. 2005?</b>
E-13-442	A	21	1		7	Poveda et al. (2001b) found positive trends in the upper quantiles of extreme precipitation events in Colombia, and negative trends in the lower quantiles of river discharges records. Those results indicate the probability of more intense and frequent extreme events as a consequence of more frequent El Niño and La Niña events, but also as a possible consequence of global and local climate change. Complete Reference: Poveda, G. C. C. Rave and R. Mantilla, Tendencias en la Distribución de Probabilidades de lluvias y caudales en Antioquia (Colombia), Meteorología Colombiana, No. 3, pp. 53-60, March 2001. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN
E-13-443	A	21	5	21	10	The section is devoted to future trends in extreme events, but current observed trends are being described. Moreover, the authors mention the lack of long-term records of daily data as the main problem. This paragraph should be moved to the section where observed trends are presented. Nevertheless, as the authors mentioned, little research is available on projected changes in extremes over the region. Moreover, a short discussion about the reliability of projected changes in extremes should be included in this subsection. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-444	A	21	5	21	10	<del>The section is devoted to future trends in extreme events, but current observed trends are being described. Moreover, the authors mention the lack of long term records of daily data as the main problem. This paragraph should be moved to the section where observed trends are presented. Nevertheless, as the authors mentioned, little research is available on projected changes in extremes over the region. Moreover, a short discussion about the reliability of projected changes in extremes should be included in this subsection. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)</del>	
E-13-445	A	21	12	21	15	The sentence .... " Some limited studies .....under the A1B scenario." is not clear (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-446	A	21	12	21	15	considere revising the sentence... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-447	A	21	13	21	15	The sentence beggining with "Some limited studies ... scenario" is not clear or incomplete. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-448	A	21	13	21	15	<del>The sentence beggining with "Some limited studies ... scenario" is not clear or incomplete. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)</del>	
E-13-	A	21	15	21	16	The sentence " .....Essentially.....by the end of the century. " is also not	CN



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

449						clear (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	
E-13-450	A	21	16	21	17	In the following sentence, I will erase the word time to make the sentence clear. ... "In Central America, the projected time mean precipitation.....in all seasons." (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN ACCEPTED
E-13-451	A	21	18	21	19	This last sentence " All models... LA region" is not related to projections on extremes. This can be moved to subsection 13.3.1.1 (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	CN Sentence deleted.
E-13-452	A	21	18	21	19	<del>This last sentence " All models... LA region" is not related to projections on extremes. This can be moved to subsection 13.3.1.1 (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)</del>	
E-13-453	A	21	18	21	19	Delete sentence beginning " All models ...." this isn't about extremes. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Sentence deleted.
E-13-454	A	21	18	21	19	Clarify the meaning of the sentence in these two lines. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CN Sentence deleted.
E-13-455	A	21	22	21	49	Should this type of statement be maintained, in spite of their errors, this sub-section needs coordination and convergence, with previous information regarding the progress which is reported on a number of actions to improve the defense of the ecosystems, the planning of ecological corridors, etc. The remarkable expansion of the agricultural frontiers, as well as the projected future expansion in the second decade of this century would bring doubts about the effective implementation of the previously mentioned planning to protect the environmental conditions in this region (see previous comments). (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC S
E-13-456	A	21	24	21	26	Change the end of this sentence, for example, to: " Deforestation in LA tropical areas.....social problems contributing to climate change." (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-457	A	21	30			69% and 62% are percentages of what? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-458	A	21	32			If the 2002-2003 deforestation rate.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-459	A	21	35	21	35	Replace Santilli et al. 2004 by Moutinho and Schwartzman 2005. (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-460	A	21	39	21	40	...trend, agriculture expansion will eliminate....., besides the loss of more than 40% of 164 mammalian species habitats (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-461	A	21	46	21	48	it would be useful earlier in the chapter to have a table explaining terms such as Chaco, Cerrado, Chiquilaño, etc. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC ALL S The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-462	A	21	48		49	This last sentence is repetitive. There is an additional concern with the expansion of soy -- it is generally one variety of soy that is being planted and not only will replace diverse ecosystems but will also increase the susceptibility of the agricultural sectors to climatic shocks and new crop pests. This expansion is an additional example of the trend towards more monoculture systems on large scales, potentially replacing the agrobiodiversity of LA's smallholder systems (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC The document was peer – reviewed and accepted.
E-13-463	A	22	1	22	51	Criteria about socio-economic issues when explicitly ( excluding ECLAC) announced in text are almost from foreigner’s authors, Michael Walton 2004 , Evelyn Huber and Fred Solt, 2004 and in English language ( Page 14. 13.2.4.3 and Page 22., 13.3.3.2 , Page 23, rows 11-17) thus perhaps credible but not sufficient. Although this is not the main point of the chapter it would be good to provide more references from Latin American authors. I suggest that latest trends towards integration and changes in MERCOSUR and also ALCA should be mentioned related to development and socio-economic scenarios (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG Please provide references. We believe that ECLAC provides an adequate, objetive and general overview of the region. We think that the papers of Walton and Huber and Stolt provide an external and complementary view of socioeconomic conditions in the region.
E-13-464	A	22	3		33	perhaps mention here the implications of demographic patterns for future consumption of natural resources and demand for food and fuel-- and the challenge for LA governments to address the growing inequality in regional wealth and access to productive resources (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	
E-13-465	A	22	5		5	is expected TO be 50% (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG OK
E-13-466	A	22	6		6	a value of 0.89% (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG OK
E-13-467	A	22	7		7	smaller than 1.9% (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG OK
E-13-468	A	22	8			80% of what? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG 80% of the population will be urban. It has been added
E-13-469	A	22	16	22	17	....."This will increase pressures on the social security systems in the region and enlarge the amount of the contributions that the population in working age will have to make....." (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-470	A	22	19	22	20	Is mortality to remain stagnant or increase from 7.8 to 12 per thousand?. Please clarify. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CG It has been rephrased
E-13-471	A	22	28		30	These two sentences contain a contradiction? (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CG There is no contradiction. The frase reffers to two different indexes
E-13-472	A	22	29			...LA countries... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-473	A	22	30	22	33	And what do you think will happen to these contrasts in future? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG
E-13-474	A	22	30			A positive trend in what? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG It has been rephrased
E-13-475	A	22	35	23	17	This is an interesting sub-section relating the potential economic evolution which, in a way or another would reflect in the design of regional socio-economic scenarios. Additional links to climate change are mentioned in the last paragraph (page 23, lines 14 to 17). However, it is considered that this type of statement is unnecessary long. Further, the use of some words, like “democracy and inequality” should be reconsidered. Instead of feeding in some political wording, the sub-section could refer to governance and equity (or inequity). As a matter of facts, in any society or community there will be inequalities, the idea is to treat these conditions with equitable decision making. A re-drafting would enable a sound simplification and a better understanding. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	CG Democracy and inequality are the original terms used in the cited literature
E-13-476	A	22	37	23	17	The section Economic scenarios was also improved and presents two different points of view what is very important in this case. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	Thanks
E-13-477	A	22	40			...type of policies....in terms of growth rate, .... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-478	A	22	45			imprints ??? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-479	A	23	6		7	Double check the conclusion on LA and the Millennium dev. Goals... I think the FAO reports that LA is making important progress compared to many other regions, particularly in relation to poverty and hunger. This progress is attributed to the support for basic education and nutrition in Brazil and Mexico through social development programs (subsidies to households with school age children) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CG
E-13-480	A	23	8	23	8	Examples on Europe, Central Asia and Asia could be rephrased. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG
E-13-481	A	23	11	23	17	Criteria about socio-economic issues when explicitly ( excluding ECLAC) announced in text are almost from foreigner’s authors, Michael Walton 2004 , Evelyn Huber and Fred Solt, 2004 and in English language ( Page 14. 13.2.4.3 and Page 22., 13.3.3.2 , Page 23, rows 11-17) thus perhaps credible but not sufficient. Although this is not the main point of the chapter it would be good to provide more references from Latin American authors. I suggest that latest trends towards integration and changes in MERCOSUR and also ALCA should be mentioned related to development and socio-economic scenarios (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG Please provide references. We believe that ECLAC provides an adequate, objective and general overview of the region. We think that the papers of Walton and Huber and Stolt provide an external and complementary view of socioeconomic conditions in the region.
E-13-482	A	23	22	24	18	The summary of expected key future impacts, etc, should include information on the future conditions of the about 30 inland wetlands in the Region. Some of them, like the Pantanal and the Ibera play important roles in the preservation of the regional	ALL

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						biological diversity. Also, these wetlands are seasonal stopover for migratory birds. Their future might be endangered by the expansion of the agricultural frontier, as a very unsustainable objective of purely fiduciary economy, without any ecological sense and no equity, as well as for the digging of channels in water courses / rivers, to improve navigation conditions in detriment of the inland wetlands 'conditions.. Further, as mentioned by some regional NGOs, the building of large dams seriously affects some of these wetlands (ref. The Iberá: ¿in danger?, by Neiff J.J. FVSA, 2004) , The Future of Large Dams, Dealing with Socpial, Environmental, institutional and politica costs, by Scudder T, Earthsxcan, 2005) The Sentence in line 50, page 23 might be clearer if reading a follows: The destruction rate of some regional forests, in particular those in Central American and the Amazonia would result in a rather low restitution probability.” The reference to clouds, in line 4, page 24, should refer to cloud-base levels, as it is said in line 7, of the same page. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-483	A	23	24		25	Is the first phrase true? (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN Accepted.. Text modifiec
E-13-484	A	23	28	23	33	Siqueira and Peterson, 2003; Miles et al, 2004; are not listed in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN Accepted
E-13-485	A	23	28	23	28	Please check Siquera and Peterson 2003, against Siqueira et al. 2001 and Peterson 2003. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN Accepted
E-13-486	A	23	33			Nobre et al., 2004: Reference is missing (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN Accepted
E-13-487	A	23	38	23	38	Rowell and Moore, 2000, is not listed (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN Accepted
E-13-488	A	23	38	23	40	Any idea what these might be? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Tropical savannas. Included in the text.,
E-13-489	A	23	42		51	This paragraph is confusing. Perhaps it would be helpful to describe the results in terms of the degree of warming simulated. The results reported are for the more extreme scenarios rather than the mid-range scenario of 2-3 degrees warming. Also, for the last sentence: is it a 40% risk of loss? or a risk of loss of 40% of the forest? Risk is typically presented as a probability, so as the sentence now reads it implies that the risk is 40% (e.g., a 40% chance of forest loss), in which case the reader wants to know how much forest will be lost. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN DC
E-13-490	A	23	48			Support the statement "more runoff in northwestern South America". In general, this is untrue. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	CN DC This was a conclusion of Scholze et al. 2005
E-13-491	A	23	50	23	50	Which the meaning of EXTANT? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN DC
E-13-492	A	24	3			...if temperature increases.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-493	A	24	5			In places.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-494	A	24	10			Is there no post TAR reference for this? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC
E-13-495	A	24	10		10	How much decrease in population? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC
E-13-496	A	24	12		18	are the percentages reported the percent increase over an above the current rate of extinction? Or are these the anticipated percent decline in species given a particular scenario? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC
E-13-497	A	24	15	24	18	Are these % of number of species or number of individuals? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC
E-13-498	A	24	15			delete the period after "mammals" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	DC
E-13-499	A	24	23	25	13	How much of Latin America's food needs are derived from imports? What does this dependence imply for LA's food security in face of climate change? Alternatively, what other regions depend on LA food exports? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM S This information will be usefull, however we don't have enough space for it.
E-13-500	A	24	28	24	30	But also include model inaccuracies and unmodelled processes. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM S DONE
E-13-501	A	24	35		36	Support the statement on Colombia with a reference. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	GM <b>The reference is Jones and Thornton, 2003</b>
E-13-502	A	24	38			...and agriculture production in Mexico ??? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM DONE
E-13-503	A	24	38			"...and in production in Mexico" . Not clear (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	GM DONE
E-13-504	A	24	40	24	40	The soy bean cropping fever would bring reduction in pasture fields. Therefore, this sentence shuld be headed by such a reference, saying asa follows: "Assuming no changes in crop distribution, pasture production could, etc" (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GM DONE
E-13-505	A	24	40		44	Considering the large country area occupied by cattle ranching, it is suprising that no information is available for changes in pasture productivity in Brazil, (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	GM I didn't find this information
E-13-506	A	24	41	24	41	Please put the complete reference here (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM OK
E-13-507	A	24	43	28	44	Explain why direct effects of CO2 lead to 20% weight decreases. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM Because of decreases in forrage quality
E-13-508	A	24	46	24	51	Move last sentences in this paragraph to follow first sentence. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM DONE
E-13-509	A	24	47		49	Considering the relevance of desertification and salinization problems it would be good to be more specific about the most impacted regions (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	DC

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-510	A	24	47			...are realted to land degradation and change on erosion.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-511	A	24	48			Change 'will' to 'is expected to'. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC
E-13-512	A	24	50			Are there LA countries among these developing countries? (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	DC S
E-13-513	A	24		24		421% of insatified demand looks a extrange number. Is that right? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	'?
E-13-514	A	25	2		7	Is there evidence that increased water scarcity may produce changes in land use or crop choice? What are the implications of increased water scarcity for irrigation as an adaptation option? (pg 32) Increasing subsidence from over exploitation of aquifers is already a problem in the region, increasing risk of flood losses (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG
E-13-515	A	25	5	25	5	Maza et al, 2001; is not listed (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Done
E-13-516	A	25	5	25	5	Maza , 2001 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Done
E-13-517	A	25	9		13	Additional sources are needed to strengthen this comment on pests and climate. This is a very important area of vulnerability in agriculture; are there any studies that anticipate the potential impact of pests on particular crops? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM DC Some references were added
E-13-518	A	25	18	29	16	Section is reanably well written but needs to be edited for grammatical errors (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Done
E-13-519	A	25	18			Is there any information how the shortage of water supply wil impact the generation of hydroelectricity for the southern part of South America? If not, it has to be recognized as na important knowledge gap. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasíla)	JCG Not acceped. Lack of data
E-13-520	A	25	21	25	28	This information MUST be turned into a table. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG S Done
E-13-521	A	25	29	25	32	Is it true that severe water stress is expected ONLY in Central America? This doesn't seem correct given text at lines 35 - 49. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG <b>Not only in Central America</b>
E-13-522	A	25	33	25	33	Ramirez, 2003 is not listed (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG OK. Reference was changed
E-13-523	A	25	35		42	Again, the risk of dam breaks in alpine regions is also a growing concern. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG We have one paper as a reference of that problem. Is that enough to include that point in the AR4????
E-13-524	A	25	36			While referring to Colombia, please add: "affecting ecosytemic functioning of paramos and water supply" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	JCG Done
E-13-	A	25	36			There are no States in Colombia, but Departamentos.	JCG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

525						(Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	Done
E-13-526	A	25	38	25	42	More than potential we should say " the projected glaciers retreat would impact, etc ..in some countries (no regions) (see Science of 23 June 2006, Bradley M, et al, to further found this statement (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Accepted. Redrafted.
E-13-527	A	25	45	25	45	Please, see the 421% of unsatisfied water deman. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG That´s correct: It is 421% of unsatisfied demand <b>related to mean monthly runoff</b>
E-13-528	A	25	49	25	49	CONAMA, 2004 is not in the References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	JCG Reference changed by <b>NC, Chile, 1999</b>
E-13-529	A	26		26		Table 13.4 I think a way has to be found to relate the numbers in these tables to the papers they come from. Single figures, with no uncertainty attached are suspect, and so the source should be provided. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GM <b>Done. The problem was with Vinocur</b>
E-13-530	A	26		26		For the impacts on Other - Potatoes in Costa Rica, would be convenient to have a % or consider if the impacts are significant. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM
E-13-531	A	27		28		Table 13.5. Kokot 2004 no cited (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed ...citations are included and deleted due to lack of space...
E-13-532	A	27		28		Table 13.5 Please use the same unit measures to express the Sea Level Rise. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed To be checked..the best in cm for SLR and mm for rate
E-13-533	A	27		28		Table 13.5 I like this table. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN Addressed ...and thanks...
E-13-534	A	28	0			Table 13,5. At the sixth line Ramos Mañé et al. 1998 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed This cite was changed: NC-Uruguay 2004.
E-13-535	A	28	0			Table 13,5. At the sixth line Kokot 2004c is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-536	A	28	0			Table 13,5. At the fifth line Kokot 2004 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-537	A	28		28		Table 13.5. On the colum Impacts/costs for Peru: please, provide the source. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed OK. Need to be checked. NC-Perú?? AV: National Communication, 2001
E-13-538	A	28		28		Table 13.5 for Argentina (Buenos aires City) there is no level or projection of the SLR. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed No...projections are known for the world and we made regional ones for the Uruguayan coast of the Rio de la Plata. Similar for BsAs
E-13-539	A	28		28		Costa Rica, 2002 open the round bakcets. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Sorry ...don't understand.????

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-540	A	28				Table 13.5. Kind, 2005; Kokot, 2004; Ramos Mañe et al, 1998; Barros et al, 2003; are not listed in the References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed : included or deleted
E-13-541	A	29	1	29	1	Agriculture malpractices: a better expression is Agriculture inappropriate practices (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	JCG Accepted
E-13-542	A	29	1			Insert "excessive use of" before "herbicides" (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG Accepted
E-13-543	A	29	1		1	Are soil erosion, herbicides etc "Agricultural malpractices?" (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Accepted
E-13-544	A	29	8	29	10	Paragraph seems out of place. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	JCG Accepted. This comment is right. Eliminated
E-13-545	A	29	8	29	10	Landslides - very surprised to see them under Water Resources. A separate section called Extreme Events may be required. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG Accepted. This comment is right. Eliminated
E-13-546	A	29	8		10	Previously the chapter mentions the trend of more intense and concentrated rainfall events. The scenarios of water scarcity and increasingly concentrated rainfall events pose significant challenges for planning and adaptation. Aside from landslides, are there indications that this trend, if it continues, will impact urban flooding? (e.g., this was a primary concern for adaptation in Hermosillo, Sonora in the study mentioned previously). The volumen of precipitation expected has important implications for urban infrastructure and sewage as mentioned in the subsequent paragraph. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Accepted. Paragraph eliminated
E-13-547	A	29	12		16	this list of problems associated with urban growth could be better integrated with the material of the previous paragraphs -- e.g., explaining the relationship of the different climate scenarios to concurrent urbanization and development in terms of demand, water availability (including quality) and sensitivity (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Not accepted. Too general and without specific references.
E-13-548	A	29	19	29	31	Section on Coastal doesn't explote all the information presented in the table 13.5 (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Probably....because of the need of space economy....we guess the table is central AV: the table was built to reduce text The previous draft included full text that was edited to built the table. We will re-edit the table and put some text again
E-13-549	A	29	19		31	Given the importance of coastal vulnerability in LA this section seems a bit brief. Perhaps the table 13.5 could be reduced in terms of the text on impacts and costs, and the more descriptive information moved to the text of the section. Are there more specifics available concerning the projected changes described? In particular details on the types of socioeconomic consequences expected, the degree to which areas are expected to increase in flooding etc would be useful. The high cost of coastal zone damage (e.g., tourist sites such as Cancun, the Rio Plata delta) makes this information particularly important for decision-makers. The work of V. Barros	GN Probably....because of the need of space economy....we guess the table is central. Text was included and expanded in the table...using less space. When this was done we needed to reduce a few pages. The table needed to be one page. Comments are valid... Addressed more examples (included a few ones). New text included for tourism.



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						is not cited here for example, nor Nagy? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	
E-13-550	A	29	21			This section was improved with a summary table (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	GN OK
E-13-551	A	29	26	29	26	The article Codignotto 2004 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-552	A	29	26	29	31	Codignotto, 2004; Conde et al, 2001; CIDAS, 2003; Revkin, 2004; Kokot 2004c; Rodriguez Acevedo, 2001; are not listed in References. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed Included or deleted.
E-13-553	A	29	26	29	26	Codignotto 2004, no cited (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-554	A	29	30			Capital P for Patagonian. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN Addressed
E-13-555	A	29	31	29	31	The article Kokot 2004c is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-556	A	29	31	29	31	Kokot 2004 c, no cited. And Kokot 2004b?.... (Roberto Kokot, FCEyN, Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN I guess Kokot b is missing... Because of space only one Kokot to be cited.
E-13-557	A	29	32			Before the sub-section on Human Health (or probably, before the one on Coasts) it would be wise to write on the trends of the important commercial and sport fishing activities in the rivers and seas of the region, as well, as already mentioned (paragraph page ) on the social and economic importance and implications of future fish cropping in lakes, wetlands and special reservoirs as well as providing some information for decision making on sea fish-farms. . (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GN Relevant information –specific for climate change- was not found on this subject – only some on shrimp and fish farmings i.e. Ecuador. AV:DONE diversion of farm land; disruption of access to fishing grounds; negative impact on biodiversity, including of mangroves; salinization and overexploitation of water, including groundwater (FAO, 2006)
E-13-558	A	29	34	31	19	It is a too long sub-section. Reducing its extension, avoiding repetition and emphasizing the main issues ( i.e. by disease not from country to country) would provide a more clear trend of expected key future impacts and vulnerability. The recently available information on chagas disease should be mentioned.(i.e the above mentioned paper by Biancardi M.A et al, Revista Medicina Vol 63 N° 2 april 2003). (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM S ACCEPTED
E-13-559	A	29	36	29	36	Since the Githeko and Woodward paper is based on the TAR conclusions, it will be better to replace “had” instead of “have”. Further, since this section is headed as Summary of expected key future impacts and vulnerabilities, I wonder whether paragraph in lines 366 to 41 is pertinent, at least, as it is written now. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM S ACCEPTED
E-13-	A	29	43	30	26	Maybe a summary table with the information about malaria could be used in this	ARM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

560						section (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	LACK OF SPACE
E-13-561	A	29	48		51	The term "relative risk" here is not clear. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM the ratio of risk of disease/outcome or death among the exposed to the risk among the unexposed
E-13-562	A	29	49	29	51	The risk relative to what baseline? Present day = 1? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM the ratio of risk of disease/outcome or death among the exposed to the risk among the unexposed
E-13-563	A	29	54	31	19	Useful information is presented but the text could be condensed. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	ARM S ACCEPTED
E-13-564	A	30	4		8	This statement might be true for regions where precipitation becomes a limiting factor for malaria, but not so in other regions, such as Colombia where temperature increase plays a major role to augment malaria transmission rates, as is the case during El Niño. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-565	A	30	5			Insert "length of the" before "transmission" (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-566	A	30	10	30	11	Which "change in climate"? Date? SRES scenario? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DONE
E-13-567	A	30	18	30	20	Date needed for this statement. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DELETED
E-13-568	A	30	24	30	26	Is this 0.22% change positive or negative? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DELETED
E-13-569	A	30	30	30	30	Please, replace cost for coast. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-570	A	30	32		32	How much does the risk of epidemics increase? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM DELETED
E-13-571	A	30	32			climate change (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-572	A	30	35	30	35	Please, explain the meaning fo GARP models. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DELETED
E-13-573	A	30	35		42	what are GARP models? Information on the current extent and impact of leishmaniasis is important in order to interpret this result. Perhaps more information should be provided on human health (current morbidity/mortality) in the discussion of current non-climatic stressors for the different diseases considered most important in the region. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM DELETED LACK OF SPACE
E-13-574	A	30	36			south-eastern (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-	A	30				Marena, 2001; Hoop and Foley, 2001; are not listed in References.	ARM

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

575						(Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DONE
E-13-576	A	31	8	31	10	Date needed for this statement. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM DELETED
E-13-577	A	31	19			The paragraphs on air quality in LA urban centers could be further developed. The severity of air pollution in Mexico City for example is well documented. I would expect a more complete presentation of this information, along with air quality/human health data fom other major LA cities. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	ARM LACK OF SPACE
E-13-578	A	31	21			Is this figure sufficiently referred to in the text? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL tiene razón
E-13-579	A	31	21			Figure 13.2> it is not clear how these hotspots were determined. Perhaps an explanation is needed in the caption explaining which studies were considered in this determination? Are these results those considered to have "high confidence" ? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-580	A	31	24			A very short introduction would be helpful for each sub section summarizing the objectives of adaptation, e.g., for natural ecosystems, in face of increased risk of species extinction and ecoservice loss, the objectives appear to be to enhance species migration possibilities and permit greater local control over resource management... (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL DC
E-13-581	A	31	28	32	27	There is few information on wetlands and other type of native ecosystems which get lost because the name is in Spanish, Would be possible to have their equivalent in English, this would enhance the fluent reading of the whole chapter. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC
E-13-582	A	31	30	31	30	Please consider the following addition to the initial sentence in 13.5.1.1: "Some option to reduce the ecosystem degradation in LA are the improvement and reinforcement of policy, planning and management" (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	DC
E-13-583	A	31	30	32	27	To what extent do the adaptations described address the specific threats mentioned earlier (e.g., Amazon savannization, decline in cloud forest species, loss of mangroves?) Agroforestry using agroecological methods (e.g., Altieri ....) also offers stong possibilities for maintaining diversity in LA given the important overlap between protected areas and agricultural zones. see also Morales, H., B. Ferguson, L. Garcia-Barrios in press. "Agricultura: La Cenicienta de la conservación en Mesoamerica", capitulo en el libro editado por C. Harvey y J. Saenz: Evaluación y Conservación de Biodiversidad en Agropasiajes Mesoamericanos. UNA editorial, Costa Rica.; Pimental et al. 1992 Bioscience vol 42; Ferguson y Griffith 2004, en Manejo Integrado de Plagas y Agroecologia (Costa Rica) 72: 72-85 (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	DC CN AV ACCEPTED
E-13-584	A	31	30	32	28	These suggestions are okay, but additional considerations are needed. For example, mangroves are included among protected areas in some LA countries, but we don't know (at least this is not presented in the chapter) how these resources would respond to SLR. This is just an example. The point that I would like to make	DC AV AV: I considered that examples cover the region. Restrictions on length text do not permit the inclusion of more examples. We

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						is that climate change could make natural resource conservation/protection more difficult. (Pierre-Andre Jacinthe, Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis)	appreciate very much this comment.
E-13-585	A	31	30			Section 13.5.1. 1. Comment. The UNEP GEO Outlook for Latin America and the Caribbean 2003 (pages 71-75) considered other options to reduced ecosystem degradation in LA, not included in this section, like multilateral and regional agreements to protect the access to biodiversity resources, and genetic resources and highlights the importance of a better management of the current protected areas. (Avelino G. Suarez Rodriguez, Ecology and Systematic- Cuban Environmental Agency)	DC
E-13-586	A	31	30			...to reduce ecosystem.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-587	A	31		36		Is it worth doing a systematic study of NAPAs for Section 13.5? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-588	A	31				WHO, 2000; PAHO, 2005; Millenium Ecosystem Aessment, 2005; are not in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DC DONE
E-13-589	A	31				In the map of Fig. 13.2, please point out the tropical Andes as the most critical hotspot for biodiversity on Earth. Also point out regions subject to ozone depletion and skin cancer. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ALL DC ARM DONE
E-13-590	A	32	3			Include: Valuation of ecosystems services. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	DC
E-13-591	A	32	5	32	5	This phrase should be cancel as a bullet and transferred as the last phrase, in the previous bullet. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	DC
E-13-592	A	32	5			Text belongs in previous bullet (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC
E-13-593	A	32	5			??? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-594	A	32	6			...and in poverty.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-595	A	32	10	32	21	Organize into a table or present as a map. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	DC S
E-13-596	A	32	10	32	21	As far as the information available to this ER, some of the protected areas and ecological corridors are plans calling for official or private support / financing to be effectively implemented. It is suggested to keep emphasis on the importance of these developments and registered as operative only those which has been enforced some time ago and continue to be in operation. The rather generalized impetus of many governments and private groups to increase agricultural production to satisfy external requirements for grains and seeds, has even affected local agro-industries. In a large number of LA countries, if not in all of them, the externalities of	DC GM accepted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						agricultural production are not accounted, in flagrant detriment of sustainability (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-597	A	32	27	32	27	Pimm et al, 2001, this cite is incomplete in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	DC
E-13-598	A	32	31	32	31	In section 13.5.1.2 the first sentence makes you think that in others sectors has been a broad adaptation assessment. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM It was changed
E-13-599	A	32	31	33	10	Given the heterogeneity of LA agriculture it is critical to specify what type of systems were considered in adaptation research, as well as what types of threats/scenarios the adaptations are in response to. In terms of food security, the significant number of subsistence farmers may be particularly vulnerable in the short term and their adaptation options more limited. Of particular concern may be farmers in Central America where drying trends have been reported, and in the poorer regions of the Andes. Adaptations in these communities may involve investment in other livelihood activities. Increasingly cross-sectoral perspectives are needed when considering adaptation options... (e.g. Eakin 2005... world development). Also there is no mention here of agroecological methods for climate change adaptation. While there may not yet be sufficient research in this area that specifically relates to climatic change, the tradition of human-ecology research on LA farm systems has amply illustrated the potential of intercropping, selection of local land races, spatial distribution of fields, management of wind breaks and vegetation to reduce climatic risk for smallholder farmers (e.g., Holtz-Gimenez; L. Garcia Barrios; Trujillo). These types of systems are often poorly represented in simulation models (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM A paragraph was added related to smallholders
E-13-600	A	32	44	32	44	Travasso et al, 2006 is not in the Reference list (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GM OK
E-13-601	A	33	3	33	10	This paragraph is odd unless it is made clear that Uruguay is just an example. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	AV AV OK deleted
E-13-602	A	33	3	33	10	The case described in these lines does not qualify as an adaptation measure. It is one to mitigate CO2 emissions. However, the real intention to afforest a grassland, which is the natural ecosystem in Uruguay, had little to do with such an objective. The large increase of exotic trees plantation was the result of a different economic approach. In this case, as facts are clearly showing, these new forest were developed for paper-pulp production by foreign groups (Finish and Spanish private groups). The apparent defense of these plantations,(which the Government of Uruguay started more than 25 years ago), is oriented to justify those afforestations on the application of Article 12 (CDM) of the Kyoto Protocol. This assumption is wrong and, if known by official levels, could create reactions from official and private institutions, on both sides of the Uruguay River (i.e. from Argentina and Uruguay). In this regard, the National University of Uruguay (Universidad de la República) has completed a report blaming for such a development, ending, as it was already	AV OK deleted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						mentioned, in paper-pulp production. This report remark that the full development is destroying the natural ecosystems, affecting the water cycle (surface and underground) and, when the raw material undergo the industrial treatment, bringing a noxious contamination, affecting people and terrestrial and aquatic ecosystem.. The Government of Argentina, has denounced the installation of these paper-pulp mills with similar arguments. The cause is before of the International Permanent Court of Arbitration, in The Hague. Before closing, let us take a lesson from this mitigation action (no adaptation). Any issue related to the environment, cannot be dealt with in isolation. The interlinkages with other environmental questions and the social, economic, environmental and political implications, call for a fully integrated analysis. Since this is not an adaptation project, although is a mitigation one, we should learn that partial considerations of environmental issues may lead to adverse collateral problems.. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-603	A	33	3		5	Needs to be re-written (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	AV AV OK deleted
E-13-604	A	33	10	33	10	Agrawala, 2004 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	AV AV OK INCLUDED
E-13-605	A	33	12	33	41	the first paragraph can be more accurate and the last onw can be simplified since is talking about policies, otherwise may be redundant. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	JCG Accepted. Paragraph redrafted
E-13-606	A	33	14	33	22	Since it is evident that water management is a pending subject in many LA countries and this practice (management) when undertaken do not consider climate change implications, it would be opportune to adapt the reference information to the region 's conditions. Moreover, since monitoring and hydrometeorological watching systems are the essence of the simplest adaptation measures, it will be useful for decision making to learn about such practices, emphasizing very strongly the need for better hydrometeorological information, and, particularly in the case of extreme events, their socio-economic implications. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Accepted. Paragraph redrafted
E-13-607	A	33	16	33	22	Better as bulleted list. Are any of these LA specific? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG Accepted. Paragraph redrafted
E-13-608	A	33	24	35	41	The interesting part of Section 13.5.1.3 is lines 24-35 but 14 -22 and 37-41could be deleted. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	JCG S Accepted. Paragraph redrafted
E-13-609	A	33	24		28	The meaning of this sentence is not clear (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Accepted
E-13-610	A	33	30		35	The efficiency of the transbasin diversion of the São Francisco River in Brazil is still under debate. The authors should careful here and maybe should cite references presenting different points of view. (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	JCG Accepted. Redrafted. “ ... would be an option..... taking into account, etc”
E-13-	A	33	31			The transfer of water from Mexico's R Lerma basin to Mexico city is a very	JCG

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

611						important example of the high institutional costs of interbasin transfers. The ecological impacts of this transfer are dramatic and currently part of a lawsuit between Mexico State and the federal district. The implications for vulnerability are also impressive, entailing a precarious reliance on fragile hydraulic infrastructure, and a very high energy use for the water transfer. There are also important equity issues involved in interbasin transfers and such transfers have been questioned in the Great Lakes region in the US (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	Accepted. Redrafted. “ ... would be an option..... taking into account, etc”
E-13-612	A	33	37	33	41	Here again, the need to adapt the WB and IDB information to the factual problems faced in the LA region suggest a clear reference on the urgency to test underground water quality. The BelVille syndrome so recommends. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	JCG Accepted. Redrafted
E-13-613	A	33	37		41	Adaptations involving sectoral transfers and purchasing of water rights are increasingly likely -- particularly as industrial and urban demand grows at the expense of agriculture. There may be literature on this issue relating to northern Mexico. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	JCG Not accepted. Too general and without specific references.
E-13-614	A	33	43	34	20	This sub-section, which should refer to adaptation, includes interesting information on assessment which should pertain to another segment of this chapter. The Table 13.6, with a short bordering information on adaptation would provide a more crispy and easy reading information. The previous comment on the Agrawala 2004 reference suggest to check this material, which reference is not include in the bibliography listing (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	GN Addressed  To be checked  AV: reference Agrawala was included. The paragraph was moved to section 13.4.4. and edited
E-13-615	A	33	45	34	3	Are you talking about NAPAs here? If so, make clear. Cite sources. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN Addressed Mostly...will be included at the very beginning.
E-13-616	A	33	45		50	These sentences appear to refer to impact assessments not adaptations. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN Addressed Ok. May be....it seem a need to introduce adaptation and the lack of homogeneity, etc. Accepted... Will be included earlier. AV: The complete paragraph was moved to section 13.4.4 and edited
E-13-617	A	33	45		45	Different from what? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN Addressed . Diverse on methodological approach (is it better?). AV: see comment E-13-616
E-13-618	A	33	51	34	2	What does the CATHALAC project have to say about coastal adaptation? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN At present ..very theoretical...not adding anything new...will be important in the future (AR5?) AV: CATHALAC include the CZM (coastal zone management) and the integrated

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

							management of water resources like a measurements to couple with climate variability into the region that included México, Cuba, Guatemala, Honduras, El Salvador, Nicaragua, Costa Rica y Panamá into the project: “Fomento de Capacidades para la Etapa II de Adaptación al Cambio Climático en América Central, México y Cuba”PNUD-GEF-CATHALAC. 2003
E-13-619	A	34	0			This section was improved with a summary table (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecología - Universidade de Brasília)	OK
E-13-620	A	34	1	34	2	Please translate into English the name of this project. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed AV: Why? The name of proyectos are similar to family names, for this reason should retain its original spelling in its mother tongue.
E-13-621	A	34	2	34	2	CATHALAC, 2003, is not listed in References (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed OK for AV AV: DONE was included
E-13-622	A	34	6			implement ? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GN Checked
E-13-623	A	34	11	34	14	CAPP, 2000; CIDAS, 2003; UNCLOS, 2005; are not in the Reference list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed added or deleted CAPP and CIDAS were deleted
E-13-624	A	34	12	34	14	Only 2 LA countries have done so? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN To be checked AV AV: in reference to
E-13-625	A	34	13	34	13	UNCLOS, 2005 is not in the references list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed AV OK I will included
E-13-626	A	34	14			what are straddling fish stocks? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN for AV AV: is referred to separation of fish stock; separation of species that were fishing.
E-13-627	A	34	22	34	22	Is SRL supposed to be SLR? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Addressed corrected
E-13-628	A	34	22			Table 13.6 -- is there any more specificity that can be given concerning the scenarios (e.g, how much SLR?) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GN No. Most Nat Comm have considered 0.5 and 1 m scenarios. Not projections from climate models. Exception was Uruguay NC-II 2004
E-13-629	A	34	22			Table 13,6. In the sixth line Ramos et al 2002 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed Was changed : NC-Uruguay 2004
E-13-	A	34	22			Table 13,6. In the last line Kokot 2004 is not detailed at References section.	GN



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

630						(Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	Addressed
E-13-631	A	34		34		Table 13.6, please add a note on LANM2 scenario. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN OK. It was shortened for space economy....
E-13-632	A	34		34		Table 13.6 the third column is says costs where only the explample of Ecuador has costs in it. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Yes. There is a lack of data on the subject (a lot of blablabla without specific data)
E-13-633	A	34				Table 13.6: In the section about Uruguay and Argentina there are missing references (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed, some were delted others will be included...we are limited by space... AV: Not apply
E-13-634	A	34				Table 13.6: In the section about Uruguay Adaptation practices and options, at the end says: develop contiongency plans against flooding; assess socioeconomic and environmental ? Something is missing. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	GN Addressed AV: DONE impacts
E-13-635	A	35	3	35	49	It would be a good idea to refer to the attention of decision making other adaptation actions, starting by the very basic building up of statistical information relating health conditions and events with the corresponding climate and related environmental issues (i.e floods, tornados, etc), the urgency to establish with the OPS / PAHO a regular channel to report such an information, so integrate same to regional blocks of similar sanitary/health conditions and, therefore, improve early warnings on epidemic spells, etc. A cross-reference with Chapter 8, regarding, for instance the information on the available methods of assessing human health vulnerability and public health adaptation to climate change, plus a recommendation to decision making to integrate the Global Health Watch , but nor as a mere recipient of information, but also as a provider of such, would assist in building-up adaptation actions in favor of human health and its surveillance. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-636	A	35	5	35	9	This is a general statement which would have its place in Chapter 8, as it is the case of the health forecast enforced in the UK (see this ER ´s comments in Chapter 8). This is a regional segment and should provide information on factual adaptation actions, implemented and in operation, in the countries of the region. In this regard, the information contained in lines 29 to 32 does not reflect any community involvement. Both references concern: one to a case study presented in an International Workshop, the other to an academic discussion on the real and effective implementation of an Environmental Monitoring and Warning System and an Early Alert for Environmental Risks, which has been in existence for more than one decade. However, its inefficiency, the lack of coordination between the services involved and other shortcomings, has been brought to a thorough revision, which is now in its final stage. The different environmental risks, logically having an effect of the national community security and safety, hence on human health, have made evident the need for establishing a reliable warning system, provided with	ARM creo que tiene razón ACCEPTED

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						regular and reliable components (basic geophysical observations, information on the social and economic implications, etc) and capable of regular and effective activities in the previous, during and post event phases. Argentina submitted a paper at the UN Third International Conference on Early Alert Systems (Bonn, March 2006), remarking the urgency to undertake this type of services, which as said before, are under development, A national body, SIFEM – Sistema Federal de Emergencias - already exists; however, in view of its weaknesses, the Government has decided to take the above mentioned action for implementing a really efficient National System, in accordance with the UN ISDR basic principles. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-637	A	35	5		48	An important concern relating to health is the implication of increased human migration and changes in disease patterns. This implies greater inter-governmental coordination, and cross-boundry action. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-638	A	35	9	35	9	Epstein, 2001 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-639	A	35	13	35	15	National Task Force, 2001 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-640	A	35	15	35	15	ANAM, 2000 is not in the reference list. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-641	A	35	29	35	32	I don't understand this paragraph. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM ver E636 DELETED
E-13-642	A	35	29		32	More needs to be said about this experience in Argentina for the message to come through in the text. What is the threat that the participation is responding to? What type of security is referred to here? (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-643	A	35		35		Section 13.5.1.5 Much can go because not LA specific, eg. Lines 5-9, 34-41, 24-27. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ARM S DONE
E-13-644	A	35				Missing cites: Epstein, 2001; ANAM, 2001; Colombian Ministry.....; Brazilian ministry....., 2004. Murgida and Gasparotto, 2004 is Murgida et al, 2004 as it appears in the Refernces? (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	ARM DONE
E-13-645	A	36	1	36	50	Section 13.5.2: I have the feeling that the diversity of the socio-economic situation in LA is not sufficiently considered. (Stephan Glatzel, Landscape Ecology)	ALL
E-13-646	A	36	1	36	50	As constrains we should understand the lack of elements enabling the reduction of the adverse impacts and cropping of the benefits of climate change. These are, for instance, the lack of basic geophysical and biological information, the faulty legal frames under which any action (i.e increase of production – crops, forestry, fishing) linked to climate change is regulated, the use of land and water under climate stresses, the lack of ecological economy rules, so to include the externalities in the costs of production, etc. In line 41 there is a reference to “National	ALL GN AV: I incorporated some references about fisheries

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						Communications”, it would be opportune to add “to the UNFCCC”, as required by the Convention. Since this item is linked to other (i.e. that in lines 9 to 10, it would be wise to associate them so to reduce the chapter’s extension. Line 44 refers verexploitation of fisheries, however, is not much reference on fisheries, as already mentioned, in this chapter. In line 49 it would be important to refer to riparian areas, where many large LA cities are also located. (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-647	A	36	1			Constraints to what? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-648	A	36	3		50	Capacity is a central challenge for adaptation. The transformation of LA economic policy in recent decades has entailed a reduction of government intervention in productive sectors, as well as in research and development. The challenge of adaptation thus will have to emerge from private-sector/public-sector collaboration, and depend on the norms established for such interaction in each country. The decline in agricultural research & investment by the public sector is of particular concern, as well as gaps in capacity in local governments and NGOs, which now have greater responsibility under decentralized planning (see. Eakin and Lemos, Global enviro change, 2006). The lack of intersectoral coordination applies not only to health but also to natural resource management, agriculture (particularly in LA where agriculture houses considerable natural capital and ecoservices) and urban development (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-649	A	36	4			°C (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GM DONE
E-13-650	A	36	11	36	11	The article Barros 2005 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	GN Addressed
E-13-651	A	36	25			...education and health services would be a major.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ALL
E-13-652	A	36	27			Change El Niño for "both phases of ENSO" (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ALL
E-13-653	A	36	31			...have not yet clearly idetified health effects from climate.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	ARM ACCEPTED
E-13-654	A	36	33	36	34	Please, Add after "socio-economic policies" and gender approach. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ARM DONE
E-13-655	A	36	39	36	40	Does this limitation only apply to coastal environments, what about the impacts in the Amazon area or other large ecosystems and areas in LA? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ALL GN ?????
E-13-656	A	36	41	36	41	change National communications for National Communication on Climate Change or Reports on Climate Change, not all readers are familiarized with these documents. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN NC-Country is better to economize space.

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-657	A	36	44	36	45	Why is tourism a barrier to adaptation? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN For AV (however it may be sometimes true) AV: I suggest deleted this phrase
E-13-658	A	36	44	36	44	Is this referred to interest around tourism and other primary sectors pose significant barriers? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GN Not for me...
E-13-659	A	36	45	36	50	Far from proper English (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	GN For AV.
E-13-660	A	36	47			...largely urban LA settlements are on the coasts.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	GN Don't understand..it is correct.
E-13-661	A	37	0			It would be useful to include some additional text to connect the case studies presented (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	CG
E-13-662	A	37	2	39	9	I like these case studies but their purpose is not clear. The Amazon case study would seem to fit better in the section on future climate scenarios for natural ecosystems. The Altiplano case study speaks directly to the comment above on agroecology but the message here needs to be stronger and re-written to improve its content. It is a case study of prior human adjustment to environmental constraints, which may provide important lessons for adaptation to climate change. The case study could be shortened and strengthened with a paragraph on the important limitations of prior adjustments to environmental constraints (e.g., the Incas substantially transformed and deforested large regions, there is some indications that the Mayans were not able to adjust to prolonged drought in the Yucatan) and where agroecological knowledge and experience may provide future opportunities (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	CN OC Not accepted the comment on the Amazonian case study. It fits well in there.
E-13-663	A	37	4	37	4	This case study needs a more useful title so the link between the Amazonia and its role and link to climate change future impacts are better presented. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN Accepted
E-13-664	A	37	4	37	4	Please number this as 13.6.1 (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CN GM DONE
E-13-665	A	37	14	37	14	Replace 2030 by 2050 (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	CN Accepted
E-13-666	A	37	34	37	35	References needed to these modelling studies (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CN Accepted
E-13-667	A	37	34	37	41	Missing cites: Costa et al, 2003; Werth and Avissar, 2002. Oyama and Nobre, 2003 and Nobre et al, 2004 are incomplete cites in the References list. (Marta Vinocur, Universidad Nacional de Rio Cuarto)	CN Accepted
E-13-668	A	37	36	37	37	Werth and Avissar 2002 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	CN
E-13-669	A	37		37		This case study on Amazonia is good. I'd like to see a map just to make it more inviting.	CN GM ADD MAP

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						(Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	<b>Graciella: there was a map in the last version, What happened to it? Carlos: The map is now in Fig 13.3</b>
E-13-670	A	38	2	38	2	Please number this as 13.6.2 (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE
E-13-671	A	38	2	39	9	As an example of ancestral andean technologies used to manage land and water, and too reduce climatic risks, the following can be mentioned: The “terrazas” or “andenes”, which are used at slopes to control the erosion and in order to win lands for crops. The “camellones” or “waru-warus”, which are fields of 3-10 meters wide elevated, and surrounded by channels where rainwater and river derived water maintains an stable temperature during the night, because at that moment it irradiates the heat that have been received during the day, this reduces the frost’s risk for crops. The “cochas” are natural depressions in flat areas, used as storages of rainwater to reserve it for drought times. Other technologies used to reduce the climatic risks are: the diversification of native crops, and the “laimes” or “aynokas”, which are land use systems where the crops are rotated between different sectors of a field, to improve the nourishing security and the conservation of the agrobiodiversity. (Lenkiza Angulo Villarreal, Soluciones Prácticas-ITDG)	OC
E-13-672	A	38	10			Reference needed to support statement "already influenced by the greenhouse effect" (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC
E-13-673	A	38	13			"paramo like" meaning (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC
E-13-674	A	38	22			...or for biotechnology.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	OC
E-13-675	A	38	25	38	33	A photo might be helpful (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC GM ADD PHOTO
E-13-676	A	38	37	38	39	On what did they base their prediction? Stars? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC
E-13-677	A	38	38	38	38	Orlove et al 2000 is not detailed at References section. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	OC
E-13-678	A	38	41	38	41	Please change to could be see as case study 13.6.2 (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	GM DONE
E-13-679	A	38	42	38	47	Re-write as rather policy prescriptive (and p. 39 lines 2-9) (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC
E-13-680	A	38		38		Map definitely needed for this Case Study. I don't think even know which country is being talked about. Still weak. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	OC GM ADD MAP
E-13-681	A	39	2	39	2	Is it possible to find another wording for colophon? (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	OC

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

E-13-682	A	39	12	40	5	Section 13.7: So far, the proposed actions are rather general. It would be helpful to learn what specific actions are advisable for countries in LA. Also, a brief discussion of the implementation of the mentioned legislative framework would improve this section. (Stephan Glatzel, Landscape Ecology)	ALL
E-13-683	A	39	12	40'	5	Section 13.7 requires convergence with other sections in this chapter. In this regard, the explosive growth of certain crops (i.e. soy bean and coca leaves) with their adverse environmental effects, definitely against any sustainable future, shall be seen as the cause of this comment. In this regard, the two sentences between line 18 and line 21 do not reflect the reality in this and other developments. As a matter of facts, the formality to sign agreements, conventions, etc, is the activity undertaken by the national chancelleries while their factual implementation depends from a series of factors which are not handled by these bodies, exception made of a few countries in this Region, and most probably, in other Regions. Should be truth that the signature of the Kyoto Protocol would reduce emissions in industrialized countries, many of the continuing efforts made by international agencies would become unnecessary. Further, although it may sound inappropriate, it has to be accepted that the sources of information from international smooth and washed-out reports is, in most cases biased because of different interests. Reading reliable national reports, like the recently published by Fundación Vida Silvestre Argentina, of the WWW, “ Situación Ambiental Argentina-2005” (June 2006), it is easy to find the comments of jurists , constitutionalists and scientists referring the lack of implementation of the decision stemming from international meetings.and, also, from the country ´s national constitutions As an example, at the Johannesburg Meeting on Environment and Development (June 2002) the only world Region that did not produce a fully comprehensive report on the state of environmental affairs and needs of the different integrating countries, was the Latin American Region. Therefore, the details given in lines 30 to 38, have only a declamatory status.. As a matter of facts, careful reading of the paragraph between line 50 (page 39) and line 5 (page 40) shows that what has been mentioned in this comment. Is not far from reality. This section should be re-written to provide decision making (official and private) with clear information on the implication of the lack of planning, adoption and definitive execution of rules oriented to chose the necessary and better sustainable development paths. Explaining about the importance of accounting for the externalities, the need to introduce new water management concepts, like “irrigation efficiency”, “water productivity” and even reinstalling the idea of food productivity, would serve to provide decision making with guidance for the better use the R and its countries, of mthe unevenly distributed resources..As a matter of clarification, the use of the word “equality”, line 14, page 39, is inappropriate, it shall be “equity”	CG GM ALL It was changed

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						(Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)	
E-13-684	A	39	12			section on implications for sust. develop.: I would rather put first lines 40 to 43 and 45 to 48 (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-685	A	39	14	39	15	The concept of sustainable development has evolved as to incorporate within equity issues the potential impacts of climate change.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-686	A	39	14	39	14	the three dimensions of SD not "equality", but social dimension. Some references on that? See FOD WG 3 chapter 2 and 12 , on the issue there are no important changes. See also WG 2 Ch 20. (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	CG
E-13-687	A	39	14	40	5	Implications for sustainable development: this section could refer much more to the previous sections. To what extent will the anticipated climate impacts impede the region from achieving sustainability? What opportunities are there in climate change to enhance sustainable development? For example, the economic dependence of many countries on natural resources both means that adaptation to future impacts on these resources should be a priority, but also that shorter-term economic interests may prevail in resource use decisions. Economic inequality could be exacerbated by climate change, particularly between urban and rural sectors (service and natural resource based sectors) - this in turn raising problems of social stability and equity for the present generation that may be prioritized over the needs of future generations (see Glantz on intergenerational equity concerns following hurricane Mitch in el Salvador). On the other hand, LA has begun a tradition of sustainable and community resource management that may provide opportunities for adaptation (e.g., organic coffee, ecotourism, community forestry, etc.) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	References?
E-13-688	A	39	19			...some of them at ministry.... (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-689	A	39	20	39	20	Would read better if says " All of them have signed..." since the text is referred to LA countries, or could be "All Latin American countries ...." (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG OK
E-13-690	A	39	23	39	25	After the Stockholm Conference in 1972 on the Human Environment, the first governmental agencies concerned with the environment were established in LA with similar national policies and legal instruments. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG OK
E-13-691	A	39	28			treaties, conventions or agreements. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-692	A	39	31			Summit (YEAR?) (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-693	A	39	40	39	41	Some cross references within the chapter on the issue of this region vulnerabilities (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG
E-13-	A	39	41			Swiss Re??	CG That is the name of the re-insurance

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

694						(Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	company
E-13-695	A	39	42	39	42	Please, standarize how the "Comision Economica para America Latina y el Caribe" is going to be referred, as CEPAL or ECLAC (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	CG OK
E-13-696	A	39	42			In LA? (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	CG OK. Sentence has been changed
E-13-697	A	39	47	39	48	...for ensuring long term effectiveness in sustainable development investments. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	
E-13-698	A	39	51			...contained in the ILAC (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG NO
E-13-699	A	40	0	41		This section (not included in the former document) is well written and the most important aspects of uncertainties and priorities are addressed (Mercedes Bustamante, Departamento de Ecologia - Universidade de Brasília)	
E-13-700	A	40	1			delete: in the caribbean? (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG ?
E-13-701	A	40	5			...margins to the core desition-making process for development strategies. (Monica Beatriz Wehbe, National University of Rio Cuarto)	CG
E-13-702	A	40	8	41	19	This part needs stronger reference but neverthe less one point of uncertainty remains what are the impacts of climate change in areas and systems (natural and human) where to little information exists and poor relevance from decision makers, as a result there is big gap to fill in. Support can be provided by science part but what is left to do from other stakeholders and sectors. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ALL
E-13-703	A	40	8	41	19	Section 13.8 looks as been designed for developed countries. In fact, it assumes that the only problems affecting the study of vulnerabilities, impacts and adaptation to climate change depends only on the modeling capacities. This is even incorrect for developed regions when discussing, for instance the further outlook for tropical cyclones and extreme events, including tornadoes; and every weather condition bringing risks and hazards in their own territories. The specific services must improve their observation systems. For those who did not follow the latest developments regarding a single observations system, the GCOS, it may sound strange to speak about observations and monitoring; however, it should be noted the scientists from developed countries, when up-dating GCOS ´requirements, emphasized the need for improving these and their quality standards, in the terrestrial and space observation systems, in their own specific services. It is incredible that Chapter 13 only speaks about models and scenarios which, in the best of the cases are only guiding elements, simply because, as it has been discussed, the SRES are not as fitted as they should, do not represent the futures of developing regions, and are global, not regional indexes.. Nevertheless, the use of the existing models and the existing downscaling procedures should be used, but also taking into account that, good observation, appropriate monitoring, organized watching and warning systems and the dissemination of early alerts for climate change potential	ALL



**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						<p>impacts, in any sector (agriculture, health, urban and rural security and safeguarding, etc) are badly necessary. This has to be expelled out to decision makers in Latin America.</p> <p>As a confirmation of that need for data has been mentioned by Bradley R.S, et al, in a paper on "Threats to water supply in the Tropical Andes (Science 23 June 2006), when remarking that the lack of data did not permit to validate their findings. Within this section there is a very interesting paragraph (page 41, lines 1 to 10) which have to be enhanced through the better expression of needs and a reduction in the statement 's extension. Clear, crispy statement are better taken by decision making</p> <p>Finally, regarding the part on Priorities (page 41, lines 12 to 19) it is unsatisfactory to see that the emphasis on the need to enforce simple actions, like better distributed and more reliable observation systems, good monitoring, and the transference from plans to effective operation of watching, warning and alert systems, is missed (Osvaldo Canziani, IPCC WGII Co-chair)</p>	
E-13-704	A	40	10	40	30	Can compress - important but not WG2 specific. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-705	A	40	10	41	10	Far too general and not LA specific. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-706	A	40	14	40	15	It would be important to remark that larger uncertainties in future climate projections are found particularly for precipitation: Precipitation changes over some regions of LA are consistent among different models, but over other regions they are not. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	ALL
E-13-707	A	40	14	40	15	It would be important to remark that larger uncertainties in future climate projections are found particularly for precipitation: Precipitation changes over some regions of LA are consistent among different models, but over other regions they are not. (Silvina Solman, CONICET - UBA)	ALL
E-13-708	A	40	25		30	What other climatic processes are important besides ENSO that need further investigation? (N. Am monsoon, PDO, NAO... ?) (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-709	A	40	25		30	Not useful for operational purposes. (Germán Poveda, Universidad Nacional de Colombia)	ALL
E-13-710	A	40	32			Instead of "predictions", "scenarios" (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	ALL
E-13-711	A	40	37		41	And the diversity of farm systems, the need to capture not only impacts on crops but also on those who farm them. This entails another layer of social complexity and uncertainty, as well as problems of scale and aggregation (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	GM accepted
E-13-712	A	41	1		10	There is a wealth of research available on the impact of climatic stress and social change on social-environmental systems, particularly research that has a long	GM ALL accepted

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						temporal trajectory such as B.L. Turner's work in the Yucatan, and work on climate impacts in pre-hispanic societies, as well as work on contemporary societies and their responses to multiple stresses. Such work provides important insights re: human vulnerability, capacity for adaptation, potential synergies between the biophysical and social environment. More of this research needs to be incorporated into the body of knowledge on climate change -- given the large uncertainties in simulation models. A greater integration of the large body of research on natural resource management in general also offers potential lessons for climate change -- this means closer integration and greater dialog between research communities. Another priority is the need to explore how climate science can best inform policy decisions, and how the needs of disenfranchised populations can be represented in responses to the climate change threat. Monitoring climate change impacts on ecosystems is also a challenge given the lack of long-term financing in the region. The closure of climate stations and declining public investment in research is a serious concern for the region. (Hallie Eakin, University of California)	
E-13-713	A	41	12	41	19	This subsections needs to be strengthened. (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	ALL
E-13-714	A	41	12	41	19	Priorities. It's clear about uncertainty, but within priorities for the region. It's nothing more to say about land use changes, water management and pollution, coastal zones and biodiversity protection?. (Juan Llanes-Reguerio, University of Havana)	ALL
E-13-715	A	41	13	41	19	What are the priorities for LA? To know more about impacts of climate change on rapidly growing urban, generally coastal, populations with pockets of deep poverty; to know more about impacts on key environments such as the Amazon and Wetland regions, glaciated uplands. This text is far too general. (Jean Palutikof, Met Office)	ALL
E-13-716	A	42	1			References: Samalvides Frine, Núñez Rosa, Marquiño Wilmer, Cabezas César y Carrillo Carlos; Cambio Climático: Evaluación de su impacto desde la perspectiva de la Salud Pública, en Perú: Vulnerabilidad frente al Cambio Climático, aproximaciones a la experiencia con el Fenómeno El Niño-CONAM, diciembre de 1999. (Lenkiza Angulo Villarreal, Soluciones Prácticas-ITDG)	
E-13-717	A	42	39	42	41	Please correct the reference as follows: Barros V., A. Menéndez and G. J. Nagy Eds. 2005. El Cambio Climático en el Río de la Plata. 200p. CIMA-CONICET. Buenos Aires. (Jorge Codignotto, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales Universidad de Buenos Aires)	
E-13-718	A	43	32	43	32	This reference is repeated (Carla Encinas, IPCC TSU)	
E-13-719	A	44	41	44	41	Include de following reference (cited at page 7, Table 13.1, Cunha 2004): Cunha, G.R. 2004. Lidando com riscos climáticos - Clima, Sociedade e Agriculture. Passo	

**IPCC WGII AR4 SOD \*EXPERT\* Review Comments**

						Fundo: Embrapa Trigo, 400 p. (Gilberto Cunha, Embrapa-Centro Nacional de Pesquisa de Trigo)	
E-13-720	A	51	30	51	30	Replace Santilli et al. 2004 by "Moutinho and Schwartzman 2005. Tropical Deforestation and Climate Change. Instituto de Pesquisa Ambiental da Amazônia, IPAM, Belém, PA, Brazil. (Paulo Moutinho, Amazon Institute for Environmental Research (IPAM))	