#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1	57191	ΤS	0	0	0	0	The executive summary was written in an attractive and clear words (Amal Saad-Hussein, National Research Center)	Thank you.
2	57566	TS	0	0	0	0	In reading AR5/WG2/Ch.19, we understand the importance of both adaptation and development pathways that may affect risks of RFCs. In Box TS.10 Figure 1, very informative chart of the relationship between acceptable risks, tolerable risks and adaptation limit is shown. By the same token, Figure 19-6 in Chapter 19 of AR5/WG2 that shows the importance of development pathways that affect vulnerability of society should be added to TS. (Mitsutsune Yamaguchi, The University of Tokyo)	The extent to which risks can be reduced through adaptation and mitigation is now highlighted further in section B. The effect of development pathways on vulnerability is also emphasized in the Technical Summary. Additionally, adaptation limits are highlighted in C-2, although it is impossible to do so to the extent of the underlying chapter given Technical Summary page constraints.
3	59802	TS	0	0	0	0	The readability of the Technical Summary for a wide range of readers—including both experts and those with limited understanding and knowledge of climate change and of previous Assessment Reports—would be enhanced by increased attention to definitions of acronyms and terms. Continuity and readability may be enhanced by the inclusion of brief, plain English descriptions of key concepts (either 'in situ' associated with first mention in the text, or as a glossary) and references indicating where in the remainder of the AR5 reports the reader might find more information about unfamiliar terms or acronyms. (AUSTRALIA)	Careful attention has been given to the clarity of wording in the TS, and the WGII AR5 glossary contains definitions of many key concepts. Line-of-sight references to supporting chapter sections are provided for each element of the TS.
4	59803	TS	0	0	0	0	The SPM would benefit from an upfront description of the Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs) and Shared Socioeconomic Pathways (SSPs). These concepts are crucial to an appreciation of what RCPs and SSPs mean. Of note, policymakers are unlikely to understand the description of RCPs as representing "radiative forcing of 2.6, 4.5, 6.0 and 8.5 W m 2". These concepts are also crucial to the the ways in which scenarios might be used (e.g. one way of dealing with uncertainty; offering a tool for thinking about the range of possible futures or for evaluating desirable futures; thinking about trade-offs; developing adaptation policies and their likely benefits), and the implications of uncertainty around future human development pathways for reporting of impacts and vulnerability in the AR5. (AUSTRALIA)	The RCPs are briefly introduced in section A-3, where findings more generally about scenarios can also be found.
5	59804	ΤS	0	0	0	0	Notwithstanding the shift to RCPs/SSP, the SRES scenarios of AR4 should also be described in the Summary for Policymakers given these are used frequently throughout the AR5 reports. (AUSTRALIA)	The continued use of the SRES scenarios in the relevant literature and thus in the report is briefly noted in section A-3.
6	59805	TS	0	0	0	0	The TS would benefit from a brief, plain English description of the climate modelling reported on by WGI, including commentary on advances since AR4 (changes in number and choices of Global Climate Models used, the new RCPs/SSPs; how useful the modelling is at the regional level and implications for downscaling; and so on. That is, reference to 'ensembles of GCMs' is vague and not meaningful). (AUSTRALIA)	Section A-3 presents an entry point to the assessment of WGI, setting the context for the assessment of risks in WGII. The reviewer is referred to WGI for the specific findings. A-3 is intended as a self-standing brief overview of observed temperature and precipitation patterns to date, projected future changes, and use of scenarios, framed as is relevant to the WGII report. The level of detail requested by the reviewer is more relevant for the Synthesis Report rather than the WGII TS.
7	60305	ΤS	0	0	0	0	Human health perspectives on climate change also include the movement of vectorborne diseases (such as malaria), to areas where they were previously found. For example in propagating the vector for malaria is moving to higher elevation's, based on consistent warming trends (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This topic is addressed in section A-1 and especially B-2.
8	60310	TS	0	0	0	0	There should be more evidence-based examples from the Pacific island regions in these "diversity of adaptation experiences" (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This topic is addressed in section A-2, to the extent possible based on the underlying assessment.
9	60815	TS	0	0	0	0	A significant step out in AR5 is inclusion of Chapter 2 on decision-making and the extension of Chapters 14-17 on adaptation. This has already introduced some very valuable new material and insights. However the linkages and complementarities of these chapters are not always clear in the Chapters themselves (they vary significantly in that repsect eg Chapters 2 and 16 do have a decent go at indicating connections). The Technical Summary is an ideal vehicle to quite consciously draw out the linkages in summary form. (Bob Webb, Australian National University)	Findings which integrate information across these chapters are indicated by the line-of-sight references to chapter sections provided in brackets. In addition, Figure 14-1 in Chapter 14 and associated chapter text illustrates linkages between these and other chapters in the report.
10	61848	TS	0	0	0	0	When regional examples are included, they should try to cover all continents or at least provide justification for a particular selection. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Regional examples have been carefully considered to ensure broad coverage of regions, based on published references.

Minas Gerais, Brazil)

IF CC V	/GII AK5	Tech			,			FIRST-ORDER DRAF
#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
11	61849	TS	0	0	0	0	Information on projected impacts is not presented very systematically. Projected impacts are not sufficiently linked to the scenarios and the statements presented about projected impacts are often too generic and lacking clear links to scenarios. Information on scenarios and time horizons is only referred to eventually or incidentally. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	The WGII assessment presents future risks over different timeframes and magnitudes of climate change, making these distinctions to the extent possible based on the assessment of the underlying knowledge base. Linkages to specific scenarios are provided where relevant.
12	61850	TS	0	0	0	0	Projections of future impacts, vulnerabilities and adaptation options should be linked to scenarios and they are seldom mentioned in the TS. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	The WGII assessment presents future risks over different timeframes and magnitudes of climate change, making these distinctions to the extent possible based on the assessment of the underlying knowledge base. Linkages to specific scenarios are provided where relevant.
13	62260	TS	0	0	0	0	The definitions for the key terms of the report follow a completely different concept compared to the AR4 (but also the earlier reports) where vulnerability is a function of exposure (in the sense of the climate signal and not in the sense of physical presence of objects at risk as it is the case here!), sensitivity and adaptive capacity. It should be explained why the definitions have changed and what implication this have for the whole understanding of the concept of 'vulnerability to climate change' which has now rather become a 'risk to be affected by climate change'. This change in 'vulnerability paradigm' may be useful but also may lead to some new problems for example when all climate change impacts are named 'hazards' even when they are slow developing creeping issues. At the same time in some parts of the report the 'old' components of the vulnerability such as 'capacity to adapt' appear again but are not anymore further explained. (Stefan Schneiderbauer, EURAC (European Academy))	Box TS.2 now includes a statement highlighting that some definitions differ from previous IPCC reports, with extended discussion available in the underlying chapters. Vulnerability, exposure, and impacts are defined in this box, and their role as core concepts is highlighted in the introduction to the Technical Summary and in section A-1.
14	63060	TS	0	0	0	0	The regional examples given for each section/sector/subject add value to the report, as it makes things more tangible. However, I was wondering whether there is some sort of logic behind the selection of these regional examples? The most important examples available per subject? Is there a balance of global regions over the TS? Could the logic behind the selection be explicitly mentioned to avoid misunderstanding in terms of regional bias? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	Regional examples have been carefully considered to ensure broad coverage of regions in text examples and tables. Differences in information provided reflect the underlying assessment, which is based on published references.
15	64015	TS	0	0	0	0	Replace in the whole TS "race" by "skin color". Ratio: it is scientifically proved that whole humankind belongs to the same race. (GERMANY)	This term is used in the underlying literature, and thus has been retained.
16	64016	ΤS	0	0	0	0	Structure of document: Generally, in order to provide guidance on the position in the text, it would be extremely helpful to add the letters (A, B, C, D etc.) to each header of sections and subsections. In addition, it would be useful to avoid very long and complicated sentences and to limit core statements up to a maximum of two lines. (GERMANY)	Careful attention has been given to the clarity of wording and logical flow in the Technical Summary.
17	64017	TS	0	0	0	0	Displaying "risk" in figures and tables: It would be very useful to always use the same color code for risk, e.g. yellow to red as in the reasons for concern across the report, e.g. in Table TS.5 and Table TS.7. (GERMANY)	The reasons for concern focus on risk levels across magnitudes of global temperature increase, while Tables TS.4 and TS.5 focus on risk levels across timeframes and the potential for adaptation and mitigation to reduce risks. Somewhat different visualization approaches have been taken given these differences.
18	64018	ΤS	0	0	0	0	The term "emergent risks" is used throughout the TS, in particular in section C.ii, but no clear definition is provided. Please add information on the time frame and conditions (temperature increase?) you are referring to. (GERMANY)	This term is now used only in Table TS.3 and is explained in that context.
19	65512	TS	0	0	0	0	The increase in climate change adaption research is mentioned in the introductory section. I believe that there should be some mention of the recent impact research, not just on a regional scale but on a cummunity scale. We have new capabilities with increases in computational power and modelling software accuracy that can improve our understanding of physical impacts to specific areas over the poorly understood time scales of 100years (ie SLR on specific coastal areas and changes in rainfall on rivers). (Michael Miloshis, Charles Darwin University)	These topics are addressed in Box TS.1 and section A-3.
20	65847	ΤS	0	0	0	0	this chapter is so good that it should converted into a manual on CC. (Milton Nogueira da Silva, Climate Change Forum of	Thank you.

	From From To To La									
#	ID	Ch			n To Page		Comment	Response		
21	65848	TS	0	0	0		the terms "very likely", "about as likely as not" "exceptionally unlikely" etc may be rigorous in science writing, but are confusing and difficult to grasp. They may even be misleading to journalists, politicians, scholars in humanities, pundits, and the general public, while meaning different things to laypeople. Deniers will easily distort the meaning. Terms should be replaced by writing style. Please see my comment on language tone, above. (Milton Nogueira da Silva, Climate Change Forum of Minas Gerais, Brazil)	These terms are defined in Box TS.3 to avoid ambiguity in interpretation.		
22	68015	TS	0	0	0	0	In reading AR5/WG2/Ch.19, we understand the importance of both adaptation and development pathways that may affect risks of RFCs. In Box TS.10 Figure 1, very informative chart of the relationship between acceptable risks, tolerable risks and adaptation limit is shown. By the same token, Figure 19-6 in Chapter 19 of AR5/WG2 that shows the importance of development pathways that affect vulnerability of society should be added to TS. (JAPAN)	The extent to which risks can be reduced through adaptation and mitigation is now highlighted further in section B. The effect of development pathways on vulnerability is also emphasized in the Technical Summary. Additionally, adaptation limits are highlighted in C-2, although it is impossible to do so to the extent of the underlying chapter given Technical Summary page constraints.		
23	68068	ΤS	0	0	0	0	The Technical Summary includes little reference to Asia in comparison with other regions (Australasia, North America and Europe in particular). Asia covers a vast and diverse area and therefore multiple examples from different subregions should be provided as special regional examples. (JAPAN)	Regional examples have been carefully considered to ensure broad coverage of regions in text examples and tables. Differences in information provided reflect the underlying assessment.		
24	68242	TS	0	0	0	0	"Summary for Policymakers" as well as Technical Summary paid practically no attention to geoengineering options though such options are discussed in many chapters of WGII SOD. However, nowadays it becomes more and more clear that only geoengineering approach can efficiently stave off potential climatic crisis in the second half of the 21-st century. It should be also kept in mind that climate engineering does not replace any mitigation measures. Such approaches have their own significance and can be applied in parallel with geoengineering. (RUSSIAN FEDERATION)	This topic has been incorporated to the extent possible, based on the assessment of the underlying knowledge base. The effect of geoengineering strategies on level of climate change is assessed in WGIII, whereas their effects on the physical climate system are assessed in WGI. Only the more narrow assessment of consequences for human and natural systems is included in WGII, and the topic is only addressed in a handful of chapters. Integrated synthesis across the Working Groups will occur in the Synthesis Report.		
25	68542	TS	0	0	0	0	New Zealand results are frequently omitted from Australasia summaries, even where they are reported alongside results for Australia in the Chapter (NETHERLANDS)	Information on New Zealand has been included, consistent with the assessment in Chapter 25.		
26	70413	ΤS	0	0	0	0	In the TS and SPM of this report, the concept of Exposure is exactly the same as in the Summary for Policy Makers of the SREX (2012). However, its accuracy should be enhanced by adding at the end (after "in places that could be adversely affected"): by a hazard in this case related with climate variability or climate change. (COLOMBIA)	The relevant scope of hazard types considered is specified within the definition for impacts and is not repeated within the definitions for vulnerability and exposure.		

IPCC W		ie				,			FIRST-ORDER DRAFT
#	ID	Ch	۲ P;		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
27	70414	TS	5 0	0		0	0	In the TS and SPM of this report, the concept of Vulnerability to climate chang is he same as in the Summary for Policy Makers of the SREX (2012). However, it is different from the one published in the Fourth Assessment Report (2007), which may cause confusion among people working in this topic. In the Fourth Assessment Report the concept was "The degree to which a system is susceptible to, and unable to cope with, adverse effects of climate change, including climate variability and extremes. Vulnerability is a function of the character, magnitude, and rate of climate change and variation to which a system is exposed, the sensitivity and adaptive capacity of that system", and here the concept was summarized as "The propensity or predisposition to be adversely affected". Based on the concept published in the Fourth Assessment Report most of the current studies related to vulnerability analysis have been done based on the issue that we should consider: Exposure Sensitivity and Adaptive Capacity (some examples of studies applying this conceptual framework are listed below). In this sense, the Fifth Assessment Report should make clear if the concept of Vulnerability changed or if it's still being considered as a function of the Exposure, Sensitivity and Adaptive Capacity of the system. In the Chapter 14 this clarification is done, but this is not reflected in the TS and SPM. • Klausmeyer K.R., M.R Shaw , J.B MacKenzie, and D.R Cameron 2011, 'Landscape-scale indicators of biodiversity's vulnerability to climate change', Ecosphere, 2 (8), p. 1-18, viewed 18 Mayo 2013, http://www.esajournals.org/doi/full/10.1890/ES11-00044.1 • Glick P., B.A Stein, and N.A Edelson, 2011, Scanning the Conservation Horizon: A Guide to Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment, National Wildlife Federation, Washington, D.C, viewed 18 Mayo 2013, http://www.med.org/News-and-Magazines/Media-Center/Reports/Archive/2011/Scanning-the-Horizon.aspx • Institute of Hydrology Meteorology and Environmental Studies of Colombia - IDEAM, 2010, 'Chapter 4	definitions differ from previous IPCC reports. Vulnerability is defined in this box and its role as a core concept is highlighted in the introduction to the Technical Summary and in section A- 1.
28	70415	TS	5 0		0	0	0	The Figure "Schematic of the interaction among the physical climate system, exposure, and vulnerability producing risk" (Figure TS.2. and SPM.1), is very clear and useful to understand Risk. However, in the figure it should be visible how Vulnerability is being considered (as a function of Exposure, Sensitivity and Adaptive Capacity? or just the suceptibility to suffer loss or damage?). As an evolution of the Figure presented in the SREX (2012) it is here clear that you are considering Exposure with Vulnerability (within the same circle), which makes sense. However, the figure could be clearer (the Exposure is an internal condition of the Vulnerability? no Exposure means no Vulnerabiliry? what about Sensitivity and Adaptive Capacity?). The Figure seams conceptually congruent with risk definition, but not with vulnerability definition (which is clarified in the Chapter 14, but not in this figure). (COLOMBIA)	The relationship between hazards, exposure, and vulnerability as determinants of risk has been clarified in the figure.
29	70416	TS	5 0		0	0	0	In the TS and SPM of this report, the definition of "emergent risk" is not as clear as the concept of "key risk". Even though there are some examples of "emergent risks" in this part of the report, the definition should be clearly presented before these examples. Also, because the Figure TS.2 shows the concept "emergent risk" and indicates that the definition will be foun in Section C.ii. (COLOMBIA)	This term is now used only in Table TS.3 and is explained in that context.
30	70417	TS	5 0		0	0	0	This is a suggestion for the "Table TS.8. and SPM.5": this Table shows a column with the title "Key vulnerabilities", however the content of some rows does not reflect what is the key vulnerability of the item analyzed. This is the case of: "Vulnerability of aquatic systems and vulnerability of aquatic services" or "Increasing vulnerability of small landholders in agriculture". This column should be revised in order to make clear what is making each item more or less vulnerable (its exposure or sensitivity or adaptive capacity or all of them, instead of its vulnerability which is too general). In the page 69, question 5, of the Frequently Asked Questions, there is a list of considerations of a "key vulnerability" which should be consistent with what is showed in this Table as an example. (COLOMBIA)	
31	70418	TS	5 0		0	0	0	If these are summaries for technicals (TS) and policy and decision makers (SPM), it is desirable to include a brief summary of Adaptation Assessments, which is presented in the Chapter 14. Decision makers do not have clarity about how to design, prioritize, and evaluate adaptation measures. Also, this is useful for technicians and scientists. (COLOMBIA)	This topic is addressed in section A-2.
32	76227	TS	5 0		0	0	0	Comment to the whole document - The TS gives the impression that the sky is falling. Suggest the inclusion of examples of changes that have been documented. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Observed impacts are presented in section A-1.
33	76228	TS	5 0		0	0	0	Comment to the whole document - There are several references to results from AR4 (specifically noted). This chapter would be well served to update with new AR5 information (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The Technical Summary presents information from the Working Group II AR5 assessment.
						I	1	1	

				From	To	То		
#	ID	Ch	Page	Line	Page	Line	Comment	Response
34	76229	TS	0	0	0	0	Detection and attribution need to be defined; and any deviation from the WG1 invocation of these terms needs to be explained. Most importantly, the agree-upon definition needs to be used consistently. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Detection and attribution in WGII and differences from the WGI context are described in section A-1.
35	76230	TS	0	0	0	0	The authors need to have a careful scrub of the chapter to remove mentions of "will" when in fact the statements are based on projections of some future outcomes. More appropriate would be language like "may" or "projections show", etc. These statements cannot be presented as fact. (e.g., p. 35, L33) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The calibrated uncertainty language (e.g., levels of confidence) associated with such statements indicates the degree of certainty in each conclusion. As specified in guidance for authors, words such as "may" paired with uncertainty language are less precise than "will" paired with uncertainty language. All instances of calibrated uncertainty language in the Technical Summary have been carefully checked by authors to maximize precision.
36	76231	TS	0	0	0	0	The authors should take care in attributing degraded ecosystems to climate change when in fact, many ecosystem shifts have been triggered by non-climate related human activities. Climate is likely a necessary component of change to these changes, but not necessary and sufficient. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Non-climatic factors have been carefully considered in the context of attribution, which is summarized in section A-1 (see the table and figure on detection and attribution).
37	76232	ΤS	0	0	0	0	The issue of jargon is problematic. From a non-social science perspective, what are the "actors, states and institutions" that are discussed? There is likely to be the same issue from a social science perspective, there is jargon on the physical or natural sciences side that should also be addressed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Careful attention has been given to the clarity of wording in the Technical Summary.
38	76233	TS	0	0	0	0	The regional plots/tables are well coordinated. The reader would benefit from an illustratin of geater coherence among regions, so it is easy to compare information between world regions. There are many good ideas here about how to present the information but they are inconsistent in their presentation. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Regional examples have been carefully considered to ensure broad coverage of regions in text examples and tables. Differences in information provided reflect the underlying assessment, which is based on published literature.
39	76234	ΤS	0	0	0	0	The text that discusses biodiversity is heavily slanted towards the bias that low biodiversity is bad. In fact, many systems prior to European settlement in North America, for example, were monocultures and, with poor management have crossed systematic thresholds into what are now highly diverse systems with regards to biota. These are unnatural systems that are undesireable from a management system, but in fact, have significantly accelerated nitrogen cycling (think woody plant encroachment - again, not an invasive problem). (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Balance of assessment on topics related to biodiversity has been considered. Assessment of risks does consider large-scale changes in biodiversity, for example as associated with extinction risk.
40	76235	TS	0	0	0	0	There are several sections that discuss ecosystem services and problems with invasives. How invasives are defined is unclear. Are these instances of alien invasive species (e.g., as in Bromus tectorum in the Palouse prairie of the US, or rabbits in Australia), or do these statements actually reflect the consequences of human activities, often in tandem with climate change that facilitate encroachment of existing species? Please clarify. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Invasive species are defined in the glossary for the report.
41	76236	TS	0	0	0	0	This document is rather long with much repetition, especially between introductory text, followed by regional examples within a section. In many instances, the regional text provides greater insight than the introductory text. There are a few sections (Food Production, Key Economic Sectors, etc) that are disproportionally short. Suggest standardizing so there is more consistency in length and level of detail. Filtering out redundant text will make this task easier. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Careful attention has been given to the clarity and logical flow of the Technical Summary. Length and redundancy have been reduced. Regional examples have been carefully considered to ensure broad coverage of regions in text examples and tables. Differences in information provided reflect the underlying assessment.
42	76237	ΤS	0	0	0	0	While the TS provides information on how likelihood, risk and confidence statements are communicated, it is not clear to what extent a statement is based on expert judgement as opposed to literature findings. One can only assume that if there is no cited reference, then an assessment is based on 100% expert judgement which is problematic for a scientific assessment. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	As stated in the introduction to the Technical Summary, line-of- sight references in square brackets to chapter sections indicate where the evaluation of the relevant literature can be found that supports each statement in the Technical Summary.
43	77303	TS	0	0	0	0	"CO2 Effect" in the map titles is confusing: expand to e.g. "Direct Effect of CO2 on Crops" or "CO2 Fertilization" (with brief explanation in the caption). (William Ingram, Met Office)	The effects of CO2 are diverse, and thus the title has been retained in its current form.

IPCC \	WGII AR5	Tech	nical	Sumr	nary		
#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Comment
"		CII	Page	Line	Page	Line	comment
44	79311	TS	0	0	0	0	There is a huge amount of repetiti

			From	From	To	То		
#	ID	Ch	Page	Line	Page	Line	Comment	Response
44	79311	TS	0	0	0	0	There is a huge amount of repetition between the SPM and the TS. Whilst the SPM is likely to change considerably, we would like the authors to really think about the different audiences for the two summaries. A greater depth of information should be drawn out in the TS and the SPM should focus on pulling together these messages for the policymaker. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Careful consideration has been given to the relationship between the SPM and Technical Summary. The Technical Summary provides a greater depth of information on the key messages highlighted in the SPM, and thus the repetition is intentional to form part of the traceable account of the SPM.
45	85201	ΤS	0	0	0	0	A bit obsessed with the idea that warming is happening (which it is not) and that it is caused by carbon dioxide (for which there is no evidence), too dependent on the biased views of your employees and too frantic. Some useful advice but too much emphasis on disasters (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	Thank you for this comment.
46	56987	ΤS	1	1	1	1	Remove 2014 since it implies that the impacts, adaptation and vulnerabilty being the subject of the document refer to climate change of the year 2014 only (KENYA)	2014 is part of the title of the report and thus cannot be changed.
47	79879	ΤS	1	31	1	31	Please rewrite this heading in accordance with SPM page 1, line 32: "Impacts, vulnerabilities,". (NORWAY)	These titles have now been harmonized.
48	64019	ΤS	2	0	4	0	The introduction is very useful in explaining the concepts, definitions of critical terms and uncertainty language, this increases the readability of the whole TS and is highly appreciated. (GERMANY)	Thank you for this comment.
49	56988	TS	2	10	2	10	Box SPM.1 referred to here is far towards the end of the last pages of the document. This location is really inconvenient for a reader to keep on turning pages of a document to refer the the box. It is noted that virtually all tables, figures and boxes are not within the same subject which they refer to and the reader has to keep seraching where they are located which is very inconvenient indeed. Further, all these labeledSPM, another confusion again since this is a Tecnical Summary ! hence for clarity, lableing of figures, boxes, tables should be TS (KENYA)	Labeling is now correct, with placement in layout adopting the same approaches taken in the underlying chapters.
50	68543	ΤS	2	29	2	30	It states 'literature has more than doubled'. Strictly seen the figure 1.1-a in Chapter 1 shows a near doubling for the climate change literature when comparing 2005 and 2010. Extrapolating this trend towards the current year 2013, We indeed expect that the claim that 'literature has more than doubled' is supported. Please spend some attention to this in the body text of chapter 1, to substantiate the claim. (NETHERLANDS)	The intended time frame of 2005-2010 is now specified, with the full traceable account for the finding provided in the referenced chapter section.
51	78538	тs	2	29	2	44	While qualitatively reflecting the truth, the Box TS.1 Figure 1 is may be quantitatively misleading as support for the assertion in the text. Researchers in developing countries (think South America and francophone Africa, probably China) often do not publish in English. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Results of more extended searches across languages are provided in the underlying chapter.
52	60283	ΤS	2	30	2	30	There needs to be an author with this "very high confidence" (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Presentation of a level of confidence here matches conventions used throughout the document, following the uncertainties guidance provided to authors.
53	64883	ΤS	2	32	2	33	Most of research on climate change have been done by individual/s or groups from independent research centre or academic institutes where the Governments of developing countries have minimum involvement on these research. (Md Younus, Lecturer, School of the Environment, Flinders University, Research Fellow, Adelaide University, South Australia)	Discussion of institutions is no longer included.
54	68544	TS	2	41	2	44	Figure 1-1 does not depict 1-1 b, although text refers to this. Please add 1-1 b to the map in Figure 1-1 (NETHERLANDS)	Only 2 sub panels are now included within this figure.
55	64884	ΤS	2	51	2	51	Adapatation limits, processes and transformation in (Md Younus, Lecturer, School of the Environment, Flinders University, Research Fellow, Adelaide University, South Australia)	This paragraph is no longer included.
56	65671	TS	3	3	3	3	"among planning for adaptation". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This typo was again missed but will be addressed in copyedit.
57	64020	ΤS	3	21	3	22	In the second bullet, please mention the term "likelihood". (GERMANY)	This text is taken directly from the uncertainties guidance for authors. The essential distinction is that quantified measures of uncertainty are broader than just likelihood.
58	70771	TS	3	22	0	0	Box TS.2. has a definition on Exposure. I think this is the combination of Exposure and Sensitivity in the older 3-component- approach such as V = f(E, S, AC). It is better to explain it somewhere in the box. (Stockholm Environment Institute)	The revised definition of vulnerability makes mention of sensitivity for clarity with respect to previous definitions. Additionally, the revised glossary provides more extended context on past definitions.

#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Comment	Response
#			Page		Page	Line		
59	60284	TS	3	22	3	56	Under glossary terms critical: needs to be references in each of these (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	All glossary terms can be found in the glossary for the report, with footnotes and references used in the glossary where appropriate.
60	61851	ΤS	3	22	4	7	The changes to the definitions are not properly justified. Are they easy to understand or clear for policy makers? Are these definitions clear enougth or better than the previous, accepted definitions? And some of them (e.g. exposure, vulnerability) seem quite incompletely (adversely affected by what?). The definition of adaptation, with different definitions for human and natural systems, is quite confusing. Incremental adaptation: "Incumbent systems" is unclear and climate change is not mentioned. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Further context for all definitions is provided in the report glossary, with footnotes and citations given where appropriate. The definition of the adaptation has been clarified, including in its sub entries. The basis for all changes in definitions is discussed at length in the underlying chapters.
61	68545	TS	3	29	3	29	Delete 'the' before 'solar cycles' (NETHERLANDS)	In the working group 2 contribution, the definition of climate change is adopted from the working group 1 contribution, for consistency across the assessment. Thus this change has not been made.
62	65672	ΤS	3	34	3	34	Do you need to say which definition has been adopted here? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	The primary definition is that presented 1st after the bolded term.
63	62261	TS	3	36	3	37	This definition of exposure taken from the disaster risk community is not always applicable in the climate change context where the zones affected are often not clearly dedicated and delinated as for example in the case of a flood (Stefan Schneiderbauer, EURAC (European Academy))	This definition is the one used throughout the report in the context of assessment of impacts and risks.
64	64021	TS	3	36	3	45	How do exposure, vulnerability and impact relate to risk? please add this information. (GERMANY)	This relationship is now clarified in the connections between definitions of impacts and risk.
65	65673	TS	3	41	3	41	Would it be useful to allow the distinction between impacts and responses here? Natural ecosystems and society respond to climate change which is different from being impacted by climate change. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	The relation between the concepts of impacts and responses is clarified where relevant in the assessment, especially for ecosystems.
66	68546	TS	3	48	3	48	Delete 'which' (NETHERLANDS)	This word is no longer used.
67	76238	TS	3	52	3	56	These secondary adaptation definitions do not add value and, in fact, will likely confuse the reader. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The adaptation definition has been further clarified, with the sub entries retained to reflect core usage across the entirety of the report. The authors across chapters feel the subentries are necessary to reflect this usage.
68	64022	ΤS	3	53	3	54	Please do never ever use additional terms to quantify likelihood, that leads to confusion and weakens the whole concept of using agreed uncertainty language across the AR5. (GERMANY)	It is unclear to what this comment is referring.
69	61852	TS	4	2	4	3	Is "hazardous event" the best term to use to refer to the varied impacts of climate change? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	A broader phrase, "event or disturbance," is now used. The concept of a hazardous event is also used centrally in the risk definition.
70	76239	TS	4	4	2	3	Suggest deleting "anticipate, reduce, accommodate" as not germane to resilience, which is solely the ability to recover quickly from a perturbation. Anticipation and reduction are not ecological properties, also. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This phrase is no longer used.
71	79312	TS	4	8	4	8	Why not provide a definition for "mitigation" as it is referred to in the text (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	To maintain a short concise list within this box, the term mitigation has not been included since it is most centrally unde the purview of working group 3.
72	85194	ΤS	4	13	4	55	All these assessments are by people who have a conflict of interest, since they are paid to make them . Alternative unbiased opinioins such as mine are unwelcome and ignored. (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	Author teams are required to consider the full range of available evidence and agreement for all topics assessed.
73	65674	TS	4	24	4	24	"an evaluation by the team of authors" Better? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Improved wording has been adopted, dropping the mention of an author team.
74	60285	TS	4	36	4	36	Remove double end parentheses after "Figure 1.4" (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	The double brackets are required.

#	ID	Ch	From Page		n To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
75	64029	TS	5	0	18	0	Section A.i.: It is difficult to follow the structure of this section. The back and forth between observed impacts on the one hand, and vulnerabilities and risk on the other is confusing. The subsections on sectors and regions in section A.i would greatly profit, if language and structure could be revised in a way that enable easy differentiation between observed impacts, present vulnerabilities, and emerging/future risks: 1) remove duplications, 2) statements human/social/economic and biophysical/natural systems, 3) statements on the past, present and future situation, 4) information on detection and attribution, 5) statements on climate change phenomena from its impacts, 6) identify vulnerability and risks, 7) The difference between the specific regional examples given for each sector and the examples given in Table TS.1 is not obvious. (For example, list on P 13, L 6: why is the example on Europe mentioned in this list, and not in Table TS.1? What are the criteria for choosing these "specific regional examples"? Is the choice related to a difference between an observed climate change impact, and a detected and attributed impact? If yes, this should be spelled out more clearly. Clarity and comprehensibility would be improved by including all examples into table TS.2. 8) Uncertainty needs to added to each key statement. (GERMANY)	Substantially improved flow across the section has been achieved, including a revision to its structure overall.
76	64023	TS	5	1	5	1	Please adjust the wording of heading A) to the more logical heading A) in the SPM. (GERMANY)	Harmonization of the headings has been achieved.
77	68547	ΤS	5	1	21	26	The section on 'Vulnerabilities, Impacts,' is very elaborate on what can be attributed to climate change and what cannot be attributed or has been rated as low confidence but it would be good if at the beginning of the section, the role of the other factors apart from climate change are defined e.g population and the interrelations especially as it relates to adaptation and vulnerability and briefly on how it was decided what is attributable to climate change and what is not before going into the details. A good example is marine systems where some studies have shown that it is not climate change or population (leading to over-fishing) but actually water quality that is leading to a decline in fish populations in some water bodies and since the waste is from municipal waste - the authorities report that it is actually climate change. How do we ensure that these factors are well addressed in the report and the attribution to climate change is well researched and proven? (NETHERLANDS)	At the start of this section and in the specific findings that follow for each sector, the role of non-climate stressors is considered and communicated. Wording is substantially clearer than in the previous draft.
78	76240	тs	5	5	54	54	This statement should have a level of confidence assigned to it. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is now provided within a paragraph asserting very high confidence.
79	57442	TS	5	6	0	0	Consider adding (phenology) after 'activities' (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	This comment is misplaced.
80	57443	TS	5	12	0	0	Consider adding (phenology) after 'activities' (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	This comment is misplaced.
81	64024	TS	5	12	5	12	Please adjust the wording of heading A.i. to the heading A.i. in the SPM. (GERMANY)	The titles have been harmonized.
82	61853	TS	5	12	5	38	Africa and Asia are not included here and are particularly vulnerable to certain events. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Through the newly added figure (Figure TS.2) and the retained table (Table TS.1), further emphasis on impacts across regions is now provided.
83	85195	ΤS	5	16	5	17	The absence of warming for the past 15 years and the persistent cold winters in the Northern Hemisphere are largely ignored (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	Assessment and attribution of climate change occurs, for this topic, in the working group 1 contribution.
84	60286	TS	5	19	5	19	"Stronger evidence" based on what ? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Within the technical summary, only high-level findings can be presented. Extended information on the underlying evidence is provided within the referenced chapter sections.
85	61854	TS	5	24	5	25	The example of Europe needs further development. As it stands it is rather poor. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Through the newly added figure (Figure TS.2) and the retained table (Table TS.1), further emphasis on impacts across regions is now provided.
86	76241	TS	5	25	5	25	Does Table TS.1 make any attempt to distribute what component of change in water quality, rain/snow, temperature versus snowpack, etc. are responsible for ecosystem response? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The table now includes assessment of whether the contribution of climate change is major or minor.
87	79313	TS	5	25	5	28	Table TS. 1, in the 'Europe' section on 'Coastal and Marine' the information on cod and eelpout seems very specific, given the high-level nature of the document. The shift in cod distribution (given a high confidence score) is actually quite controversial, and there is much argument about whether the shift is due to climate or depletion by the fishery. There is huge literature base on European fish distribution shifts, so the inclusion of these specific studies seems very narrow. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Revised wording in Table TS.1 is more appropriately broad, based on substantial available evidence.
88	65675	TS	5	35	5	35	"attributional" adjective rather than noun? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This phrase is no longer used.
89	76242	TS	5	37	5	38	Research needed for the risk and impacts of extreme events? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
90	61855	TS	5	41	7	17	This section places a lot of emphasis on vulnerability drivers relating to social and socioeconomic factors. While these factors are very important to define differential vulnerability within particular communities and socioeconomic systems, the section lacks reference to the primary causes of vulnerability, i.e. those affecting everybody, such as the presence of people and assets in vulnerable or exposed areas, the biophysical and climate drivers in different geographies, etc. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Improved balance within this subsection has been achieved, with more information on vulnerability and exposure to climate variability especially.
91	61856	TS	5	41	7	56	The evidence, confidence and agreement of statementsn in this section should be included. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Calibrated uncertainty language is now included.
92	64025	TS	5	43	0	0	What does "systemic" signify here? (The statement on p 3, I 28 of the SPM does not contain this word.) And are these systemic drivers also non-biophysical? (GERMANY)	This word is no longer included in this finding.
93	61946	TS	5	43	5	51	Still no mention of sensitivity to climate change. This may go beyond 'multi-dimensional' vulnerability - which focuses here on power and equality - and environmental degradation, rather than the environment even without degradation. Perhaps there is a wish to avoid any hint of environmental determinism here, but at the expense of saying that the cards you are dealt with can be a major factor in a priori sensitivity to climate change? (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	Broader reference to non-climate stressors and variations in vulnerability and exposure is now made.
94	64026	TS	5	44	5	44	After "impacts" add "on people and communities". Rationale: it should be said clearly in the first sentence of the para what or who is at risk. (GERMANY)	The word impacts is no longer used, although broad framing is maintained given the number of affected systems, sectors, and people.
95	60287	ΤS	5	44	5	45	AR4 the framing of adaptation is moved further from the focus on biophysical" (need source here and page number) (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This sentence is no longer included.
96	64027	TS	5	47	5	47	See also comment referring to SPM: To use the term "gender" in this context is confusing and contraproductive. The term "gender" refers to the physical, mental, and behavioral characteristics distinguishing between masculinity and femininity, hence is socially constructed. The term "sex" distinguishes between men and women biologically. People are discriminated / more vulnerable because of their sex not because of their gender. Therefore, in this paragraph the term "sex" should be used, not the term "gender". (GERMANY)	Gender is no longer mentioned in this paragraph, although it is considered in the associated box (Box TS.4). Gender is favored given that it has fewer secondary meanings.
97	65676	TS	5	48	5	48	"Uneven pathways of socio-economic development" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This phrase is no longer used.
98	63054	TS	5	49	5	50	I suggest to include power imbalance. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This sentence is no longer included.
99	68548	TS	5	53	5	53	Notice that in chapter 19 the paragraph 19.6.1.3 starts with "Vulnerability and exposure of societies and social-ecological systems". In the TS and SPM this changes to "Vulnerability and exposure of communities or social-ecological systems". There are differences between societies and communities. The term society is more general, and it also refers to a social kind of organization, like human ones, but not all communities are social. In a biological context, community can refer to a community of animals or plants. In this case it is clear from the content of the paragraph that the the subject is human, so in the summaries the term "communities" should probably be changed to "societies". (NETHERLANDS)	A more concise formulation is now used, avoiding ambiguities and ensuring consistency with the Chapter 19 assessment.
100	64028	TS	5	53	6	2	The level of confidence is missing in this para. (GERMANY)	The 1st sentence of this paragraph is now embedded in a paragraph asserting very high confidence.
101	60288	TS	5	54	5	54	Effective "disaster" risk reduction. Should have the word "disaster" here . (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This sentence is no longer included.
102	65677	TS	5	54	5	54	"adaptational" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Adaptation is the more commonly used word, and thus is retained even in this usage as an adjective.
103	61857	TS	5	56	6	1	What is the meaning of this statement? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	More extended explanation is available in the underlying assessment supporting this statement.
104	76243	TS	6	6	6	6	It is arguable whether wealth affects level of vulnerability, as opposed to level of resilience. The examples given in the subsequent finding are all from wealthy countries. All nations with coastal zones are vulnerable to sea level rise independent of wealth. Suggesting reconsidering the assignment of "very high confidence" here unless the statement addresses resilience instead of vulnerability. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The statement is now associated with high confidence where it is included in section A. Support for the assertion is available in the referenced chapter sections.
105	76244	TS	6	6	6	8	What about health as a factor that influences vulnerability? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The phrase "socioeconomic factors" has been added to better describe the scope of factors listed.

ŧ	ID	Ch		From	To Page	To	Comment	Response
.06	68549	TS	6	6	6	11	This paragraph is difficult to read. Suggest simplifying or rephrasing. The last sentence is particularly confusing and could be split in two. (NETHERLANDS)	The revised paragraph has been clarified.
.07	68550	TS	6	6	6	11	Although this paragraph generally fits the discussion in the Chapter referred to, none of the Chapter sections specifically discuss the dependency of future vulnerability to the factors such as wealth and its distribution across society, patterns of aging, access to technology and information, labor force participation, societal values, and mechanisms and institutions to resolve conflicts. (NETHERLANDS)	A broader set of supporting chapter sections is now provided.
.08	76245	ΤS	6	6	17	23	These details are not mentioned in Table TS.2 but seem like they would be better placed there than in the text; similar details are not given in the other bullets (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This table is no longer included, and instead, a broader set of examples is provided in this bullet list.
.09	64031	TS	6	12	0	0	The expression "some ecosystems and many human systems" is very vague, so that although "very high confidence" is attributed to it, it is not very useful. Could you be more specific? (GERMANY)	The long set of examples provided is intended to illustrate the diversity of relevant systems.
10	76246	TS	6	12	6	12	Suggest that the authors re-word this sentence so that 'current climate variability' is up front. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The sentence has instead been broadened to refer to "climate variability."
.11	78536	TS	6	12	6	26	This section is about vulnerability "to current climate variability", while Table TS.2 is about risk to extreme events under climate change. The meteorological/climate columns of Table TS.2 therefore do not bear any relevance. The "impacts" columns in Table TS.2 also appear parallel to the bullet points in the text and so these could be merged (into table or text). Also, note that one of the main ideas with Table 18-4 (and thus Table TS.2) is to convey the concept of risk in relation to extreme events. When discussing vulnerability, as here, we may have *very high confidence* that the hurricane *caused* the property damage, but if we are discussing risk then we may have to say instead that the hurricane was *a major contributing factor* (along with building codes for instance), possibly with lower confidence. Thus the confidence assessments in Table TS.2 may not directly relate to the discussion of vulnerability here. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This table is no longer included.
12	65345	ΤS	6	12	6	37	While cases of Australia, New Zealand and North America are mainly described, those of other regions including Asia are not included. In Korea, 67 people lost their lives due to floods in Seoul and Gyeonggi area in 2011 and heat waves in 2012 resulted in a large number of heat-related patients. (Source: J of Preventive Medicine and public health 2013;46:19-27) (REPUBLIC OF KOREA)	Examples across a broader set of regions are now provided, based on examples available in the underlying assessment. In all cases, further details are available in the underlying chapters.
13	68016	ΤS	6	12	6	37	There are no examples of Asian impacts from recent extreme climatic events. A suggested addition is: "Asia experienced the highest number of weather- and climate-related disasters in the world during the period 2000-2008 and suffered huge economic losses, accounting for the second highest proportion (27.5%) of the total global economic loss. (Chapter 24 page 29 lines 42-44)" (JAPAN)	Examples are now provided across a broader set of regions, based on examples provided by authors across the regional chapters. In all cases, further details are available in the underlying chapters.
14	64030	TS	6	12	6	45	This paragraph should be moved to the beginning of this section (P5 L 42) because it is closely related to the prior paragraph (P5 L 14- 38). If it is left at its current position, it interrupts the reading flow on vulnerability. (GERMANY)	Improved flow across paragraphs in this section has been achieved.
15	64032	ΤS	6	13	6	15	Put "human" instead of "ecosystem" first. (GERMANY)	The rationale for this suggestion is not clear. Flow across the examples has been improved, although ordering has not been substantially shifted.
16	64033	TS	6	15	6	16	The statement "developed and developing countriesfor some sectors and within some regions" is at the same time ubiquitous and vague. Please clarify what is meant here. (GERMANY)	The expanded list of specific examples is intended to further illustrate support for this important finding of the assessment.
17	68551	TS	6	15	6	16	The statement, "These experiences are consistent with a significant adaptation deficit" followed by "See Table TS.2" suggests that Table TS.2 should mention something about adaptation deficit, however it does not. "See Table TS.2" would be better places after the previous sentence that end with "consequences for mental health and human well-being." because infrastructure, mortality, etc. are mentioned in table TS.2 (NETHERLANDS)	This table is no longer included.
18	64034	ΤS	6	16	6	46	Line 16 mentions and the subsequent bullet point indicate a "significant adaptation deficit" (please add uncertainty of this statement), but this is not reflected in Table TS.2 (GERMANY)	Table 2 is no longer included. A sentence has been added to the uncertainty language box to clarify interpretation of confidence levels within a paragraph, as well.
19	78537	ΤS	6	17	6	22	"caused", "destroyed", "resulted in": In WGII it is not enough to say that some weather event "caused" some damage without some assessment of the confidence of the assertion. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Please note that these examples are not asserting attribution to climate change, rather they are a more factual description of impacts observed from recent extreme events.

IPCC WGII AR5 Technical Summary Ch

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
120	68552	ΤS	6	17	6	23	It is accurate but a large understatement to say that drought resulted in mental health problems, when in Chapter 25 it is stated that many suicides occurred. (NETHERLANDS)	This part of the example is no longer included.
121	61858	ΤS	6	24	6	25	Which extreme events in Europe? 2003 heatwave? 2002 floods? Effects of heatwaves have diminished since 2003. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This is meant to be a broad conclusion across multiple extreme events in recent years.
122	63055	тs	6	26	6	25	How this economic sectors in North America respond to extreme weather events? In terms of adaptation? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This bullet list and paragraph focus on observed impacts, rather than adaptation.
123	76247	ΤS	6	26	6	26	What economic sectors are affected? This goes to general statement above on the use of the term 'sector'. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is an assessment finding, with full support provided within the referenced chapter sections.
124	63058	ΤS	6	26	6	35	If feasible it would be interesting to provide some numbers for this example, e.g. for no. Of vulnerable elements, damage (e.g. in USD). (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	Examples in this list primarily draw from conclusions made at the level of executive summary statements within underlying chapters, and full support can be found within the underlying chapter sections.
125	63056	ΤS	6	30	6	30	I suggest to replace the term (strom) 'pathway' with storm track or trajectory, because previously in the report pathway was used for socio-economic pathways (to avoid confusion). (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	The word pathway is no longer used here.
126	76815	TS	6	34	0	0	For instance hurricane Katrina with winds up to 224km/h, Mississippi bank burst, New Orleans was flooded and oil rigs severly damaged. It lead to 165 USD bn economic losses whereof 76 USD bn were insured. http://media.swissre.com/documents/sigma2_2006_en.pdf#page=21 (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	More specific examples are now provided for this statement, with much more extended detail available in the underlying chapters.
127	63057	TS	6	36	6	36	What does timeliness mean in this context? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	The sentence is no longer included.
128	76248	ΤS	6	36	6	37	This statement is REALLY important. Please clarify, detection and attribution of what? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence is no longer included.
129	60289	ΤS	6	38	6	38	Needs to be an additional bullet point in here regarding the Pacific island countries with respect to recent floods and severe damage of infrastructure and settlements in this past year (2011-2012) (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Examples are provided across more regions than before, based on material available in underlying regional chapters, as provided by the assessment authors. A paragraph on small islands however was not added, following from material available at the executive summary level. In all cases more examples are available in the underlying chapter text.
130	64035	TS	6	47	8	2	Box TS.4: It is not obvious why these paras are in a box. In which way are they different from other paras? In addition, the text in this box is not easily accessible. It is recommended to use simpler language, and avoid redundancies, also between text and figure. Please order the content of the list of bullet points, there are some repetitions. E.g., all statements on gender differences could be summarized in one bullet. The statement on pastoralists and artisanal fisher folk is a bit surprising as it seems to be much more specific than the others. In addition, the examples in the list are mostly risks and vulnerabilities, often relating to the impacts of extreme weather - they do not describe observed impacts of climate change. This should be made clear in the subheading. A common and clear structure, also with regard to past vs. future vulnerabilities would be helpful. The focus of the box on human systems should be spelled out in the title. Most of this information is repeated later in the human systems and sectors discussion on p14-18. Please consider to remove redundant part of the list, and text. (GERMANY)	than in previous assessments, which is why it is featured at the level of the box. Accessibility of the text has been enhanced, with the figure simplified as well.
131	60290	ΤS	6	51	6	51	People who are socially, economically, culturally, politically and institutionally marginalized, (forgot "," after marginalized (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This suggestion is not grammatically correct.
132	64036	тs	6	54	7	4	The term "gender" should be replaced by the term "sex" (see also comment on TS P5 line 47) (GERMANY)	Gender is the clearer term, without ambiguous secondary meanings.
133	61859	ΤS	6	54	7	8	Are all these factors described in the literature? What does "voice" mean? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	These statements reflect assessment conclusions originating from the long list of examples provided. The word voice is no longer used.
134	64037	TS	7	1	0	0	What does "voice" mean? (GERMANY)	The word voice is no longer used.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	n To Page		Comment	Response
135	60291	ΤS	7	1	7	8	Needs to be consideration here with respect to the overlap with poverty alleviation. Another was this dimension needs to include a section on poverty and how this overlaps with multidimensional inequality. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Assessment findings on poverty and poverty reduction are provided throughout the TS in sections A, B, and C, with multidimensional inequality the focus of this box.
136	64038	ΤS	7	4	7	5	It is not clear what is meant by the example in the brackets. The example is rather misleading, hence creating confusion. Either erase the example or explain in more detail. (GERMANY)	Wording has been simplified to improve clarity.
137	61860	TS	7	5	7	8	The phrase: "Few studiesand thus attribution remains a challenge" contradicts the rest of the section. The final statement is not clear either. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Attribution is no longer discussed within this paragraph, for clarity.
138	63059	ΤS	7	6	7	7	The statement that inequality is not just a consequence of climate change could be misleading or misunderstood. Climate change is typically only a small driver of inequalities. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This sentence is no longer included.
139	61947	TS	7	7	7	7	Here is a mention of sensitivity but pre-fixed by inequality. There is a risk that this becomes the only lens through which it is seen. Perhaps that is the intention, and justifiably, but the report mentions and accepts that there are so many other important factors at play so the justification for this single-focus could be more explicit. (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	The sentence is no longer included.
140	76249	ΤS	7	19	/	56	This is a laundry list. Suggest provide a few compelling examples to illustrate the point. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This extended support for the conclusions presented in the 1st paragraph within the box has been retained, with a substantially condensed version presented in the summary for policymakers.
141	85196	ΤS	7	19	7	56	You are only interested in disasters. Are none of us ever better off? (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	The technical summary assesses the positive impacts of climat change.
142	68553	ΤS	7	23	7	26	Whether it is the language or what the author intended to convey, the message from this sentence is that people are dying from gender roles. We think it is supposed to argue that gender roles inform the type of work/occupation taken up by an individual hence their exposure to heat stress. (NETHERLANDS)	The word "affected" is now used rather than "dependent" for enhanced accuracy.
143	64039	ΤS	7	25	7	25	Replace "due to gender roles and responsibilities" by "due to their roles and responsibilities" (GERMANY)	Revised wording has been adopted.
144	64040	TS	7	27	7	29	Add a brief explanation why this is the case. It is particularly unclear how climate change can lead to an increase in domestic violence. Brief explanation could be taken from CH 13 P12 line 27-34. (GERMANY)	Extended explanation is available in the cited chapter sections, and a full box on gender is now included in the underlying report to clarify the linkages across chapters of the assessment
145	79880	TS	7	30	7	31	Move this point up in the list of points because of its relatively general nature. (NORWAY)	The example has been moved earlier.
146	58950	ΤS	7	38	7	38	After "diseases." Add "Children are at increased risk for severe mental health reactions following extreme events." (Kevin Ronan, CQUniversity Australia)	Further material has been added to this paragraph, although this specific example has not been included based on material available across the underlying cited chapter sections.
147	61861	TS	7	42	7	43	Indigenous peoples may be more resilient to climate effects. For example, changing crop types and where they are grown; grow a wider variety of crops to lower their risk to climatic events. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Findings on indigenous adaptation are provided in section C.
148	68554	ΤS	7	49	7	49	Shouldn't the reference be rather 12.4.1.2. instead of 12.4.2, since in Chapter 12, section 12.4.1.2 at page 13, lines 51 until page 14, line 9 provide supporting evidence for the statement at page 7, lines 47-49 of the TS. (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
149	79881	TS	7	50	7	51	Move this point up in the list of points because of its relatively general nature. (NORWAY)	This example is no longer included within the box but is reflected as an assessment finding elsewhere in the main body of section A-1.
150	68555	TS	7	51	7	51	Can change reference in Chapter from 12.5 to 12.5.3 to make it more relevant (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer provided here.
151	70710	ΤS	7	52	7	52	This sentence appears unclear. It suggests wouman are a marginalised group. Please rephrase. (BELGIUM)	This example is no longer included.
152	63368	TS	7	52	7	53	The context in which this statement relates to climate change should be provided. (IRELAND)	This example is no longer included.
153	63369	ΤS	7	54	7	56	This is a very strong and contentious statement and should be reconsidered. (IRELAND)	Further supporting chapter sections are provided in support of this statement.

#	ID	Ch		n From e Line			Comment	Response
154	64041	TS	7	54	7	56	The statement in its current form erroneously suggests that mitigation actions generally increase vulnerability. We suggest the following modification: "If mitigation measures are not coordinated and/or coherent with other objectives of sustainable development, disadvantaged groups without access to land and labor, including female-headed households can disproportionally be harmed". Please add at the end of line 56: "Therefore, if their needs are not properly considered in the planning and implementation of mitigation measures, there [also] might be an actual tradeoff between the goals of efficient generation of carbon emissions certificates and the broader generation of the sustainable development dividend." (taken from Ch 20, P10 lines 22-23) (GERMANY)	More qualified wording is now used, rather than expanding the text given the shortening of the document that had to occur.
155	60292	TS	7	56	7	56	Bullet points need to include traditional knowledge dimension with respect to risks of climate change and climate change responses (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This topic is reflected partially in an existing bullet within this box, with a more expanded assessment of the role of traditiona knowledge provided in section C-1.
156	70410	TS	8	7	8	9	An article that considers the same trend in glaciers in South America is: A. Rabatel, B. Francou, A. Soruco, J. Gomez, B. Caceres, J. L. Ceballos, R. Basantes, M. Vuille, J.E. Sicart, C. Huggel, M. Scheel, Y. Lejeune, Y. Arnaud, M. Collet, T. Condom, G. Consoli, V. Favier, V. Jomelli, R. Galarraga, P. Ginot, L. Maisincho, J. Mendoza1, M. Menegoz, E. Ramirez, P. Ribstein, W. Suarez, M. Villacis, and P.Wagnon. Current state of glaciers in the tropical Andes: a multi-century perspective on glacier evolution and climate change. The Cryosphere, 7, 81–102, 2013. doi:10.5194/tc-7-81-2013. (COLOMBIA)	While relevant, the technical summary can only reflect material assessed in the underlying chapters and cannot directly cite literature.
157	76250	ΤS	8	7	8	9	Please explain why and how have these changes occurred - increased snow, precipitation, other? Wind events? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Enhanced description of causal relationships is now provided in this subsection of A-1.
158	76251	ΤS	8	8	7	9	Although correct, a more nuanced approach is warranted here. For example, data on growth of glacial icepack in Antarctica should be acknowledged even though the net effect is reductin. This should reflect our level of knowledge regarding the spatial distribution of glacial changes. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Complete assessment of the cryosphere is provided in a working group 1, with only very brief treatment here.
159	58318	ΤS	8	8	8	8	Replace "seasonal ice in many lakes and rivers" with "lake and river ices". (Juqi Duan, National Climate Center, Chinese Meteorological Administration)	This statement is no longer included.
160	80610	TS	8	8	8	8	Replace "seasonal ice in many lakes and rivers" with "lake and river ices" (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	This statement is no longer included.
161	76252	ΤS	8	8	16	17	As written, it is suggested that the authors consider a level of "Very High Confidence" - we know these changes have occurred. The link to climate change, however, may have "Medium Confidence, hence it may be that the statement should be restated as implicating climate as primary causal agent. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Confidence assignments have been adjusted for retained statements.
162	60295	ΤS	8	12	8	12	Permafrost boundaries (which boundaries with which countries-geographic range) ? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This terminology is no longer used.
163	76253	ΤS	8	14	8	14	It is unclear if this is a medium attribution or medium response to climate change. Please clarify (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This phrase is no longer used.
164	71035	TS	8	16	0	0	The section identifies "changing rainfall" but then discusses decreased spring snowpack. Suggest revising to "changing precipitation" (CANADA)	This phrasing has been adopted.
165	66032	TS	8	16	8	19	Here it is sayed "Low to medium confidence: in many rivers flood frequency has been alterated by climatic change". Then, this degree of confidence should be considered in the conclusions about flood frequency. (Maria-Carmen Llasat, University of Barcelona)	This statement is no longer included.
166	79759	TS	8	22	0	0	define low flows better, is there a definition to rely on in chatper 18? (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	This statement is no longer included.
167	68556	ΤS	8	23	8	24	More references could be added, e.g. to 3.2.5 and 3.2.6 (NETHERLANDS)	Expanded support for statements in this subsection of A-1 has been provided accordingly.
168	78539	TS	8	26	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
169	65317	TS	8	26	0	44	In the regional examples, to be consistent, chapter sections in square brackets indicating detection and attribution levels of confidence, the sections In Chapter 18 where these are found should be included, except in the those cases where there are none. (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
170	60296	TS	8	26	8	26	Pacific regional examples including the following should be separated by temperate land versus tropical regions. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is no longer included.
171	85197	TS	8	26	8	50	You are only interested in disasters. Are none of us ever better off? (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	This material is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch			n To Page		Comment	Response
172	63061	ΤS	8	27	8		Why are exactly these Asian regions picked out for the subject of glacier shrinkage? I think that could be misleading because they are not exactly representative for a global average. Many regions over the world show glacier shrinkage (area) more on the order of 20-40% since 1960, much more than the 10% indicated for these Asian regions. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
173	68017	TS	8	27	8	29	The example of Altai-Sayan, Pamir, and Tien Shan glaciers should be discussed as a special regional example under Terrestrial and inland water systems (page 9 line 46). A suggested replacement is: "Increased runoff from shrinkage of glaciers has been observed in the Himalaya and Central Asian mountains due to increased temperature (Chapter 24 page 9 line 54 - page 10 line 2)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
174	63062	TS	8	32	8	32	Not only snowpack but also runoff (attribution) (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
175	63063	TS	8	37	8	37	The cryosphere is not a geophysical variable (just delete 'geophysical variables'). (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
176	63064	ΤS	8	39	8	39	Based on the rapid glacier retreat in the Andes, I suggest to add 'are retreating fast' (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
177	78540	ΤS	8	54	8	55	What does it mean to have "high confidence" that something "could" be possible? I could probably also have high confidence that future climate change could not approach that, without contradicting the first sentence. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	
178	61862	ΤS	8	54	9	3	Is this a statement on observed impacts or on projections? If the latter, it should not be placed here. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Focus on observed impacts has been clarified as the focus for this subsection of A-1.
179	79882	ΤS	8	56	8	56	Exchange "even" for "also" to generate "have responded to climate change in Earth history also when the rates of past global change were slower". (NORWAY)	This statement is no longer included.
180	63065	ΤS	9	1	9	1	I'm not sure it is a good idea to talk about warming scenarios in a section on observed impacts. Just say: slower than warming observed during the past decades. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	Focus on observed impacts has been clarified as the focus for this subsection.
181	77353	ΤS	9	4	9	5	It is necessary to clarify that the data presented do not correspond to the entire Amazon, because deforestation in the Amazon in Ecuador has not diminished in the last 10 years. (Maria Jose Galarza, Ministerio del Ambiente del Ecuador)	This statement is no longer included.
182	65678	TS	9	5	9	5	A species cannot move its range. A range of a species can move, however. "The ranges of plant and animal species have moved, abundance has altered, and seasonal patterns of activities have shifted in response". A species is a collection of individuals which can shift. A species cannot decide to move its range as implied by this wording. (Embarrassingly I have used it myself – but it is wrong). (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	The word "shifted" is now used.
183	76254	TS	9	5	9	5	Please provide some assesment of the extent of plant and animal species that moved ranges (some? most? a few?) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Further qualification has been added.
184	64042	ΤS	9	6	9	6	Please insert (bold letters words): "activities or community composition in response" (Chapter 18, P 3, I.40-43). (GERMANY)	This specific wording has not been added, although it is not inconsistent with aspects already characterized.
185	76255	ΤS	9	7	9	7	Have broad patterns of species and biome movements been seen for animals, plant, both? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence is no longer included.
186	76256	TS	9	7	9	9	Please clarify what is meant by distant and recent past. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence is no longer included.
187	79883	ΤS	9	9	9	9	Please consider adding "(i.e. phenology)" if that is what is meant by seasonal activity here so that it reads "Seasonal activity (i.e. phenology)". (NORWAY)	For clarity, this phrase has not been added, as it is a more specific scientific term.
188	76257	ΤS	9	9	9	10	Seasonal activityWhat does this sentence mean? In particular, what is meant by "seasonal activity"? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This phrase is a more accessible description of phenology.
189	64043	TS	9	10	9	11	The text states "Species have already started to migrate out of protected areas and towards mountaintops over the last several decades due to warming climate". Comment: This sentence is copied from TS, P 34 L 1-2 where it is embedded in a paragraph dealing with effects of climate change on species that are primarily restricted to protected areas. Although the sentence is correct, it may lead in the given context of P 9 of the TS to the misinterpretation that species migrate in particular out of protected areas (although range shifts are occurring in protected as well as in unprotected areas). Suggestion: please delete the sentence and add instead at the end of the second phrase of this paragraph (L 9) the words "as well as for the present" so the whole sentence would read: "The broad patterns of species and biome movements towards the poles and higher altitude in response to a warming climate are well established for the distant and recent past as well as for the present". (GERMANY)	This sentence is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
190	76258	ΤS	9	17	9	19	This sentence, about past climate analogues is important and should be highlighted. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Given the dramatic reduction of word count of this subsection of A-1, this statement has not been retained.
191	64044	TS	9	20	0	0	Please insert (bold letters words): "In freshwater ecosystems of most Due to many confounding factors [18.3.2.4, 18.5]" (based on executive summary Ch 18 P 3 L 40-43). (GERMANY)	Given the dramatic reduction of word count of this subsection of A-1, this statement has not been retained.
192	64045	TS	9	21	9	23	The statement is incomprehensible. (GERMANY)	Substantially improved wording has adopted.
193	79884	ΤS	9	21	9	24	The important point here is not the low confidence to which recent species extinctions can be attributed to climate change, but that it is very difficult to attribute climate change to species extinctions due to confounding factors such as habitat loss/fr (NORWAY)	Clarified wording has been adopted reflecting the assessment of the underlying chapter.
194	65318	TS	9	23	0	24	Degree of confidence in attribution to climate change in subsection 18.3.2.3 of WGIIAR5-Chap18_SODall (lines 23-30, p. 17) states "in the case of Central American amphibians, climate change has been invoked as a causal factor in extinction but there is low agreement among investigators concerning the importance of climate variation in driving extinction and even less agreement that extinctions were caused by global warming as contrasted with that of subsection 4.3.2 of WGIIAR5-Chap4_SODall (lines 42-47, p.32) which states that "In contrast, changes in climate have been identified as one of the key drivers of the extinction of amphibians". (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	Improved clarity of assessment across the chapters has been achieved, with revised wording of the statement in the technical summary now adopted.
195	57919	TS	9	23	9	24	A recent study does not support the links between high temperatures and mortality of amphibians infected with this pathogen (Bustamante et al 2010; Robinet and Roques 2010.). Robinet C and Roques A 2010. Direct impacts of recent climate warming on insect populations Integrative Zoology 5: 132-142 Bustamante HM, Livo LJ and Carey C. 2010. Effects of temperature and hydric environment on survival of the Panamanian Golden Frog infected with a athogenic chytrid fungus. Integrative Zoology 5: 143-153 (Zhibin Zhang, Institute of Zoology, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	A comprehensive traceable account for this statement is provided in the cited chapter sections.
196	76259	ΤS	9	23	9	24	What other factors are likely driving amphibian extinctions? It seems unlikely that this is all due to climate. What about human encroachment and land use? Please provide at least acknowledgement of other factors. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Clarified wording is adopted indicating a contribution of recent climate change.
197	80611	TS	9	23	9	24	A recent study does not support the linkage between high temperatures and mortality of amphibians infected with this pathogen (Bustamante et al 2010; Robinet and Roques 2010.). Reference : Robinet C and Roques A 2010. Direct impacts of recent climate warming on insect populations Integrative Zoology 5: 132-142 Bustamante HM, Livo LJ and Carey C. 2010. Effects of temperature and hydric environment on survival of the Panamanian Golden Frog infected with a athogenic chytrid fungus. Integrative Zoology 5: 143-153 (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	A comprehensive traceable account for this statement is provided in the cited chapter sections.
198	78541	ΤS	9	26	9	38	Wind storms are an element of the climate system, but the others are not and, except with some of the later examples, this paragraph does not clarify the relation between trends in the non-climatic features and climate change. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	The paragraph now opens with a general statement on climate change.
199	60293	ΤS	9	29	9	29	Spatially patchy transitions (pls. define this term) ? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This sentence is no longer included.
200	60294	ΤS	9	29	9	36	Forest dieback (ie like effect from mountain pine beetle, in B.C Canada) significant GHG risk as source (if burnt). (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This topic is addressed in section B.
201	64046	TS	9	32	9	42	The statements on tree mortality and its attribution to climate change around line 30 and those around line 41 are not consistent. (GERMANY)	The latter paragraph is no longer included.
202	65319	ΤS	9	35	0	36	In Table 18-7, degree of confidence in attribution to climate change of the increase in tree mortality at regional scales and insect infestation in forests in western and boreal north America is low. (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	More nuanced wording is now used, with support provided in the cited chapter sections.
203	76260	ΤS	9	35	9	38	In addition, there is a significant literature showing that fire suppression and management have been largely responsible for degraded forests and catastrophic fire. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.
204	64047	ΤS	9	40	9	41	Please add uncertainty qualifiers throughout the text, for example in this statement. (GERMANY)	This statement is no longer included.
205	68557	ΤS	9	43	9	44	A very strong position taken (on the Amazon) and even though it may be elaborated well in chapter 18, a brief explanation would strengthen the position taken (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
		TS	9	46	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page		To Page	To	Comment	Response
207	79760	TS	0		0	0	Asia is not included in this section of examples and it may be important to include especially with consideration to China as a very quickly growing economy with accompanying drastic land use change-ths should be checked with Chapter 24 (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	This material is no longer included.
208	65320	TS	9	46	0	53	It is suggested that to be consistent, chapter sections in square brackets indicating levels of confidence in detection and attribution, including those in regional levels, should include those of Chapter 18 (i.e., Tables 18-6, 18-7, 18-8) (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
209	57920	TS	9	46	10	23	Need to add examples in Asia showing the complexity on response of species to temperature change. By using nearly over thousands yrs' historical data, it was found locust outbreaks are more linked to high frequency of droughts in cold periods in China (Stige et al. 2007; Zhang et al. 2009; Tian et al. 2011). This finding is different with the observation on the positive relation between locust and temperature with decadal scale (Ma 1958; Ma et al., 1965). Xu et al. (2011) found that the intensity of the third plague pandemic was positively associated with precipitation of previous years in dry northern China, but negatively associated previous years in damp southern China. Jiang et al. (2011) report that many rodent species in Inner Mongolia grassland of China, e.g. hibernating species, showed positive response in abundance to temperature increase; but a few showed negative response, probably due to they do not like high vegetation or rainfall induced by increased temperature. Yan et al. (2012) found increase of irrigation area in North China Plain offset the positive effect of global warming on winter reproduction and abundance of a hamster species in winter, causing continued decline of the population during past 2 decades. (Zhibin Zhang, Institute of Zoology, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	This material is no longer included.
210	57921	TS	9	46	10	23	References: Xu L, Liu Q, Stige LC et al. (2011). Nonlinear effect of climate on plague during the third pandemic in China. PNAS 108, 10214–9. Tian H., Stige L. C., Cazelles B., Kausrud K. L., Svarverud R., Stenseth N. C.* and Zhang,Z.B.*. 2011. Reconstruction of a 1,910-y-long locust series reveals consistent associations with climate fluctuations in China. PNAS, 108: 14521–14526. Ma (1958) The population dynamics of the oriental migratory locust (Locusta migratoria manilensis) in China. Acta Entomol Sin 8:1–40. Ma S, Ding Y,Li D (1965) Study on long-term prediction of locust population fluctuations. Acta Entomol Sin 14:319–338. Stige LC, Chan KS,Zhang Z, Frank D, Stenseth NC (2007) Thousand-year-long Chinese time series reveals climatic forcing of decadal locust dynamics. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:16188–16193. Zhang Z, et al. (2009) Periodic temperature-associated drought/flood drives locust plagues in China. Proc R Soc Lond Ser B Biol Sci 276:823–831. Jiang G, Zhao T, Liu J, Xu L, Yu G, He H, Krebs CJ, Zhang Z (2011). Effects of ENSO-linked climate and vegetation on population dynamics of sympatric rodent species in semi-arid grasslands of Inner Mongolia, China. Canadian Journal of Zoology 89, 678–691. Yan C, L. Xu, T. Xu, X. Cao, F. Wang, S. Wang, S. Hao, H. Yang and Z. Zhang. 2012. Agricultural irrigation mediates climatic effects and density dependence in population dynamics of Chinese striped hamster in North China Plain. Journal of Animal Ecology 2:1365-2656. (Zhibin Zhang, Institute of Zoology, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	This material is no longer included.
211	68018	ΤS	9	46	10	23	No Asian examples are provided for terrestrial and inland water systems. A suggested addition is: "In Asia, the Altai-Sayan, Pamir and Tien Shan glaciers have lost on average 10% of their area an 15% of their ice volume since 1960. Rates of further glacier degradation depend mainly on increased in summer air temperature and changes in precipitation. (TS page 8 lines 27- 29)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
212	68019	TS	9	46	10	23	No Asian examples are provided for terrestrial and inland water systems. A suggested addition is: "Regional studies in northern and eastern China and in Japan, using observational or satellite data, have shown earlier greening in spring, delayed senescence in autumn, and thus a longer growing season, associated with rising temperatures, although the details vary between sites and species.(Chapter 24 page 12 lines 18-21)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
213	68020	TS	9	46	10	23	No Asian examples are provided for terrestrial and inland water systems. A suggested addition is: "In Uttarakhand in the Indian Himalayas, the treeline has moved upwards into the alpine zone by an average of 388 m between the 1970s and 2006. (Chapter 24 page 13 lines 52-54)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
214	68021	ΤS	9	46	10	23	No Asian examples are provided for terrestrial and inland water systems. A suggested addition is: "Climate change has driven larch stand crown closure, and larch invasion into tundra at the rate of 3-10 m/year was observed in the northern forest- tundra ecotone in Siberia in the last three decades of the 20th century. (Chapter 24 page 14 lines 10-12)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
215	68158	ΤS	9	46	10	23	Information on climate change impacts to regional terrestrial ecosystems is given here but without an example of Asia, a region that is ecologically and environmentally vulnerable to global climate change. It is suggested to add examples of Asia taking into account Table TS.1. (CHINA)	This material is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
216	80612	TS	9	46	10	23	Need to add examples in Asia showing the complexity on response of species to temperature change. By using nearly over	This material is no longer included.
							thousands yrs' historical data, it was found locust outbreaks are more linked to high frequency of droughts in cold periods in	
							China (Stige et al. 2007; Zhang et al. 2009; Tian et al. 2011). This finding is different with the observation on the positive	
							relation between locust and temperature with decadal scale (Ma 1958; Ma et al., 1965). Xu et al. (2011) found that the	
							intensity of the third plague pandemic was positively associated with precipitation of previous years in dry northern China,	
							but negatively associated previous years in damp southern China. Jiang et al. (2011) report that many rodent species in Inner	
							Mongolia grassland of China, e.g. hibernating species, showed positive response in abundance to temperature increase; but a	
							few showed negative response, probably due to they do not like high vegetation or rainfall induced by increased temperature. Yan et al. (2012) found increase of irrigation area in North China Plain offset the positive effect of global	
							warming on winter reproduction and abundance of a hamster species in winter, causing continued decline of the population	
							during past 2 decades. Reference : Xu L, Liu Q, Stige LC et al. (2011). Nonlinear effect of climate on plague during the third	
							pandemic in China. PNAS 108, 10214–9. Tian H., Stige L. C., Cazelles B., Kausrud K. L., Svarverud R., Stenseth N. C.* and	
							Zhang,Z.B.*. 2011. Reconstruction of a 1,910-y-long locust series reveals consistent associations with climate fluctuations in	
							China. PNAS, 108: 14521–14526. Ma (1958) The population dynamics of the oriental migratory locust (Locusta migratoria	
							manilensis) in China. Acta Entomol Sin 8:1–40. Ma S, Ding Y,Li D (1965) Study on long-term prediction of locust population	
							fluctuations. Acta Entomol Sin 14:319–338. Stige LC, Chan KS,Zhang Z, Frank D, Stenseth NC (2007) Thousand-year-long	
							Chinese time series reveals climatic forcing of decadal locust dynamics. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:16188–16193. Zhang Z, et	
							al. (2009) Periodic temperature-associated drought/flood drives locust plagues in China. Proc R Soc Lond Ser B Biol Sci	
							276:823–831. Jiang G, Zhao T, Liu J, Xu L, Yu G, He H, Krebs CJ, Zhang Z (2011). Effects of ENSO-linked climate and vegetation	
							on population dynamics of sympatric rodent species in semi-arid grasslands of Inner Mongolia, China. Canadian Journal of	
							Zoology 89, 678–691. Yan C, L. Xu, T. Xu, X. Cao, F. Wang, S. Wang, S. Hao, H. Yang and Z. Zhang. 2012. Agricultural irrigation mediates climatic effects and density dependence in population dynamics of Chinese striped hamster in North China Plain.	
							Journal of Animal Ecology 2:1365-2656. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	
217	79005	тс	9	47	0	49	Ille Europe ^{II} is repeted to income contained (Luine Cristici, University of Llausi)	This metavial is no langer isoluded
217	78695	TS	-		9	48	"In Europe" is repeted twice in same sentence (Luisa Cristini, University of Hawaii)	This material is no longer included.
218	57444	TS	9	48	0	0	Remove 'in Europe' (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	This material is no longer included.
219	57445	TS	9	49	0	0	Remove 'in Europe' (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	This material is no longer included.
220	64048	TS	9	52	0	0	Please insert the additional message: "Climate change in Europe" (Ch. 23 P 3 L 17-19) (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
221	76261	ΤS	9	52	9	53	This statement is confounded by historic land use and management practices, which should be acknowledged. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
222	68558	ΤS	10	5	10	5	0.29% is NOT the current value but it is the value for the period 2005-2010 (Ch27 pg10 line 12) (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
223	77291	TS	10	5	10	6	Meaningless. Is %/year meant? (William Ingram, Met Office)	This material is no longer included.
224	68559	TS	10	6	10	6	Chaco forest deforestation rate is not mentioned in Ch27.2.2.1. DELETE Chaco forest (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
225	64049	TS	10	7	0	0	Does the term 'Conversion' generally consider anthropogenic activities? Please specify. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
226	61863	TS	10	7	10	12	Climate change is not mentioned as a factor for climate change impacts and vulnerability in Central and South America.	This material is no longer included.
							(European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	
	5.0000	TC	46		10	10		*1 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
227	56989	TS	10	8	10	10	The use of the acronym RCPs is confusing since it is not defined in the text. There is need to define what the acronym stands	This material is no longer included.
							for before its usage since it is widely used in many pages of the document including the Box sum. 4 figures1 A&B on pages 35	
228	76262	TS	10	10	13	14	and 36 respectively. (KENYA) Evidence of change in Antarctic terrestrial systems is confined to a couple of flowering plants. The referenced section	This material is no longer included.
220	10202	15	10	10	15	14	(28.2.3.7) considered the lack of taxonomic coverage in the Antarctic to be a major gap. Perhaps including Antarctic using the	mis material is no longer meladea.
							same brush as for Arctic is overstating? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
229	76263	TS	10	10	30	31	It's not just eutrophication from land - but also upwelled waters tend to have lower pH - would be worth including mention of	This material is no longer included.
							this here. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
230	76264	ΤS	10	10	30	31	This statement could be misleading since in other coastal areas OA can be less than in the open ocean. Section 5.3.3.5 only	This material is no longer included.
							emphasizes that coastal biogeochemical processes mean that pH is more variable and that the records are insufficient to	
							parse out among the large spatial and temporal variability. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
			1	1			1	

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
231	76265	TS	Page 10	10	42	44	An additional (primary) factor in regional variability is differential changes in land surface elevation, whether from subsidence or isostatic rebound. The former may be partially attributable to human-caused changes in sedimentation, but the latter cannot. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
232	76266	TS	10	10	42	44	The term "precludes" seem overly strong. Examples in section 5.4.2 show sea level related impacts, but parsing out attribution between multiple SLR, temp change and other human drivers remains difficult. It seems strange that Section 5.4.4 makes no mention of sea level rise, yet this statement strongly states that detection is not possible. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
233	64050	TS	10	11	10	12	Please delete this last sentence. It suggests that loss of biodiversity is not that serious, because there is still a lot left. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
234	65321	TS	10	16	0	55	Same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
235	61864	ΤS	10	19	10	21	Some studies suggest that the boreal forest tree line moved southwards in response to the Little Ice Age, and is now moving northwards owing to the warmer conditions. Some northward movement may therefore have happened even without anthropogenic climate change. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This material is no longer included.
236	64051	ΤS	10	23	0	0	Please add the message: "Summer phytoplankton levels" (Ch 28 P 4 L19-20), very high confidence. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
237	85198	TS	10	28	10	35	There is no evidence that variability in pH value of seawater has any deliterious effect on marine organisms. Yiu even admit this on page 54 line 46 to 47 (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	This statement is no longer included.
238	60297	TS	10	29	10	30	More than 70% of the world's coastlines has significantly warm during the past 30 years (missing source here)? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This statement is no longer included.
239	68560	ΤS	10	29	10	30	This sentence states: 'More than 70% of the world's coastlines have significantly warmed', while Chapter 5, p.9,line 43 states: 'Sea surface temperature has significantly warmed during the past 30 years along more than 70% of the world's coastlines'. There is a difference between coastlines that are warmed, and sea surface temperature along the coastline that has warmed. Suggestion: 'More than 70% of the coastal waters' (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
240	79314	ΤS	10	32	10	33	It should read "decreased rates of calcification in some areas and species" (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This statement is no longer included.
241	63370	TS	10	39	10	39	loss of reef building corals this is ambiguous. Loss can mean wither reduction in abunbance or complete removal. Please clarify. (IRELAND)	Coral bleaching is now referred to in particular.
242	77292	ΤS	10	42	10	43	Isn't it also relevant that many of the expected impacts of sea-level rise are by worsening rare catastrophic events, for which statistical sampling is inevitably problematic? (William Ingram, Met Office)	This statement has been substantially broadened and shortened to refer to impacts of climate change in coastal areas more generally.
243	63371	TS	10	42	10	44	Sea level rise is clear attributably to climate change, so what does this statement mean? Is it that other changes in coastal areas (outside the arctic) have masked the impact of climate change? Even so, it is difficult to understand that these impacts cannot be separted from hte idrect impact changing sea level. More clarity required on this topic. (IRELAND)	This statement has been substantially broadened beyond sea level and thus clarified.
244	61865	ΤS	10	43	10	44	Doesn't this statement contradict the example of North America (p.10, line 47-49) where sea-level rise is mentioned as impacting factor. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This statement no longer refers to sea level specifically.
245	78543	тs	10	46	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
246	58678	TS	10	46	11	4	There is no example from Asia, however Asia is very important, please add example from Asia. (chunfeng wang, State Forestry Administration, China)	This material is no longer included.
247	80613	TS	10	46	11	4	There is no description about Asia. SUGGESTION: add description about Asia. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	This material is no longer included.
248	61866	TS	10	46	11	5	Please include an example from Europe (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This material is no longer included.
249	64052	тs	10	46	11	5	Please add uncertainties to all statements. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
250	68022	ΤS	10	46	11	5	No Asian examples are provided for coastal systems and low-lying areas. A suggested addition is: "Increases in coastal water temperatures are also one of the most plausible explanations for widespread declines in beds of large seaweeds in temperate Japan: the Isoyake phenomenon (Nagai et al., 2011)(Chapter 24 page 20 lines 48-50)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.

263

264

64053

68565

76268

ΤS

ΤS 11 13 11 14

ΤS 11 28 11 29

11 12 0 0

and 6.3.3 (NETHERLANDS)

ŧ	ID	Ch		From		То	Comment	Response
251	68023	TS	Page 10	Line 46	Page 11	Line 5	No Asian examples are provided for coastal systems and low-lying areas. A suggested addition is: "Warming coastal waters have also been implicated in the northwards expansion in Japanese waters of tropical and subtropical macroalgae and toxic phytoplankton (Nagai et al, 2011), fish (Tian et al., 2012), and tropical corals, including key reef-forming species (Yamano et al., 2011), over recent decades. (Chapter 24 page 20 lines 50-53)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
52	68024	TS	10	46	11	5	No Asian examples are provided for coastal systems and low-lying areas. A suggested addition is: "The decline of large temperate seaweeds and expansion of tropical species in southwest Japan has been linked to rising sea surface temperatures (Tanaka et al., 2012b), and the changes in the seaweed community have, in turn, impacted fish communities (Terazono et al., 2012). (Chapter 24 page 20 line53- page 21 line 2)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
53	68025	тs	10	46	11	5	No Asian impacts are provided for coastal systems and low-lying areas. A suggested addition is: "Average erosion rates of Asian Arctic coastlines range from 0.27m/year (Chukchi Sea) to 0.87m/year (East Siberian Sea). (Chapter 24 page 21 lines 8-9)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
254	68561	TS	10	51	10	51	Reference to 1970s comes from Table 25-3, not this Chapter reference (25.6.2). (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
255	68562	TS	10	53	10	53	"Unique human and natural systems tend to have very limited adaptive capacity" is here related to "unique" and the threshold of 2 degrees. However "adaptive capacity", as presented in chapter 8, (see chapter 8, page 72, line 53, also TS page 58, line 50, page 14, line 23, chart in page 106 and figures page 112 and 113, SPM charts page 30 and page 43) is also basis for major goal and sole necessary key concept for paradigmatic shifts in urban traditions. Also for "differential adaptive capacity for individuals, households, and communities" in TS, page 7, lines 1 and 2). In SPM, page 5, line 52 "Adaptive capacity is generally high in many Australasian human systems" in page 6, line 8 "In the Arctic, indigenous people have a high adaptive capacity". Also UHI experience variations from city centres to the peripheries of higher ranges. Suggest contextual improvement so that key concept does not weaken. The clarification is probably the "intrinsic capacity" which has thresholds and the "acquirable capacity", namely by learning, which does not have (known) thresholds. TS, Page 60, line 21 "Such limits are context-specific and subject to uncertainty". (not referred in SPM). TS, Page 28, lines 14 to 15 "Any assessment of limits to adaptation in human systems is preliminary because of uncertainty about the existence and level of adaptation limits, and whether these limits are hard or soft." (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
256	63372	ΤS	11	3	11	3	What is meant by "composition" of sea ice in this context? Are you refering to structure and texture or is this a reference to natural and/or anthrogoenic particles? (IRELAND)	
257	60523	TS	11	4	0	0	Add transportation safety (Hélène CONNOR LAJAMBE, HELIO International)	This material is no longer included.
258	76267	ΤS	11	4	11	4	Are there other non-indigenous peoples that are affected? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
259	61867	ΤS	11	8	13	28	The section on marine impacts is overdeveloped compared to others. Most evidence is presented as high confidence. Is this a signal of real higher evidence in marine areas compared to others? This is not reflected in the SPM, where marine areas are summarized in just one paragraph. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Confidence levels have been carefully considered to reflect the
260	68563	TS	11	10	11	15	Significantly, this depends on the assumptions. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
261	68564	ΤS	11	10	11	15	Chapter 30.6 should be added to the source as well. The whole statements should also mention that not all the aforementioned changes occur all over the world. The changes in particular area are highly subjected to the geographical configurations, social-economic conditions, and management regime. In Line 12, maybe it is necessary to put natural- triggered climate change as well. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.

This material is no longer included.

This material is no longer included.

Please insert (bold letters): "...such as regional circulation intensity,..." (because according AR 5 WG I, there are no signals

The observation that changes to oceanic systems have led to changes in organisms and ecosystems both is happening now

and in the past (geological record). It is good to mention that such changes have been observed in the geological record, so that the changes observed now can be understood within a framework of extant knowledge. Also, add references to 6.1.2

regarding a general decline of ocean circulation intensity (WG I Ch.3.6.). (GERMANY)

Do these references support or replicate Figure TS1? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

IPCC WGII AR5 Technical Summary

#	ID	Ch			To Page		Comment	Response
265	65322	TS			0	38	Same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	Chapter 18 is now referenced.
266	76269	ΤS	11	31	11	32	Are the authors saying that changes in body size occur on seasonal or decadal timeframes (as opposed to evolutionary time frames)? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This assertion is being made for observations over recent decades.
267	57446	ΤS	11	32	0	0	Consider adding (phenology) after 'activities'. I think it is important to highlight the fact that 'timing of seasonal activitities of	This term, which is a more specific scientific term less broadly
							organisms' and 'phenology' are the same thing, throughout the document. (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	accessible, has not been added.
268	79315	ΤS	11	32		32	It should read"reduction in their body size in some areas" (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Qualification has been added reflecting the chapter assessment.
269	65679	TS	11	35	11	35		This example is no longer included.
270	77293	TS	11	40	0	0	"amplification" doesn't make sense - I guess "local amplification" is meant? (William Ingram, Met Office)	This statement is no longer included.
271	63373	ΤS	11	52	12	26	also pp 113, 114, Figure TS 1: Panel A is difficult to intrepret. Consider more clarity in text, or new design of graphic to clearly illustrate the messages. Labels "Tpejus", and "Tp" are used, text indicates that Tp is appropriate (typo but confusing). Text refers to "southern spring", this is ambiguous. "Low latitude Spring" would be better. (IRELAND)	An improved legend and caption now facilitates interpretation of the figure (now Figure TS.3).
272	76270	TS	12	12	26	1	This section could be shortened significantly. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The caption for Figure TS.3 has been shortened.
273	76271	TS	12	12	34	34	Reference to 6.2.6 needs to be removed from this section. The section does not exist in Chapter 6. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The issue has been remedied.
274	76272	TS	12	12	37	43	The statement that "Field observations attributed to anthropogenic ocean acidification are few due to limited change in water chemistry between the pre-industrial times and today" is misleading and contradictory with other statements in Chapters 6 and 30 indicating that the changes in water chemistry are significant and rates of change unprecedented in millions of years. The changes in water chemistry since pre-industrial times are significant. The complication with respect to attributing field observations to anthropogenic OA is due primarily to the confounding factors of multiple stressors affecting marine organisms in most regions. This statement should be rewritten to appropriately reflect that fact. Additionally, lines 42-43 should be rewritten to read, "Ecosystems at risk of ocean acidification also include warm and cold water coral reefs." Finally, the list of references to chapters should include 6.1.1.2 and CC-OA in addition to those listed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Additional qualification and improved wording have been adopted.
275	76273	ΤS	12	12	41	41	We believe the effects of high CO2 on oyster cultures was characterized as Low Evidence and Agreement (6.3), suggesting that this is not a "high confidence" statement. This again highlights the critical need for care in translating findings from the underlying chapters to the TS (and SPM). (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This example is no longer included.
276	79316	ΤS	12	14	12	15	It doesn't say in the caption what sort of organisms are featured "only warm-temperate pseudo-oceanic species" - I presume that the figure is for copepods??? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Copepods are now specified.
277	70772	TS	12	30	12	30	The sentence mentioned sensitivity. The sensitivity has not explained in the chapter before. If the chapter still use it, it may be need to mentioned in Box TS 2. (Stockholm Environment Institute)	Sensitivity is now mentioned within the definition of vulnerability in Box TS.2.
278	60300	TS	12	37	12	37	Anthropogenic ocean acidification should be defined somewhere here? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Please see the glossary for the report.
279	61868	ΤS	12	37	12	38	Is this statement consistent with others about ocean and coastal acidification? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Clarified wording has been adopted for this statement.
280	63374	ΤS	12	45	12	50	There is a need to quantify these differnet responses. What are the net impacts on fish based diet, livelihoods. Which are the vulnerable fish and human communities. (IRELAND)	Quantitative information is provided where possible in the context of future impacts in section B.
281	76274	ΤS	12	45	12	50	Perhaps add some text that reflects an assessment on climate - perhaps as the driver of changes in sea ice, warming. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph is no longer included.
282	64054	TS	12	54	0	0	Please insert ", regionally reduced intensity of ocean circulation,", because a general reduced intensity of ocean circulation is not confirmed by IPCC AR5 WGI (chapter 3.6.). (GERMANY)	A paragraph on microbes is no longer included.
283	70711	TS	12	54		54	Please check that the suggestion of "reduced intensity of ocean circulation" is consistent with WGI findings, especially chapter 3 (and chapters within this report). (BELGIUM)	This statement is no longer included.
	78544	TS	13	5	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
284			13				It would be necessary to mention which particular oceans or seas the examples are referring to. (European Union DG	

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
286	65323	TS	13	6	0	8	Same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
287	79317	TS	13	6	13	6	It should read"ranges of some marine fishes" As the papers point out that many species do not show any significant response. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This material is no longer included.
288	68566	ΤS	13	9	13	16	Chapter 30.6.2.1.3 should be added as the source as it strongly related with that statements. Also, this paragraph can be improved by explaining the impacts i.e. conflicting between fishing, and the solution i.e. collaboration for the fisheries framework or during the decision making process. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
289	76275					3	Reference to section 6.2.4 should not be included in this section because it focuses on the effects of temperature and ocean acidification on macrophytes, and is not relevant to a discussion of hypoxia. Additionally, there is no section 6.2.6 in Chapter 6 of the WGII document. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
290	76276	TS	13	13	15	16	There is no section 30.8.3 in Chapter 30 of the WGII document. Please verify and remove. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
291	76277	ΤS	13	13	22	22	Section 30.5.6 is on sub-tropical gyres and is not relevant to the discussion of semi-enclosed seas. Reference to this section should be removed, and reference to section 30.5.3 on semi-enclosed seas should be included. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
292	76278	TS	13	13	28	28	Reference to section 30.5.6 on sub-tropical gyres should be included at the end of this bulleted statement. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
293	68567	ΤS	13	16	13	16	There is no section as 30.8.3, actually the chapter 30 goes as far as 30.7. It is possible that this was referenced before a chapter rearegwment. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
294	68568	ΤS	13	17	13	18	Maybe is better to rephrase as "Semi-Enclosed Seas show significant warming since early 1980's," instead of 1982. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
295	68569	ΤS	13	17	13	28	Figure 30-15 and Chapter 30.6 should be added to the source (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
296	65680	TS	13	23	13	23	Delete "(through intensified upwelling)" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This material is no longer included.
297	70712	TS	13	23	13	23	Editorial comment : "through intensified upwelling" is repeated twice. Please clarify this sentence. (BELGIUM)	This material is no longer included.
298	65682	ΤS	13	26	13	29	Possible contradiction here. Re-phrase? A decrease in primary productivity would decrease organic material and hence substrates for metabolism. There would be less oxygen demand?? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This material is no longer included.
299	65681	TS	13	28	13	28	Rising temperature would also affect solubility of gases such as O2. Worth mentioning? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This material is no longer included.
300	64055	ΤS	13	29	0	0	Please add as additional bullet-point:" In the Arctic and Antarctic environmental changes and ecosystem responses" (Ch.28, P3, I. 1-3) high confidence; " Some marine species will shift" (Ch. 28, P3, I. 9-10) medium confidence. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
301	63375	ΤS	13	31	14	9	Can the authors provide any findings related to animal based agricultrue, including pastural systems and more intensive grazing and feeding systems, especially in light of project increase in global demand for beef and dairy produce in developing economies. (IRELAND)	Given the substantial reduction of this subsection of A-1, based on the underlying chapter assessment, further material has not been added.
302	76279	TS	13	31	14	9	This section is disproportionally short relative to other sections (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	All subsections have been substantially shortened in the revised draft.
303	63376	ΤS	13	33	13	38	The messages here on regional impacts on yields is confusing, especially the different high, medium and low confidences attached to similar statements. For example there is high confidece of positive impacts on "trends" (of what?) at high latitudes. Yet in hte next sentenec there is low confidence in increased yields due to warming and CO2 in mid-high latitudes. Need more clarity and consistency on the use of language here. (IRELAND)	Substantially improved clarity has been achieved across this subsection of A-1.
304	68570	ΤS	13	33	13	42	A sub-sentence addressing the likely economic effects and behavioural response of climate change-induced effects on food production should be added to this paragraph. Paragraph 7.3.3. would be a good source for information on this. (NETHERLANDS)	This subsection of A-1 refers only to observed impacts and sensitivity. Relevant forward-looking information is provided in section B.
305	64056	TS	13	34	13	35	Please highlight this important statement in bold. (GERMANY)	This statement is now included at the start of the paragraph.
306	60298	TS	13	35	13	36	Yields have increased in some (mid to high latitude regions). What yields and of what ? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	More specific information by crop type is now provided.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
307	68571	TS		38	13		The sentence "Demonstratingvariability." This claim is tenacious at best, and is insufficiently supported by the material presented in Chapter 7 The Chapter provides ample and convincing support for (mostly negative) influences of climate change on yield and provides some relevant projections of yield decreases in the future. However, there is hardly any evidence presented to support the claim that current climatic events are already influencing these prices. In contrast, figure 7-4 depicts a strong correlation with oil production and the resulting effects on biofuel demands, while the text on multiple locations extensively mentions other factors than climate change, such as (biofuel) policies, increasing demand for food and population size increases as important factors for food price increases. In the only study presented accounting for this proposed relationship already in the present (Lobell et al. 2011), this aspect is only touched upon very peripherally. The authors of the SPM are advised to rewrite this sentence. They should make the logical argument that supply decreases due to yield decreases (which are well supported) combined with demand increases due to population growth and changing food consumption patterns and other economical factors are likely to cause price increases. Disentangling climate change components in food prices is still an unresolved question and demonstrating the reactivity of markets to Climate change is complex as many economic (e.g. production and transaction costs, speculation, expectations) and social forces interplay in very dynamic conditions. Support can be found in Chapter 7, page 6 line-49 ff , page 10 line-14 ff, page 24-line 43 ff. (NETHERLANDS)	This is a statement about sensitivity to climate variability, not attribution to climate change.
308	63377	TS	13	38	13	39	It is reasonable to state than not all recent price changes can be attributed to climate change, however some market events where a direct response to actions taken due to food security concerns arising from exception conditions which themselves have been attributed (at least in part) to climate change. For example the peak in food prices following damage to crops, and ban on exports during the 2010 heat wave in Russia (Otto, Masset et al, GRL, 2012) Vol 39, Issue 4; The Impact of Russia's 2010 Grain Export 2 Ban, Oxfam Research Report, June 2011). (IRELAND)	This paragraph has been revised to emphasize sensitivity to climate variability (and climate extremes in particular), not attribution to climate change, as can be supported by assessment in the underlying chapter.
309	63066	TS	13	40	13	40	For the social and economic issues: add market effects/speculation? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This statement is no longer included.
310	63378	TS	13	40	13	41	Can this statement be justified? A severe climate event such as the 2010 Russia heat wave and drought, or the 2011 Texas could occur at any stage in a major food producing region. This cannot be predicted, but nor can it be discounted. Analysis of the 2010 Russia drought indicated that the probablity of such events have increased signitifcantly (e.g. Rahmstorf and Coumou, 2011, PNAS Vol 108, No. 44, 17905-17909). At best one can state that it is "likely" that the factors indicated will remain the the main drivers, although I also question the prominence given to energy policy in this statement. (IRELAND)	This statement is no longer included.
311	76280	TS	13	40	13	42	This is an important finding and should be given additional prominence in the document. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The statement has been removed, as the paragraph has been revised to emphasize the most salient findings on observed impacts from the chapter 7 executive summary.
312	65683	тs	13	46	13	46	Insert "storage" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This specific example is no longer included.
313	79885	TS	13	52	13	52	Consider to include the very relevant finding in chapter 7 page 2 line 49-53. (NORWAY)	This subsection has been reduced in length rather than expanded given page restrictions.
314	68026	TS	13	53	14	9	No Asian examples are provided for food production systems and food security. Examples in Asian countries are required. (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
315	68572	TS	13	54	14	3	The African example quoted is inconsistent with the policy statement in line 44-46. The example given that livelihood-based approaches for managing risks to food production from multiple stressors including rainfall variability, have increased substanatially since 2007, seems inconsistent with the policy statement which refers to new understanding of the sensitivity of crops to extreme heat. Instead the authors could cite reduction in growing seasons length, increase in pests and diseaseson crops and livestock. In addition there is inconsistency in the messages in terms of where the level of high confidence is assigned. The Excutive summary (page 4 Line 1-11) assigns high confidence to the fact that while efforts are being achieved in managing risks to food production, these will likely not be sufficient to address long-term risks from climate change. On the other hand, the technical summary (page 13 Line 54-56 to page 14 Line 1-3) instead assigns high confidence level to statement "livelihood approaches for managing risks to food production, NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
316	60299	тs	13	56	13	56	"Collaborative participatory research" should be in the glossary on page 3. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is no longer included.

IPCC WGI	AR5	Technical	Summary	/
----------	-----	-----------	---------	---

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
317	76816	TS	13	56	14	3	An example for protecting livelihoods in a changing climate is the Rural Resilience initiative (R4) which is directed to low income farmers in Africa. The R4 launched by Oxfam America and the World Food Programme with the support of Swiss Re helps low income farmers to protect their crops and incomes through insurcen. It gives poor farmes and rural households the option to pay for insurance by contributing their time and labour to local climate adapation measures, such as crop irrigation and forestry project. Read more on http://www.swissre.com/rethinking/crm/The_R4_Rural_Resilience_Initiative.html (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	This material is no longer included.
318	65324	TS	14	4	0	5	Same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
319	61948	TS	14	14	14	19	Whilst this may be so, developed countries expanded their cities in areas absent of climate change considerations and do indeed face considerable financial challenges of adapting them and resource challenges (water) of supplying them. Is this sentence perhaps too uniform statement that hides variation between but also within developed and developing countries, some (by no means all) of which will benefit from a clean slate opportunity to get some basic climate-focused planning in place using simple approaches - if only limited to risk limitation? (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This paragraph is no longer included.
320	61870	TS	14	14	14	30	There is no mention of land use or urban planning as an adaptation measure and a factor for reducing climate risk. This can be an essential adaptation measure facing future urban developments. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Substantial treatment of this topic is provided in examples in section C.
321	63067	TS	14	15	14	16	To my knowledge, geo-hydrologic hazards is not a very common term. What is it actually? Mainly floods? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	The term is no longer used.
322	64057	TS	14	18	0	19	Please clarify what is meant by "novel compound risks and slow onset hazards", and why resulting impacts on resilience of ecosystems are included here (as part of the discussion of Urban Areas)? (GERMANY)	This paragraph is no longer included.
323	76281	TS	14	18	14	19	While it is easy to say that reducing deficits and building resilient infrastructure are important, the authors should also address the offsets, compromises and costs associated with this. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph is no longer included.
324	60301	TS	14	21	14	21	"Around 1 billion people live in informal settlements in urban areas" (need to define "informal settlements" ?). Of these categorize as 'urban poor' or squatter ?settlements (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This statement is no longer included.
325	60302	TS	14	23	14	23	Need to define adaptive capacity in terms of urban areas ? This is quite different than adaptive capacity in rural areas (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is no longer included.
326	76282	TS	14	28	14	30	This sentence references Ch 8 key findings, but Ch 8 reflects challenges in high income as well as other nations. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
327	76283	TS	14	28	14	30	This statement is simply not true as presently worded. Suggest removing the last phrase about how high-income nations will not be affected. In fact, high-income nations will be hit with extraordinary costs that may be impossible to bear. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
328	64058	ΤS	14	32	0	0	There are certainly more examples of impacts in urban settlements that can be reported here. Also, this section is rather general. Given the clear statements in L 14-19 about vulnerability and past exposure, more information about actual observed impacts should be available, and summarized here. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
329	78545	ΤS	14	32	0	0	Examples of urban areas? (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
330	68027	TS	14	32	14	42	No Asian examples are provided for urban systems. A suggested addition is: "Many cities in Asian high growth economies are located on low-lying coastal areas, which are undergoing rapid urban and economic transformation. (Chapter 8 page 4 lines 19-20)" (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
331	68028	тs	14	32	14	42	As no Asian examples have been provided for urban systems, examples are to be added. (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
332	68029	ΤS	14	32	14	42	No Asian examples have been provided for urban systems. Furthermore, although reference is made to the exacerbation of hazards and disaster risks by climate change including inland and coastal flooding in a preceding paragraph, no such examples have been provided. (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
333	79761	TS	14	33	0	0	This may also apply to large cities in Asia such as Tokyo, Shanghi- I am not sure of the evidence though, check with Chapter 24 (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	This material is no longer included.
334	63068	ΤS	14	33	14	34	Should the logic not rather be: impacts on social and economic systems? Can examples be given? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	n To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
335	76284	TS	14	38	14	40	Why are there higher risks in coastal and dry areas versus coastal, or humid? This statement either needs a reference or needs to be generalized or removed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
336	61871	TS	14	48	14	49	No need for this issue on definitions of urban areas. It also clashes with the first statement. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This paragraph has been removed.
337	78546	TS	14	53	14	56	I think the "medium confidence" applies to the last part beginning "but evidence for", right? At the moment it sounds like it applies to the entire bold sentence. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This paragraph is no longer included.
338	63069	TS	14	55	14	55	What does 'action of non-climatic shocks and trends' mean? Are these other drivers of change? (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This paragraph is no longer included.
339	76285	TS	14	56	15	2	This is also true for Australia, the US SW, etcnot just the Andes (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph is no longer included.
340	63070	TS	15	2	15	2	I suggest including: glacier melt in many regions such as the Andes, Alps, or the Arctic (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This paragraph is no longer included.
341	64260	TS	15	2	15	2	Why mention only the Andes here? Enhanced glacer melt attributable to climate change is far more widely observed. See for instance chapter 4 in the upcoming WGI IPCC report, especially figure 4.9 and 4.10 and the summary statement that there is "robust evidence in high agreement that globally glaciers continue to shrink and loose mass. See also Blunden, J., and D. S. Arndt, Eds., 2012: State of the Climate in 2011. Bull. Amer. Meteor. Soc ., 93 (7), S1–S264 (ICELAND)	This paragraph is no longer included.
342	76286	TS	15	7	15	9	Are poverty rates falling in rural because of migration to cities? Re-vitalization or not? Economies? Why especially Sub- Saharan Africa? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A sentence on this topic has been added to the corresponding paragraph on rural areas.
343	76287	ΤS	15	11	15	29	These two paragraphs describe issues in developing countries, but there are also examples in North America and other places. As it currently reads, it sounds quite biased. Suggest generalizing the attribution. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	More nuanced wording has been adopted in the related text for rural areas.
344	60303	ΤS	15	23	15	23	Resilience needs to be defined in the glossary (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	A definition is provided within the glossary.
345	78547	TS	15	31	0	0	Examples of rural areas? (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
346	60304	TS	15	31	15	31	Specific region examples could be expanded particularly in the Pacific island region and small coastal rural areas on low-lying atolls (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is no longer included.
347	63071	TS	15	31	15	33	l suggest to include some more examples on specific regions. E.g. from Africa, South America, Asia. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
348	64059	TS	15	31	15	33	There are certainly more specific regional examples of impacts in rural areas that can be reported here. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
349	76288	TS	15	36	15	36	It is not clear to an outsider what an economic sector might be (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is the terminology provided in the plenary approved outline for the report.
350	61872	ΤS	15	36	15	55	Impacts and adaptation in key economic sectors should be an important chapter of the TS. The section is too short. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	All subsections have been substantially shortened given requirements for reducing word count.
351	64060	TS	15	36	15	55	There is no para summarizing these cc-impacts on ' Key economic sectors and services' in the SPM. (GERMANY)	The length of section A-1 within the summary for policymakers has been further reduced in length, not including treatment of all sectors specifically beyond the cross-sectoral assessment of chapter 18.
352	64061		15	36	15	55	Please provide explanation on the definition of the concept of "key" sectors and services, and then provide specific examples supporting this concept. The current section is rather short given its relevance for decision making and text remains quite vague. (GERMANY)	This terminology is adopted from the plenary approved outline for the report.
353	76289	TS	15	36	15	55	This section is disproportionally short. Suggest a more consistent approach to level of detail, and thus section length. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	requirements for reducing word count.
354	78548	TS	15	38	15	39	A confidence assessment is needed. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Confidence is now provided.
355	64062	ΤS	15	38	15	42	The level of confidence is missing in this para. (GERMANY)	Confidence is now provided.
356	80614	TS	15	38	15	42	Why no confident level assessment followed after this conclusion? (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	Confidence is now provided.

	ID	ch.	From	Fron	n To	То		Desmonae
#	ID	Ch		Line			Comment	Response
357	63072	TS	15	42	15	42	The 'documented contribution of climate change' could be contested here. It is mostly climate variability and in some cases	Clearer wording is now used.
							there may be some contribution of climate change, e.g. if climate change is considered to have contributed to some change in	
							weather extremes, or longer dry periods. Reword, e.g. as follows:,but there are increasing indications that climate change	
							and variability are contributing to economic losses. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	
358	64063	TS	15	44	15	47	is this a description of the constituity of the insurance sector, or a statement about observed impacts on that sector? Place	This paragraph is no longer included.
550	04005	15	15	44	15	47	Is this a description of the sensitivity of the insurance sector, or a statement about observed impacts on that sector? Please clarify. (GERMANY)	This paragraph is no longer included.
359	76817	TS	15	44	15	47	As a major global reinsurer and in the role as an ultimate risk taker Swiss Re is strongly exposed to the potential impacts of	This paragraph is no longer included.
555	,001	1.2	15		15		climate change. Tropical cyclones, or hurricanes as they are often referred to in the North Atlantic region, have been a major	
							source of large losses for Swiss Re in the past. Hurricane Katrina in 2005 provides an example of this. At the time of that event	
							Swiss Re announced an estimated loss of US\$ 1.2 billion for its share. For Swiss Re climate change is an issue of long-term,	
							group-wide strategic importance and therefore a component of our long-term risk management strategy. Swiss Re's action	
							are based on the premise that it is in the interest of its shareholders, clients and employees, the wider stakeholder	
							community and society in general to tackle the issue of climate change. For more information please refer to	
							http://www.swissre.com/rethinking/sustainable_energy/our_position_and_objectives.html (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance	
							Company Ltd)	
360	76818	TS	15	44	15	47	Insured losses are increasing in frequency and severity. This development is primarily due to higher insurance penetration,	This paragraph is no longer included.
							growing technological vulnerability and value concentrations in exposed areas. At the same time, there is increasing evidence	
							that climate variability and climate change are affecting the cat perils market. (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	
361	68573	ΤS	15	44	15	55	Europe seems to be leaning towards attributing some of the causalities of natural events like floods to actual developments	Material across regions is no longer provided.
							while for some other continents the attribution of causality seems sometimes to lean towards climate change. There may be	
							need for a deeper analysis of the argumentation underpinning the different attributions since I noted a stark difference	
							between the other examples and Africa, e.g. the Africa examples seem very weak. The other examples for other continents	
							seem stronger; Asia is however barely mentioned apart from the fact that Asia is insufficiently represented in the studies. In	
							the recent past Asia has experienced enormous catastrophes so that it seems imperative to spend more attention to	
							(examples from) Asia (NETHERLANDS)	
362	68574	TS	15	46	15	46	The term "particularly in low and middle income countries" most of the low and middle income countries barely have formal	This paragraph is no longer included.
							insurance systems that may be strongly affected by climate change especially if we are referring to adaptation and	
							vulnerability because of varied reasons - we might need to re-check the statement unless it also refers to informal insurance	
262	60575	TC	45	47	45	47	systems. (NETHERLANDS)	
363	68575	TS	15	47	15	47	This sentence implies that economic vulnerability reduction through insurance is always effective, whereas 10.7 clearly indicates that this depends beguing an the situation and on the insurance mechanism. It would be more accurate to add	This paragraph is no longer included.
							indicates that this depends heavily on the situation and on the insurance mechanism. It would be more accurate to add "under certain circumstances" to the end of this sentence. (NETHERLANDS)	
364	78549	TS	15	49	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
365	63164	TS	15	54	15	54	Use the term "permafrost thaw" instead of "permafrost melt" which is incorrect terminology. This revision probably needs to	This material is no longer included.
							be made in various chapters. Note that it is only the ice in the frozen ground (permafrost) that melts, not the soil or rock that	
							contains it. Therefore the term thaw is correct (Sharon Smith, Geological Survey of Canada)	
366	76290	TS	16	4	16	4	Are human health populations sensitive to all/some shifts? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The non-bold sentences are intended to illustrate core aspects
300	10250		10	-	10	-		of this sensitivity.
367	76291	TS	16	8	16	11	What about effects of heat and aerosols? Ozone? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph has been condensed, given word count
								restrictions, rather than elongated to encompass further
								examples.
368	76292	ΤS	16	8	16	17	Repetitive text. Please remove. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Section A-1 has been substantially condensed, thus reducing
			1.5	4-		15		repetition.
369	78551	TS	16	13	16	15		
							Cape Town)	confidence is implied. Please see Box TS.3.
369	78551	TS	16	13	16	15	More likelihood/confidence assessments are needed for the various components of the sentence. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	If a likelihood term is used in isolation, high or very hig confidence is implied. Please see Box TS.3.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment
370	65346	TS	16	13	16	20	Reporting relatively low confidence of studies without considering nor mentioning the difficulties of quantitative asses for the complex mechanisms involved in health impacts from climate change as well as difficulties in health assessmen lead to misunderstanding that climate change hardly has any impact on health or that there are insufficient evidences prove its impact on health. (REPUBLIC OF KOREA)
371	80615	TS	16	17	16	18	Is it acceptable to assess that the increasing trend of Dengue fever and malaria were attributed to climate change only very low confidence? A higher confidence can be assigned. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)
372	64064	TS	16	21	16	25	The term "climate altering pollutant" is unclear. Pollutants need to have a media/pool/reservoir to contaminate like air/atmosphere, water, soil which affect human health and ecosystems directly. GHGs are not regarded as pollutants. seems however, that they are meant by the term pollutant here. The new meaning added to the term "pollutant" caus confusion and inconsistencies. Please revise. In addition, it is unclear, if the number 7 % refers to inhalation of all air pollutants (e.g. including NO2) or only to those air pollutants substances with an important climate altering effect? (GERMANY)
373	61950	ΤS	16	22	0	0	Cultural heritage is raised here as threatened by climate change. Is it sufficiently raised earlier on as a contributing or mitigating factor (e.g. in adaptation/transformation), regardless of whether this is in relation to developed or developi countries? This is a sensitive issue that needs to be included - mindsets that refuse to accept climate change, or potent ways to embark on climate resilient development, may be based on reasonable or unreasonable assumptions which in may prove to be detrimental - or not - whether by accident or design (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering Science and Technology)
374	63379	TS	16	22	16	26	This statement, and Box 11.4, on which the finding in based, regarding the other health implciations for all non-CO2 cli forcers is incorrect. The statement is too general. The discussion and finds are broadly related to particulate polluntan as such are limit to a range of radiatively active species. Ozone could also be included in this discussion. N2O and CH4 known health impacts at ambient atmospheric concentrations. Likewise, CFCs and HCFCs have no direct impact, but ar concern due to impact of stratopheric ozone. (IRELAND)

571	00015		10	17	10	10	very low confidence? A higher confidence can be assigned. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	retained conclusion carries medium confidence.
372	64064	TS	16	21	16	25	The term "climate altering pollutant" is unclear. Pollutants need to have a media/pool/reservoir to contaminate like air/atmosphere, water, soil which affect human health and ecosystems directly. GHGs are not regarded as pollutants. It seems however, that they are meant by the term pollutant here. The new meaning added to the term "pollutant" causes confusion and inconsistencies. Please revise. In addition, it is unclear, if the number 7 % refers to inhalation of all air pollutants (e.g. including NO2) or only to those air pollutants substances with an important climate altering effect? (GERMANY)	This paragraph is no longer included.
373	61950	TS	16	22	0	0	Cultural heritage is raised here as threatened by climate change. Is it sufficiently raised earlier on as a contributing or mitigating factor (e.g. in adaptation/transformation), regardless of whether this is in relation to developed or developing countries? This is a sensitive issue that needs to be included - mindsets that refuse to accept climate change, or potential ways to embark on climate resilient development, may be based on reasonable or unreasonable assumptions which in turn may prove to be detrimental - or not - whether by accident or design (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This comment appears to be misplaced.
374	63379	TS	16	22	16	26	This statement, and Box 11.4, on which the finding in based, regarding the other health implciations for all non-CO2 climate forcers is incorrect. The statement is too general. The discussion and finds are broadly related to particulate polluntants and as such are limit to a range of radiatively active species. Ozone could also be included in this discussion. N2O and CH4 have no known health impacts at ambient atmospheric concentrations. Likewise, CFCs and HCFCs have no direct impact, but are of concern due to impact of stratopheric ozone. (IRELAND)	This paragraph is no longer included.
375	78550	TS	16	28	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
376	64065	TS	16	28	16	40	The reference to Table TS.1 is confusing since the table does not exactly reflect the points mentioned here and is rather general (hardly mentioning specific health impacts). If referring to this table maybe add: 'for an overview of further general observed impacts in the regions see table TS1'. Best would be though if there was a specific table on regional health impacts instead. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.

376	64065	TS	16	28	16	40	The reference to Table TS.1 is confusing since the table does not exactly reflect the points mentioned here and is rather general (hardly mentioning specific health impacts). If referring to this table maybe add: 'for an overview of further general observed impacts in the regions see table TS1'. Best would be though if there was a specific table on regional health impacts instead. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
377	65347	ΤS	16	28	16	40	Asia is expected to have considerable impacts of climate change on health and it is the most populated continent. Therefore, the regional cases of Asia should be included. (REPUBLIC OF KOREA)	This material is no longer included.
378	68030	TS	16	28	16	40	Asian examples are missing regarding human health. A suggested addition is: "Associations between temperature rise and mortality have been shown for India, Thailand, and several cities in East Asia, including Japan, South Korea, China and Taiwan. Intense heat waves have also been shown to affect outdoor workers in South and East Asia."(Chapter 24 page 34 lines 21-26) (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
379	68031	TS	16	28	16	40	Asian examples are missing regarding human health. A suggested addition is: "Prolonged drought in combination with windy conditions increases the exposure to sand and dust, often mixed with toxic compounds. There are indications that dust storms in South West Central and East Asia increase hospital admissions and worsen asthmatic conditions, as well as causing skin and eye irritations. Prolonged drought may also lead to wildfires and haze exposures, with increased morbidity and mortality as observed in Southeast Asia. Drought can also cause disruption of food security that leads to increases of malnutrition and consequently increase susceptibility to infectious diseases. (Chapter 24 page 34 lines 28-34) (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
380	68032	TS	16	28	16	40	Asian examples are missing regarding human health. A suggested addition is: "Increases in temperatures have been correlated with outbreaks of waterborne diseases in for example East Asia. Other studies from South and East Asia have shown a correlation between diarrheal outbreaks and a combination of higher temperatures and heavy rainfall." (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.
381	68033	ΤS	16	28	16	40	Asian examples are missing regarding human health. A suggested addition is: "Cholera outbreaks in coastal populations in South Asia have been associated with increasing water temperatures and algal blooms." (JAPAN)	This material is no longer included.

Page 26 of 90

Response

Clearer examples are now provided in this paragraph.

The specific examples are no longer provided. The broader

	GII AR5	I CCIII		From		То		FIRST-ORDER DRAF
#	ID	Ch	Page	Line			Comment	Response
382	68576	TS	16	29	16	31	The word "inadequate" is missing in the technical summary but it appears in the Excutive summary of Chpater 22 on page 4 Line 30. Proposed "In Africa, climate change is a multiplier of existing vulnerabilities affecting health outcomes (high confidence), including inadequate water and sanitation coverage, food security, and access to health care and education. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
383	64066	TS	16	32	16	33	Please double check if the example for Europe is appropriate here since it is not reflected under the health section of the regional chapter 23, P25ff (there are several other examples under the health section there though, as well as in the executive summary Ch 23 P 4 I.13ff.) In addition, the low confidence example for Europe should be replaced by an other example of medium or high confidence, if possible. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
384	65325	TS	16	34	0	37	Same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, The Manila Observatory)	This material is no longer included.
385	77271	TS	16	45	0	0	How does this positive framing of mobility relate to statements made on page 12, row 45 of SPM and on page 7 line 47. (Kreft Sönke, United Nations University - Institute for Environmental and Human Security)	This paragraph is no longer included here, although assessment of migration has been considered collectively across chapters to ensure comprehensive, clear conclusions.
386	61949	TS	16	45	16	46	Is the difference between mobility and migration clear enough here? Many ways of defining, including scope for ther to be little difference between them (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This topic is now discussed in the human security subsection of B-2. Improved clarity of word choice has now been ensured.
387	76293	TS	16	47	16	48	What constitutes or facilitates an ability to move? It's not just about being poor. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Where this topic is now discussed (in the human security subsection of B-2), improved precision has been adopted in the sentence.
388	61873	TS	16	49	16	51	What does "expanding opportunities for mobility" mean as an adaptation option? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This point has been clarified where this material occurs (now in the human security subsection of B-2) by referring to lack of resources in the preceding sentence.
389	68577	TS	16	51	16	51	Change reference to 12.4.2 There is no 12.4.3! (NETHERLANDS)	Where this topic is now discussed (in the human security subsection of B-2), accurate referencing has been ensured.
390	76294	TS	17	4	17	6	Why? Does this not speak to resilience opportunities? Must these factors all be present to mitigate violence? It would seem that education, sanitation and proper nutrition also would be important mitigation factors. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence is no longer included.
391	76295	TS	17	11	17	13	Does conflict DRIVE or exacerbate vulnerability? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Substantially clarified wording is now used where conclusions on conflict are presentedboth here in A-1 and in the human security subsection of B-2.
392	61874	TS	17	15	17	19	This paragraph is unclear and vague. "Many indigenous peoples" (Who? where?) "have adapted" (when? To what?). The evidence for this statement should be clarified. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This material is no longer included.
393	78552	TS	17	21	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This material is no longer included.
394	61875	ΤS	17	21	17	35	An example from Africa should be added (important links to security). (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This material is no longer included.
395	64067	TS	17	22	0	0	It is not clear what this statement refers to. Please specify cultural heritage. The section and table provided as reference do not contain specific references to observed impacts, or confidence statements. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
396		TS	17	22	0	0	I don't see why a low confidence prediction for European cultural heritage is one of the regional examples in the discussion of human security. More salient examples from Africa and on more important effects on human well-being (namely survival) would seem to be more relevant than whether or not Venice retains its cultural charm. (Busby Joshua, University of Texas-Austin)	
397	76296	ΤS	17	22	17	22	Has climate change affected pre-industrial revolutionary cultural heritage? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
398	60306	TS	17	23	17	23	"Indigenous people have higher than average exposure to climate change due to a heavy reliance on climate sensitive primary industry". This is a bit of an ambiguous statement. What does higher than average exposure mean has to be backed up by a source or reference). (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is no longer included.
399	68578	TS	17	23	17	31	Not clear what the evidence is for economic opportunities in forestry for Maori. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
		1	1	1	1	1		-

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
400	76297	TS	17	31	17	31	In North America, pre-European settlement societies evolved in highly variable climate - it's exactly this component of climate change that led to adaptation to natural resources (food, water, land). There were also many instances of failure. See for example Hegmon et al., 2008 - Social Transformation and Its Human Costs in the PreHispanic U.S. Southwest that describes 3 societies, and in particular, the Hohokum and their failure to adapt to drought, largely because of their brittle society, and increased efforts to develop irrigation canals, denude their landscape. North American, Asian, African, etc societies were not allways successful at this. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
401	63073	TS	17	31	17	32	I'm not sure the unique history and relationship to the land is easily understood by a larger readership (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
402	76298	ΤS	17	33	17	35	Have western infrastructures (e.g., pipeline) influenced human/environmental interactions in the Arctic? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
403	56990	TS	17	38	17	38	Give the full meaning of the acronyme REDD before its usage in the text of the document. (KENYA)	The acronym is widely used, and the i defined acronyms.
404	76299	TS	17	40	17	41	Does climate change always constitute an additional burden to poor? This seems biased. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The statement now refers to climate-
405	76819	TS	17	40	18	9	DEVELOPING COUNTRIES ARE MORE AFFECTED BY CLIMATE CHANGE THAN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES. In some developing countries, climate-related disasters could shave off up to 19 percent from annual national income by 2030, according to studies on the economics of climate adaptation (ECA) in different parts of the world. The risks they face span from more frequent and severe storms, floods, droughts and other natural hazards to sea-level rise, crop failures, and water shortages. In some cases, one single large disaster can set back years of development gains. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Forward-looking information is provic section, information is provided for lo countries.
406	76300	ΤS	17	46	17	47	Do urban and rural transient poor always slide into poverty? Are there also opportunities? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Further qualified wording has been ad
407	61876	TS	17	48	17	51	This statement can be very important. If duly supported by evidence and agreement, it should be highlighted (and probably	Given restrictions on word count, this

							example Hegmon et al., 2008 - Social Transformation and Its Human Costs in the PreHispanic U.S. Southwest that describes 3 societies, and in particular, the Hohokum and their failure to adapt to drought, largely because of their brittle society, and increased efforts to develop irrigation canals, denude their landscape. North American, Asian, African, etc societies were not allways successful at this. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
1	63073	TS	17	31	17	32	l'm not sure the unique history and relationship to the land is easily understood by a larger readership (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
2	76298	TS	17	33	17	35	Have western infrastructures (e.g., pipeline) influenced human/environmental interactions in the Arctic? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
3	56990	TS	17	38	17	38	Give the full meaning of the acronyme REDD before its usage in the text of the document. (KENYA)	The acronym is widely used, and the report will contain a list of defined acronyms.
4	76299	ΤS	17	40	17	41	Does climate change always constitute an additional burden to poor? This seems biased. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The statement now refers to climate-related hazards.
5	76819	TS	17	40	18	9	DEVELOPING COUNTRIES ARE MORE AFFECTED BY CLIMATE CHANGE THAN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES. In some developing countries, climate-related disasters could shave off up to 19 percent from annual national income by 2030, according to studies on the economics of climate adaptation (ECA) in different parts of the world. The risks they face span from more frequent and severe storms, floods, droughts and other natural hazards to sea-level rise, crop failures, and water shortages. In some cases, one single large disaster can set back years of development gains. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Forward-looking information is provided in section B. In that section, information is provided for low income to high income countries.
6	76300	TS	17	46	17	47	Do urban and rural transient poor always slide into poverty? Are there also opportunities? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Further qualified wording has been adopted.
7	61876	ΤS	17	48	17	51	This statement can be very important. If duly supported by evidence and agreement, it should be highlighted (and probably sent to the SPM) (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Given restrictions on word count, this material is no longer included.
8	76301	TS	17	48	17	51	What about extreme weather events and agricultural failures? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Given restrictions on word count, this material is no longer included.
9	76302	ΤS	17	53	17	54	Does climate change always worsen poverty? Are there no other factors? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
D	61877	ΤS	17	53	18	6	Given the emphasis the TS places on this socioeconomic stressor, there should be a stronger evidence base. The report should concentrate on literature findings. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Although this paragraph is no longer included, robust evidentiary support is provided for the box on the multidimensional inequality (Box TS.4).
1	76303	TS	17	56	18	9	Are socially marginalized societies always negatively affected by climate? Are there no examples of improvements? There are drivers that are non-climatically related with climate as a contributing factor. Sometimes, the affluent can respond or take advantage, sometimes, the affluent are destroyed. It's not all about climate, and it's not all about being poor. Suggest a reconsideration of these statements. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph is no longer included, with related assessment provided instead in the box on multidimensional inequality (Box TS.4).
2	64068	TS	18	1	18	1	The term "gender" should be replaced by the term "sex". Hence "the intersection of sex, age, race" (see also comment on TS P5 line 47). (GERMANY)	This paragraph is no longer included.
3	76304	ΤS	18	3	18	4	Do the authors intend to say that pre-existing gender inequalities are exasperated by weather events? This should be explained, or revised. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This paragraph is no longer included.
4	61878	TS	18	6	18	9	This statement on very poor evidence of positive impacts should be deleted. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	More nuanced wording is now used for a related sentence that has been retained: "Limited positive observed impacts on poor people include isolated cases of social asset accumulation, agricultural diversification, disaster preparedness, and collective action."
5	76305	TS	18	8	18	9	Sometimes more affluent portions of society can recover but not always. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
416	60307	TS	18	11	18	15	This paragraph can be omitted (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This paragraph is no longer included, although related material is included at the start of section A as context for assessment of observed impacts.
417	61951	TS	18	11	18	15	Should not environmental factors be added to 'social and economic factors' listed here? The complexity of understanding social and ecological systems - e.g. in relation to how climate impacts play out across ecosystem components, linkages and scales affecting marine fisheries - suggests that perhaps they should be. (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This paragraph is no longer included.
418	61954	TS	18	13	18	25	In some areas there is no manifest desire among national governments to delegate power to local levels due to histories of centralised control currently maintained by party machineries that see general but also political benefits in the arrangement. As everywhere, it is not always just a lack of capacity and institutional strength - but the will to act while trusting others who may be opposed to your views and powerbase. (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This material is no longer included.
419	76306	ΤS	18	22	18	25	This finding, that uncertainties have not been reduced and in some cases have increased, is an important one and warrants a more prominent place in the document. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material is no longer included.
420	63074	TS	18	23	18	25	There is a bit of a debate going on how the increasing range projected by newer generations of climate models is communicated. Stating that the uncertainty has increased is likely not the best way. Maybe say: have increased the range of possible outcomes. (Christian Huggel, University of Zurich)	This material is no longer included.
421	64069	TS	18	25	0	0	Please replace the term "uncertainty" by "diversity", because the real uncertainty did not increase by including more processes into the models, but the differences between models (i.e. model diversity) increased, showing the effect of until then unknown uncertainties. (GERMANY)	This material is no longer included.
422	77294	ΤS	18	29	18	30	This sentence is very true, but why not add that here precipitation change will often be comparably or more important than temperature change? (William Ingram, Met Office)	This material is no longer included.
423	61879	TS	18	38	21	27	The report provides many general statements about adaptation processes, but specific examples of adaptation experience in sectors or areas are missing. Sectoral and transectoral approaches are essential, and also coastal adaptation is mentioned specifically. What about other experiences in mainstreaming, capacity building, governance, etc? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	The balance of material included within this subsection now places substantially greater focus on examples across regions, both in the text and in the table in the section (Table TS.2).
424	76307	ΤS	18	40	18	41	The statement that natural systems have some potential to adapt is misleading. Natural systems have enormous potential to adapt as evidenced by the persistence of life on earth over the millennia. The authors are strongly encouraged to present a more thoughtful analysis of the flexibility of natural systems (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	this statement is no longer included.
425	76308	TS	18	40	18	44	This paragraphy seems unnecessary and fails to note that natural systems have been adapting to climate change for millenia. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	An introductory paragraph much better focused with regard to the subsection has been developed.
426	61952	TS	18	40	19	39	A more over mention of risks of maladaptation might be a welcome, if cautionary, note here albeit mentioned on p.23 (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	Maladaptation is addressed in section C.
427	68579	ΤS	18	41	18	41	Saying 'through ecological and evolutionary processes', but only 'evolutionary proccessess' can be founded in [14.1]. (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
428	68580	TS	18	44	18	44	Saying 'reducing existing adaptation deficits' is not founded in [14.1], actually the terminology 'adaptation deficits' only occurs in [14.7.4]. (NETHERLANDS)	The concept of risk at present and potential for adaptation at present is now emphasized much more within the technical summary, especially in section B. The paragraph has further been revised as introductory material.
429	76309	TS	18	52	18	52	How have social dimensions attracted more attention? Has some profile or awareness increased? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.
430	76310	ΤS	18	53	18	55	This is an awkward sentence. Please re-word for clarity. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.
431	61880	TS	18	55	19	1	Why this explicit reference to hard infrastructure? Most strategies currently stress the need for no-regrets, win-win, mainstreaming, etc. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	A much broader statement on engineered and technological adaptation options is now provided.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
432	68581	TS		55	19	1	Europe and Australasia have moved steps ahead in terms of trying to ensure that risk -reduction is not just left to the modelers but the citizens are actually engaged. There have been emerging initiatives including the WeSenseit Citizen Observatory of Water which is a four year European Framework 7 funded project. The project is aimed at developing a citizen based observatory of water, which will allow citizens and communities to become active stakeholders in information capturing, evaluation and communication http://www.wesenseit.com/web/guest/home . Prior to this there were other similar initiatives but the one that comes to mind is the Eye on Earth (Partnership between the European Environment Agency and Microsoft) http://eyeonearth.cloudapp.net/, these initiatives should be recognised and small steps being made to move away from the top-down approach mentioned in the report. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
433	76311	ΤS	18	55	19	1	This sentence needs clarification or removal. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A much broader statement is now used in A-2 on engineered and technological adaptation options.
434	77272	TS	19	2	0	0	Please look at mandates of NAPAs. NAPA is about identifying urgent and immediate adaptation needs, and not a long-term strategy. The UNFCCC implementation of National Adaptation Planning is in its infancy. There are promising country examples such as the Bangladesh Climate Change and Action Plan. (Kreft Sönke, United Nations University - Institute for Environmental and Human Security)	This statement is no longer included.
435	76312	TS	19	3	19	3	What is a NAPA? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.
436	68582	ΤS	19	5	19	7	Should you please provide more information to support this statement as we cannot draw such a conclusion from [14.5.3,14.5.4]. By the way, [14.5.1] perhaps should be referred as to support of this argument? (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is now included within a broader paragraph with further context and more supporting citations.
437	76313	ΤS	19	5	19	7	The logic behind this heirarchy is unclear. The previous paragraph had engineered systems as top down. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A clarified presentation of this material has been ensured through a new ordering of conclusions and revised language.
438	76820	TS	19	5	19	27	A good example for a comprehensive adaptation assessment is the Economics of Climate Adaptation (ECA) Methodology. The Economics of Climate Adaptation (ECA) methodology provides decision-makers with a fact base to tackle climate adaptatin in a systematic way. It enables them to understand the impact of climate change on their economies - and identify actions to minimize that impact at the lowest cost to society. It therefore allows decision-makers to integrate adaptation with economic development and sustainable growth. See http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf http://www.swissre.com/rethinking/climate_and_natural_disaster_risk/shaping_climate_resilient_development.html Case studies on US-Florida, UK-City of Hull, India, Guyana, Tanzania, Mali, China and Samoa are included in the report. They found that existing climate patterns are responsible for annualized losses of 1-12% of GDP and are likely to rise up to 19% of GDP by 2030. This is a worrying trend. But the good news is that cost-effective adaptation measures can prevent anywhere between 40 and 68 percent of the expected economic loss in the regions studied. The Economics of Climate Adaptation working group is a partnership between the Global Environment Facility, McKinsey & Company, Swiss Re, the Rockefeller Foundation, ClimateWorks Foundation, the European Commission, and Standard Chartered Bank. (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Although specific examples are not included at this level of detail in the main findings, a broader emphasis on adaptation evaluations within A-2 has been achieved.
439	68583	TS	19	8	19	9	Saying 'very few assessing the process of'. However, similar statement cannot be found in [14.5.3,14.5.4]. (NETHERLANDS)	Broad support for the statement is now provided.
440	64070	ΤS	19	9	11	19	This sentence should be printed in bold (please add uncertainty). (GERMANY)	This sentence is no longer included, based on revisions made to the paragraph overall.
441	68584	тs	19	15	19	15	We do not know why same statement cited by ExSum of Chapter 14 with high agreement, while here with high confidence. (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
442	76314	TS	19	15	19	15	Are adaptation evaluations in their infancy for societally relevant processes? Natural ecosystems? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This statement is no longer included.
443	76315	TS	19	15	19	20	There is no mention of the wealth of information on adaptation from the agricultural community. This community has a long history of crop adaptation strategies to climate change. Probably one of the earliest in the US, and still significant, is the establishement of the SCS in response to the dust bowl and poor cropping practices. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	More specific information on adaptation relevant to agriculture is provided in sections B and C.
444	64071	ΤS	19	22	19	23	A statement on the experiences and lessons learnt with the different tools would be extremely helpful. Currently, the statement is quite obvious. (GERMANY)	This statement is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
445	76316	TS	19	29	19	39	Scale is important. Not just the national level. Many decisions are made at local and regional scales. There is also no mention of the relevance or import of global scale roles? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A finding on opportunities for actors across contexts and scales is provided in section C.
446	64072	TS	19	34	11	35	This sentence should be printed in bold (please add uncertainty). (GERMANY)	This topic is now addressed in section C.
447	64073	TS	19	38	11	39	This sentence should be printed in bold (please add uncertainty). (GERMANY)	This topic is now addressed in section C.
448	70407	TS	19	41	0	0	South America is also another example here. Colombia's government in the National Development Plan 2010-2014 determined that the country should establish a National Climate Change Adaptation Plan. Therefore, the National Planning Department (DNP) is currently working on the formulation of this plan with the support of the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development (MADS), Institute of Hydrology Meteorology and Environmental Studies of Colombia (IDEAM), and National Unit for Disaster Risk Management (UNGRD). (COLOMBIA)	Examples are now provided for all regions.
449	68585	TS	19	41	19	51	(Same as SPM, page 5, from line 31) The process has been modelled in existing literature and coined as "learning alliances" concerning the development of interpretation among stakeholders (understand why they need to engage with adaptation) and "learning active alliances" concerning developing intervention with stakeholders (initiate measures). Ashley, R., Blanskby, J., Newman, R., Gersonius, B., Poole, A., Lindley, G., Smith, S., Ogden, S., Nowell, R., 2012. Learning and action alliances to build capacity for flood resilience. Journal of Flood Risk Management 5, 14 - 22. Van Herk, S., Zevenbergen, C., Ashley, R., Rijke, J., 2011. Learning and Action Alliances for the integration of flood risk management into urban planning: a new framework from empirical evidence from The Netherlands. Environmental Science & Policy 14, 543 - 554. (NETHERLANDS)	The revised paragraph focuses much more on findings across specific examples, rather than focusing on principles for effective adaptation. This suggested inclusion is thus no longer relevant.
450	64074	ΤS	19	41	21	26	The difference between the bullet points on adaptation experiences for specific geographic contexts (i.e. regions) and those listed in Table TS.3 is not obvious. Clarity and comprehensibility would be improved by including all examples into table TS.3. Uncertainty needs to added to each key statement. (GERMANY)	Further distinction between examples in the text in A-2 versus the table TS.2 has been achieved, with the text providing high-level findings and the table providing extended examples.
451	76317	ΤS	19	41	21	26	Table TS.3 is redundant to the text. Consider simplifying the table with novel examples not presented in the text? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Further distinction between examples in the text in A-2 versus the table TS.2 has been achieved, with the text providing high-level findings and the table providing extended examples.
452	65684	TS	19	46	19	46	"experience of implementing adaptation plans" better? Rather than "adaptation implementation experience". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This sentence is no longer included.
453	76821	TS	20	1	20	7	Maybe worth mentioning the Economics of Climate Adaptation case for the city of Hull, UK. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=100 http://media.swissre.com/documents/Economics_of_Climate_Adaption_UK_Factsheet1.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	This paragraph is no longer included.
454	60308	ΤS	20	3	20	4	is being slowly build in some parts the world " (ambiguous statement). Which parts of the world ? (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE- Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This statement is no longer included.
455	68586	TS	20	4	20	7	"feedback mechanisms are important for building urban resilience (high agreement, medium evidence)". Lacks the distinction between positive and negative feedbacks, i.e. those that bring systems beyond tipping points (positive feedbacks) and therefore have a negative impact and those that have capacity to restore equilibriums (negative feedback) and therefore have a positive impact . (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
456	60309	TS	20	9	20	10	Gender, the supply of information for decision-making. Omit "gender (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This sentence is no longer included.
457	61881	TS	20	10	20	12	It is unclear what the constraints are. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Usage of this term is consistent with the definition provided in the report glossary.
458	68034	TS	20	41	22	13	Asian examples of adaptation experiences are missing. A suggested addition is: "While some practical experiences of adaptation in Asia at the regional, national and local level are emerging, there can be barriers that impede or limit adaptation. These can include the lack of financial resources for adaptation implementation, institutional barriers, biophysical limits to ecosystem adaptation and others (Chapter 24 page 40 lines 1-3)." (JAPAN)	A paragraph for Asia has been added.
459	76822	TS	20	45	20	53	Maybe worth mentioning the Economics of Climate Adaptation case for the US Gulf coast and the utility company Entergy - even on sector and company level there is adaptation action http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=105 http://media.swissre.com/documents/Entergy_study_exec_report_20101014.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Although relevant, this example is at a much greater level of specificity than the conclusions presented in section A-2.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
460	68587	ΤS	20	51	20	52	The line "There are few examples of proactive adaptation energy and public infrastructure." is not found in the body of Chapter 26.7 as it is cited. In fact, on Chapter 26 page 26 line 48, referring to infrastructures it states that "only an emerging consideration of proactive adaptation in anticipation of future global warming" suggests that proactive adaptation has not begun, and is only beginning to be considered. (NETHERLANDS)	Direct support for the revised paragraph has been ensured.
461	71036	ΤS	21	1	0	0	The statement has been made that "indigenous people have a high adaptive capacity" with reference to Sections 28.2.4, 28.2.7 and 28.4.1. Section 28.2.4 and 28.3.7 does not indicate that in the present the adaptive capacity is high. Rather "the ability of indigenous peoples to maintain livelihoods, is increasingly being threatened by climate change" and "in recent years these successful adaptation strategies have been challenged at unprecedented rates". Section 28.4.1 has a balanced analysis of this question and seems to be indicate aspects of both higher and lower current adaptive capacity of indigenous people. The threat to adaptive capacity via social or physical stressors should be fairly reported in section 21.1 at the same time as recognizing the historical and potential adaptive capacity of indigenous Arctic people. (CANADA)	The revised statement included here has been substantially broadened.
462	61955	ΤS	21	1	21	3	Does this statement withstand the headlong rush by Arctic communities into hydrocarbons development, both in onshore and offshore areas already most affected by the impacts of carbon-based development further south? Surely repeating the pattern is not climate-resilient development? (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	The revised statement included here has been substantially broadened, and it also considers the challenges associated with rates of change.
463	64075	TS	21	1	21	3	The level of confidence is missing in this para. (GERMANY)	It is now provided.
464	68588	TS	21	1	21	3	Level of confidence of that statement not mentioned (NETHERLANDS)	It is now provided.
465	68589	TS	21	1	21	3	It is not entirely clear why a reference is made to the section 28.2.4, as this section describes the direct and indirect impacts of climate change on the indegenous people, but does not directly support the statement from the SPM: "in the arctic with scientific partners". Rather, it appears that only the co-production of studies on the impacts of climate change is discussed in these sections. (NETHERLANDS)	The statement has been substantially revised and broadened, with robust support from the underlying chapter.
466	68590	ΤS	21	1	21	3	This statement is supposedly based on Section 28.2.7 from Chapter 28, but this section does not exist in the main chapter. Perhaps the layout of the chapter has been changed, without updating the references in the SPM/TS (NETHERLANDS)	The statement has been substantially revised and broadened, with robust support from the underlying chapter.
467	76318	ΤS	21	21	4	13	Lines 6-13 are more generally applicable than Coastal specific statements. One meaningful take away from Ch 5 is that assessments of the state of coastal adaptation to date have primarily focused on "protection" options, and on hard structures within the protection category, but that accomodation and retreat options also need to be assessed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This point is reflected in the revised 1st paragraph of the subsection as well as in the material included here.
468	60311	TS	22	1	22	12	Understanding approaches to managing risk through adaptation. Determinants of risk should be framed within effective adaptation (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This material is now part of the overall framing in the introduction to the Technical Summary and in section A-3 providing the decision-making context. Principles for effective adaptation are presented in section C-1 in the context of managing future risks.
469	64076	тs	22	6	0	0	The concept of the era of climate responsibility / option is not clear enough. Does the first mean that there are no options, and the latter that there is no responsibility? The time frames should be defined more clearly. A box on the two eras would be useful, which can then be referred to throughout the TS. F605 (GERMANY)	The second paragraph of section A-3 introduces these eras and the roles of adaptation and mitigation in influencing outcomes in these two timeframes.
470	61882	TS	22	11	22	12	References to transformation should be better explained and justified. What does it exactly mean? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Transformation is discussed in section C-2 and Box TS.8
471	64077	ΤS	22	15	0	0	Please rename Section B.i. "Structure and Elements of Iterative Risk Management". Section is not dealing with determinants of risk management. (GERMANY)	This section has been removed, with some material moved to the introduction of the Technical Summary and to section A-3. Section A-3 is now titled "The Decision-making Context."
472	76319	TS		22	40	48	It is important to recognize that locally-obtained adaptations may be in conflict with neighboring solutions, and will not necessarily be locally, regionally, or globally optimal. This same observation is made on page 23 lines 27-31. The factor to emphasize here is not necessarily the top-down flow of risk information, but the top down flow of policy and information on the consequences of alternative adaptation strategies that should guide selection of more appropriate courses of action at regional/local levels. In other words, a local solution is not necessarily a national/regional solution. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	These topics are discussed in sections C-1 and C-2, where the context specificity of adaptation and the potential for positive and negative interactions among adaptation actions are highlighted.
473	65685	ΤS	22	25	22	25	Delete "Schematic of" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Suggestion followed.
474	76320	TS	22	28	22	28	Please write out what Section C.ii. Refers to (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.

#	ID	Ch	Page_	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
475	76321	TS	22	29	22	30	This statement is not true. Suggest removing the figure and revising the text. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The figure and caption have been revised to clarify this point. The figure is now Figure TS.1.
476	64078	TS	22	35	0	0	Section B.ii. deals with (few) enhancing factors for effective adaptation (and not with principles). We suggest to rename the section in "Enhancing Factors for Effective Adaptation". (GERMANY)	This material is now presented in section C-1, and provides information on several aspects of adaptation, not just enhancing factors.
477	76322	TS	22	45	22	47	SME's, etc will pursue as long as there is economic gain to be had. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
478	61956	TS	22	50	23	2	The power of reputational risk should not be omitted or underestimated here. Beyond straight metrics as mentioned in the text, the overnight adjustment of consumer preferences and power can be determinant. Perhaps worth a mention? Just as consumers may not wish to buy clothes from manufacturers using building that collapse on workers, so they may be able to influence their suppliers on climate if benchmarks for ranking are trusted. There are plenty of examples of this already - although public doubt over climate change, and its relegation in recent years to a lesser priority perhaps have worked against consumer power (e.g. in current recession). (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	The importance of values and risk perceptions, relevant to this point, is highlighted in section A-3.
479	68591	ΤS	22	50	23	2	Inconsistent message: The topic sentence of this paragraph in TS is the topic sentence of another paragraph in ExSum (chapter 17 page 2 lines 37, 38). (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
480	68592	TS	23	4	23	19	Reference to 17.2.6; 17.3; 17.5.4 is missing in this statement whereas it is included in the SPM and in the ES (NETHERLANDS)	Reference to chapter 17 is now provided where this paragraph appears in C-1.
481	76323	ΤS	23	8	23	8	What does the use of "actor" mean in this sense? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Text revised for clarity.
482	68593	TS	23	19	23	19	Reference to pararaph 21.3 differs between TS and ExSum. TS cites 21.3 while ExSum 21.3.2. The latter is the most adequate. (NETHERLANDS)	Given space considerations, references are presented to the second level in the Technical Summary main text.
483	60312	TS	23	27	23	27	"Maladaptation" should be in glossery on page 3. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Maladaptation is defined in the WGII glossary.
484	68594	TS	23	27	23	29	This statement originates from [14.7.3]. (NETHERLANDS)	Reference revised.
485	76324	TS	23	27	23	29	It should be noted that maladaption and unintended consequences of what was considered to be a sound adaptation strategy are a cause of increasing concern. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Maladaptation is discussed in section C-1, to the extent suppor by the assessment in the underlying chapters.
486	65686	TS	23	29	23	31	Maybe add "small-scale or local scale" and in "short-term, local scale outcomes". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Text revised to address both temporal and spatial issues.
487	76325	ΤS	24	3	24	4	Are there any crosscuts with WGIII on mitigation? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Interactions with mitigation are addressed in section C-2.
488	64079	ΤS	24	15	24	15	Is the correct text "actions can be pursued now AND increase climate resilience"? (GERMANY)	This text, now in section C-1, has been revised for clarity.
489	68595	TS	24	15	24	22	Reference paragraph 17.4.4 does not exist (NETHERLANDS)	Reference revised.
490	76326	ΤS	24	18	24	22	This sentence is a long laundry list. While it's important to note how adaptation and resilience go hand in hand, perhaps it would be more useful to trace a single, clear example. Also, it is not allways possible to restore areas to some notion of pristine or pre-managed state. Careful and thoughtful analyses are needed to manage options for intended use versus the reality of the state a system may or may not be stable. This also goes to public perceptions of a 'healthy' ecosystem. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised to broaden the coverage of relevant strategies. It now appears in section C-1. Greater specifics are presented in Table TS.7.
491	79318	TS	24	19	24	19	You could include "recovery of healthy fish stocks" (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Relevant examples are presented in Table TS.7, including controlling overfishing.
492	68596	TS	24	24	24	29	In the TS (page 24, line 24-29) it is stated that 'steps ARE BEING taken to achieve better integration', while the Executive summary of Chapter 15 (page 2, line 49 to page 3 line 5 and page 3 line 41-49) rather seems to convey that steps SHOULD be taken. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
493	79886			31	24	38	This is a very important point that should be more clearly reflected also in SPM. (NORWAY)	Ecosystem-based adaptation options are highlighted in both Table TS.7 and SPM.2.
494	64080	TS	24	33	0	0	The text states "Ecosystem-based adaption is regarded as one of the more cost effective and sustainable approaches to urbar adaptation, although the costs of needed land acquisition can be high." Comment: the last part of the sentence is misleading. Please delete or rephrase the last part of the sentence "although the costs of needed land acquisition can be high." If a costs of needed land acquisition can be high." Comment: the last part of the sentence is misleading. Please delete or rephrase the last part of the sentence "although the costs of needed land acquisition can be high" since not in all cases of ecosystem-based adaptation in urban areas land acquisition is needed. (see also chapter 8, page 75, lines 40-42). (GERMANY)	
495	76327	TS	24	33	24	34	This sentence is awkward. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
496	76328	ΤS	24	43	24	44	Integration of what? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text, now in section C-1, has been revised for clarity.
497	68597	тs	24	43	24	53	Reference paragraph 17.4.4 does not exist (NETHERLANDS)	Reference revised.
498	68598	TS	24	44	24	46	The statement is not directly reflected in executive summary (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
499	66249	TS	24	52	24	53	Which cod stock? The cited paper covers Atlantic cod in general. The sentence applies to the North Sea cod and most of the US and Canadian stocks, but certainly not the Barents Sea stock. Easiest fix is to move this sentence to after the following one. (Geir Ottersen, Institute of Marine Research)	Misplaced.
500	68599	ΤS	25	3	25	6	The sentence 'Due to the uncertainty, dynamic complexity and short to long timeframes associated with climate change, robust adaptation efforts require iterative risk management strategies.' is presented as main conclusion printed in bold in both the SPM and the TS, while in the Executive summary of Chapter 15 (page 3, line 48-49) it is merely a line appearing under another heading. Moreover, this statement does not appear at all in the main text of Chapter 15. So where is this conclusion actually underpinned in the main text? (NETHERLANDS)	These topics are now addressed in the first paragraph of section A-3, which integrates material from a number of chapters indicated in the line-of-sight references to chapter sections.
501	61883	TS	25	13	25	15	Could also mention that there are many metrics for evaluation but no consensus in the literature on which one(s) are best. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This point is discussed in section A-2.
502	64081	TS	25	30	25	36	Neither the synthesis in chapter 16.5 nor the assessment of ethical dimensions of adaptation in Ch 16.6 support the thesis that all actors have opportunities for effective adaptation: The greater the magnitude of climate change, the greater the likelihood that adaptation will encounter limits (executive summery Ch. 16). Additionally, the lower the adaptive capacity or the higher the vulnerability of actors, the greater the likelihood of no, ineffective or maladaptation. Especially the first sentence in bold letters is not valid in its generality. Furthermore we cannot follow the expert judgment of "medium agreement, medium evidence" as no literature source is given explicitly. Therefore, the first sentence in bold letters should begin with "Because adaptation (Figure SPM.2A)", and this sentence should be highlighted (bold). (GERMANY)	This text, now in section C-1, has been revised to clarify the finding. The finding on encountering limits is also presented in section C-2, and maladaptation is addressed in C-1.
503	68159	TS	25	38	25	39	In the process of development and implementation of adaptation plans, it is not enough to only focus on decision-making. It is necessary to obtain sufficient financial and technological support as well. Therefore, it is suggested to change "adaptation governance plays a key role to promote the transition from planning to implementation of adaptation" to "adaptation governance, including institution, finance, technology, incentives, information management etc., plays a key role to promote the transition of adaptation" (CHINA)	Section C-1 addresses constraints on adaptation planning and implementation, including several of these topics.
504	68600	TS	25	38	25	50	Content of Ch 15 section 15.2.3 is not reflected well by the Executive summary (Ch 15, page 3, line 30-39) and the TS (page 25, line 38-50). Executive summary and TS are in agreement with each other, but not with the main text of the Chapter. For example, the statement that complementary top-down strategies are required couldn't be found in the main text of section 15.2.3 (it is actually in section 15.4.2, page 32, line 12 and section 15.5, page 35, line 1) Similarly, the word 'bottom-up' does not even appear in the main text of Section 15.2.3. In section 15.2.4.4 or 15.4, these words are mentioned. Therefore, please be morte accurate in referencing the statement in th TS as well as in the Ex Sum of Ch. 15. (NETHERLANDS)	The Technical Summary has been revised based on the final drafts of all chapters, and line-of-sight references in brackets indicate the chapter sections where assessment supporting findings can be found.
505	76329	TS	25	52	25	52	This text presents the information much more clearly than the figure. Consider deleting the figure. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure has been removed.
506	68601	ΤS	25	56	25	56	figure TS.5 reads "efforts in adaptation CAN be, whereas chapter 15 reads "NEED to be" (Chapter15, caption of Figure 15.1, p.52) (NETHERLANDS)	This figure and its caption have been removed.
507	60313	TS	26	5	16	21	separate component (sub chapter) on Traditional Knowledge (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Section C-1 discusses traditional knowledge. These subheadings have been removed in the process of shortening the Technical Summary.
508	76330	TS	26	9	26	9	Are the authors referring to a diffusion process, or dissemination? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This term has been deleted.
509	65687	TS	26	12	26	14	Perhaps some more commentary needed in addition to the bold text? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Section A-3 includes an expanded paragraph on this topic.

521

522

	/GII AR5	Teen			n To	То		FIRST-ORDER DRA
#	ID	Ch			Page		Comment	Response
510	76331	TS	26	26	16	21	The statement that "traditional and indigenous forms of knowledge" are a major resource for adaptation except where changes exceed the knowledge repertoire should be more carefully qualified. The implication made here is that the exceptional "changes" refer to climate. In fact, most facets of the social, economic, regulatory, and environmental baselines have changed over most of the globe relative to "traditional" knowledge baseline, hence there are many more reasons to question the utility of such knowledge in guiding adaptation than just cases when climate has shifted outside of the "repertoire." (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text, now in section C-1, has been revised to clarify the finding.
511	60314	TS	26	26	26	46	Risk financial mechanisms and economics of climate change should be separate sub chapter (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Section C-1 discusses these topics. These subheadings have been removed in the process of shortening the Technical Summary.
512	76823	TS	26	26	26	46	Insurance puts a price tag on risk and therefore incentivizes risk prevention and mitigation. Adaptation measures are available to make societies more resilient to the impacts of climate change. But decision makers need the facts to identify the most cost-effective investments. Climate adaptation is an urgent priority for the custodians of national and local economies, such as finance ministers and mayors - as well as to leaders in the private sector. Such decision makers ask: What is the potential climate-related loss to our economies and societies over the coming decades? How much of that loss can we avert, with what measures? What investment will be required to fund those measures - and will the benefits of that investment outweigh the costs? The Economics of Climate Adaptation (ECA) methodology provides decision makers with a fact base to answer these questions in a systematic way. It enables them to understand the impact of climate change on their economies - and identify actions to minimise that impact at the lowest cost to society. It therefore allows decision makers to integrate adaptation with economic development and sustainable growth. Find the publication on http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	The themes of risk and risk management are discussed throughout the Technical Summary.
513	68602	TS	26	27	26	27	Where does the "high confidence" come from? It is not found in the chapter summary for section 10.7 and 10.9. Is it based on one of the other sections (8.4,17.4 or 17.5) or should it be: "high agreement, robust evidence"? (NETHERLANDS)	This material is covered in section C-1, with medium confidenc assigned in line with the Executive Summary of Chapter 17.
514	68603	TS	26	30	26	30	Institutions often include norms and regulations, therefore norms and regulations are similar to institutional innovations. Also, the main text 17.5 does not say about institutional innovations but R&D subsidies. Therefore, we suggest to change "institutional innovations" by "R&D subsidies". These comments are also mentioned for the SPM, ExSum and the main text 17.5. (NETHERLANDS)	Institutional innovations deleted.
515	76332	ΤS	26	31	26	31	What does 'climate proof' mean? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Term deleted.
516	68604	TS	26	36	26	46	Paragraph 17.3.4 not relevant here (NETHERLANDS)	Reference revised.
517	68605	TS	26	38	26	38	Kinship networks and microfinance, even though relevant examples, are not covered in the main text. [Microfinance in Malawi is only mentioned as an example, but microfinance per se is not enumerated as one of possible instruments] (NETHERLANDS)	Examples deleted.
518	68606	TS	26	42	26	43	Public private partnership is not covered in the main text in the context of risk sharing and insurance market, but uniquely within the framework of investment in paragraph 17.5.3 (NETHERLANDS)	Public-private partnerships are presented as an example of an economic instrument.
519	76333	TS	26	45	26	45	Please provide explanation/examples for "many counteracting factors" (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This material has been condensed due to space considerations, and the explicit mention of counteracting factors has been removed. It now appears in C-1.

Page 35 of 90

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
523	68608	ΤS	27	6	27	7	Discussion in the literature also includes warnings and concerns about deliberately created transformations. E.g.: Meadowcroft, M., 2009, What about the politics? Sustainable development, transition management, and long-term energy transitions. Policy Sciences, vol. 42, iss. 4, pp 323-340. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. E.g.: Voss, JP., Bornemann, B., 2011, The politics of reflexive governance: challenges for designing adaptive management and transition management. Ecology & Society, vol. 16, iss. 2, art. 9. (NETHERLANDS)	This topic is discussed in section C-2.
524	68609	TS	27	8	27	8	The idea of deliberately steering transformations that take place in interacting spheres is based on 1 source (O'Brien and Sygna, forthcoming) according to p. 24 of Chapter 20. It would be more appropriate to state here that "deliberate transformations could possibly be deliberately triggered, and stimulated to take place accross interacting spheres". (NETHERLANDS)	This material, presented in section C-2, has been revised for clarity.
525	79319	TS	27	14	27	15	This figure is poorly explained and not easy to understand (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure has been removed.
526	76335	TS	27	23	27	25	or, increased resilience but with undesireable outcomes (this goes to management objectives). A resilient ecosystem or society does not necessarily translate into a desireable functional outcome. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
527	70408	ΤS	27	24	27	24	This line could be more accurate as "development will influence future human adaptive capacity and therefore its vulnerability,". This if we are still considering that Vulnerability is a function of Exposure, Sensitivity and Adaptive Capacity, as the Fourth Assessment Report mentioned. (COLOMBIA)	This text has been removed.
528	76336	TS	27	27	20	25	This statement ignores another salient constraint on adaptation: regulatory and policy requirements that have been put in place that are inappropriate to changing climatic conditions or that are based on too narrow a view regarding potential impacts in other domains. Please consider revising. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This topic is discussed in section C-1, particularly in the paragraph on maladaptation.
529	76337	TS	27	30	27	30	It's not really proper to say that societies catastrophically fail. They transform in many ways. See e.g., Hegmon et al., 2008 example given for page 17, line 31. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed, and transformation is discussed in section C-2 and Box TS.8.
530	76338	TS	27	32	27	32	The end of this sentence does not make sense "limits to adaptationand environmental constraintsbeing reached" (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
531	76339	ΤS	27	45	27	45	Mitigation and adaptation areoftencomplementary. They can also offset each other and compromise in the decisionmaking processes is required for one versus the other. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Co-benefits, synergies, and tradeoffs among adaptation and mitigation are discussed in section C-2.
532	65688	TS	28	2	26	2	Strictly speaking it is individuals or populations that adapt not species. Maybe rephrase? Within species individuals and populations can adapt through phenotypic and genetic responses". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
533	76340	TS	28	6	28	6	"goods and services, shifts in ecological systemshard limits" This statement is vague (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
534	77273	TS	28	17	0	0	Since limits to adaptation are geographical and time specific, this flows directly from the statement on page 27 line 35. However, do the authors of the chapter feel that the literature support to supplement the statement regarding the relative incidence of limits to adaptation in a <2 and >2 world? (Kreft Sönke, United Nations University - Institute for Environmental and Human Security)	What can be said about the relationship between the magnitude of climate change and limits to adaptation is presented in section C-2 and Box TS.8. Box TS.5 also discusses relevant material in the context of Article 2 of the UNFCCC.
535	63380	TS	28	17	28	20	This statment regarding the 2degree target may mislead the reader into thinking that avoiding "limits to adaptative capacity" across all systems is the objective of the target. The 2 degree target seeks to avoid unmanageble danagerous climate change. This is subjective in terms of what is considered dangerous in this global context, however, localised failures due to limits of adaptation are inevitable at 2 degrees, which is implicitly recognised. (IRELAND)	What can be said about the relationship between the magnitude of climate change and limits to adaptation is presented in section C-2 and Box TS.8. Box TS.5 also discusses relevant material in the context of Article 2 of the UNFCCC.
536	65689	TS	28	19	28	19	Insert "essentially arbitrary" to give "essentially arbitrary climate" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
537	61885	тs	28	33	28	35	Statement is too vague. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been removed.
538	76341	TS	28	33	28	35	Are limits to adaptation to climate change counfounded by human activities that have also contributed to change? YES. In many examples, these limits are tied to human management of landscapes and seascapes. Climate change is an additional stressor. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is discussed in the context of hard and soft limits in Box TS.8.
#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
-----	-------	----	--------------	--------------	------------	------------	---	---
539	78696	TS	28		28	35	Statement seems very general and applicable to every region, not necessarily Europe. I suggest to be more precise and describe specific examples (Luisa Cristini, University of Hawaii)	This text has been removed.
540	64082	ΤS	28	36	0	0	Please add as a 3rd bullet-point: "Although in the Arctic there is a general agreement" (Ch. 28, P5, I 9-11); high confidence. (GERMANY)	This material is included in section A-2.
541	63381	TS	28	42	28	52	The terminology "era of climate responsibility" and "era of climate options" can be misleading and differ from normal usage. (IRELAND)	The second paragraph of section A-3 introduces these eras and the roles of adaptation and mitigation in influencing outcomes in these two timeframes.
542	60637	TS	28	48	0	0	Increased intensity, frequency, and duration of extreme events, as climate change becomes more extensive, means that adaptation based on recent experience or extrapolation of historical trends will be largely ineffective. [15.3.2.2] (George Backus, Sandia National Laboratories)	Limits to adaptation are discussed in section C-2 and Box TS.8.
543	68610	TS	28	49	28	51	In chapter 21, to which these statements of the TS refer, it is not explicitly mentioned that 'uncertainties about future vulnerability and exposure also increase over time'. Reconsider giving another reference for these statements. Consider also adding Section 21.5.2 as a reference. (NETHERLANDS)	The last paragraph of section A-3 addresses these topics, drawing from the Chapter 21 final draft.
544	69904	TS	29	10	29	11	More precisely the radiative forcing levels at 2100, not the whole 21st century. (John Caesar, Met Office Hadley Centre)	This text has been removed.
545	64083	TS	29	17	49	21	The information on sectors and regions in section C.i should be differentiated for different emission pathways, i.e. the decrease in risks for ambitious mitigation scenarios should be emphasized as this is most relevant for decision making. (GERMANY)	Such differentiation is made where possible throughout section B (previous section C). Section B-1 also includes a paragraph highlighting the potential for mitigation to substantially reduce risks in the second half of the 21st century.
546	64084	ΤS	29	17	49	21	The subsections on sectors and regions in section C.i would greatly profit from revising and clarifying the structure: 1) remove duplications, 2) separate climate change phenomena from its impacts, 3) separate human/social/economic and biophysical/natural systems, 4) separate risks from adaptation measures (e.g. the para on adaption on page 20, lines 20 to 32), 5) clarify the time period to which the statements relates. 6) reduce on the statements in each of subsections to subject (e.g. in "Terrestrial and inland water systems" the paras on moving ranges of plants and animal and on alien species should be moved to another section or the title must be changed to "Terrestrial systems and inland water systems"). Uncertainty needs to added to each key statement. (GERMANY)	clarity, and calibrated uncertainty language is used throughout. Material is presented by sector and by region, corresponding to the chapters of the underlying report. Specific adaptation options are presented where relevant to discussion of specific
547	64085	TS	29	22	22	23	The statement needs more explanation, currently it suggests that uncertainty is uncontrollable and models unreliable. (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
548	76342	TS	29	29	18	23	The use of the term "emissions" is generally taken as a reference to products of fossil fuel combustion. However, releases of greenhouse gases from the environment itself are of extreme importance to climate forcing, including releases from peatlands, permafrost, coastal wetlands, etc. that are now a consequence of combined warming and sea level rise. Perhaps a better term than "emissions" can be used or clarification as to what is intended. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
549	78697	ΤS	29	36	29	38	The sentence is not very clear and should be rewitten to avoid misunderstandings. (Luisa Cristini, University of Hawaii)	The caption has been revised for clarity. This figure is now Figure TS.5.
550	65690	TS	30	0	0	0	General Comment. It is worth trying to get over the idea that glaciers act as saved freshwater capital. Perhaps here and in the policy summary as well. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	
551	76825	TS	30	3	30	14	In a seminal study on the Economics of Climate Adaptation (ECA), Swiss Re and other leading organizations developed a methodology to quantify local climate risks and provide decision-makers with the necessary facts to design a cost-effective climate adaptation strategy. ECA offers countries and local level decision-makers the facts and framework to design an adaptation strategy and to demonstrate the role of insurance risk transfer measures. Case studies in 17 different regions around the globe, ranging from Maharashtra in India to Florida and Northern England, showed that up to 68 percent of expected loss from climate change can be averted using cost-effective adaptation measures. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Thank you for this input. The scope of the technical summary is to present salient findings from the underlying chapters of the report.
552	64087	TS	30	17	0	0	Please adjust the wording of heading C.i. to the heading C.i. in the SPM (GERMANY)	Section B (formerly section C) presents sectoral and regional risks and potential for adaptation in separate sections in both the SPM and Technical Summary.

IPCC	WGII ARS	5 Tech	nical	Sumr	nary		
#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Comment
**		CII	Dago	Line	Dago	Lino	comment

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
553	64086	ΤS	30	17	49	22	A table joining all "specific regional examples" should replace the various lists of bullet points in Section C.i to improve readability. (GERMANY)	Section B-3 now presents regional risks and potential for adaptation, including a table of regional key risks (Table TS.5).
554	64088	ΤS	30	19	0	0	The concept of the era of climate responsibility / option is not clear enough. It should be explained clearly when first mentioned on P 22, possibly in a box. See also our general comment on the concept of eras on the SPM and in Ch 1. (GERMANY)	The second paragraph of section A-3 introduces these eras and the roles of adaptation and mitigation in influencing outcomes in these two timeframes.
555	61886	ΤS	30	19	30	21	Where are the eras defined? What do they mean and what are their implications? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	The second paragraph of section A-3 introduces these eras and the roles of adaptation and mitigation in influencing outcomes in these two timeframes.
556	64089	TS	30	26	0	0	"would change": the AR5 uses future tense for projections, please change. (GERMANY)	This text has been revised as suggested.
557	76343	TS	30	26	30	26	Are there any assessment of changes to seasonality/precipitation in temperate regions? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such topics are assessed in the Working Group I contribution to the Fifth Assessment Report.
558	71037	ΤS	30	26	30	36	Why is the term "would" used here while not later in this section? This may imply that the other identified risks are more likely. (CANADA)	The use of "would" has been removed.
559	77295	TS	30	29	0	0	And anywhere warm enough not to have any snow (William Ingram, Met Office)	This text has been removed.
560	76344	тs	30	30	30	31	An SRES figure? Why not current (i.e., use of RCPs) - can a similar figure be generated from more recent model results? This statement is in accordance with the AR4. What are the vulnerabilities? To social unrest? Irrigation? Residential consumption? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure has been replaced by an RCP-based figure illustrating projected changes in river flooding return period and exposure. See Figure TS.6.
561	76345	TS	30	30	38	43	Statement should be qualified to refer to non-antarctic glaciers/ice caps. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
562	76346	TS	30	30	52	52	Use of "renewable" as adjective is unnecessary and undefined. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This term has been retained for consistency with the underlying chapter assessment.
563	80616	ΤS	30	33	30	34	The emission of GHGs will affect climate firstly, then the precipitation and runoffs, then the water resource, during this process, there are uncertainties in each step, thus can not use the term "inference" as a causality. SUGGESTION: change as "Hydrological impacts of climate change would increase as global warming." (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	This text has been revised for clarity, but the comparison has been retained. The section is now B-2.
564	61887	TS	30	33	30	36	Should this one be moved to the SPM? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	A revised version of this text is included in the SPM.
565	76347	TS	30	33	30	36	These two sentences are not consistent. What does a low emissions pathway have to do with developing country vulnerabilities to water availability? This bias is also consistent with the rest of the text. High income countries will also be vulnerable, perhaps more so due to cost and willingness for adaptation. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity and logical flow. The paragraph now focuses on risks as evaluated through assessment of projected impacts. Note that the original statement applied to both developed and developing countries, while emphasizing impacts in developing countries.
566	71038	ΤS	30	34	30	34	Suggest replacing the phrase " a low-emissions pathway reduces" with "a low-emissions pathway could reduce". As the document acknowledges that there is limited evidence in support of the statements they should be made more conditional in nature. (CANADA)	This text has been removed.
567	71039	тs	30	35	30	35	Suggest replacing the phrase " change on water resources are expected to reduce" with "change on water resources have the potential to reduce". As the document acknowledges that there is limited evidence in support of the statements they should be made more conditional in nature. (CANADA)	This text has been removed.
568	64090	TS	30	52	0	0	"renewable water resources"? (GERMANY)	This term has been retained for consistency with the underlying chapter assessment.
569	61888	ΤS	30	54	30	54	Is this statement acceptable? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	
570	79887	ΤS	30	54	30	55	Very vague statement. Chapter 3, p. 20, l. 14 says that there is "insufficient agreement of projections", which is different from using different definitions. (NORWAY)	This text has been removed.

65691

65692

61889

61890

76349

76350

79888

76351

79320

68612

TS 31 10 31 10

ΤS 31 18 31 18

ΤS 31 20 31 24

ΤS 31 27 31

ΤS 31 31

ΤS

ΤS 31 39 31 39

ΤS

TS 31 44 31 45

ΤS

31 38 31 38

31 44 31 44

31 46 31 54

575

576

577

578

579

580

581

582

583

584

#	ID	Ch		From	To Page	To	Comment
571	66033	TS		1		4	It is sayed that there is an "High agreement robust evidence: projected climate changes imply large changes in the freq of floods as a consequence of most intense rainfall events". It also says that it will mainly affect small catchments due t limited extent of heavy rains. However, when more intense and local rainfall (usually convective rainfall), more uncerta On the contrary, the projected changes on heavy rainfall are more robust for extended events (and not so intense/heav convective rainfalls), like those that affects great basins like Rhine or Danube. Another question here is why the report than only "limited evidence" on the increase of economic impacts as a consequence of the major exposition and vulner to floods? All reports (included those of UNISDR) point to an increase of economic impacts due to the major exposition vulnerability (included the major value of the assests); see for instance chapter 3, page 25, lines 38-51. (Maria-Carmen University of Barcelona)
572	76348	TS	31	1	31	7	No changes in N. America? EU, Australia. Please specify. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
573	76824	TS	31	1	31	7	The city of Hull, on England's North Sea coast, faces a three-pronged climate-induced threat. In addition to exposure to freshwater flooding following severe rainfall, Hull is at risk from the impact of strong windstorms and coastal flooding. area is also economically deprived and currently under regeneration, which increases its vulnerability. Today's risk from coastal and river flood, as well as winterstorm amounts to US\$ 50m. Analysis shows that even with only moderate clim change by 2030, the risk across all asset groups would increase by 10% compared with that scenario, and 20% in the camajor change. For example, the worst-case situation would incur an expected annual loss amounting to US\$ 50m for residential buildings alone. http://media.swissre.com/documents/Economics_of_Climate_Adaption_UK_Factsheet1.pd http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=100 (Lea Mue Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)
			1	1	1	1	

Environmental Risks Unit)

US. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

availability for organisms. (NORWAY)

(UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)

Fragile is a rather judgemental term. Perhaps just delete. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

29

10 11

FIF	RST-ORDER DRAFT
Response	
The text on floods has been revised for clar	ity, and a figure

(TS.6) is now included to illustrate projected changes in river flood return period and exposure. The relevant section is now B-

Figure TS.6 is now included to illustrate projected regional

References are given to the first sublevel in the Technical

This text has been revised for clarity and shortened. The

The relevant section is now B-2. The statement on water quality

has been revised to address raw water quality with an emphasis

on drinking water quality. Water for cooling of thermoelectric

power plants is addressed in the subsection on economic

Thank you for this input. The scope of the technical summary is

to present salient findings from the underlying chapters of the

Thank you for this input. The scope of the technical summary is to present salient findings from the underlying chapters of the

changes in river flood return period.

2.

report.

Summary text.

This text has been removed.

relevant section is B-2.

This text has been removed.

report.

sectors

This statement (on Europe) seems a bit of a blanket statement (too vague) and poorly justified compared to the other	This text has been removed.
examples (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	
As a reference for the main statement in lines 46-47 section 24.4.3 is mentioned. We doubt whether this reference is	This text has been removed here, although part of the revised
adequate. Section 24.4.3 refers to coastal systems and low-lying areas, and not directly to freshwater resources (section	version of this material from the final draft of Chapter 24 is
24.4.1). Moreover the term 'water scarcity' is mentioned at page 25, line 33 (in section 24.4.4.3), page 31, line 20 (in section	presented in section B-3. References to chapter sections have
24.4.5.3) and in FAQ 24.1 (page 49, line 50 and 53). Please reconsider refering to another section then 24.4.3.	been carefully checked.
(NETHERLANDS)	

There is classic evidence from Gene Likens work on de-forestation on nutrient retention in catchments in upstate New York -

done back in the 1960s. e.g. Likens, G.E., F.H. Bormann and N.M. Johnson. 1969. Nitrification: importance to nutrient losses

However, BOD is likely to be higher under warm conditions in receiving waters from treatment plants. Extreme rainfall events

from a cutover forested ecosystem. Science163:1205-1206. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)

will also lead to greater incidence of storm water discharge. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)

This paragraph is too vague and general. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change &

This reference to global costs should be clarified. Costs for the water sector? (European Union DG Research, Directorate

Deteriorating water quality applies not only to municipal water supplies but to all waters - where either concentrations of

dissolved constituents or temperatures increase beyond normal tolerances of aquatic species. In addition, increased water

Since basically all life on Earth is water dependent, maybe "water constrained" is a better wording for areas with low water

What is it about water quality and high temperature that will be affected? Demand? Increased ET? Sedimentation? Other?

temperature has already resulted in derating or temporary halts in thermoelectric power production in the central/southern

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
585	68613	TS		55	32		Evidence in Chapter is for increases and decreases in freshwater resources in NZ; TS cites only decreases (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed here, although part of the revised version of this material from the final draft of Chapter 25 is presented in section B-3, which also addresses potential positive impacts. Material is presented following the Chapter 25 Executive Summary.
586	68614	TS	31	55	32	6	SPM states eastern and northern parts of NZ; Chapter states east and north of North Island (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
587	76352	ΤS	32	7	32	24	These are nice examples but are in conflict with previous statements. (Page 31, line 7) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been condensed and revised for clarity (see section B-3). Note that there are limits to the extent to which adaptation can reduce vulnerability.
588	76353	TS	32	13	32	13	The broad term of invasive is probably not applicable. Need to explore what is truly an invasive versus expanded range of existing species that are not necessarily desireable (by people). (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This comment is misplaced (refers to page 33). This text has been removed, but note that the text refers to invasive alien species, which is also defined in the Working Group II glossary.
589	77354	TS	32	14	15	32	Ecuador as well as Chile and Argentina has semi-arid zones with high vulnerability in terms of water supply. (Maria Jose Galarza, Ministerio del Ambiente del Ecuador)	This text has been removed.
590	77355	TS	32	21	32	24	The water law has not been updated yet in Ecuador. (Maria Jose Galarza, Ministerio del Ambiente del Ecuador)	This text has been removed.
591	76354	TS	32	22	32	22	What role is this "actor"? Residents? Communities? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
592	76355	ΤS	32	23	32	23	What happens when species migrate to mountain tops or limits to habitat? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This comment is misplaced (refers to page 33). This text has been removed, but this topic is discussed in the underlying chapter (chapter 4).
593	76356	TS	32	37	32	37	Do the authors mean lagged response times? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
594	76357	ΤS	32	44	32	45	What about surface roughness? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
595	79889	ΤS	32	44	32	45	Include changes related to carbon storage, through e.g. deforestration and destruction of wetlands, in this list of climate feedbacks (NORWAY)	This text has been removed, although carbon storage is addressed in this section (now section B-2) in a separate paragraph.
596	76358	ΤS	32	45	32	46	What about teleconnections? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
597	76359	ΤS	32	53	33	2	Is there a chance that land use change or management practices might also contribute? Perhaps even more so than climate? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed. See the first paragraph of this subsection (now in section B-2) regarding discussion of this topic.
598	65693	TS	33	4	33	4	A species will not move its range, nor alter its abundance, nor shift seasonal activities. (See comments for Policy Makers Summary). This implies a conscious decision by the species. Individuals and populations in species respond to environmental change resulting in shifts in distribution, changes in abundance, phenology etc. Rephrase "In terrestrial plant and animal species, ranges will continue to move, abundance will alter and there will be shifts in seasonal patterns of activities in response to" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
599	64091	TS	33	4	33	31	The para starting in line 4 and the one starting in line 18 seem to be closely linked, it is suggest to join and shorten them. (GERMANY)	This text has been condensed and combined in the revised draft. The relevant section is now B-2.
600	57447	TS	33	5	0	0	Consider adding (phenology) after 'activities' (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	This text has been removed.
601	78698	ΤS	33	13	33	14	Please add one sentence on why are invasisve species more likely than native species to have attributes favouring survival and reprodction under climate change (Luisa Cristini, University of Hawaii)	This text has been removed.
602	65694	ΤS	33	14	33	14	Insert "and more variable" to give "changing and more variable" (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
603	64092	TS	33	18	33	31	Please add to the paragraph that there is a great interspecific variability in phenological responses to climate change, leading to changes in interspecific interactions and to increased asynchrony (see chapter 4, page 24 lines 18-42 and chapter 23.6.4.). Even if species would be able to move fast enough to reach suitable climates, changed species interactions poses an additional threat on them. (GERMANY)	This point has been considered, but has not been included due to length considerations.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	TO Page	To Line	Comment	Response
604	61891	TS	33	22	33	23	Mountains have often been reported as particularly vulnerable because they are limited territories, migration is upwards (physical limit to mountain peaks) and competence and other ecological relations can make ecosystems non-viable. Flat areas are usually easier to migrate. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been removed, but this topic is discussed in the underlying chapter (chapter 4). See also Figure TS.7.
605	64093	TS	33	22	33	23	The text states "Species in large flat areas are particularly vulnerable because they must migrate over longer distances to keep up with climate change than will species in mountainous regions." Please add: "An important exception is for species that are already at the tops of mountains (or near other boundaries) - they are among the most threatened by climate change because they cannot move upwards." (citation from chapter 4, page 30, lines 4 -5) (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, but this topic is discussed in the underlying chapter (chapter 4). See also Figure TS.7.
606	61892	ΤS	33	23	33	24	Amphibians, reptiles should be mentioned. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been removed.
507	65695	TS	33	24	33	24	Perhaps amphibians and reptiles as well? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
608	79321	TS	33	34	33	50	This figure is very crowded and difficult to read. Perhaps the 3 panels (a-c) could be separated a little more. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure (now Figure TS.7) has been revised for clarity.
509	64094	TS	33	52	33	54	To which time does this statement refer and to which RCP? (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
610	79890	ΤS	33	52	33	54	Consider to include a summary of this finding in the in SPM. (NORWAY)	This text has been removed, but this topic is addressed more broadly in the context of extinction risk in both the technical summary and the SPM.
611	65696	ΤS	34	4	34	12	Perhaps it is worth emphasizing that extensive local extinctions are likely to occur ahead of global extinction for a particular species. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This comment has been considered, but not incorporated due to space considerations.
612	71040	TS	34	14	0	0	For traceability, it would be good to see in this section a reference to other sections in the document supporting the claim of "virtual certainty" that carbon stored in land and freshwater has increased over last two decades in plant biomass and SOM. It is rare that the document uses "virtual certainty" and it would seem that SOM sampling is uncertain enough that context is needed in referenced sections. (CANADA)	This text has been removed. The carbon sink is still addressed i
613	79891	TS	34	14	34	16	Please check for consistency between this sentence and the sentence in TS, p. 34, I. 23-25. (NORWAY)	This text has been removed.
614	70409	TS	34	17	34	18	A study of the Institute of Hydrology Meteorology and Environmental Studies of Colombia, that contributes with this statement is: Yepes, A., Duque, A.J., Navarrete D.A., Phillips J.F., Cabrera, E., Corrales-Osorio A., Alvarez-Davila E., Galindo G., García-davila M. C., Idarraga A., Vargas- D. M. (2011). Estimación de las reservas y pérdida de carbono por deforestación en el periodo 2000-2007 en los bosques del departamento de Antioquia, Colombia". Actual Biol 33 (95): 193-208. (COLOMBIA)	Thank you for this input.
615	76360	ΤS	34	31	34	34	The authors are cautioned to approach this statement carefully. Models are important surrogates and can provide insight into processes, but they are not definitive. Just because models state that N will be a limiting factor doesn't mean that other factors (e.g., P, the N-H2O, disturbance rates, etc) aren't equally as important. Please clarify. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed.
616	76361	ΤS	34	34	14	34	An additional factor that moves carbon from terrestrial systems back to atmosphere that is not discussed is that due to simple change in permafrost conditions, and resulting increase in natural microbial metabolism as well as melting of clathrates. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This point is addressed in B-2, page 21, first bold paragraph.
617	76362	TS	34	34	54	54	The "low confidence" is misattributed as written: the release of greenhouse gases from thawing permafrost and burning forests is "high confidence"; what may be "low confidence" is whether this constitutes a tipping point. Suggest that this be checked also in the underpinning chapter. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity. The overarching finding for the paragraph now has medium confidence. The relevant section is now B-2.
618	76363	ΤS	34	36	34	38	Have there been no results since AR4 on this topic? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity and condensed, and summarizes the available evidence since AR4. The relevant section is now B-2.
619	58808	TS	34	36	34	41	The sentences in this paragraph seem to be exaggerated in terms of the impact of climate change on tree sensitivity. You have referred the section 4.3.3.1 to show how trees are more sensitive to futre climate change than reported in IPCC AR4; however, the section 4.3.3.1 does not necessarily compared with the information in the AR4. Also most of the tree mortality are caused by drought, not temperature rise. Also in the second sentence, you've said high conficence that future climate change impacts on tree mortality and tree ranges could be large; however, there are not many papers directly showed tree mortality is caused by climate change: most papers discussed tree mortality is caused by combinations of varous factors such as drought and insect attack, etc. Therefore it may be better to lower the degree of your confidence from "high" to "medium". (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	This text has been revised for clarity, and the revised statement is assigned medium confidence. The relevant section is now B- 2.

IPCC WGII AR5	Technical	Summary	
---------------	-----------	---------	--

#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Comment	Response
"			Page	Line	Page	Line		
620	68035	TS	34	36	34	41	The first sentence, "Recent experimental, observational much sooner than previously anticipated. [4.3.3.1]", does not seem to have sufficient backing elaboration in the indicated section 4.3.3.1, particularly for the comparison made with the assessment by IPCC AR4, therefore it is strongly suggested to deleted the sentence. Also, for the second sentence, "Future climate change impacts on tree mortality and tree ranges could be large (high confidence),", the stated level of "high" confidence here is suggested to be lowered since the section 4.3.3 points out that tree mortality and tree ranges are driven by various factors; i.e. direct attribution of tree mortality and tree ranges to climate change is not necessarily clear. (JAPAN)	This text has been revised for clarity, and the revised statement is assigned medium confidence. The relevant section is now B- 2.
621	65697	TS	34	36	34	45	Increasing disease risk as pathogens spread with warming? Worth mentioning? (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This topic has not been included due to space considerations.
622	76364	тs	34	47	34	49	There will be changes to carbon emissions, though not always increases. Rapid woody encroachment can decrease carbon emissions, no-till agricultural practices can decrease carbon emissions, afforestation can decrease emissions, etc. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant section is now B-2.
623	76365	ΤS	35	10	35	10	Management can shape, not always reduce (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The point here is that certain management actions can reduce risks, without implying that any management always will reduce risks.
624	79892	TS	35	12	35	13	Species cannot lose "species", please considering using "individuals" or "populations". (NORWAY)	This text has been removed.
625	65698	TS	35	15	35	20	very long sentence – split? "The capacity for ecosystems to adapt to climate change can be increased by reducing the other stresses operating on them: reducing the rate and magnitude of change, reducing habitat fragmentation and increasing connectivity, maintaining a large pool of genetic diversity and functional evolutionary processes. In addition active management can occur via assisted translocation of slow". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been condensed and revised for clarity. The relevant section is now B-2.
626	64095	TS	35	17	35	18	Since assisted translocation is highly debatable because of possible unforeseeable negative consequences (see chapter 4.4.2.4.) it should either not be listed in this paragraph (proposal to delete the term here) or should be only mentioned with a qualifier e.g. in exceptional cases. (GERMANY)	These options are presented as examples that are not intended to imply suitability to all situations. The first paragraph of section C-1 makes this point in general terms, highlighting the context specificity of adaptation.
627	77274	TS	35	22	0	0	Consider regional balance of case studies (add African example) (Kreft Sönke, United Nations University - Institute for Environmental and Human Security)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in a separate section (B-3) covering all regions.
628	68036	ΤS	35	22	36	13	Only one Asian example from Central Asia has been provided as a Sectoral Risk with Regional Examples (freshwater systems), which is insufficient to represent the vast diversity of the Asian continent. Examples in each region should be added. (JAPAN)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in a separate section (B-3) covering all regions.
629	76366	ΤS	35	25	35	25	Not sure what the authors mean by phenological mismatch. Perhaps shifts (in seasonality, etc) in attempts to coincide with new growing season, etc? What time scales does this occur on? Suspect that this is will differ among organisms (e.g., microbe versus a tree). (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed. Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in a separate section (B-3).
630	76367	TS	35	27	35	28	Either state the specific phenomenon (what species is moving where), or generalize that undersireable natives are increasing range, or habitat. Is it really invasives? If so, what are they replacing, etc? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A revised version of this text is included in section B-3. The requested level of detail is provided in the underlying chapter text. See chapter 23.
631	61893	TS	35	28	35	30	This statement is very unclear. Natura 2000 provides plenty of opportunities for adaptation given its significant surface area covered. Other measures are included in the Habitats Directive to facilitate connectivity. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been removed.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
632	64096	TS		28	Page 35		The text states "Biodiversity is affected in unprotected areas more than in protected areas, but Natura 2000 areas retain climate suitability for species no better and sometimes less effectively than unprotected areas." Comments: 1) This sentence is an incorrect citation of the summary of the original paper from Araujo 2011: whereas in the original paper the sentence is formulated as a statement about the future ("Protected areas ARE EXPECTED to retain climatic suitability for species better than unprotected areas, but Natura 2000 retain climate suitability for species no better and sometimes less effectively than unprotected areas.") because the paper deals with projections until 2080, the given sentence in the TS is a statement about the presence "Biodiversity IS AFFECTED". 2) In the analysis of Araujo a distiction is made between protected areas, unprotected areas and NATURA 2000 areas. This is not explicitly mentioned in the TS nor chapter 23 and may lead to confusion. 3) One key finding is based on data of plants ("in fact, the Natura 2000 is less effective rulation climate climate for plant species than sets of randomly selected unprotected areas and Natura 2000: "Different results ("For half of the remaining combinations of taxonomic groups and scenarios, the Natura 2000: "Differences in changes of climate suitability between protected areas and Natura 2000: "Differences in changes of climate suitability between protected areas and Natura 2000: "Differences in changes of climate suitability between protected areas and Natura 2000: "Differences in lower and flatter lands. Because proportional range losses arising from climate change are usually more pronounced in flatlands than in rugged terrains, the Natura 2000 is more vulnerable to climate change." Suggestion: Since the given sentence in the TS is a coarse reduction of findings and explanations of the original paper and may lead to misinterpretations, we propose to delete the sentence here. (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
633	64097	ΤS	35	28	35	30	Since the sentence in the TS (and in Ch 23, P 5 L 23-25) is a coarse reduction of findings and explanations of the original paper and may lead to misinterpretations, we propose to delete the sentence here and to replace it with the following original quotation from Araujo's paper: "Protected areas are expected to retain climatic suitability for species better than unprotected areas." (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
634	76368	TS	35	33	35	33	Not just climate, but management will alter damage to forests,fire suppression is a substantial factor. This is also major concern for North America, not just Europe. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed, but tree mortality is addressed in general terms in this terrestrial ecosystems subsection (of section B-2).
635	68037	ΤS	35	40	35	49	The sentence "permafrost degradation during the 21st Century" is repeated in one paragraph. One of them should be deleted. (JAPAN)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in a separate section (B-3). This text has been revised for clarity.
636	76369	TS	35	47	35	48	This statement is not clear. Please revise. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in a separate section (B-3). This text has been removed.
637	68615	TS	35	51	35	56	It is confusing to apply confidence statements to compound / multi-clause statements. Does it apply to the whole sentence, or the last part, or? (NETHERLANDS)	Following the convention throughout the Technical Summary and explained in Box TS.3, confidence statements apply to the whole sentence in which they are included and subsequent sentences of the same paragraph, unless otherwise indicated.
638	76370	TS	35	52	35	54	Much of Australia's native forest has been lost to slash pine production or conversion to rangelands. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This section is focused on future risks and potential for adaptation.
639	68616	TS	35	55	35	56	Reference to endemic species extinction. Original text states local species extinction, which we don't consider the same thing as endemic species. (NETHERLANDS)	This material on regional risks and potential for adaptation is now presented in section B-3. This text has been revised in line with the final draft of Chapter 25.
640	76371	TS	35	55	35	56	Please provide specifics. Australia is an outstanding example of true invasives (rabbits, fox, horse, etc.) displacing native species. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Space constraints do not allow inclusion in the Technical Summary, but details can be found in the underlying chapter text. See chapter 25.
641	65699		36	0		0	Nice section on coasts. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Thank you.
642	76372	TS	36	5	36	6	This statement is weak. Consider also Deser et al., regarding changes to regions. What are projected changes other than mean temperature? What will or could be affected? Would have expected inclusion of chages in rain-on-snow in mountain regions, decreasing water availability, changes to flood patterns, extreme events, etc. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now presented in section B-3. This specific example is no longer used, but relevant findings for ecosystems in North America are presented.

Gover

ΤS

nent and Expert Review

W	GII AR5	Tech	nical	Sumr	mary			FIRST-ORDER DRA
	ID	Ch	From	From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
	61894	ΤS	36	18	36	25	Proposal to add this paragraph to SPM (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	A revised version of this text is included in the SPM. Please see the coastal subsection of B-2 in the SPM.
	68617	ΤS	36	27	36	42	Chapter 30.6 should be added to the source (NETHERLANDS)	Ocean acidification is now addressed in the "Marine systems" section of B-2, with corresponding line of sight to the relevant assessment in Chapter 30.
	68618	TS	36	28	36	29	Line number 28 states: 'The increase in acidity will be higher in areas where eutrophication is an issue'. From Chapter 5 (p.12, line 39 onward), eutrophication causes hypoxia and this has negative consequences for some organisms, but, in Chapter 5 at least, it is not stated that eutrophication exacerbates acidification. After a check with a chemist, the statement is correct. However it is not yet clearly stated in the chapter text. Suggestion: Crossrefer or state that 'hypoxia can exacerbate acidification since acid producing (anaerobe) organisms thrive in these environments'. (NETHERLANDS)	That is correct. The text of chapter 5 has been revised to incorporate this perspective, and ocean acidification is now addressed in the "Marine systems" section of B-2.
	64098	TS	36	29	36	29	"Due to relative sea level rise…": The term "relative" is misleading; it could also mean that SL is rising due to land depression which is not a climatic effect. What is meant here, is the total net rise due to freshwater discharge into the ocean plus thermosteric. (GERMANY)	This term has been removed.
	79322	ΤS	36	33	36	34	Why would kelp and seagrasses not expand elsewhere? i.e. Why assume a decline? Also, they would probably be benefited by ocean acidification (mentioned elsewhere in the report) (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This statement has been extensively revised, and ocean acidification is now addressed in the "Marine systems" sectio of B-2.
	76373	TS	36	36	18	19	Suggest broadening this sentence to include coastal erosion and sedimentation in addition to submergence and flooding. This is consistent with Chapter 5 material on coastal erosion. For example: "Due to relative sea-level rise, coastal systems and low-lying areas will increasingly experience adverse impacts associated with coastal erosion and sedimentation, submergence, and flooding from extreme coastal high water levels (high confidence)." The paragraph could also be expanded by a sentence or two to include examples, such as a) up to 3/4 of world coastline is rocky or cliffed (Ch 5 P15/L38) and/or b) Ch 5 P43/L37-39 demonstrates that coastal response is the product of complex drivers and processes beyond simple submergence. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Coastal erosion has been added to the revised statement now in section B-2. The paragraph also highlights non-climate drivers of the risks.
	76374	ΤS	36	36	18	25	Increased coastal inundation that is already observed is not just related to RSLR and surgebut is itself increasingly related to increased precipitation associated with coastal meteorological extreme events even in areas where RSLR is less of a concern (non erosive etc). (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is a forward-looking statement focused on the effects of sea level rise. Table TS.5 includes an entry on coastal inundation due to sea-level rise and intensified precipitation events.
	76375	TS	36	36	25	25	Change "5.3.1" to "5.3.2.4." (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Reference revised. Note that all references in the Technical Summary text are given to the first subsection level.
	76376	ΤS	36	36	28	29	It's not just eutrophication from land - but also upwelled waters tend to have lower pH - would be worth including mention of this here. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	That is correct. Ocean acidification is now discussed in the marine systems subsection as well as in Box TS.7. Box TS.7 explicitly refers to the role of upwelling.
	65700	ΤS	36	36	36	36	Replace "intertidal" with "littoral". The Mediterranean is an essentially tideless sea. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	That is correct but this statement has been cut because it was too long. The new finding does not mention "Mediterranean intertidal" anymore.
	76377	TS	36	36	39	39	A statement that further explains the ability of beaches and dunes to migrate landward at moderate rates of sea level rise (e.g. FAQ 5.2) would be a meaningful addition to the simple statement about erosion continuing. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Due to space considerations, the new finding no longer discusses dunes.
	76378	TS	36	36	42	42	Reference to section 30.5.6 on sub-tropical gyres should be removed from this section as it is not relevant to the discussion of coastal ecosystems. Reference to 30.5.4 on coastal boundary systems should be added to the list of sections referenced. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
	76379	TS TS	36 36	36 44	49 36	49 50	Is this supposed to say "increased runoff" (not "reduced")? If not, might be better to say "changes in freshwater input." (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA) This paragraph is on changes in exposition, please explain the link to climate change and its influence on risk? (Are sea level	This text has been removed due to space considerations. This text has been revised and condensed for clarity.
	04099	13	50	44	50	50	rise and changes in climate conditions irrelevant until 20502) (CERMANN)	This text has been revised and condensed for clarity.

rise and changes in climate conditions irrelevant until 2050?) (GERMANY)

Are there projected changes to other topics, e.g., to 100 year flood events? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

This text has been removed due to space considerations.

					. /			
#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
658	76826	ΤS	36		36	52	Losses from floods, storms, earthquakes and other natural catastrophes (Nat Cat) impact the economies of entire countries and are therefore a key driver of the re/insurance business. Such losses are becoming more frequent and severe due to higher insurance penetration and the concentration of assets in exposed areas as well as climate change. If unmitigated, climate change could cost the world economy around 20% of global GDP by the end of this century. http://media.swissre.com/documents/Top_Topics_Group_Issue_Management_2013.pdf#page=6 (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Thank you for this input. This topic is discussed in detail in the IPCC Special Report on Managing the Risks of Extreme Events and Disasters to Advance Climate Change Adaptation.
659	68619	TS	36	52	37	4	We found the 1.26 m sea-level rise in 2100 very difficult to "fact-check" back to WGI. In WGII (Ch5) the number (1.26 m rise in 2100) is indeed mentioned in a couple of instances as a very extreme scenario (as far as I can see the effect of ground subsidence must have been taken into account). In contrast, in WGI (Table 13.5, Ch13), none of the scenarios produce a rise anywhere close to 1.26 m by 2100, even with the already considerably large uncertainty estimates provided. This suggests a very large contribution coming from the ground subsidence. Without further evidence, public critique could be expected that the 1.26 m rise is 'alarmistically' high given the model output. But maybe we overlooked something here. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
660	78554	ΤS	37	13	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
661	76381	ΤS	37	13	37	51	Suggest including examples in N.America, e.g., Sandy, Katrina, loss of barrier islands, buffer ecosystems, extreme drought. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
662	60315	ΤS	37	14	37	51	More evidence-based regional examples from the Pacific island countries would be recommended (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE- Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those for small island nations.
663	76827	ΤS	37	23	0	0	Mention ECA Hull flood risk: http://media.swissre.com/documents/Economics_of_Climate_Adaption_UK_Factsheet1.pdf http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=100 (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now summarized in section B-3, which includes discussion of coastal and river flood risks in Europe.
664	68620	ΤS	37	36	37	37	A misinterpretation of text: the original text says evidence is limited about the ability of reefs to respond to CC, but the claim here is that a reef's ability to respond is limited. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now summarized in section B-3.
665	76382	ΤS	37	37	11	11	Change "5.4.3" to "5.4.3.1". (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Throughout the Technical Summary text, references to chapter sections are to the first subsection level.
666	61895	ΤS	37	45	37	48	This has nothing to do with projections. Furthermore, examples are usually linked to regions, not specific countries. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now summarized in section B-3.
667	79323	ΤS	37	45	37	48	For the statement on Brazil, it is not clear how the activities relate to climate change? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now summarized in section B-3.
668	79893	ΤS	37	49	37	49	Please consider including "and other ice dependent arctic marine mammals" after "polar bears", since for example many arctic seals are dependent on ice for giving birth and lactating pups (which is a reason for polar bears to hunt there). (NORWAY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now summarized in section B-3.
669	76829	TS	37	51	0		Small islands development states experience four types of flooding: flash floods, river floods, coastal floods and ponding floods. The island of Samoa, for example, has his-torically suffered coastal flooding. In 2008, it was estimated that the associated annual average losses could be up to US\$25 million http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=110 (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Thank you for this input. The scope of the technical summary is to present salient findings from the underlying chapters of the report.
670 671	68621 76383	TS TS	38 38		38 38		Should add Box CC-CR as a source (NETHERLANDS) Please be more specific on AR5 WGI reference. What about fish catch at around 10% NPP? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Box CC-CR is now referenced in the revised paragraph. The relevant section is now B-2. This material has been condensed due to space considerations, and the revised text does not reference WGI AR5. The statement that remains is specific to NPP, and does not tie directly to findings on fisheries catch potential.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
672	76384	ΤS	38	38	16	16	This section makes reference to Box 6-2. However, there is no box 6-2 in Chapter 6 of the WGII document. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The reference to Box 6-2 has been removed.
673	79324	TS	38	43	38	49	The figure is ok but the panels are too crowded and laid out in a very ugly and confusing way. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The figure has been revised for clarity, with panels A and C removed and replaced by a panel related to ocean acidification Layout has been improved. This figure is now TS.8.
674	65701	TS	38	54	38	54	Delete "fisheries" "and is" replace with key "high value exploited species, are". (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
675	79325	ΤS	39	4	39	5	Sentence doesn't make sense grammatically and should be re-written (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed.
676	68622	TS	39	4	39	14	These statements were also sourced from Chapter 30.6.2, Chapter 30.6.6, and Chapter 30.6.7. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been revised and condensed for clarity. References for the revised text have been checked. The relevant section is now B-2.
677	68623	ΤS	39	5	39	5	the term "fish stocks" should be substituted by "some fish species" so as to better reflect the content of chapter 7. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been condensed, and this specific term has been removed. The relevant section is now B-2.
678	60316	TS	39	6	39	6	Ecosystem-based management needs to be in the glossary (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This text has been condensed, and this specific term has been removed. The relevant section is now B-2.
679	68624	TS	39	16	39	19	Chapter 30.6.6 should be added as the source as well (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been revised and condensed for clarity. References for the revised text have been checked. The relevant section is now B-2.
680	76385	TS	39	16	39	19	Would have expected that lack of sanitiation would be the primary threat. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised and condensed for clarity. The relevant section is now B-2.
681	60317	ΤS	39	21	39	32	More evidence-based results from the Pacific island regions regarding influencing ocean mixing sea-levels and primary productivity. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed i section B-3, including those for small island nations.
682	68625	TS	39	21	39	32	Chapter 30.6.6 and Figure 30-15 should be added as the source as well (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been revised and condensed for clarity. References for the revised text have been checked. Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those for ocean regions.
683	64100	TS	39	36	39	36	Storms are not influenced by SLR, but could be enhanced by climate change. The sentence, however suggests a relation between SLR and the impacts of storm surges, which is not correct, please clarify. (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
684	64101	ΤS	39	42	39	42	The text deals with coasts. Therefore "sub-regions" should be replaced by "coastal regions". (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
685	60318	TS	39	42	39	48	Ocean ecosystems and associated subregions should include examples from the Pacific island countries in particular blue carbon related references (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	This text has been removed.
686	68626	TS	39	42	39	48	Chapter 30.7 is not the appropriate source of these statements. Instead, Chapter 30.6.4 is more suitable. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
687	79326	ΤS	39	44	39	44	Is "strategies" the best word to use in this context? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed.
688	58938	TS	39	46	83	48	It is unclear whether this sentence is dealing with the sequestration of CO2 as such (liquid or solid), of other forms of carbon e.g. dissolved inorganic carbon or both. The different forms of carbon will have very different effects so this sentence needs to be clear what it is dealing with. (Chris Vivian, IMAREST)	This text has been removed.
689	79894	TS	39	50	39	52	We believe that this statement could be misunderstood since it may be confused with storage in geological reservoirs under the seabed which is not geoengineering in this report (see Glossary). Therefore we propose to add after deep ocean: "above the seafl (NORWAY)	A revised version of this text is now presented in section C-2. While the suggested phrase has not been included, the wordin has been revised for clarity.

ŧ	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
590	61896	TS	39	50	39	54	The section on geoengineering is too brief. More detail is needed here on the different geoengineering options and possible consequences in the context of climate change. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This topic is summarized to the extent possible based on relevant findings of the assessment. The effect of geoengineering strategies on level of climate change is assess in WGIII, whereas their effects on the physical climate system are assessed in WGI. Only the more narrow assessment of consequences for human and natural systems is included in WGII, and the topic is only addressed in a handful of chapters (e.g., Chapters 6 and 19). Integrated synthesis across the Working Groups will occur in the Synthesis Report.
591	64102	TS	39	50	39	54	This para mentions the risks from geoengineering techniques in the context of other risks for the marine environment. These other risks result from impacts that are very likely to occur with increasing temperature, such as ocean acidification and warming, or sea level rise. Geoengineering, in contrast, is a cause for risk that might never be put into practise as these techniques are not available yet, and might never be. This fact should be explicetely stated in the para, and the conditional clause should be used for all statements. In addition, it is not balanced to highlight ocean fertilisation in the TS with regard to ocean acidification, because other geoengineering techniques (both CDR/SRM) would also have highly negative effects on the ocean. In addition, please explain the expression ""environmental footprint" as it is downplaying the risks. In addition, geoengineering will ""not only" have environmental footprints, but even more socio-economic consequences. The ""purposeful alteration" is associated with high risks. Please mention these aspects here. (GERMANY)	A revised version of this text is now presented in section C-2, which incorporates this perspective.
592	65053	TS	39	53	0	54	"solar radiation management" is a contested term as it implies that radiative forcing can be "managed" intentionally and with precision. This is far from certain. The first time the term is used, it would be appropriate to include a preceding qualifier such as "so-called" or to place quotation marks around the term. In addition, Williamson and Turley (2012) raise the possibility that SRM focusing on sulphates could actually worsen ocean acidification (OA). While it is true that SRM will not stop OA, and the text currently reflects this, we suggest the following wording: "Alternative methods to ameliorate climate change such as those focusing on so-called solar radiation management will not abate ocean acidification, and, in some cases, could increase it (Williamson and Turley, 2012)." (Action Group on Erosion, Technology and Concentration (ETC Group))	which clarifies the point being made here. Relevant literature
93	57512	ΤS	39	53	39	54	"SRM leave ocean acidification unabated" See the comment to (Chapter 5, Page 50, Lines 26-28). (Alexey Ryaboshapko, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	A revised version of this text is now presented in section C-2, which clarifies the point being made here.
94	79895	TS	39	53	39	54	This sentence describes another geoengineering method not an "alternative" method to geoegineering. Furthermore we believe the text should mention the issue of a sudden cessation of SRM. Therefore we propose the following change: "Other geoengineering met (NORWAY)	A revised version of this text is now presented in section C-2, which clarifies the point being made here. Climate implication of SRM and its cessation are assessed in the Working Group I contribution to the AR5.
95	78555	ΤS	40	1	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
96	60319	ΤS	40	1	40	11	Regional specific examples should include Pacific island examples. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed section B-3, including those for small island nations.
97	61897	ΤS	40	1	40	11	Is this section in the wrong place? They don't follow on from the previous paragraph on geoengineering. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
98	76386	TS	40	1	40	11	Is there nothing on changes in monsoon, either for Asia or North America? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This topic is assessed in the Working Group I contribution to the Fifth Assessment Report.
99	79327	TS	40	2	40	3	Please remove "in some parts of Europe (e.g. the Bay of Biscay)" as it makes it sound very parochial and is probably true of the region as a whole. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed.
00	61898	ΤS	40	2	40	5	This statement about Europe should be carefully checked. It is important and can send confusing messages. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

#	ID	Ch		From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
701	66248	ΤS		3	40	4	l question the general validity of this statement, even if restricted to Europe: "Climate Change will not entail relocation of fishing fleets (high confidence)" (Geir Ottersen, Institute of Marine Research)	This text has been removed.
702	79328	ΤS	40	4	40	4	I strongly disagree that climate change will not entail "relocation of fishing fleets" as this would be very context specific and in certain parts of Europe we are seeing some changes in fleet behaviour/location to make the most of new opportunities (e.g. in the UK). Perhaps "not necessarily entail relocation" would be better. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed.
703	79329	ΤS	40	4	40	5	The frequency of harmful algal blooms will not necessarily increase across the whole of Europe. Some species prefer cooler conditions (e.g. Karenia) and may decline in the south, whereas others would increase. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been removed.
704	64103	ΤS	40	5	0	0	Please check consistency of the terms "algal blooms" as used here and "cyanobacterial blooms" as used in chapter 23 (Ch. 23, P 4, I.50). (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
705	68627	ΤS	40	6	40	7	This sentence mentions a ' decreased abundance of high latitude marine organisms'. This statement is somewhat ambigious: "high latitude marine organisms" can both refer to the current species that live at high latitudes (which we believe is meant here), or any species that happen to live at high latitudes. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
706	64104	TS	40	9	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "to food webs (medium confidence)". (Ch. 28, P3, l. 33-34) (GERMANY)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Please note that the implied level of confidence for this statement was medium confidence (see Box TS.3).
707	64105	TS	40	11	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "to marine ecosystems (medium confidence)". (Ch. 28, P3, l. 19) (GERMANY)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Please note that the implied level of confidence for this statement was medium confidence (see Box TS.3).
708	76387	ΤS	40	14	40	14	Perhaps clarify that this is for land systems. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised to clarify its focus. Food security related to the oceans is emphasized+I721 in the marine systems section. Please see section B-2.
709	57425	TS	40	14	42	16	The impacts of pests and pest control on food production systems and food security are somewhat understated in summary. To my opinion increased risks of crop losses, poor crop quality and mycotoxins sue to pests shuould be mentioned here. Also the risks of increased pesticide use to increased pesticide residues and increased environmental hazards should be somehow commented in summary. (Asko Hannukkala, MTT Agrifood Research Finland)	This summary focuses on the impacts of climate change, and the context of multiple stressors is also discussed in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 7). The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
710	66147	TS	40	16	0	0	Clarify meaning of 'up to 2 deg C'. Does it many any small amount of warming reduces yield potential in this region. Unlikey. And you do not mean' temperate' do you, but 'mid and mid-high latitude'. Or are you specificsally excluding continental mid latitude. Can solve the former issue by separating our a) altered yield potential from b) likley changes in output after adaptation. (Martin Parry, Imperial College)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
711	76388	тs	40	16	40	19	Does this also include changes to water demand? Irrigation and water for energy production will also be compromised. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity, and the details of the underlying evidence are discussed in the supporting chapter sections (see chapter 7). The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
712	57424	ΤS	40	16	40	22	There are estimates on impacts on cereal production, what about other crops e.g. potato that is becoming increasingly important crop in many parts of the world? (Asko Hannukkala, MTT Agrifood Research Finland)	Impacts on other crops are discussed in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 7), but have not been included here due to space considerations.
713	68629	ΤS	40	17	40	17	Inclusion of rice in this list of species that are likely negatively affected by climate change is puzzling considering the following sentence in the main text: "There is also medium confidence that effects on rice and soybean yields have been small in major production regions and globally. (Chapter 7, page 7, lines 21-23). It is advisable to resolve this inconsistency. (NETHERLANDS)	This is a forward-looking section, and observed changes are presented in section A-1. Figure TS.2 Panel E illustrates observed impacts on rice yields.
714	68628	TS	40	17	40	18	"Many individual locations" seems not to align with the main text which would support "some individual locations", or even "individual locations" better. (NETHERLANDS)	Text revised along these lines. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
715	68631	TS	40	19	40	19	"yields": it is ambiguous to which yields this term refers. Is this yields in the tropics in general, or does it refer to cereal yields as in the previous sentence. Clarification is needed. (NETHERLANDS)	Text has been revised for clarity. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
716	68630	TS	40	19	40	20	"Reductions century". It is unclear what reductions this refers to. Is this a general pattern, globally and over all crops? If yes, say so explicitly. If this concerns examples of some particularly badly affected systems, clarify so no misunderstanding to the generalisability of this claim arises. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and an overall statement
717	68632	ΤS	40	19	40	22	"Reductions evidence)." This sentences leans heavily on, and is in fact almost, a copy of the coverage in Chapter 7 of the study of Challinor et al. (2013). Although Challinor is on of the leading author of Chapter 7, this study is not yet accessible to the scientific community, and according to the bibliography, has not yet passed peer review. It seems appropriate for such a wide ranging and important statement in the SPM to be more widely supported by publicly accessible data, particularly with the labelling, high agreement robust evidence. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and an overall statement quantifying negative impacts on crop yields is included based on the assessment of the evidence base. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
718	62890	TS	40	24	0	0	The word 'competiveness' may be correctly spelled as 'competitiveness'. (Muhammad Mohsin Iqbal, Global Change Impact Studies Centre)	Thank you. This text has been removed due to space considerations.
719	68633	TS	40	24	40	25	The confidence level here associated with the statement that climate change will increase the competitiveness of weeds seems at odd with remarks on page 17 of chapter 7, lines 47-50 suggesting CO2 to increase typical crop competitivity compared to many weeds (generally C4-plants). Suggestion: lower evidence and agreement. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
720	76389	тs	40	44	40	44	Figure TS.10 is not a regional figure. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	That is correct. This text has been revised to clarify the relevance of the figure (now Figure TS.9). The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
721	68634	TS	40	47	40	49	The statement about urban food adaptation mentions factors that are applicable to food adaptation in general and not specific or very important for urban areas. In chapter 8, there is discussion about specific adaptive local responses for urban areas such as strengthening local markets, per-urban agriculture etc (see page 40, line 24 to 32). These should be included in the statement. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
722	78556	TS	41	1	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
723	68038	TS	41	1	42	16	Only one Asian example from Central Asia has been provided as a Sectoral Risk with Regional Examples (marine systems). Considering the importance of Asia, in terms of its dominating the global production of food from both capture fisheries and aquaculture, more examples should be introduced from Asia. Suggested additions are: "Sea-level rise is expected to impact both capture fisheries and aquaculture production in river deltas." (Chapter 24 page 27 lines 14-15); "For marine capture fisheries, Cheung et al (2009, 2010) suggest that climate change may lead to a massive redistribution of fisheries catch potential, with large increases in high-latitude regions, including Asian Russia, and large declines in the tropics, particularly Indonesia." (Chapter 24 page 27 lines 15-19) (JAPAN)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
724	76828	TS	41	2	41	11	For example, Mali is considered at risk of a 'climate zone shift', owing to the Sahara moving south. Because of changes in climate, in 2030, the annual value of crop and livestock production is likely to drop between 5 percent and 15 percent. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf#page=86 (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Thank you for this input. Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
725	76390	тs	41	12	41	19	This paragraph conflicts with previous text that EU will increase productivity (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those related to agriculture in Europe.
726	76391	TS	41	39	41	39	Longer growing season will increase ET, increasing water demand. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A revised version of this text is included in section B-3. This topic is discussed more extensively in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 24).
727	68635	ΤS	41	46	41	52	Chapter bolds and underlines "if" from "if scenarios of severe drying"; TS does not. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.

#	ID	Ch	From	From	To Page		Comment	Response
728	76392	TS	41	46	41	52	The Murray Darling is also a very complex system - intense withdrawals for irrigation, combined with drought have increased salinization. Another example of human activities interesecting with climate (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such topics are discussed in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 25).
729	68636	TS	41	47	41	49	Reference to "food production" seems a little alarmist because we can only find reference to the effects of water availability on "agriculture production" which includes animal and human food production, fibre, biofuel production, etc. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
730	59806	ΤS	41	49	41	51	The report states "More efficient water use, allocation, planning and trading would increase the resilience of systems in the near term but cannot prevent significant reductions in agricultural production and severe consequences for ecosystems and some rural communities at the dry end of the projected range." Suggest replacing this with "More efficient water use, allocation, and trading are expected to increase the resilience of systems, but at the dry end of the projected range they cannot prevent significant reductions in agricultural production and severe consequences for ecosystems and some rural communities." (AUSTRALIA)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
731	68637	TS	42	10	42	12	In the main chapter, the fact is mentioned only for SA not for CA and SA (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
732	79896	ΤS	42	10	42	12	Very important observation but true for all regions of the world, please consider including a statement that would encompass other regions. (NORWAY)	This text has been removed, and such topics are discussed in general terms in section C-2.
733	68638	TS	42	13	42	14	Insert 'the' before 'climate'. This sentence is a bit hard to understand, so a slight rephrasing would be advised (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been revised for clarity and appears in section B-3, where regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed.
734	64106	TS	42	16	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "mammals (high confidence)". (Ch. 28, P5, I.1). (GERMANY)	This text has been revised for clarity and appears in section B-3, where regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed. As described in Box TS.3, confidence levels stated in a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in a paragraph unless otherwise indicated.
735	61899	TS	42	19	42	46	The urban section does not mention air quality at all. Please include a brief discussion. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Air pollution is included in the revised text, but space considerations do not allow a detailed discussion. Please note that the relevant section is now B-2.
736	60320	TS	42	21	42	27	Increasing populations, assets and economic activities in urban areas, has been documented by UN Habitat in different parts the world, particularly Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, and parts of the Pacific (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Environment and Sustainable Development)	This topic is discussed in detail in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 8).
737	76393	TS	42	29	42	37	Are there any examples of current strategies, e.g., green roofs, etc? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples are presented in Table TS.8.
738	64107	TS	42	37	42	37	Please add at the end of the para: "As the existing settlements represent large investments of the past into buildings and infrastructures which can't be given up without considerable financial losses, it is of utmost importance to find intelligent strategies and not too expensive measures to adapt as many existing settlements to climate change as possible. In general it might be easier to adapt settlements to rising temperatures than to rising flood risks. In addition, before using valuable Greenfield sites for climate adaptation, the use of existing Brownfield sites, which often have infrastructure available, is to be studied." (see similar comment Chapter 8,P38, I10) (GERMANY)	Space constraints do not allow inclusion in the Technical Summary, but relevant discussion can be found in the underlying chapter text (see chapter 8).
739	68639	TS	43	11	43	17	Since this paragraph points out "global food supply security" it seems to be opportune mentioning food security which is developed in Chapter 7 specifically 7.22 and 7.3.3 or related subsections, possibly with a short phrase to make a link. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed here, but the remaining paragraph and revised text now appearing in the subsection of B-2 on livelihoods and poverty include reference to food security. Traceability is most robust for chapter sections provided in support of that paragraph.
740	76394	ΤS	43	19	43	24	Are there no impacts on Russia or the US? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
741	78557	TS	43	26	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

Government and Expert Review

28 March - 24 May 2013	

IPCC WGII AR5 T	echnical Summary	
	From From To To	

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
742	68039	TS	43	26	43	28	Only one example from Asia has been provided as a Sectoral Risk with Regional Examples (rural systems). More examples may be derived from Chapter 9 (9.3.3.1) to cover all regions. Given the importance of water availability as discussed throughout the report, a suggested addition is: "Climate change is expected to impact water resources, and thus the viability of agricultural livelihoods in the Asian region in a major way. Diminishing Himalayan glaciers would impact the agricultural water supply and food security of more than one billion people in Asia." (Chapter 9 page 9 lines 48 to page10 line 3) (JAPAN)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those related to water resources in Asia.
743	79897	ΤS	43	26	43	28	Please consider including some examples for Africa and Central and South America. (NORWAY)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
744	68640	ΤS	43	27	43	28	As specific regional examples, a little more detailed description on this general statement would be expected. Please give some examples of parts of Asia where these phenomena are expected. (NETHERLANDS)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
745	76395	ΤS	43	27	43	28	This could be strengthened by including flood and drought impact on livestock production, sanitation, etc. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
746	61900	TS	43	31	45	36	This section is critical and should be further developed. What about industry? Insurance? Etc. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This subsection has been revised to reflect findings from the underlying chapter assessment, including on insurance and aggregate economic impacts. Space considerations do not allow discussion of all topics assessed in the chapter (chapter 10).
747	76396	ΤS	43	33	43	41	Suggest adding treatment of increased energy demand on water resources. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This topic is discussed in the underlying chapter (see chapter 10), but has not been included here due to space considerations.
748	76397	ΤS	43	43	43	51	Suggest adding treatment of building energy efficiciencies. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This topic is discussed in the underlying chapter (see chapter 10), but has not been included here due to space considerations.
749	79898	TS	43	43	43	51	It seems to us that the bold text may underestimate that some of the impacts may be quite severe if not properly handled. Furthermore in the body of the text in this para is unbalanced in relation to the description of other issues such as REDD+ and biofu (NORWAY)	The previously bold text has been retained in the Technical Summary as a description of differential impacts on the energy sector. The nonbold text has been removed. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
750	68641	TS	43	55	44	3	There is insufficient evidence in 10.2 to support the claim that "Climate change is about as likely as not" Evidence in 10.2 points to several areas where pipelines and grids are vulnerable, but does not indicate anything about the likelihood. If this assertion is based on expert judgment, the reasoning should be more transparent. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
751	64108	TS	44	5	44	7	Check sentence: should = under? (GERMANY)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
752	76398	ΤS	44	5	44	7	Is this specific to cold regions? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity. The underlying chapter discussion covers all regions (see chapter 10). The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
753	79330	TS	44	5	44	9	Why nothing on marine transport (shipping), which would be affected by changes in storminess. There are several published studies. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This topic is addressed in section B-3 in the paragraph on ocean regions.
754	79899	ΤS	44	6	44	6	Consider exchanging "would" and "should" with "will" and "with" to generate "which will happen more frequently with climate change." to clarify that this is not as hypothetical as it now sounds. (NORWAY)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
755	70681	ΤS	44	13	44	16	The relationship with tourism is overly simplified. Should be careful when indicating gains in countries close to the poles and higher altitudes and losses in other countries. Temperature is not the sole control on tourism. (Goncalo Vieira, University of Lisbon)	This text focuses on the effect of climate change specifically, and has been revised for clarity. The relevant section for this material is now B-2.
756	60638	ΤS	44	26	0	0	Add section 8.2.3.3 to note example of sectoral water-availabilty impacts. (George Backus, Sandia National Laboratories)	This topic is addressed very briefly in the urban subsection of section B-2.
757	76399	ΤS	44	26	44	26	Energy demand/production is also a factor (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed due to space considerations. But please see relevant material in Box TS.9.

70	64111	ΤS	44	56	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "summer after 2050 (medium confidence)." (Ch. 23, P3, I. 53). (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise indicated.
71	68644	ΤS	44	56	44		here you refer to "damages", but in the cited ref (chap 23, p. 14, lines 38 and 39) you write about "delays", not damages. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

How can severe accidents be affected by climate change? Will the severeness decrease or the number, and why? and is there

Maybe rethink if you want to keep "medium confidence", since cited par. 23.3.3 starts with this sentence "knowledge on the

Case studies on US-Florida, UK-City of Hull, India, Guyana, Tanzania, Mali, China and Samoa are included in the report. They

found that existing climate patterns are responsible for annualized losses of 1-12% of GDP and are likely to rise up to 19% of GDP by 2030. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller,

While climate change will likely exacerbate these problems, it seems likely that lack of education and sanitation are probably

See broad comments in File: IPCC-AR5-NBCCRC-Maclellan-2013.pdf. Without a bibliometric baseline, it is difficult to judge

This section but also overall in the entire technical summary examples from Latin America and the Caribbean are missing.

scientific papers and conferences reports to fill in this information gap. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)

to energy use. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)

increased use of dredging and could curtail alternative uses of water. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

There is plenty of information available. The report is heavily represented on European examples, and the region with less number of examples or scientific information to back up statements is Latin America and the Caribbean. There are enough

The number of examples representing each region appears to be unbalanced; there is no introduction of any Asian Sectoral

Asian countries are major tourist destinations and more studies are needed to understand the impact of climate change on tourism. With respect to beach tourism, large developing countries and small islands states may be among the most vulnerable due to high exposure and low adaptive capacity. A number of Asian countries were found vulnerable in this

Specific regional examples are Eurocentric focused. Would be good of you to have a Pacific Islands focus particularly related

An additional factor to be included in transportation infrastructure is transport using waterways. Drought has already

Ref (15.44.15.47) states that river flood damages are increasing due to development in flood zones and in the current

reference climate change is being attributed to increased river flood risk and if unabated increased flood damages.

Is the text true for Europe, too? Temps close above and below zero cause most damages on roads and buildings

effects of climate change on transport in Europe remains limited (Koetse and Rietveld, 2009)" (NETHERLANDS)

Risks (key economic sectors and services) whereas there are many examples for other regions. A suggested addition is: "Many section B-3, including those for Asia.

impacted shipping on the Mississippi River. Altered timing of snowmelt and resulting changes in river hydrographs will require been included here due to space considerations.

ΤS

ΤS

ΤS 44 32 0

тs 44 38 0

TS

ΤS 44 38 45 36

ΤS 44 39 44 56

ΤS 44 44 5 9

ΤS 44 49 44 52

ΤS 44 53

ΤS 44

ΤS 44 55 44 55

0 0

44 55

55

44 28 44 30

44 29

44 38 45

ID

76830

76400

77262

78558

58068

68040

60321

76401

68642

64109

64110

68643

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

From From To

То

30

36

0

36

44

Comment

(NETHERLANDS)

(congelifraction). (GERMANY)

Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)

primary factors rather than climate change (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

regard." (Chapter 24 page 31 lines 53 - page 32 line 2) (JAPAN)

an effect an road traffic or only on transport? (GERMANY)

knowledge gaps as inferred here. (James MacLellan, University of New Brunswick)

Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)

Response

of section B-2.

for small island nations.

Thank you for this input.

This text has been removed due to space considerations, but

This text has been removed due to space considerations.

Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those for Central and South America and

Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in

Regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in

This topic is discussed in the underlying report, but has not

A revised version of this text has been included in section B-3.

Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and

potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for

This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for

section B-3, including those for small island nations.

where the point has been clarified.

this topic is discussed in the livelihoods and poverty subsection

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
772	64112	TS	45	1	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "temperatures will increase (medium confidence)." (Ch. 23, P4, l. 1) (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise noted.
773	76402	TS	45	1	45	14	This is rather long. Suggest that it be consolidated (i.e., shortened) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
774	68645	ΤS	45	26	45	27	Chapter 25 states annual peak electricity demand could decrease in NZ and NSW, but increase in QLD and SA; it mentions decreasing winter heatinbg demand, but gives no explicit references as support; it does not give a confidence level. TS says winter heating demand could decrease in NZ and southern states, with high confidence. (NETHERLANDS)	A revised version of this text appears in section B-3, in line with the executive summary of Chapter 25.
775	77296	TS	45	28	0	0	"In North America, there is an emerging concern that" - presumably what is meant is more like "Evidence is emerging that in North America, and this may well apply to other (developed) economies."? (William Ingram, Met Office)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
776	76403	ΤS	45	28	45	29	Is this all of the information that is available for North America? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those relevant to North America.
777	64113	TS	45	34	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "transportation networks (high confidence)". (Ch. 28, P5, I. 49) (GERMANY)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise indicated.
778	64114	TS	45	36	0	0	Please insert confidence level: "the Arctic (high confidence)". (Ch. 28, P4, I.5) (GERMANY)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise indicated.
779	65348	ΤS	45	41	45	49	One of the most critical impacts on health is hypersensitivity for plant allergen like allergic rhinitis and asthma sensitized by tree pollens of which concentration is influenced by changes in ecosystem. This fact needs to be added. (REPUBLIC OF KOREA)	This topic is discussed in the underlying chapters, but is not included here due to space considerations. See the relevant subsection of B-2.
780	76404	TS	45	43	45	43	Would fires be through climate change (changes in thermal regime, fuel loads and lightning strikes) or human-started? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This level of detail is included in the underlying chapter discussion.
781	79331	ΤS	45	46	45	46	The text says "increased risks of food and water-borne diseases" - why only increases? Surely it will depend on the climatic preferences of the individual pathogen, in some areas it might become unsuitable for the pathogen. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Reduced capacity of some disease-carrying vectors is mentioned in the revised paragraph. The relevant section is now B-2.
782	64115	TS	45	47	45	48	Delete "reduction of disease-carrying vectors", since this pronouncement cannot be found in chapter 11.5. as such. (GERMANY)	Reduced capacity of some disease-carrying vectors is mentioned in the revised paragraph, in line with the final draft of Chapter 11. The relevant section is now B-2.
783	76405	TS	46	5	45	6	This needs to be expanded to include human activities, aerosols, increased impacts. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
784	68646	ΤS	46	5	46	6	We suggest to substantiate mentioning the US and Europe, the regions where the majority of the sudies on air quality have taken place (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed due to space considerations.
785	78559	TS	46	12	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
786	60322	ΤS	46	13	46	45	More specific regional examples in the Pacific island countries; particularly related to incidents of vectorborne diseases such as malaria and dengue and changes in insect habitat based on climate change records of temperature and rainfall changes within the last century. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.

#	ID	Ch		From		То	Comment	Response
787	68647	TS	Page 46	Line 20	Page 46	Line 20	here you say "assuming future emissions reductions", but in the cited ref (23.6.1) it's written "assuming no change in future emissions or other factors", which is different (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
788	61901	TS	46	21	46	24	Why is this general statement in the Health section? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
789	68648	TS	46	24	46	24	based on what you wrote in the cited ref 23.2.2 [i.e., "evidence about future risks from climate change with respect to infectious diseases is still limited (Semenza et al., 2012)(Randolph and Rogers, 2010)"], We would use a more conservative sentence instead of "Climate change will change the distribution and" (for instance adding a "likely"?) (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
790	64116	TS	46	25	0	0	Please insert confidence level:"by arthropods (medium level)". (Ch. 23, P4, I. 15) (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise specified.
791	79900	TS	46	25	46	25	"infections transmitted by arthropods." is a bit vague (many readers may not know what arthropods are) compared to specifically mentioning malaria as increasing in Asia (TS p. 46, I.27). To clarify, please give examples e.g. malaria (transmitted by mo (NORWAY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
792	68649	TS	46	29	46	34	It is confusing to apply confidence statements to compound / multi-clause statements. Does it apply to the whole sentence, or the last part, or? (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that confidence levels apply to a full sentence, unless otherwise indicated.
793	68650	TS	46	29	46	34	Not clear what the evidence is for statements on chronic disease or children. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
794	76406	TS	46	37	46	41	This suggests that in North America there are no poor communities which is not true. Please revise. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been condensed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. The statement does not relate directly to poor communities.
795	58069	TS	46	42	42	44	Statement is too general. There is ample of literature on the potential expansion of Malaria and dengue. There are even ongoing adaptation projects in Barbados, Colombia to reduce such risk. GEF is implementing a project in Bhutan, China, Jordan, Kenya, Barbados and Uzbekistan. In Mexico there is published research relating diseases, water, poverty and climate change. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	This text has been revised for clarity, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
796	76407	TS	46	42	46	44	This finding is not restricted to Central and South America. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
797	68651	TS	47	9	47	16	The level of confidence attributed to the statement "Climate change will have significant impacts on forms of migration that compromise human security(medium agreement, medium evidence)." seems not consistent to the supporting material in the main text of Chapter 9. According to Chapter 9 page 14 line 21, "extreme evente=s might lead to changed patterns of migration", while "the impacts of climate change are likely to affect population distribution and mobility." The conclusion in Chapter 9 page 14 line 50 shows "the detection of the effects of climate change on infra-rural and rural- to urban migration remains a major challenge". Considering all the confidence level in these main texts, maybe in the SPM it would be better to bring the agreement and evidence level back to a lower level and change the expression to " Climate change might (or " is likely to") have impacts on forms of migration that compromise human security." (NETHERLANDS)	These evidence and agreement statements have been revised in line with the final draft of Chapter 12, as well as Chapter 9. The relevant section is now B-2.
798	76408	ΤS	47	16	47	16	This finding is not restricted to developing countries. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised to make the point more general. The relevant section is now B-2.
799	76409	TS	47	21	47	21	Clarification on what a 'state' is would be helpful. Are these regions? Countries? Communities? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This term refers to nations, and the wording has been revised to make this clear. The relevant section is now B-2.
800	64117	ΤS	47	28	47	29	Please add this para to SPM (P 12, I.56): "Climate change affects cultures and cultural expressions" (GERMANY)	This text has been considered, but has not been included in the

SPM due to space considerations.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
801	76410	TS	47	28	47	33	Archaeologists have known this for a very long time. See pub by Hegmon et al., 2008 (cited on page 17 line 31) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Thank you for this input.
802	78560	ΤS	47	35	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
803	60323	TS	47	36	47	45	More specific regional examples in the Pacific island nations related to human security national security policies, and cultural forms of expression particularly related to traditional knowledge (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, including those relevant to small islands.
804	68652	TS	47	37	47	37	" Including buildings, local industries, landscapes, and iconic places such as Venice": Section 23.5.4, page 28 line 35, states that Venice previously was vulnerable to flooding, but that adaptation measures have now been taken and that the frequency of storm surges may decrease, so that now the climate change impact on Venice is estimated to be smaller. Suggest to skip the reference to Venice. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
805	68653	ΤS	47	38	47	38	Reference to Table 23-5 not correct, should be Table 23-4? (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
806	64118	ΤS	47	39	47	45	The example on the Arctic does not really pertain to "human security". (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
807	68654	ΤS	47	43	47	45	The second part of the sentence "and are often rivers and lakes." is not supported by the findings in the main chapter. Section 28.2.4 does not mention a percentage of arctic people living near bodies of water, and it does not mention how the impacts are different for such people. (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
808	64119	TS	47	44	0	0	Please insert confidence level:"diverse settlements (high confidence)," (Ch. 28, P4, I. 32) (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3. Note that as described in Box TS.3, confidence levels assigned to a sentence apply to subsequent sentences in the same paragraph, unless otherwise specified.
809	64120	TS	48	13	0	0	Some crucial factors for motivating adaptation strategies or measures are listed, but the idea of climate resilience as a long- term objective is still missing. We suggest to add (in Executive Summary of Ch. 14 P 2 L 46; TS P 48 L 13 and SPM P 5 L 14): "For example, in a development context resilience 'evokes positive and broad development goals (e.g., education, livelihood improvements, food security), includes multiple scales (temporal and spatial) and objectives, better captures the complex interactions between human societies and their environments, and emphasizes learning and feedbacks' (Moss et al., to appear)." Source: Chapter 14, P 20 L 45-48. (GERMANY)	Section C-1 discusses principles for effective adaptation, including topics relevant to building resilience.
810	78561	ΤS	48	15	0	0	Examples of what? This is a new paragraph. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
811	64121	ΤS	48	15	48	18	It is not quite clear, why there is one specific example for North America only, in particular as the first para of the sub-section does not mention NA as a critical region. Either add some other regions as well, or leave out. (GERMANY)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.
812	68041	TS	48	15	48	19	Despite the discussion that "most severe impacts are projected for urban areas and some regions in sub-Saharan Africa and Southeast Asia," 'TS page 47 lines 51-52) the only example introduced as a sectoral risk for livelihoods and poverty is from the North American continent. A suggested addition is: "Floods, droughts and changes in seasonal rainfall patterns are expected to negatively impact corp yields, food security and livelihood in vulnerable areas, Rural poverty in parts of Asia could be exacerbated due to negative climate change impacts on the rice crop and increased in food prices and the cost of living. The poverty impacts of climate change would be heterogeneous among countries and social groups. In a low crop productivity scenario, food exporting countries, such as Indonesia, the Philippines and Thailand would benefit from climate change related global food price rises and be able to reduce poverty, while countries such as Bangladesh would experience a net increase in poverty of 15% by 2030." (Chapter 24 page 35 line 53 - page 36 line 6) (JAPAN)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
813	60324	ΤS	48	16	48	18	More specific examples related to regional examples of social protection livelihoods and poverty and in particular urban and rural adaptation climate change initiatives (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page		Comment	Response
814	76411	ΤS	48	16	48		Are there any additional examples for North America? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Such examples have been removed, and regional risks and potential for adaptation are now discussed in section B-3, covering all regions.
815	76412	TS	48	23	48	23	How is this expert judgement evaluated? Is there any metric? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure has been removed, but Table TS.5 presents key regional risks identified based on assessment of the relevant scientific, technical, and socioeconomic literature, as detailed in supporting chapter sections. Each key risk is characterized as very low to very high for three timeframes: the present, near- term (here, assessed over 2030-2040), and longer-term (here, assessed over 2080-2100).
816	76413	TS	48	23	48	26	Figure TS.12 is very qualitative and judgemental. Is this an appropriate assessment of the science? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure has been removed, but Table TS.5 presents key regional risks identified based on assessment of the relevant scientific, technical, and socioeconomic literature, as detailed in supporting chapter sections. Each key risk is characterized as very low to very high for three timeframes: the present, near- term (here, assessed over 2030-2040), and longer-term (here, assessed over 2080-2100).
817	76414	ΤS	48	30	48	30	Table TS.5 would benefit from being shortened. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This table has been substantially revised and updated, and now presents a smaller set of key regional risks.
818	76415	ΤS	48	32	48	35	This seems awkward and needs elaboration/clarification. It appears that Table TS.6 and TS.7 are a repeat of TS.5 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	These tables have been removed, and the new Table TS.5 presents key regional risks in a single table.
819	79332	ΤS	48	37	48	43	On figure TS.12 it is unclear why 'ocean systems' are always left blank. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure has been removed, but Table TS.5 presents key regional risks including those for ocean regions.
820	79333	TS	48	45	48	56	Table TS. 5, Europe - Marine & Coastal (page 99) I strongly disagree that climate change will not entail "relocation of fishing fleets" as this would be very context specific and in certain parts of Europe we are seeing some changes in fleet behaviour/location to make the most of new opportunities (e.g. in the UK). Perhaps "not necessarily entail relocation" would be better. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This table has been substantially revised and updated, and this specific entry is no longer presented.
821	76418	ΤS	49	0	0	0	Figure TS.14 Comment - This figure is the same as figure TS.9C. It is recommended that TS 14 be removed and reference made to figure TS.9C to minimize repetition. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure has been removed.
822	60325	тs	49	1	50	22	Spatial convergence of impacts in different sectors creates impact hotspots. Mention Pacific island countries and impact hotspots located in Fiji and Vanuatu, Tuvalu, Klribati (particularly related to low-lying coral atolls). (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	Section B-3 now presents regional risks and potential for adaptation, including those for small islands.
823	79334	ΤS	49	19	49	21	Note that figure TS. 14 is duplicated in it's entirety within TS. 9 (page 124) - is this necessary?? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure has been removed.
824	68160	тs	49	24	50	47	Here is a reproduction of the ES of Chapter 19 (see the comment of the Chinese government on Chapter 19). It is suggested to simplify and elaborate the conclusions and ensure their consistency with the revised ES of Chapter 19. (CHINA)	This section has been shortened and simplified, now only presenting key risks, consistent with the final draft of Chapter 19. This material is now presented in B-1.
825	64122	ΤS	49	24	55	0	Section C.ii should mention potential "tipping points", including those natural/biophysical, social and economic systems. Currently, the term tipping point is only used on P 47, L 34 for terrestrial and freshwater ecosystems, and on p 50, I 49 for socio-ecological systems (GERMANY)	This material is now presented in section B-1, which does include discussion of tipping points.
826	79901	ΤS	49	30	49	44	A key risk lacking here is loss of biodiversity, ecosystem function and services. Pleae include a discription of this factor. (NORWAY)	Key risks regarding loss of terrestrial and marine ecosystems and implications for ecosystem services are now included in this list. This material is now presented in B-1.
827	76416	TS	49	43	49	44	Education and sanitation are also factors (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The text has been revised to clarify the point being made here. This material is now presented in B-1.

							system, however, the temperature rise will continue even that the increased emission comes to a stop now. But it is very important to actively take adaptation measures to address the adverse impacts that have already occurred. In order to express the conclusion in a balanced manner, it is suggested to add after this sentence the following: "However, it is very necessary to take adaptation measures to address the adverse impacts that have already occurred or are occurring". (CHINA)	these topics are also addressed in section A-3 (second paragraph).
840	64124	TS	51	13	51	15		This text has been removed, but a more general statement about the potential for mitigation to reduce risks is included in section B-1.
841	76420	TS	51	26	51	26	Table TS.8 appears to be a summary of Table TS.5 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Both of these tables have been substantially revised and updated to improve clarity and to present distinct information. Table TS.3 now contains a shortened set of examples from the previous Table TS.8, and key risks are presented in Tables TS.4 and TS.5.
Govern	ment ar	nd Exp	ert R	eviev	N		Page 57 of 90	28 March - 24 May 2013

IPCC WGILARS Technical S

PCC V	VGII AR5	Tech	nical	Sumr	nary			FIRST-ORDER DRAFT
#	ID	Ch	From	From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
828	61902	ΤS	49	46	49	46	The TS uses a variety of baslines which makes it difficult to compare impacts. This line uses "pre-industrial" as a baseline yet on p.51, line 54, the baseline is 1886-1905, "early industrial", and Fig. TS.9 uses 1870-1889. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Temperature increases and their reference period are clarified throughout. In most cases, temperatures are presented relative to preindustrial levels.
829	79902	ΤS	49	46	49	46	The finding in the bolded text would be more clear if the exampel in the next sentence was included in the bolded text. (NORWAY)	This paragraph has been revised to more broadly discuss the implications of large magnitudes of warming. This material is now presented in B-1.
830	79903	TS	49	51	49	54	The key finding in the bolded text is mostly about process while the findings in the text after is very important and this should be better reflected in the bolded text. (NORWAY)	Emergent risks are no longer presented in the text of this section (B-1), but are presented in Table TS.3.
831	76417	TS	49	51	50	22	These examples provide a good summary of a lot of previous text. Suggest that the authors use this approach to shorten the previous section. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Section B-1 now presents key risks before the more detailed discussion of sectoral and regional risks.
832	79904	ΤS	50	5	50	7	This is an exampel of a very important finding. (NORWAY)	Key risks regarding loss of terrestrial and marine ecosystems and implications for ecosystem services are now included in the listing in section B-1.
833	79762	TS	50	8	0	0	Soil could be mentioned here as a possible mediator of water quality, water stores ?Chapter 19?? (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	This text has been removed.
834	76419	TS	50	15	50	15	What is a "sector"? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A sector is a broad set of related systems (e.g., water, health, food). As established in the chapeau to section B and subheadings of B-2, the assessment considers IAV across a suite of defined sectors.
835	77297	TS	50	17	50	18	"Mariana Island" should presumably be "the Mariana Islands" (William Ingram, Met Office)	This text has been removed.
836	68655	TS	50	22	50		In the executive sumary of chapter 19 (page 3) there is a list of interactions that increase vulnerabilities and risk. There are 6 bullet points; all of these are present in the TS and SPM as well, except for the last one: "adaptation designed for one sector may interfere with the functioning of another sector, creating new risks". This bullet point should also be included in TS and SPM, as it is a very important interaction to consider. Nowadays the efforts of scientists and policymakers are put into finding and implementing solutions to face the effects of climate changes. Unfortunately, too often action is taken based on limited or unilateral information, without considering possible effects on other sectors or fields. Therefore, it is necessary to stress the importance of evaluating all possible consequences of adaptation measures before putting them into practice. (NETHERLANDS)	These interactions are highlighted in section C-2.
837	79763	ΤS	50	42	0	0	soil as a factor in crop production, CRP and other soil protection programs in danger from food/biofuel need, degrading soil resources (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	This text has been removed.
838	64123	тs	50	42	50	47	SRM is not a climate change impact, it is therefore not justified to mention SRM in the sub clause in this para. In addition, wording implies that SRM technologies are already at hand. Please reformulate. Please consider the large uncertainties attached to SRM and reformulate, e.g.: "…and adverse regional impacts p o t e n t i a I I y arising from Solar Radiation Management…". (GERMANY)	This text has been removed.
839	68161	TS	51	5	51	6	"Since mitigation reduces the rate as well as the magnitude of warming, it also delays the need to adapt to a particular level of climate change impacts, potentially by several decades." This sentence itself is valid. Due to the inertia of the climate system, however, the temperature rise will continue even that the increased emission comes to a stop now. But it is very important to actively take adaptation measures to address the adverse impacts that have already occurred. In order to express the conclusion in a balanced manner, it is suggested to add after this sentence the following: "However, it is very necessary to take adaptation measures to address the adverse impacts that have already occurred or are occurring". (CHINA)	The specific text referenced has been revised for clarity, and these topics are also addressed in section A-3 (second paragraph).
840	64124	ΤS	51	13	51	15	Please highlight this important statement in bold. (GERMANY)	This text has been removed, but a more general statement about the potential for mitigation to reduce risks is included in section B-1.
841	76420	ΤS	51	26	51	26	Table TS.8 appears to be a summary of Table TS.5 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Both of these tables have been substantially revised and updated to improve clarity and to present distinct information. Table TS.3 now contains a shortened set of examples from the

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page		Comment	Response
842	61957	ΤS	51	37	51	45	There is nothing in this paragraph that could perhaps be stated for many non-island (non-insular) poor and vulnerable coastal areas. Whilst e.g. SIDS may be special cases, their specificity perhaps needs to be clearer here, because landlocked states - as one example - also face particular challenges. (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This text has been removed, and such topics are discussed at a high level in sections A-3 and C-2. The level of detail has been reduced given page constraints.
843	61903	TS	51	48	52	17	This is very important, and should be further developed. Also projected impacts of other temperature scenarios could be described (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	This box has been updated and expanded based on the final draft of the WGII report.
844	79905	тs	51	52	51	52	Add "levels" after "preindustrial" to generate " preindustrial levels" (NORWAY)	This revision has been made.
845	79906	TS	52	2	52	2	Add "levels" after "preindustrial" to generate " preindustrial levels" (NORWAY)	This revision has been made.
846	79908	TS	52	2	52	10	Also mention other biological systems that may be very adversely affected by a temperature increase of 4 degrees C or more, e.g. boreal forests, arctic systems (including permafrost), tropical rain forests. (NORWAY)	Relevant material has been included in Box TS.6, to the extent available based on the underlying assessment.
847	79907	TS	52	4	52	4	Add "with corresponding effects on associated biodiversity, ecosystem function and services and ultimately social systems and human well being." since coral reefs are extremely important for tropical marine ecosystems and their production of biodiversity (NORWAY)	This point is incorporated in the marine subsection of section B- 2 in general terms.
848	76421	TS	52	8	52	8	Consider including droughts in the US in 2011, 2012: power deratings, crop failures. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Impacts of recent extreme events are discussed in section A-1.
849	68656	TS	52	11	52	14	Chapter 18 clearly mentions that the permafrost in the arctic has receded and on the other hand ice layer in Antarctic region has increased and hence the generalisation of decrease of ice layer of whole permafrost region seems not an accurate summary of the chapter. (NETHERLANDS)	This comment is misplaced, it appears to refer to page 8 lines 11 to 14. This text within A-1 has been revised for clarity.
850	68657	TS	52	13	52	13	The TS reports for Sub Saharan Africa on increase of the risk of disease, while in the body of the chapter 19) only malaria is mentioned, and only for some areas (section 19.5.1, page 27, line 42) (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
851				24	53	50	Box TS.7: 1) Some sort of calibration is needed for the risk portrayed: even if qualitative and based on expert jugdment, an indication of what constitutes "high" risk for each of the categories is mandatory, also as a guide to interpretation with regard to "dangerous" anthropogenic interferene with the climate system. In addition, it is not obvious how a detection and attribution anaylsis of past and present impacts translates into a statement of risk. 2) We recommend to spell out the AR4 assessment for those cases where "the risk has not changed". 3) The Box appears conceptually unclear concerning detection&attribution. On the one hand, in L 3-7 it is stated that "detection and attributionsupports assessments of current conditions with respect to reasons for concern", however in the following "update" section, that assessment is not integrated. E.g. in Ch 18 it is stated "Evidence from detection and attribution analysis supports concerns that both the Arctic and the global warm-water coral reef system are experiencing irreversible regime shifts" - onsets of global regime shifts constitute a massive RFC, however this has not been taken up here or elsewhere in the TS. The statement in L 16 "there is higher confidence", and how it relates to the assessment made for unique and threatened systems, is not clear. Please consider to include the support of mention the high risk even at T below 2° to Arctic and tropcial coral reef ecosystems, as well as the tundra biome to the assessment made for unique and threatened systems. 4) There seems to be a lack of information on aggregate economic impacts, both in present and for the future; it is not clear, therefore, how this risk has been assessed. 5) Please add explanations on the meaning of "distribution of impacts" - is it the geographical distribution? 7) Please explain "large-scale singular events", in addition to the deglaciation of GREMANY)	
852	64126	TS	52	28	52	30	Please add a sentence on attribution. (GERMANY)	Attribution is discussed in section A-1.
853	64127	TS	52	49	52	21	Box TS.6: See our comment on Box SPM.5. (GERMANY)	Please see response to that comment.
854	64128	TS	52	53	0	0	Box TS.7: See our comments on Box SPM.6. (GERMANY)	Please see response to that comment.
855	76422	TS	53	10	53	12	Is there any confidence in rates of change? What does it mean for temps over 2 degrees C pre-industrial? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is discussed in the context of terrestrial ecosystems in the corresponding subsection of section B-2. See also Figure TS.7.
856	78553	ΤS	53	20	0	0	A reference to 18.6.2.2 should go in the middle here. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This text has been revised, and the specific reference would no longer be appropriate. The relevant location is now Box TS.5.

#	ID	Ch	From		To Page		Comment	Response
857	69905	TS	53	25	53	27	Does this refer to global or local warming? (John Caesar, Met Office Hadley Centre)	These levels refer to global mean warming, which is specified in the associated figure (Box TS.5 Figure 1).
858	76423	TS	53	25	53	27	Developed countries are probably at most economic risk. What are the thresholds or tipping points for economic disaster? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	What can be said about aggregate economic impacts is summarized in the economic sectors subsection of section B-2.
859	78563	TS	53	28	53	33	A reference to 18.6.2.4 could maybe support this. I think it supports this statement (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Section 18.6 is referenced for the discussion of reasons for concern. The relevant location is now Box TS.5.
860	59741	TS	53	34	53	35	A proposed slight addition to the conclusion about large-scale singular events. The TS contains a summary about large-scale singular events that is derived from Chapter 19. I proposed the slight modification in the following summary statement in the Chapter 19 Executive Summary: The risk from large-scale singular events, such as large-scale irreversible deglaciation, of the East Antarctica Ice Sheet, remains comparable to that assessed in AR4. As explained in a comment on the overall WGII, the Technical Summary should summarize the conclusions about large-scale singular events in all WGII chapters—not just Chapter 19. The Chapter 28 about the Polar Regions contains additional summaries about large-scale ecosystem changes in Greenland, such as "rapid colonization of ice-free ground" (Chapter 28, page 25, lines 35-38). So, I propose a slight addition to the overall TS summary, as follows (TS, page 53, lines 34 and 35): The risk associated with large-scale irreversible deglaciation, of East Antarctica Ice Sheet remains comparable to that assessed in AR4 (19.6.3). However, rapid colonization of ice-free ground is evident around the Greenland Ice Sheet (28.2.3.7). (Thomas Dunning Newbury, U.S. Department of the Interior (retired))	This text, now presented as box TS.5, has been revised for clarity, and the broader conclusions presented in section B of the Technical Summary include findings relevant to other large- scale nonlinear earth system responses from across the chapters of the Working Group II contribution.
861	76424	TS	53	34	53	35	This sentence is awkward. Please revise it. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant location is now Box TS.5.
862	78562	TS	53	34	53	35	A reference to 18.6.2.5 might be appropriate. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Section 18.6 is referenced for the discussion of reasons for concern. The relevant location is now Box TS.5.
863	68162	TS	54	1	54	29	The total financial need for adaptation was mentioned to be 75-100 Billion US Dollars. It is suggested to assess the financial need of developing countries for adaptation. (CHINA)	This box has been removed, and a paragraph on adaptation cost estimates is included in section C-1, which includes estimates for developing countries.
864	80617	TS	54	1	54	29	For the 75-100 billion adaptation fund, the author should specify that how much (or what proportion) is for the demand of developing countries. SUGGESTION: specify the exact number (percentage) for developing countries. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	This box has been removed, and a paragraph on adaptation cost estimates is included in section C-1, which includes estimates for developing countries.
865	80131	TS	54	5	54	7	I don't think it is appropriate to pick "the most recent" estimate as implicitely better than others and give this range, even if it is politically desirable to have one. The range simply is extremely broad depending on assumptions, response stratgegies and real climate impacts. We should acknowledge this and refrain from picking certain values or narrow intervals as best estimates. There is simply not enough convergence in the literature. (Jochen Harnisch, KfW)	This box has been removed, and a paragraph on adaptation cost estimates is included in section C-1, which has been revised to clarify what can be said based on available evidence.
866	68658	TS	54	5	54	9	Most recent estimate of global adaptation costs, as shown in table 17.2, is that from World Bank 2010. This source states that in 2050 annual adaptation costs range from 70 to 100 USD billion. Not from 75 to 100 USD billion. (NETHERLANDS)	This box has been removed, and a paragraph on adaptation cost estimates is included in section C-1, which includes the range as indicated here.
867	68659	TS	54	5	54	9	Cannot find the reference in the main text of chapter 17 corresponding to the statement ', and important shortcomings in the data and methods available for costing adaptation suggest the low end of this range could be substantially lower.' (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been revised for clarity. The relevant material now occurs in C-1.
868	76425	ΤS	54	5	54	9	What about natural hazards, e.g., non-climate events (e.g., seismic)? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	These costs are focused on adaptation to climate change. The relevant material now occurs in C-1.
869	76831	TS	54	5	54	29	Losses from floods, storms, earthquakes and other natural catastrophes (Nat Cat) impact the economies of entire countries and are therefore a key driver of the re/insurance business. Such losses are becoming more frequent and severe due to higher insurance penetration and the concentration of assets in exposed areas as well as climate change. If unmitigated, climate change could cost the world economy around 20% of global GDP by the end of this century. A good example for a consistent framework is the Economics of Climate Adaptation Framework. http://media.swissre.com/documents/rethinking_shaping_climate_resilent_development_en.pdf (Lea Mueller, Swiss Reinsurance Company Ltd)	Thank you for this input. The relevant material now occurs in C- 1.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page		Comment	Response
870	64129	ΤS	54	6	0	0	To which climate change scenario do these costs refer? (GERMANY)	These costs use a range of assumptions, which are discussed in the underlying chapter text. The relevant material now occurs in C-1.
871	68660	TS	54	10	54	12	Reference paragraphs 17.3.10 and 17.3.11 do not exist (NETHERLANDS)	References revised. The relevant material now occurs in C-1.
872	66383	TS	54	14	54	14	Where indicated "This is due to ecological effects resulting from reductions in the duration and extent of ice cover and enhanced" it should say "duration and extent of snow cover and enhanced"; however, if the point is to indicate sea-ice, you should you sea-ice instead. I think that it is snow cover, since we are dealing with the terrestrial environment. (Carla Andreia Silva Mora, University of Lisbon)	This comment is misplaced.
873	76426	ΤS	54	16	54	16	What is the sector to which the authors refer? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This level of detail is included in the underlying chapter discussion (see chapter 17). The corresponding finding now occurs in C-1.
874	68661	ΤS	54	17	54	20	Paragraph 17.6.3 does not seem to be the most relevant here. The problem of underinvestment and adaptation deficit resulting from underdevelopment is mentioned in paragraph 17.6.1. However, the problem seems to be covered in a more detailed way in TS than in the main text, giving impression that TS refers directly to the referenced article by Parry et al. (2009) (NETHERLANDS)	This text has been removed.
875	65702	TS	54	22	54	22	"Studies costing adaptation" better than "Adaptation costing studies" ??. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been removed.
876	68662	TS	54	38	54	44	Box CC-OA should be added as the source (NETHERLANDS)	This box (now Box TS.7) has been revised accordingly.
877	65703	ΤS	54	43	54	43	Suggest "where eutrophication and upwelling also influence local ocean pH" – not sure they contribute to acidification per se – but they do influence pH. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	This text has been revised for clarity taking into consideration this comment. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
878	79335	ΤS	54	44	54	44	I suggest the text reads "local ocean acidification and or buffering may occur." (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This text has been revised for clarity taking into consideration this comment. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
879	85199	ΤS	54	46	54	47	If it is "poorly understood: why do you worry so much about it? (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	The potential for large consequences suggests better understanding is important. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
880	76427	ΤS	54	50	54	55	On line 50, the reference to section 6.2.4 should be changed to 6.2. On line 52, reference should be made to section 6.2.4 after the statement "Growth and primary production are stimulated in seagrasses". On line 53, reference should be made to section 6.2.3.4 after the words "some phytoplankton". On line 55, reference to section 6.2.4 should be changed to 6.2.5.3. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	References revised. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
881	76428	TS	54	54	44	44	Reference to the incorrect section. Change "5.3.3.6" to "5.3.3.5". (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	References revised. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
882	65704	TS	55	0	0	0	Box TS9. Nice balanced box on Ocean Acidification. (STEPHEN HAWKINS, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON)	Thank you. Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
883	76429	TS	55	13	55	13	Impacts on prey is rather constraining. Consider instead, impacts associated with trophic dynamics (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Admittedly, the wording was not ideal but the one proposed is too vague as the focus is here on how the impacts on the lower trophic levels will propagate. To be consistent with Box CC-OA, the new formulation is "The largest uncertainty is how the impacts on lower trophic levels will propagate through the food webs and to top predators". Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.
884	79336	TS	55	14	55	16	I strongly disagree with this statement as there have been only 2 modelling studies on the indirect food-web consequences of ocean acidification for fisheries. Therefore 'high agreement' would be meaningless. I do not think it is possible to conclusively state that "ocean acidification will generally reduce fish biomass and catch" - there is some emerging evidence that the opposite might be true in certain areas. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Unless published, emerging evidence cannot be used in this assessment. The sentence was revised as "Models suggest that ocean acidification will generally reduce fish biomass and catch (low confidence) and". Please note that the relevant box is now Box TS.7.

68675

902

TS 57

57

1

1

IPC	C WGII AR5	Tech	nical S	Sumn	nary		
#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Commont

			From	From	To	То		
#	ID	Ch	Page	Line		Line	Comment	Response
885	79912	ΤS	56			43	Please consider including in this section more about ecosystem-based approaches. (NORWAY)	More specific examples of ecosystem-based approaches are now given within Table TS.7, which is included in this section (now section C).
886	79911	TS	56	16	56	18	Monitoring climate parameters and their effects as well as effectiveness of adaptation and mitigation efforts is a very important point that should be highlighted, especially to emphasise the importance of financing such monitoring programs over long time (NORWAY)	The importance of this topic is now better reflected within the technical summary, through findings presented in section A as well as through examples in this section (now section C).
887	79909	ΤS	56	33	56	34	Please consider to include this finding in the SPM. (NORWAY)	a clear finding addressing this point is now included within the summary for policymakers in section C-2.
888	68663	TS	56	36	56	39	Readability of statement would improve from cutting into shorter sentences. (NETHERLANDS)	This paragraph is no longer included.
889	64130	TS	56		56	41	Please include as a the first finding the general ideas given in Ch 1 P12, L14-30 as they link the conceptual framework of Rockström and Raworth with the IPCC AR5 concept of "era of responsibility and era of climate options", explain better the "opportunity space" given in Figure 1-7 (here Figure TS.16) and give strong reasons for including Figure 1-7 into TS. Text proposal for a finding: "Rapidly advancing climate science provides an "opportunity space" for policy relevant information to support policy decisions leading to high resilience, low risk and low vulnerability and climate change is just one of many stressors that influence resilience. The conceptual framework of the AR5 WGII report of existing stressors and the boundaries they create, of actions to reduce climate change impacts can entail both an era of responsibility and an era of climate options. The last is an opportunity space, will affect the degree of resilience in human and natural systems. Please add confidence level [1.1.4, Figure 1-7]" After this inclusion Figure TS.16 suits better below this findig> please shift the figure and its legend below the new finding. (GERMANY)	The figure (now Figure TS.13) has been substantially revised and better integrated within this section. Additionally, terminology has been better defined.
890	68664	TS	56	42	56	42	Statement starts with "Because climate change is a growing threat". It should probable read: "Because human-induced climate change" (NETHERLANDS)	A more specific, related finding is now included. The relevant section is now C-2.
891	79910	ΤS	56	42	56	43	Please consider to include this finding in the SPM. (NORWAY)	A more specific related finding is now included within the summary for policymakers as well. The relevant section in both documents is now C-2.
892	68665	TS	56	43	56	43	Indication as high agreement does not reflect the discussion in the literature. The idea of "climate resilient pathways" is based on a UN report (see p. 4 of Chapter 20). Chapter 20 does not show that the idea of "climate-resilient pathways" is drawn from the review of the academic literature. (NETHERLANDS)	Please note that the chapter has a mandate to assess the topic per the plenary approved outline. The focus of TS revision has to been to ensure traceable accounts within the underlying assessment for all findings included.
893	68666	ΤS	56	44	56	44	Statement reads "added to other stresses". Please indicate which other stresses. (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included. The relevant section is now C-2.
894	68667	TS	56	44	56	47	Statement is unclear and would benefit from cutting into shorter sentences and rephrashing. (NETHERLANDS)	Related material has been substantially reduced in length. The relevant section is now C-2.
895	68668	TS	56	45	56	45	Line mentions "such objectives". Please indicate to which objectives "such objectives" refer. (NETHERLANDS)	This phrase is no longer included. The relevant section is now C-2.
896	68669	TS	56	46	56	46	Line includes "but". But refers to a contrast. Which contrast is meant here? (NETHERLANDS)	Substantially different phrasing is now used. The relevant section is now C-2.
897	68670	TS	56	51	56	53	it is not clear how this sentence connects to the previous one: do adaption and mitigation fall under (a) and sustainable development falls under (b)? (NETHERLANDS)	Clarified wording has been developed. The relevant section is now C-2.
898	68672	ΤS	56	53			as well as sustainable development strategies and choices? (NETHERLANDS)	Clarified wording within this paragraph has been developed, and this specific sentence is no longer included. The relevant section is now C-2.
899	68673	ΤS	56			53	Line includes "climate change responses" directly followed by "Both kind of responses". Using of the word "responses" directly after each other in different ways may be confusing. (NETHERLANDS)	Clarified wording within this paragraph has been developed, and this specific phrasing is no longer used. The relevant section is now C-2.
900	68671	ΤS	56	53		54	what are you refering to when talking about both kind of responses?, do you mean 1. adaption and mitigation and 2. sustainable development? (NETHERLANDS)	This phrase is no longer used.
901	68674	тs	57	1	57	1	what are the two categories of responses? (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
		1	1	1	1	1		

What is meant with "each of the two categories of responses"? (NETHERLANDS)

This sentence is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
903	68676	TS				2	Indicating statement as "high confidence" and "high agreement" is not supported by the underlying material. Medium confidence and medium agreement would be more appropriate. Please also bear in mind that "resilience" is a frame to interprete empirical phenomena. Using "resilience" as a research frame is also still under discussion itself. See e.g. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
904	68677	ΤS	57	3	57	4	Please avoid circular reasoning. Sentence now reads: pathways that are resilient are likely to be resilient. (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
905	68678	TS	57	3	57	6	Statement is unclear and would benefit from cutting into shorter sentences and rephrashing. (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
906	68679	ΤS	57	5	57	5	what are you referring to by goals? (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
907	68680	TS	57	5	57	5	Which goals are meant with "each goal"? Please indicate. (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
908	68681	TS	57	5	57	5	Please indicate what is meant with "the other". (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
909	68682	TS	57	5	57	5	Please indicate which contrast is meant, when using the word "but". (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence is no longer included.
910	68683	TS	57	5	57	6	Please indicate which "windows of opportunity" are meant and why these opportunities may narrow over time. (NETHERLANDS)	Substantially clarified wording on opportunities for synergies is now provided. The relevant section is now C-2.
911	68684	ΤS	57	25	57	29	Again, indicating statement as "high confidence" and "high agreement" is not supported by the underlying material. Medium confidence and medium agreement would be more appropriate. Please bear in mind that "resilience" is a frame to interprete empirical phenomena. Using "resilience" as a research frame is still under discussion itself. See e.g. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. (NETHERLANDS)	The traceable account for the assignment of high confidence for this finding is provided in the underlying chapter assessment (see chapter 20).
912	79913	ΤS	57	25	58	23	Some of the bolded texts here represents important findings. Please consider to reflect the essence of some of them in the SPM sect. D.i. or D.ii. (NORWAY)	These findings are reflected in the summary for policymakers, albeit in shorter form.
913	68685	TS	57	26	57	29	The statement is too long and not clear. Please rephrase the sentence. (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
914	68686	TS	57	31	57	35	Similar to previous comment, indicating statement as "high confidence" and "high agreement" is not supported by the underlying material. Medium confidence and medium agreement would be more appropriate. Please bear in mind that "resilience" is a frame to interprete empirical phenomena. Using "resilience" as a research frame is still under discussion itself. See e.g. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. (NETHERLANDS)	This exact finding is no longer included, with a broader finding on transformation now provided, building from robust support
915	68042	TS	57	37	0	0	"Recent research suggests that mitigation and adaptation are likely to be more effective when they are designed and implemented in the context of other interventions within the broader context of sustainability and resilience." (Chapter 20 page 16 lines 41-50) This is a fundamental message of the IPCC which has been stated since the TAR that needs to be reinforced as there are always newcomers to the climate change field unfamiliar with past reports; and therefore, we strongly suggest that its is included in the TS as a starting point. (JAPAN)	Findings addressing these themes are included within the section. The relevant section is now C-2.
916	80618	TS	57	37	57	43	Although in this paragraph, the author emphasizes that "Although at a global scale both mitigation and adaptation are essential, relatively local scales in many developing regions have limited capacities to include mitigation in their climate-resilience strategies because they contribute very little to the causes of climate change.", the author should further illustrate the importance of adaptation at relatively local scales, in order to make this sentence to be more complete. SUGGESTION: add that "the developing countries should pay more efforts on adaptation" after the aboving quotated sentence. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	A finding on the context specificity of adaptation is now highlighted within the section. The relevant section is now C-2.
917	68687	TS	57	39	57	39	Please indicate to which scales "those scales" refer. (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
918	68688	TS	57	40	57	42	limited capacity for climate change mitigation attributed by little contribution to climate change is not logical. Could it be due to poor economic and political conditions, or due to lack of awareness ? (NETHERLANDS)	This statement is no longer included.
919	60326	TS	57	48	58	55	Example of co-benefits, synergies and trade-offs should include Pacific island countries and territories (PICTs).this is covered to some degree on page 59 from lines 43 to 52. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)	One paragraph of examples is given in most cases for each regional chapter including the small islands chapter. Please see C-2.

#	ID	Ch		From Line			Comment	Response
920	79764	TS	57		0	0	Another example could be that of removing the CRP program to grow more crops, but then reducing the soil resource ??see food systems? (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	Several examples related to agriculture are provided, as can be supported by assessment in the underlying report. The relevant section is now C-2.
921	76430	ΤS	57	53	57	55	Water use for irrigation during drought also has impacts for energy systems (as well as downstream ecosystems) (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Interactions at the intersections among water, energy, land use, and biodiversity are commented on broadly, with inclusion of some specific examples. The example reference here however is no longer included. Please see relevant information in Box TS.9 as well.
922	68689	TS	58	9	58	13	Reference to the text should be changed from 3.7.2 to 3.7.2.1 (NETHERLANDS)	Referencing has been updated for related material in the revised technical summary.
923	68171	TS	58	11	58	12	This sentence should read: "Hydropower CAN have negative effects on freshwater ecosystems that can be reduced by appropriate management." (International Hydropower Association (IHA))	This specific example is no longer included.
924	76431	ΤS	58	11	58	12	Need clarification regarding the operational aspects of hydropower and negative impacts. Many freshwater ecosystems are impacted because of clearcutting, other land use practices upstream of hydropower systems. Hydropower systems are contributing factors, but not the only factor. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This specific example is no longer included.
925	68043	TS	58	15	58	17	A concern presented in Chapter 4 and should be stated here is about large-scale forest conversion or land use change leading to habitat loss and fragmentation (e.g. paragraph 4.2.4.1 P11L12,P12L19), and not about "use of terrestrial biosphere in climate mitigation actions" as a whole, (e.g. mitigation actions by conservation of forests). Introduction of fast-growing tree species, which is an effective means for the rehabilitation of degraded or bare lands, should not be denied in general as mentioned here. Further, this sentence seems to oppose the use of the terrestrial biosphere in climate mitigation actions and thus contradicts UNFCCC Article 4 paragraph 1(d) , "Promote sustainable management, and promote and including biomass, forests and oceans as well as other terrestrial, coastal and marine ecosystems;." Regarding fast-growing tree species, the relevant text raise concern about increasing water consumption in some country (semi-arid areas) in paragraph 3.7.2., but this sentence would be mistaken as if these lead to negative impacts on ecosystem and biodiversity as a whole. This sentence should be deleted or revised so as to avoid unnecessary misunderstanding (JAPAN)	The relevant finding has been revised accordingly. The relevant section is now C-2.
926	68690	TS	58	21	58	25	The referenced Paragraph 21.5.3 does not touch upon the costs for mitigation. Reference to another chapter where this topic is discussed might be more appropriate. (NETHERLANDS)	This material is no longer included.
927	80619	ΤS	58	21	58	25	This part belongs to the WGIII, which has little connection with impacts. The carbon emission is not the only object, SUGGESTION: delete this part. (Jiahua PAN, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	This material is no longer included.
928	77275	TS	58	38	0	0	No Africa Example (Kreft Sönke, United Nations University - Institute for Environmental and Human Security)	A bullet for Africa is now included in the section. The relevant section is now C-2.
929	79914	TS	58	38	58	48	It also seems to us to be an imbalance between the description of impacts of different mitigation options and the relation to adaptation in the section. It is felt that the potential impacts of nuclear power as a mitigation option in relation to safety, n (NORWAY)	Improved balance of examples has been prioritized in the revision. The relevant section is now C-2.
930	64131	ΤS	58	40	58	41	The text states "Climate policies, such as encouraging cultivation of biofuels and payments under REDD, will result in mixed and potentially detrimental impacts on land-use and on the livelihoods of poor and marginalized people." The TS is not coherent with the SPM and the underlying CH 13 with regard to the certainty of the statement. Please check the use of the word "will" and "may", and the associated uncertainty statements. In addition, the wording is different in this chapter ("REDD+") from the one used in the SPM P 17 L 38 ("REDD"). (GERMANY)	Revised wording supported by the underlying assessment has been developed in the TS consistent with the assessment in Chapter 13. The statement is no longer included within the summary for policymakers. The relevant section is now C-2.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	1 To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
931	68044	TS		40	58	42	The sentence "Climate policies, such as payments under REDD, will result in mixed and potentially detrimental impacts on land-use and on the livelihoods of poor and marginalized people." presents a very much different evaluation on REDD+ from TS of WG3 (page45); "The implementation of REDD mechanisms and its variations that can represent a very cost-effective option for mitigation with high social and other environmental co-benefits". The relevant text of the underlying report (paragraph 9.3.3.4) raises issues related to community participation etc. in the ongoing REDD+ pilot projects, however, the REDD+ framework itself should not be judged as "potentially detrimental" only by the results of those pilot projects that are being implemented and are still in the early stages and in general lack sufficient infrastructures, framework, governance and capacity. The reviews of projects in Chapter 9, 13 are not always the result of result-based projects with payments under REDD, and references don't always reflect the result of Decision1 of UNFCCC COP16 where safeguards for REDD+ were defined, which should be promoted and supported when undertaking REDD+ activities. (Further, contents in Chapter 13 show some positive results projects even in early stages.) There is not a sufficient basis for conclusion of medium confidence. Due to the above reasons, this sentence "Climate policies, such as payments under REDD, will result in mixed and potentially detrimental impacts" should be deleted. But if some reference to (it any content) regarding climate policy is inevitable here, the sentence should be revised as follows; : "As climate polices, such as encouraging cultivation of biofuels, may result in mixed impacts on land-use and on the livelihoods of poor and marginalized people, the appropriate measures should be considered." for aforementioned reason, also the contents in chapter 13 do not mean the climate polices, such as encouraging cultivation of biofuels and payments under REDD, always result in mixed impacts o	More specific and nuanced wording for the related finding has been developed in the revision of the technical summary. The relevant section is now C-2.
932	68045	TS	58	40	58	42	To give the example of the relationship between ecosystem resilience and adaptation, "Climate Change adaptation efforts to the migration of plants and animals" (chapter15 P3 L23-27) should be inserted in place of "Efforts to improve ecosystem resilience can benefit adaptation". (JAPAN)	This comment appears to refer to page 24 lines 18-19. This specific example is no longer included in the corresponding paragraph now in C-1.
933	79915	ΤS	58	40	58	42	This sentence is fundamentally flawed and must be changed. The main draft report itself - 13.3.1.2 - states that experience to date is "inadequate to permit broad generalizations about the effects of REDD+ on livelihoods and poverty". While effects may be (NORWAY)	More specific and nuanced wording for the related finding has been developed in the revision of the technical summary. The relevant section is now C-2.
934	70449	TS	58	42	58	42	Delete "such as the CDM and REDD+" and add "Some" at the beginning. There is no evidence that the policy instruments CDM and REDD+ have negative impacts on the poor. For the CDM, there is evidence that the projects have no strongly beneficial impacts on the poor, but outright negative effects are rare exceptions. See TERI (2012): Assessing the Impact of the Clean Development Mechanism on Sustainable Development and Technology Transfer, New Delhi, and also the assessment (Axel Michaelowa, University of Zurich)	More precise wording is now used for the related material in this paragraph. The relevant section is now C-2.
935	68691	ΤS	59	7	59	14	Although this summary is given in the executive summary of Chapter 25, it is not substantiated by the facts in the Chapters indicated (e.g. 25.7.5, 25.9.1, 25.9.2, Box 25-10). (NETHERLANDS)	Full support of the paragraph included for Australasia can be found within the cited chapter sections. The relevant section within the TS is now C-2.
936	68692	ΤS	59	7	59	14	The term trade-intensive is used here and in the ES of the Chapter 25, but not at all in the body of Chapter 25 (NETHERLANDS)	The finding, now presented in C-2, is fully supported by the assessment of chapter 25.
937	76432	TS	59	19	59	19	We can partially protect coastal properties, but protecting vulnerable areas may also be maladaptive. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This example is no longer included, but regional examples of co- benefits, synergies, and tradeoffs are now presented in C-2.
938	79765	TS	59	22	0	0	this section is very confusing (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	Examples of co-benefits, synergies, and tradeoffs in the region have been very substantially reduced to focus on topics highlighted within the assessment. These topics are now presented in C-2.
939	76433	TS	59	29	59	41	Are there fertilization issues with agricultural production in South America? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Examples of co-benefits, synergies, and tradeoffs in the region have been very substantially reduced to focus on topics highlighted within the assessment. These topics are now presented in C-2.

TS 61 10 61 11

ΤS 61 11 61 11

ΤS 61 25 0 0

950

951

952

70682

63165

64134

#	ID	Ch	From	From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
940	61958	TS	59	51	59	52	This reference to the determining influence of cultural and worldview factors relates not just to islands. Their importance could perhaps be referred to earlier in the SPM - where both appear to be downplayed. (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	This example is no longer included within a regional context, but the importance of values, goals, and worldviews is highlighted earlier in the SPM as well as in the technical summary, including its box on adaptation limits (Box TS.8).
941	79916	ΤS	59	54	60	5	Consider to describe the risk for maladaptation for small island states in the SPM e.g. page 18 line 9. (NORWAY)	A cross chapter paragraph on maladaptation is included in C-1, although the example is no longer provided in this regional context.
942	68693	TS	60	3	60	5	This statement is contradictory to the statement given in the body of Chapter 29, page 24 line 4 to 5. (NETHERLANDS)	This paragraph is no longer included.
943	61904	TS	60	19	60	27	This paragraph is too complicated to understand. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	the paragraph has been clarified, although it is intended as a technical introduction to the topic. The relevant box is now Box TS.8.
944	68694	TS	60	26	60	27	Sentence and meaning are very unclear. In the current formulation, the suggestion is made that statement is normative, not drawn from the literature, and a kind of random unfounded warning. Please rephrase. (NETHERLANDS)	Substantially clarified wording has been adopted. The relevant box is now Box TS.8.
945	68695	TS	60	43	60	43	Discussion in the literature also includes warnings and concerns about deliberately created transformations. E.g.: Meadowcroft, M., 2009, What about the politics? Sustainable development, transition management, and long-term energy transitions. Policy Sciences, vol. 42, iss. 4, pp 323-340. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. E.g.: Voss, JP., Bornemann, B., 2011, The politics of reflexive governance: challenges for designing adaptive management and transition management. Ecology & Society, vol. 16, iss. 2, art. 9. (NETHERLANDS)	Challenges along these lines are addressed within the final paragraph of the box. The relevant box is now Box TS.8.
946	68696	TS	60	48	60	50	Or is it the other way around? May societal debate trigger change? E.g.: Meadowcroft, M., 2009, What about the politics? Sustainable development, transition management, and long-term energy transitions. Policy Sciences, vol. 42, iss. 4, pp 323- 340. E.g.: Smith, A. and Stirling, A., 2010, The politics of social-ecological resilience and sustainable socio-technical transitions. Ecology & Society, vol. 15, iss. 1, art. 11. E.g.: Voss, JP., Bornemann, B., 2011, The politics of reflexive governance: challenges for designing adaptive management and transition management. Ecology & Society, vol. 16, iss. 2, art. 9. (NETHERLANDS)	This finding has been broadened, with focus on societal debates. The relevant box is now Box TS.8.
947	64132	TS	61	0	64	0	FAQs: The other WG did not include FAQ in their TS. It is suggested to treat FAQs consistently across all WGs, instead of inconsistently including them in only one of the WG's TS. If keeping FAQ in the TS: some but not all FAQs from the underlying report have been taken up in the TS, e.g. FAQ 3.6, 4.1-4.7., 6.1, etc. would also be interesting, and an FAQ on tipping points, key impacts, key risks should be added. (GERMANY)	The frequently asked questions were placed within the technical summary only for purposes of review. They will not be part of the technical summary within the final report. These frequently asked questions differ from those of the underlying report, spanning chapters, and their role is now clarified in their introduction.
948	64133	TS	61	5	0	0	Please change to "Are we seeing impacts of RECENT climate change?" (GERMANY)	The question (now FAQ #6) has been changed accordingly.
949	78564	TS	61	5	61	17	Should the distinction between climate change and anthropogenic climate change be made again here? (Dáithí Stone,	This distinction is now further addressed within the summary

University of Cape Town)

University of Lisbon)

not cited. (Sharon Smith, Geological Survey of Canada)

for policymakers and technical summary but for clarity is not reintroduced here, given the necessity of retaining accessible text for the frequently asked questions. Please note that the

This statement has been substantially shortened, using

Uncertainty language is no longer included, with an

introductory preface describing this at the start of the

decreased snowpack as the featured example. Please note that

relevant FAQ is now FAQ #6.

the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #6.

frequently asked questions.

This example is no longer included.

Where "...hydrological cycles have been disrupted by decreased snowpack, degradation of permafrost regions, and

diminishing glaciers...", replace by "...hydrological cycles have been affected by decreased snowpack, degradation of

permafrost, and diminishing glaciers..." (replace "disrupted and delete "regions" after "permafrost" (Goncalo Vieira,

strange to those not familiar with the specific use of "confidence" in the IPCC. (GERMANY)

Degradation of permafrost regions is incorrect terminology. It would be better to say "degradation of permafrost in Polar

regions and at high altitudes". It isn't clear what region this statement refers to. It is also not clear why ch 28 (polar regions) is

The uncertainty qualifier should be put in parenthesis at the end of the statement, in the current version the sentence sounds

#	ID	Ch	From	From Line			Comment	Response
953	68697	ΤS	61		61	26	evaluate carefully if you want to keep "medium confidence" and not decrease to "low confidence", since we see that in some parts of Chapter 23 there are controversial results (increase in cereals' production because of CC) (NETHERLANDS)	Uncertainty language is no longer included, with an introductory preface describing this at the start of the frequently asked questions.
954	64135	ΤS	61	29	0	0	It is confusing to mention change of CO2 as a consequence, not a reason of climate change, please use the word "carbon cycle" instead. (GERMANY)	This question is no longer included.
955	64136	тs	61	30	61	31	Please mention that these effects will increase with increasing climate change. (GERMANY)	This question is no longer included.
956	64137	ΤS	61	37	61	38	Please do not open this para with such a positive statement. Instead it of saying "only a few are positive" it should be "(by far) most are negative" (GERMANY)	Clearer wording is now used for this statement. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #7.
957	77298	ΤS	61	37	61	48	Explain WHY only a few of the impacts assessed are positive (because unprecedented changes are ipso facto not what existing systems have evolved or been designed to cope with? because hydrology becomes more extreme & less reliable across the board? because research funding is much more available for investigating potential problems & action to reduce them than for investigating potential gains with no action needed?) (William Ingram, Met Office)	As can be supported by findings across the report, explanatory detail is further clarified. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #7.
958	79337	ΤS	62	1	62	1	It would be better to say "will affect the livelihoods of fishing communities in some regions" As increases in fish stocks will occur elsewhere. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This question is no longer included.
959	64138	ΤS	62	8	62	21	This FAQ provides a definition of key vulnerabilities. In its current form, it is not adding value to the TS and should be deleted. The reader would expect information on which actually are the key vulnerabilities identified in this report, like those given in Table TS.8. (GERMANY)	This question is no longer included.
960	76434	ΤS	62	31	62	31	Changing property rights as well as water rights. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The wording has been broadened accordingly. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #9.
961	78565	ΤS	62	36	0	0	Chapter 19? Is it not 12? (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Both chapters provide corresponding assessment. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #9.
962	64139	ΤS	62	38	62	46	In this FAQ, the effects of ocean acidification are reduced to marine and coastal areas (because it comes from this chapter). However, the in context of the TS, this is not sufficient and other effects of ocean acidification must be added, e.g. on fishery, corals, etc. (GERMANY)	This question is no longer included.
963	68698	ΤS	62	43	62	45	The line states: ' has numerous implications for ocean and coastal processes and organisms, including rates of primary production, the deposition of calcium carbonate in shells and skeletons, and the degradation of limestone.' The description 'implications for rates of primary production' is too general and unclear. Cross-chapter Box Ocean Acidification clearly describes that primary production of seagrass and some phytoplankton is stimulated with the observed changes. Suggestion: 'implication for the primary production rate of seagrass and some phytoplankton' (NETHERLANDS)	This question is no longer included.
964	64140	ΤS	62	48	63	2	The notion of risk is missing. (GERMANY)	Although many questions focus on risks, this question is intended to address vulnerability, which is one of the factors underpinning risk in the context of climate change.
965	62891	ΤS	62	53	62	55	The FAQ No. 8 is about vulnerabilities of communities to impacts of climate change whereas the write-up gives impression other way round, i.e. the effect of age, race etc. on past weather and climate extremes. The authors may like to consider the suggested write-up: 'There is high confidence that age, race and ethnicity, socio-economic status and governance are significantly influenced by the outcome of past weather and climate extremes'. (Muhammad Mohsin Iqbal, Global Change Impact Studies Centre)	Substantially clarified wording is now included for this topic.
966	76435	тs	62	62	38	47	This statement also should reference Chapters 6 and 30. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This question is no longer included.
967	76436	ΤS	63	8	63	11	There are also tradeoffs and consequences to either a mitigation or adaptation strategy. They must be considered together. One or the other are not always a win-win. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Emphasis on synergies and trade-offs is further clarified and balanced. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #10.
968	68699	TS	63	23	63	26	TS states it is impossible to attribute flooding to climate change. Chapter 25 states that stronger SSTs contributed to heavy rainfall during La Niña, suggesting a partial attribution. (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #11.
969	78567	ΤS	63	23	63	26	Perhaps an example that is not purely climatological would be more illustrative for WGII? Such as the effect of water management infrastructure on flood occurrence. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	Emphasis has been further placed on effects for people and ecosystems. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #11.

979

980

981

982

983

64143

58071

68701

60327

59807

TS 65 0

тs 65

ΤS

ΤS 65 33 65 45

65 27 65 27

67 0 0 0

85 0

66 2

Grupo La era)

6

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
970	76437	TS	63	25		26	While some events, such as those noted for Australia may be triggered by ENSO/LaNina or other climate modal changes, not all flood events are. Extreme hurricane events/storm surge, rapid snowmelt also contribute to changes in flood patterns relevant to the observed past. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This specific example is no longer included. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #11.
971	78566	TS	63	25	63	26	More explanation is needed for this to make sense. It is not impossible in principle (otherwise we would not have been able to attribute observed global warming to emissions). (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	This specific example is no longer included. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #11.
972	64141	TS	63	34	63	56	The FAQ2 11 and 12 are not really answered to in the text. (GERMANY)	Question 12 is no longer included. Question 11 is now answered much more directly. Please note that the former FAQ #11 is now FAQ #1.
973	76438	TS	63	36	63	36	Average climate is not the critical issue. Biogeographic limits or inertia are often more related to frequency and magnitude of extreme events and threshold limits. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A more direct answer for the question is now provided, addressing this point. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #1.
974	58070	TS	63	39	63	39	I think it is important to show that crops can also fail following a change on seasonal patterns. See all the case studies and literature available for coffee and wheat. For example, many coffee growing areas have suffered drastic and subtle changes in the seasons (drought season has delayed or shortened or prolonged, for example). Quality coffee is very dependent on when it rains or not, a drought period is needed and has to coincide with specific timing for the plant. Chapter 7 mentions this but this is not reflected in this summary and is an important issue to highlight. In many of the countries adaptation strategies are being confused with disaster risk management and these issues of changes on seasonal patterns are not being considered. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	Although this level of specificity is too high to reflect in this context, extended assessment of this topic is provided in the underlying report, with crops here mentioned for both average conditions and extremes in a broad sense. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #1.
975	77299	TS	64	6	0	0	I cannot believe this is a frequently asked question! (William Ingram, Met Office)	Most people would recognize climate change as a particularly difficult challenge, which is now better reflected in the format of the question. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #3.
976	76439	TS	64	25	64	31	Consider restating some of the climate opportunities and time frames. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Improved description has been achieved. Please note that the relevant FAQ is now FAQ #4.
977	64142	TS	64	37	54	38	The second sentence is not fully consistent with FAQ 10. Please revise. (GERMANY)	The findings are not inconsistent. Climate change impacts are already widespread and consequential, despite the challenges for attribution. Please note that the previous FAQ #15 is now FAQ #5, and the previous FAQ #10 is now FAQ #11.
978	68700	TS	64	39	64	40	It is the same comment made for the Box CC-OA. The definition of ocean acidification is quite confusing. We would sugget: "	This comment appears to refer to page 62 line 39. This question

dissolved carbonate ion and the capacity" (NETHERLANDS)

Strongly support inclusion of Box CC-CR coral reefs. (AUSTRALIA)

text, once within the X-chapter boxes.) (GERMANY)

FIRST-0	ORDER	DRAFT
---------	-------	-------

the uptake of CO2 into mildly alkaline ocean results in an increase in dissolved CO2 that combined with water reduces the pH, has been deleted.

WGII Cross-Chapter Boxes: The idea of including of content from the cross chapter boxes in the TS is supported in principle,

but copy/paste is not enough, inclusion of the X-boxes increases the volume/extent of the TS to a non-acceptable amount.

The text should be significantly shortened, simplified and adapted in style the rest of the TS. Before inclusion in the TS, information from the underlying chapters should be shortened, references should point to the underlying report and not to the original literature. In addition, it is not possible that the same figures are shown twice in the TS (once as part of the main

EBAs will be among the most common adaptation strategies, due to the compare relative low cost. To improve our knowledge and be able to properly inform decision makers it is also important to acknowledge the current limitations of

Include some ecosystem-based approaches to adaptation such as: utilization of traditional knowledge is adaptive

management approach. (Dan F. Orcherton, PACE-Pacific Centre for Envionment and Sustainable Development)

Missing the year of publication of Munang et al – should be Munang et al. (2013). (NETHERLANDS)

EBAs, of the scientific evidence of EBAs and on information deficiencies to back up decision makers on EBAs. For references

on this see the same reference Munroe et al 2011 that is being used in the box in this chapter. (Carmen Lacambra Segura,

Please note that the cross-chapter boxes were placed in the

A sentence has been added to address the need for more

scientific evidence on the effectiveness of EBA in achieving

Traditional knowledge is referenced as important to ecosystem-

technical summary ONLY for purposes of review.

society's goals for adaptation.

Thank you.

The year for the citation has been added.

based adaptation within the revised Box CC-EA.

			Erom	From	To	То		
#	ID	Ch		Line	Page		Comment	Response
984	68702	ΤS	67	1	69	1	Box CC-CR. References to coral in the Chapter 25 should stress that this Box contains the most detailed and definitive information. (NETHERLANDS)	Chapter 25 has ensured harmonized assessment and appropriate cross-referencing of the box.
985	79917	TS	67	4	67	10	Considering adding the following about corals: "Coral reefs are also extremely important from a biological point of view, for	Although this is correct, we have not chosen to incorporate thi
							ecosystems and biodiversity in tropical waters, as home and/or nursery/foraging/spawning areas for a huge number of species". (NORWAY)	perspective due to space constraints.
986	84331	TS	67	6	67	6	Casual usage of "likely" should be avoided, as it is a reserved likelihood term. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	OK, "likely" deleted.
987	79918	TS	67	16	67	16	Consider including at the end of the sentence " and their associated ecosystems and species." (NORWAY)	The paragraph has been substantially rewritten and now captures this particular sentiment.
988	68703	ΤS	67	26	67	26	Line 26 states: 'and may tip the calcium carbonate balance of reef frameworks towards dissolution', with reference to Chapter 5.4.2.4. But this is not mentioned in Chapter 5.4.2.4, this information can be found in Cross-chapter box Coral Reefs. (NETHERLANDS)	The text of section 5.4.2.4 has been revised; it now explicitly mentions enhanced dissolution.
989	79338	тs	67	30	67	36	This paragraph does not mention the impact of destructive fishing practices e.g. dynamite fishing. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	That is correct but "human activities" covers destructive fishing practices. There is no need to mention this activity rather than other ones, which are considerably more significant
990	68704	ΤS	67	31	67	31	Confusing statement: Around 50% of all coral reefs have experienced medium-high to very high impact of human activities (30-50% to 50-70% degraded). Suggest it be reworded to "medium-high (30-50% degraded) to very high (50-70% degraded)" (NETHERLANDS)	The text has been modified accordingly.
991	84332	ΤS	67	45	67	46	The summary terms for evidence and agreement could be placed within parentheses at the end of this sentence to maximize directness of wording. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	The text has been modified accordingly.
992	84333	ΤS	67	46	67	47	If it is possible to indicate the metric of "risk" as done for impact on lines 30-31, it would be great to do so. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Unfortunately, there is no metric. It is based on expert judgement.
993	84334	TS	67	49	67	52	What are the time frames for these projected outcomes? (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Time frames have been added.
994	76440	TS	67	67	23	23	Reference to Fig. 5X need to be updated with the appropriate figure reference. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Done.
995	84335	ΤS	68	5	68	7	Given that the citations differ in year, it could be helpful to indicate more explicitly the timeframe for these statements. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	The timeframe has been added.
996	84336	TS	68	8	68	8	The completed cross-reference should of course be supplied in the final draft. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Yes.
997	84337	TS	68	21	68	23	It could be helpful to specify the relevant time frame for the statistics. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	The timeframe has been added.
998	68705	TS	68	22	68	23	This is a good point, but appears to be a post hoc fact that is likely to apply to many other environmental assets around the world. (NETHERLANDS)	We agree and think that it is important to mention in the context of coral reefs.
999	61959	TS	68	25	68	23	Some reference to how relevant MPA remain in some areas given the larger scale impact of ocean acidification and bleaching might be pertinent here given that the opportunity cost of not taking other actions may need to be considered as well as any potential gain. E.g. if reefs really are set to disappear, buying time may or may not be the best option compared to diverting resources to dealing with the impacts of that scenario (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	We have not chosen to incorporate this perspective due to the lack of sapce.
1000	84338	ΤS	68	31	68	31	"high confidence" should be italicized for clarity. Additionally, it could be placed within parentheses at the end of the sentence to maximize directness of wording. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Done.
1001	84339	ΤS	68	32	68	32	Of course the completed cross-reference should be supplied in the final draft. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Yes.
1002	59808	TS	68	48	0	0	The Biggs 2011 reference mentioned in the text (at line 11) is missing from the reference list. (AUSTRALIA)	Reference added.
1003	76441	ΤS	68	68	8	8	Reference to 13.x.x needs to be updated with the appropriate chapter reference. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	References have been completed.
1004	76442	TS	68	68	32	32	Reference to 5.X.X needs to be updated with the appropriate chapter reference. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	References have been completed.
1005	76443	ΤS	70	4	70	8	Box CC-RF: Are changes to water quality also important? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Pollution and changes to water quality are one of many stressors, (see 4.3.3.3) however, this Box deals specifically with the effects of flow alteration.

#	ID	Ch	From	From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1006	84340	ΤS	70	10	70	10	It would be preferable to use calibrated uncertainty language to summarize available evidence and agreement here. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Have included "Medium confidence" to this statement
1007	61905	TS	70	10	70	29	The paper by Doll and Zhang used results from the ECHAM5 model as well as HadCM3 and also the B2 emissions scenario. It's not clear whether these extra results are referred to. Perhaps they should be? Local change in hydrology will differ between models. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Information on specific scenario added
1008	76444	ΤS	70	15	70	15	Box CC-RF: 'suffer' is rather subjective. Perhaps degraded is a better term? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Have changed this to "may be negatively affected"
1009	84341	TS	70	15	70	15	Which climate scenario? If possible, it would be preferable to specify this. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Information on specific scenario added
1010	76445	TS	70	17	70	19	Box CC-RF: Many hydropower, or operational systems of water impoundment have limits to their water holding capacity. Climate change may, through increased rain on snow events, exacerbate vulnerability to flood events. Also human activities upstream of an impoundment (clearcutting, etc) have significant impacts on riverine systems that are downstream. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This point acknowledges that, although climate change can exascerbate the effects of dams, careful operation of dams can also mitigate some of the impacts. We agree there are limits though to what can be achieved. These issues are dealt with further in Chapter 3 and in 4.3.3.3.
1011	76446	TS	70	28	70	28	Box CC-RF: Suggest presenting a suite of model results rather than a single model which may be viewed as an extreme result. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Unfortunately, no comparable results of other models are available
1012	68706	ΤS	72	13	72	14	It is the same comment made for the Box CC-OA. The definition of ocean acidification is quite confusing. We would suggest: " the uptake of CO2 into mildly alkaline ocean results in an increase in dissolved CO2 that combined with water reduces the pH, dissolved carbonate ion and the capacity" (NETHERLANDS)	We have not chosen to incorporate this perspective because it is found more confusing. The present wording is scientifically sound and reads well.
1013	68707	тs	72	32	72	32	Reference to Fig X.C. (NETHERLANDS)	This has been fixed.
1014	68708	TS	72	32	72	32	Box CC-OA. There is a reference to a Figure X.C, that does not exist. (NETHERLANDS)	This has been fixed.
1015	79339	TS	72	49	72	50	I strongly disagree with this statement as there have been only 2 modelling studies on the indirect food-web consequences of ocean acidification for fisheries. Therefore 'high agreement' would be meaningless. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The comment probably applies to page 73 line 31. See reply to comment #883.
1016	84342	TS	72	51	72	52	It would be preferable to place the summary terms for evidence and agreement within parentheses to maximize directness of wording in the sentence. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	The text has been corrected accordingly.
1017	76447	тs	72	72	17	17	Reference to incorrect section. Change "5.3.3.6" to "5.3.3.5". (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This correction is being made at production stage.
1018	76448	TS	72	74	1	17	There are several technical corrections that need to be made to Box CC-OA. These have been indicated in the reviews of chapters 30 and 6. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	These comments have been dealt with in revision.
1019	76449	ΤS	73	5	73	6	Box CC-OA: Temperature is probably a climatic driver. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Agreed but temperature is listed under "other climatic and non- climatic drivers". So it should be OK.
1020	76450	TS	73	12	73	13	Box CC-OA: Are economies also important (as well as ecosystem services)? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The text has been revised to incorporate this perspective.
1021	76451	ΤS	73	22	73	38	Box CC-OA: This section is largely repetitive. Perhaps weave estimated costs into relevant text. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	It is not clear what is repetitive and the costs are already woven into the text. The paragraph was left unchanged.
1022	84343	TS	73	28	73	31	The relevant scenarios of climate change should be specified for these projections. Importantly, instead of providing the results as "up to 13%" and "over 100 billion" the full ranges relevant to the analysis should be provided. Finally, the summary terms for evidence and agreement on line 30 should be italicized. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	The text has been corrected accordingly.
1023	79340	TS	73	32	73	33	I strongly disagree with this statement as there have been only 2 modelling studies on the indirect food-web consequences of ocean acidification for fisheries. Therefore 'high agreement' would be meaningless. I do not think it is possible to conclusively state that "ocean acidification will generally reduce fish biomass and catch" - there is some emerging evidence that the opposite might be true in certain areas. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line			Comment	Response
1024	84344	TS	73		73	36	It would be preferable to provide the ranges for these estimates. (Katharine Mach, IPCC WGII TSU)	Unfortunately, the ranges are not provided in tabular forms or in the text, only in a figure. Hence, no change was made other than a correction of wrong number. It was then useful to get back to the paper.
1025	79341	TS	73	40	73	53	What about reducing other stressors, e.g. fishing, eutrophication, pollutants etc - so less vulnerable? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The comment is unclear because other "locally determined drivers", "nutrient pollution", "anthropogenic inputs of nutrients and organic matter" are mentioned in this paragraph. No change was made.
1026	65054	ΤS	73	43	0	45	We suggest alternate wording: "Climate geoengineering techniques based on solar radiation management will not abate ocean acidification, and, in some cases, could increase it (Williamson and Turley, 2012)." (Action Group on Erosion, Technology and Concentration (ETC Group))	The text has been revised to incorporate this perspective.
1027	68709	TS	73	43	73	43	Mitigation of ocean acidification through reduction of atmospheric CO2 is mentioned as the most effective and least risky way method. But probably it is not the most cost effective (NETHERLANDS)	We have not chosen to incorporate this perspective because the sentence does not address the issue of cost. It uses the standard definition of "effective" ("successful in producing a desired or intended result").
1028	76452	TS	73	44	73	44	Box CC-OA: What about light limited processes in the ocean, such as NPP, etc? Changes to NPP impact ocean acidification. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	We have not chosen to incorporate this perspective because, although conceptually true, we are unaware of any paper addressing the link between NPP and ocean acidification that we could add to this assessment.
1029	68710	ΤS	73	49	73	49	The information given in this line cannot be found in Chapter 5.3.4.2 but in the Ocean Acidification Box (CC-OA) (NETHERLANDS)	Agreed. The link has been deleted.
1030	79342	TS	74	4	74	17	Figure OA-1 (page 141) is almost identical to figure TS.9. (page 134). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Although the cross-chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1031	79343	TS	76	29	76	43	Figure RC-1 (page 142) is almost identical to figure TS.5. (page 120). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Although the cross-chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1032	79344	TS	76	45	77	5	Figure RC-2 (page 143) is almost identical to figure TS.5. (page 120). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Although the cross-chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1033	62788	TS	78	9	78	19	Please include the assessments results by the UN ESCAP/WMO Typhoon Committee Expert Team on the impacts of tropical cyclones and future projections of tropical cyclone activities in the western North Pacific basin. References : - Lee, T. C., T. R. Knutson, H. Kamahori, and, M. Ying, 2012a: Impacts of Climate Change on Tropical Cyclones in the Western North Pacific Basin. Part I : Past Observations. Tropical Cyclone Res. Rev. 1, 213-230. http://tcrr.typhoon.gov.cn/EN/abstract/abstract30.shtml - Ying, M., T. R. Knutson, H. Kamahori, and T. C. Lee, 2012: Impacts of Climate Change on Tropical Cyclones in the Western North Pacific Basin. Part II: Late 21st Century Projections. Tropical Cyclone Res. Rev. 1, 231-241. (Sai-ming Lee, Hong Kong Observatory)	These references are cited in IPCC WG1 report, therefore we only refer to the WG1 report.
1034	76453	ΤS	78	11	78	11	Box CC-TC: Please insert reference to Field et al., 2012 and spell out SREX first time the acronym is used. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Done.

-	ID	Ch	Page	Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
L035	62787	TS	78	19	0	0	The word "lower confidence" repeated twice. (Sai-ming Lee, Hong Kong Observatory)	Revised
L 03 6	68046	TS	78	19	78	19	duplication of "lower confidence" (JAPAN)	Revised
L 0 37	68711	TS	78	19	78	19	The phrase lower confidence is repeatedly mentioned and one must be deleted. (NETHERLANDS)	Revised
1038	79766	TS	78	26	0	0	Could this vulnerability also have to do with infrastructure inadequate for protecting populated areas against severe storms?	Further infrastructure might be necessary for protecting
							As per page 7, line 39 (Jessica Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	populated areas with increase of combined influences of
								storms, relative sea-level rise including subsidence, land-use change like deforestation of mangroves. Appropriate ways will depend on region to region.
1039	62892	ΤS	80	8	0	0	The word 'modes' needs clarification, what type of modes? (Muhammad Mohsin Iqbal, Global Change Impact Studies Centre)	Text revised. Transportation modes are being referred to here, which is clarified through the addition of a comma.
L040	76454	TS	80	47	80	47	Box CC-WE: Please also include Skaggs et al., 2012. For proper reference, see comment for page 81, lines 33,34 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Skaggs et al., 2012, is included in the reference list for the box.
1041	76455	TS	81	33	81	34	Box CC-WE: This is referenced improperly and is the PNNL reference (which does not include the full list of authors), and in	Reference updated in full box during production.
							the wrong order. The correct citation is: Skaggs, R., Hibbard, K., Frumhoff, P., Lowry, T., Middleton, R., Pate, R., Tidwell, V.,	
							Arnold, J., Averyt, K., Janetos, A., Izaurralde, C., Rice, J., and S. Rose. 2012. Climate and energy-water-land system	
							interactions. A technical report to the US Department of Energy in support of the National Climate Assessment. PNNL 21185. Pacific Northwest National Laboratory, Richland, WA. 152 pp. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
L042	76456	TS	82	14	82	16	Box CC-VW: This sentence implies that Leakey et al., 2009 discussed spatial encroachment (presumably on landscapes) with	Reformulated
							FACE results which is not true. Expansion of species into new habitates does not always lead to increased Ts rates. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
L043	76457	TS	82	18	82	23	Box CC-VW: For the TS, only the most recent results should be presented. As a result, the authors can delete lines 19-21,	Reference to older work were left to clearly express progress.
							simply stating that "Since AR4, recent studies (e.g., Dai et al) show that" (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	
L044	77300	TS	82	45	82	46	"the anthropogenic component of the precipitation and temperature contributions(i.e. of the radiative CO2 effect) to runoff	The sentence does not imply that a "precise" attribution is
							trends is not yet established" doesn't actually make sense, but also seems to imply that it is possible in principle to establish a precise anthropogenic contribution to climate change, which is of course untrue. (William Ingram, Met Office)	possible.
L045	77301	TS	82	53	0	0	"although other models project a smaller response" makes no sense as no magnitude has been mentioned (William Ingram,	Reformulated
L046	76458	TS	83	1	83	9	Met Office) Box CC-VW: Anything on downregulation? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Not clear what is meant with downregulation, but paragraph
1040	70438	13	65	1	03	5		has been reformulated
L047	79767	TS	83	11	0	0	This paragraph refers to interactive effects of drying and plant cover, but not altered precipitation regimes and plant cover	Not included due to space constraints.
							that may be more applicable to temperate systems- for instance work from the Konza Prairie LTER long term rain fall	
							experimental plots could be cited if published http://www.konza.ksu.edu/knz/pages/research/knzcore.aspx (Jessica	
							Gutknecht, Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research-UFZ)	
L048	68712	TS	83	16	83	17	There is no reference in the Chapter to Green et al 2007. It could be inserted e.g. P13 L33-38. (NETHERLANDS)	Not included due to space constraints.
L049	76459	TS	83	32	83	32	Box CC-VW: These systems are probably less synchronous than we think. Probably more like lagged effects as indicated earlier in this summary. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Lagging without overlaps cannot be expected, so there will be some synchronicity.
L050	79345	TS	85	0	86	0	TABLE TS.1 there are several blank cells in the table; could they be populated with examples? Especially for Small Island state	The writing team decided to confine examples presented in th
							row; SIS are accepted as farily vulnerable, but few observed impacts are recorded here. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT	table to those for which attribution to climate change is made
							BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	with medium or high confidence. The underlying tables within
								Chapter 18 present a larger number of examples accordingly.
								Additionally, the small islands chapter discusses availability of
			1	1	1	1		evidence on observed impacts in that specific regional context

#	ID	Ch	From	From	То	То	Comment	Response
1051	59809	TS	Page 86	Line O	Page 0	0	Table TS1 - Mass coral bleaching has also been recorded on Western Australia's Ningaloo and Abrolhos Island fringing reefs. Sources: Australian Institute of Marine Science - Ningaloo Atlas: http://ningaloo-atlas.org.au/node/193 & 2011 SOE report card: Anthony K, Harrison P, Lough J, Brinkman R, Oliver J and Wachenfeld D. Australia's coral reefs in a changing ocean. Report prepared for the Australian Government Department of Sustainability, Environment, Water, Population and Communities on behalf of the State of the Environment 2011 Committee. Canberra: DSEWPaC, 2011. (AUSTRALIA)	The geographic scope of described coral bleaching has been expanded.
1052	61960	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS 1: There is no entry for climate impacts on Africa marine and coastal systems. Coral bleaching linked to El Nino, redistribution of fish stocks and abundance, could perhaps feature here if only in terms of ENSO linkage? (Matthew Bunce, Institute of Marine Engineering, Science and Technology)	No examples could be included within the cell based on the assessment of the underlying chapter, chapter 18. Discussion of marine and coastal systems is provided within Chapters 22 and 30.
1053	68048	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.5.: The table could be revised to provide the better understanding the relationship between the risks and adaptation issues discussed herein and temperature increased. (JAPAN)	This comment was misplaced, but the relevant tables are now Tables TS.4 and TS.5. The table structure has been very substantially revised to clarify presentation of information on risks and adaptation potential.
1054	68049	TS	86	0	0	0	Given the vast geographical coverage of Asia and hence the diversity of Asian subregions, examples for Asia should be provided for each sub-region when available. (JAPAN)	References to specific parts of Asia is made for examples included within this table, but full assessment across subregions could not be achieved within the concise table in the technical summary.
1055	68713	ΤS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.1, bottom row: The first sentence of the coastal and marine system cell needs to be replaced by "Mass bleaching of corals in Great Barrier Reef, changes in coral calcification rates (high confidence), and changes in coral disease dynamics (medium confidence)". (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example has been revised based on the updated assessment of chapter 18.
1056	68714	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.1, bottom row: snow depth actually declined at three out of four sites, not all four sites. Confidence for this is high, not medium. (NETHERLANDS)	The example has been revised to match the updated assessment of chapter 18.
1057	68715	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.1, bottom row: The categories used to analyse changes in the Chapter 25 are different to those used here (Chapter: morphology, geographic distribution, life cycles, marine productivity, vegetation change, freshwater communities, disease, coral reefs; TS: genetics, growth distribution, & phenology) (NETHERLANDS)	Reference is now more clearly provided to sources within chapter 18 and 25 in support of this example.
1058	68716	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.1, bottom row: : Chapter 25 also cites decreases in fish growth rates (see page 88); TS cites only increasing fish growth rates (like Table 18.8) (NETHERLANDS)	Reference is now more clearly provided to sources within chapters 18 and 25 in support of this example.
1059	68717	TS	86	0	0	0	For Table TS.1 in "Europe - Coastal & Marine Systems", Chapter 30.6.2.1.3 also support these points. (NETHERLANDS)	Further reference is now made to supporting sections of Chapter 30 and one of the oceans cross-chapter boxes (Box CC- MB).
1060	76460	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS.1 Comment - Does this table make any attempt to attribute what component of change is respon;sible for the impact? Changes in precipitation quality, rain /snow, temperature versus changes in snowpack for glacier retreat, etc? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Information on relevant climate drivers is provided within the underlying tables in Chapter 18. Within the technical summary, reference is made to the relative contribution of climate change versus other factors, but all information from the chapter 18 tables is not transcribed into the technical summary given page restrictions for the summary products.
1061	79919	TS	86	0	0	0	Table TS 1: Please state what is the time period for those observations. (NORWAY)	At appropriate levels of generalization given the different scopes of examples included, information on relevant time frames is included.
1062	80134	TS	86	0	0	0	Under Asia second column. "Shrinking mountain glaciers across Asia. Increase runoff in many rivers due to shrinking glaciers in the Himalayas & Central Asia". Comments. We should be careful about this statement, because glaciers in the Western Himalayas are presently not being impacted much from global warming. Similarly, the river flows in the Indus-River has also not been observed increasing because of shrinking glaciers. (Qamar uz Zaman Chaudhry, Ministry of Climate Change Government of Pakistan)	The traceable account for this statement is provided in detail in the referenced chapter sections.
#	ID	Ch			I To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
------	-------	----	----	---	--------------	------------	--	--
1063	68047	ΤS	86	0	86	0	No Asian examples are provided for food production systems and food security. A suggested addition is: "In Japan, where mean air temperature has risen at 1.15 degrees Celsius per the past 100 years, effects of recent warming in agriculture clearly exist (Chapter 24 Page 23 lines 29-35)" (JAPAN)	A specific example is now provided within this cell of the table.
1064	79346	TS	86	0	86	0	Table TS. 1, in the 'Europe' section on 'Coastal and Marine' the information on cod and eelpout seems very specific, given the high-level nature of the document. The shift in cod distribution (given a high confidence score) is actually quite controversial, and there is much argument about whether the shift is due to climate or depletion by the fishery. There is huge literature base on European fish distribution shifts, so the inclusion of these specific studies seems very narrow. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	A more appropriate level of generalization is now provided based on the abundant specific examples relevant to this cell within the table.
1065	64144	TS	86	0	87	0	Table TS.1: Please see our comments on Table SPM.1. (GERMANY)	Comments provided on this table within the summary for policymakers in the previous draft have been considered by authors of the underlying chapter and writing team members in revising the table.
1066	68718	TS	87	0	0	0	Table TS.1. Please, to consider if section 26.4.2 could be removed from references in Terrestrial Ecosystems, Drought, & Wildfire section. Despite that in this section is clear that distribution of cold and hot water fish (page 17, line 52-53), and that the abundance and productivity of Salmon (pages 18, 28-29) are changing by climate change. There are no studies that support strongly "the shifts in the species distribution in northward latitude for these taxa". (NETHERLANDS)	Supporting references have been updated for this cell within the table.
1067	68719	TS	87	0	0	0	In Table TS 1. Region: Polar Regions: 'Impact on livelihoods of Arctic indigenous peoples' [18.4.5, Box 18-5] is mentioned in the last column with title 'Human Systems'. This reference indication is however incorrect and should be [18.4.7, Table 18-5] instead of [18.4.5, Box 18-5], since there is no mention of impact on livelihoods of Arctic indigenous peoples in section 18.4.5 (this should be section 18.4.7) and Box 18-5 discusses how indigenous Arctic peoples perceive climate change impacts and does not specifically address the impacts of climate change on their livelihoods (see Table 18-5 for this, at page 85 of chapter 18). (NETHERLANDS)	References provided for this example have been updated.
1068	68720	TS	87	0	0	0	Table TS1 row8 col5: add ", dengue and yellow fever" to the sentence " increase in frequency and extension of malaria" (NETHERLANDS)	Based on the revision of the underlying chapter, this example is no longer included within the table.
1069	70683	ΤS	87	0	0	0	Table TS1. page 2, line 3 (Polar regions), column 2: table mentions that lakes will be created in areas of formerly frozen peat. This is not correct. Instead of frozen peat, should be frozen ground (or permafrost). Similar problem to SPM1 table (Goncalo Vieira, University of Lisbon)	The traceable count supporting this example can be found within the underlying assessment as referenced in table 18-6.
1070	68050	TS	87	0	87	0	In Table TS.1, the term "foraminifera shells" should be replaced with a formal academic term "foraminiferal shells". (JAPAN)	Wording has been changed accordingly.
1071	64145	TS	88	0	0	0	Table TS.2: 1) It seems more logical to change the order of the columns Meteorology and IMPACTS. 2) The impact of the 2003 heat wave (hot summer) in Europe is stated with 70,000 excess deaths. In Table 23-5 in chapter 23 (Europe), page 87 in comparison there are stated 35,000 deaths for the same 2003 summer. These statements have to be coherent. 3) It is not clear, if the confidence statement relates to the statement itself or to the extreme event's / anthropogenic contribution to the statement. (GERMANY)	This table is no longer included within the technical summary.
1072	76461	тs	88	0	0	0	Table TS.2 Comment - Suggest including hurricanes Sandy, Katrina, Mississippi floods, midwest drought in 2011, 2012. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This table is no longer included within the technical summary.
1073	78535	TS	88	0	0	0	Table TS.2: As the person responsible for the compilation of this table in Ch18, I am a bit surprised to see it featured in the TS. Within the chapter the table is given as a possibly bold but defensible example of where research into the risk of impacts from extreme events is potentially heading; I hope it comes across that way. We have indeed included confidence assessments, but again this is included more as an example of what can be done rather than a definitive across-the-board assessment; for instance think of all of the events we have not included and the selection issues involved. As a reader, the presence of this table in the TS implies to me that the content is systematic and representative of the impact role of extreme weather events and their link to climate change (I know the caption starts with "illustrative", but still). It may or may not be representative but it is definitely not systematic: the protocol for selection depends explicitly on using occurrence of the weather event and of severe associated damage as evidence. (Dáithí Stone, University of Cape Town)	

#	ID	Ch		From Line	n To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1074	80135	TS	88	0	0	0	2010 – Pakistan . Last column: (Confidence in contribution of anthropogenic emissions to extreme weather event. " very low". This should be either" medium or low" instead of very low. Third column- Impact/damage- Total loss be 10 US\$ billion instead of 40 US\$ billion. (Qamar uz Zaman Chaudhry, Ministry of Climate Change Government of Pakistan)	This table is no longer included within the technical summary.
1075	68051	ΤS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3.: In the Early Warning Systems for Heat table, the Description box should also include Asia in the last line, "Warning systems for heat waves have in used in" as they have been developed in Asia as well - for example, in the Sarawak river system as herein discussed (Chapter 24 page 11 line 14). (JAPAN)	The text has been amended accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1076	68163	TS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3 lists no adaptation practice arising from Asia. Considering the fact that Asia is vulnerable to climate change, it is suggested to add Asian cases on adaptation practice taking into account relevant chapters, such as Chapter 24. (CHINA)	Further relevant mentions of adaptation in Asia have been added to several of the examples. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1077	68721	TS	89	0	0	0	from the chapter, 11.3.2 covers current health status but it is mentioned in the TS in relation to cyclones. (NETHERLANDS)	This reference refers to WGI chapter 11.3.2. Enhanced clarity of referencing has been ensured. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1078	68722	TS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3. Third row. There is no discussion in the Chapter of an observed increase in heat waves or warm spells, except for a reference to AR4. Perhaps the discussion of temperature extremes needs to be joined or aligned with heat waves. (NETHERLANDS)	The reference supporting this statement has been clarified. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1079	68723	TS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Fourth row. Not clear what the evidence is that warning systems for heat waves have been used in Australia. There are references to a Heat Health alert system and to attention being given to developing early warning plans; these don't seem exactly the same as "have been used" (NETHERLANDS)	The wording has been updated accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1080	76462	ΤS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Comment - The last bullet in broader context is confusing - what are "mangrove bioshields?" It would be useful if this example also included mention of the multiple benefits provided by mangrove ecosystems (in addition to coastal proection) - such as habitat for juvenile fishes, etc. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The sentence has been deleted. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1081	76463	TS	89	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Comment - The text and the table are redundant. The table is too long and might only have value through the use of hyper links. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Interactions between the material in the text and table have been improved. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1082	64146	TS	89	0	93	0	Table TS.3: Please see our comments on Table SPM.2. (GERMANY)	The table provides illustrative examples that can be thoroughly supported across the report's assessment. Confidence levels have been updated for retained statements on climate information. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1083	68724	TS	90	0	0	0	Under the BROADER CONTEXT this statement 'Mangrove bioshields created from exotic species can detrimentally impact native ecosystems.' is contradictory with 29.7.2 (page 29 line 12 to 13). (NETHERLANDS)	The sentence has been deleted. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1084	76464	TS	90	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Comment - Community-based adaptation—Climate information at the global scale. The number of intense tropical cyclones may have already increased within the last several decades and is likely to increase further in the future (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The assessment of this material occurs in WGI, with cross reference provided here. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1085	68052	TS	90	0	90	0	Table TS.3: Mangrove restoration to reduce flood risks and protect shorelines from storm surge: CLIMATE INFORMATION AT THE REGIONAL SCALE: Projected: AND Table TS.3: Community-based adaptation and traditional practices in small island contexts: CLIMATE INFORMATION AT THE REGIONAL SCALE: Projected: "In the North Atlantic and the EASTERN part of the North Pacific, the frequency of category 4/5 tropical cyclones is projected to increase" should be "In the North Atlantic and the WESTERN part of the North Pacific, the frequency of category 4/5 tropical cyclones is projected to increase" should be "In the North Atlantic and the WESTERN part of the North Pacific, the frequency of category 4/5 tropical cyclones is projected to increase." According to Box.14.2 Figure 1 (p. 14-191) and Figure TS.19 (p. TS-98) of WG1 SOD, projected changes in Category 4-5 TC frequency is assessed for Global, North Atlantic and Western North Pacific, and not for Eastern North Pacific due to insufficient data. (JAPAN)	The sentence has been deleted. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1086	80477	TS	92	0	92	0	For the insurance scheme, incentives for reducing risk are mentioned: while this is true theoretically, in practice these have not really been shown to be important and working. As risk reduction is crucial, I would put a caveat, such as 'theoretically" in here, and also mention this under challenges. (Reinhard Mechler, INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR APPLIED SYSTEMS ANALYSIS)	The statement has been further qualified. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	I TO Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1087	63033	ΤS	93	0	0	0	Table TS-3: On Page 93 in the section of the table headed "Climate information at the regional scale" an observed "Mean temperature invcrease of 0.9°C per decade over Australia since 1911" is reported. I assume this number should be 0.09°C per decade ? (I'm pretty sure that Australia has not warmed by 9°C degrees total over the past century!). (David Wratt, NIWA, New Zealand)	The sentence has been corrected. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1088	68725	ΤS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 In the section "Relocation of agriculture industries in Australia" of Table SPM.2, under projected sub-heading, fifth sentenced needs to be changed as follows: Increase in intensity of rare daily rainfall extremes (high confidence) and of short duration (sub-daily) extremes (medium confidence) in Australia and New Zealand" (see Table 25-1, 25.5.1). (NETHERLANDS)	The statement has been revised to match the table in Chapter 25. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1089	68726	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 In the section "Relocation of agriculture industries in Australia" of Table TS.3, level of confidence (high) needs to be added at the sentence beginning "Freshwater resources" (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence has been revised accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1090	68727	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Observed temperature change should be 0.09 degrees per decade, not 0.9 (NETHERLANDS)	The sentence has been corrected. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1091	68728	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Inconsistency in baseline timeframes reported i.e. it is in some cases (e.g. since 1911) but not in others (e.g. for cool extremes the timeframe is since 1950, but this is not cited) (NETHERLANDS)	Baselines used reflect the assessment in the underlying chapters. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1092	68729	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Re: observed heavy precipitation trends, the snglects to mention trends that are mixed or not significant; these are reported in the Chapter 25 (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence has been revised accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1093	68730	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 RE: projected extreme rainfall: not all measures of extreme rainfall from Chapter 25 are reported here in TS (NETHERLANDS)	More measures are now included. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1094	68731	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Re: freshwater resources, SPM states "highly populated southeast", Chapter 25 states "far southeast" (NETHERLANDS)	This sentence has been revised accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1095	76465	TS	93	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Comment - Freshwater resources entry (under Regional Climate Information) is missing a confidence statement. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This sentence has been revised accordingly. The relevant table is now Table TS.2.
1096	58951	TS	94	0	0	0	Table TS.4. In Adaptation/Social/Educational section, after 'awareness raising' add "and specific guidance" (Kevin Ronan, CQUniversity Australia)	Substantial further specificity has been included for examples within this entry based on examples available within the assessment across the report. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1097	58952	TS	94	0	0	0	Table TS.4. In Transformation/Spheres of change/Personal after 'responses.' add "Educate children." (Kevin Ronan, CQUniversity Australia)	Although education is featured within the table, broader wording is retained within this entry based on assessment available in the underlying chapters. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1098	64147	TS	94	0	0	0	Table TS.4: See our comments on Table SPM.3. (GERMANY)	These comments have been considered in the revision of this table. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1099	68054	TS	94	0	0	0	If the concepts of the ecosystem management approach and ecosystem based approach are different, the clarification is necessary. If not, the terms should be unified. (JAPAN)	The broader term "ecosystem management" is maintained for the vulnerability reduction portion of the table. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1100	68732	TS	94	0	0	0	Block Transformation. Note that the idea of steering transformations that take place in these spheres of change (pratical, political, personal) is based on 1 source (O'Brien and Sygna, forthcoming) according to p. 24 of Chapter 20 and fig 20-2. (NETHERLANDS)	Further references made to supporting sections across chapters in the underlying report. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1101	76466	TS	94	0	0	0	Table TS.4 Comment - What does: "low regrets options to reduce structural inequalities" mean?; Insurance schemes sounds sinister. Are maintaining wetlands, etc the only ecosystem management options? What about forests, rangelands, etc?; Are brushfire fuel reductions as important as forest fuel reduction?; What is a social safety net? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The 1st phrase referenced here is no longer used. Further examples are provided for ecosystem management in the revised table. Further explanation of phrasing used can be found within the context of assessment in the cited chapter sections. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1102	68053	TS	94	0	94	0	Table TS.4 "River improvement works, construction of reservoirs, enhancement of flood projection technique, promotion of safer ways of residing, retention of rain water run off, construction of drainage pumping stations" and "Amount of future sea level rise should be incorporated when renewing coastal facilities" should be added in appropriate lines. (JAPAN)	A much larger number of examples is not provided, reflecting the types of examples cited here. The relevant table is now Table TS.7.
1103	64148	TS	95	0	0	0	Table TS.5: Please see our comments on Table SPM.4. Within the box risk/human system/global right at the bottom "reduction of disease-carrying vectors" should be deleted, since this pronouncement cannot be found in chapter 11.5. as such. (GERMANY)	In the revised table corresponding to this example (table 4 within the technical summary), this specific example is no longer included.

ΤS 96 0 0 0

ΤS 96 0 0 0 (NETHERLANDS)

1112

1113

68734

68735

#	ID	Ch			n To		Comment	Response
1104	68733	TS	Page 95	0	0 0	0	See the box about cross-sectoral risks, region: global, first paragraph). It says that between 20-60% of the physical impacts can be potentially avoided. In the body of the chapter, though, different percentages for avoided impacts are mentioned (from 20-70%, or 30-80%, etc.) Chapter 19, page 47, lines 36-41. It is not clear why in the summary 60% is chosen as the maximum value for avoided impacts. When generalizing, one should take the extreme values, in this case 20% and 80%, to indicate potential avoidment of impacts. (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included in the revised technical summary table.
1105	76467	TS	95	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Comment - This table is not only egregiously long, but it adds little value. We suggest removing this table. Additionally, the invocation of "era of climate responsibility" and "era of climate options" are new terms that are neither intuitive nor clear. Also, "climate drivers" typically do not go beyond GHG and other forcers. How is precipitation or sea level a "climate driver"? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This table has been very substantially revised in its approach to characterizing risks and potential for adaptation clearly and concisely. Phrasing used has been clarified for the description of time frames and for the climate-related drivers of impacts.
1106	79920	ΤS	95	0	0	0	Table TS 5: Good table, but somewhat difficult to grasp. It is particularly hard to understand why there are sometimes four columns (2 +2) and sometimes only two. When only two: are we lacking information for the other period? Please clarify. (NORWAY)	The table structure has been very substantially revised to improve accessibility and clarity. Information across time frames is provided in all cases now.
1107	79347	TS	95	0	99	0	TABLE TS.5 'the era and adaptation potential column uses graphics to communicate the level of risk and adaptation potential and severity of CC over time. I found I had to repeatedly x-ref to the legend to understand the meaning, since they are not especially accessible. Given this, it might be better to alter the graphics or accept that x-reference is needed and replace thegraphics with simpler, more distinct symbols which are easier to discern from each other. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The table structure has been very substantially revised to improve accessibility and clarity. Assessment of risk levels across time frames is substantially clearer now.
1108	59810	ΤS	95	0	101	0	Table TS5 - It is not clear why some rows show two 'Era and adaptation' graphs and some only show one. (AUSTRALIA)	The table structure has been very substantially revised to improve accessibility and clarity, thereby addressing the specific point raised here as well.
1109	68055	TS	95	0	101	0	Table TS.5 In this table, more other "Climate Drivers" which cause remarkable current and potential comprehensive risks should be listed as the remarkable "Climate Drivers" in each region, in order to avoid misunderstandings by the Policy Makers that existing current serious risks and increasing risks are negligible or alleviated as the result of future climate change without considering positive impacts by the drivers. For example, freshwater resources and systems in Asia are significantly vulnerable to tropical cyclones and the future change of intensity and frequency of them, however, only temperature is listed as "Climate Drivers" in the corresponding column in page 25. [Risks - Coastal and Marine systems are significant vulnerable not only to Sea level but also to the cyclones.] (JAPAN)	The presentation of regional key risks within Table TS.5 has been revised to highlight several of the most substantial key risks for each region, with cyclones as a climate-related driver included in the key risk presented for Asia.
1110	68056	ΤS	95	0	101	0	Table TS.5.: There is far too little discussion of Asia in the table as a whole. Given the vast geographic and climatic diversity of the Asian continent, it can not be represented by one single example and therefore, examples representing each subregion should be provided where possible. (JAPAN)	The presentation of regional key risks within Table TS.5 has been revised to highlight several key risks for each region, with improved balance of examples across regions.
1111	68058	TS	96	0	0	0	Table TS.5.: The single Central Asian example provided as a regional example of risks for freshwater resources and systems is insufficient to represent the vast diversity of the Asian continent. Suggested additions representing the various subregions are: "Throughout much of Russia, a warmer climate would decrease water availability due to the increase in evaporation but on the other hand precipitation would increase which tends to increase water availability." (Chapter 24 page 10 lines 19-22); "In China, a projection (A2, PRECIS) suggests that there will be insufficient water for agriculture in the 2020s and 2040s due to the increases in water demand for non-agricultural uses, although positive trends in precipitation may occur in some areas."; and "In a study of the Mahanandi River Basin in India, the future water availability projection (A2, CGCM2) indicated an escalating trend in excess river runoff (runoff after meeting water demand), thereby increasing the future possibility of floods	The presentation of regional key risks within Table TS.5 has been revised to highlight several key risks for each region, with improved balance of examples across regions.

for the month of September, yet the outcomes for April indicate an accelerating water scarcity." (JAPAN)

water or flooding. Reference should be removed? (NETHERLANDS)

Table TS.5 - Risks - Freshwater resources and systems - Europe: "Climate change is likely to further increase coastal and river

Table TS.5 - Risks - Freshwater resources and systems - Europe: reference to section 23.8.3, but in that section no mention of

flood risk", ok for coastal flood risk, but river flood risk is equally or more determined by "changes in population and

economic growth" (see Ch.23 p.13 lines 8-10) and "no causal role for climate" was mentioned in Table 23-6 (p.89)

The revised key risk presented for Europe reflects the

exposure in determining the risk.

risk for Europe.

importance of human-related influences on vulnerability and

Referencing has been checked and revised for the related key

#	ID	Ch	From Page		n To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1114	68057	ΤS		0	96	0	For Asia, "Increases in frequency and intensity of torrential rainfall, an increase in number of dry days, a decrease in maximum snow depth, increases of flood scale and frequency are projected." should be mentioned. (JAPAN)	Although these factors are related to the key risks for Asia, the revised table approach identifies several key risks for each region based on the assessment of the underlying chapter.
1115	68736	TS	97	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Terrestrial ecosystems, drought & wildfire - Europe: "wildfires in Southern Europe (high confidence)", section 23.4.4 mentions that changes in fire occurrence are "often difficult to precisely quantify" (Ch.23 p.23 line 8), change to "medium confidence"? (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included.
1116	68737	ΤS	97	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Terrestrial ecosystems, drought & wildfire - Europe: "and from storms (low confidence)", section 23.4.4 mentions impact of storms only in Central Europe (Ch.23 p.23 lines 18-25), change to "and from storms in Central Europe (low confidence)"? (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included.
1117	68738	ΤS	97	0	0	0	Table TS.3 Australasia row, states endemic species are a risk of extinction but we find no reference to this, only that native species face this risk. There is reference to "local species extinctions" but we don't think this is necessarily the same thing. It is ambiguous, could mean extinction in a localised area. (NETHERLANDS)	This comment actually applies to Table TS.5. "Native" is now used within the corresponding key risk in the technical summary.
1118	68739	TS	97	0	0	0	Table TS.5 In the table under Australasia, fire weather has been interpreted as wildfire - and we don't think they are the same thing? XX (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included.
1119	68059	ΤS	97	0	97	0	For Asia, "Decreases of drought river discharges and river discharge are projected." should be added. (JAPAN)	In the revised table format, several key risks are presented for each region, with a drought-related key risk included for Asia.
1120	68740	TS	98	0	0	0	First row in the table. The sentence states the following: 'direct global cost of coastal flooding may reach 300 US\$ billion per year in 2100 without adaptation and 90 US\$ billion per year with adaptation under a 1.26 m sea-level rise scenario'. In Chapter 5 these amounts (90 billion, 300 billion) are only mentioned with respect to a sea level rise of 0.6 to 1.3 m (see Table 5.8) and thus not '1.26 m'. Next to the fact that the 1.26 is mentioned in another perspective (cost estimation only for Africa), the bold statement made in the TS is only based on one reference, while Table 5.8 shows the broad ranges in cost estimates if also e.g. submergence is taken into account. It seems therefore innapropriate to state only the numbers 90/300 billion. Suggestion: include the broad cost estimations, taking into consideration more impacts of sea-level rise. (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included in the table.
1121	68741	ΤS	98	0	0	0	Second row in the table. The sentence states: 'While developed countries are expected to be able to adapt to even high levels of sea-level rise'. This information cannot be found in Section 5.4.3 of 5.5.3 or anywhere else in Chapter 5. Nowhere it is stated that developed countries are expected to be able to deal with high sea level rises. (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included in the table.
1122	68742	ΤS	98	0	0	0	For Table TS.5: Chapter 30.6.6 and Figure 30-15 should be added as the source as well for Global point "Changes in ocean mixing" (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included in the table.
1123	79921	TS	98	0	0	0	Table TS.5, Under "Coastal and marine systems" - 6th row under "global", 2nd column ("risks"): Please explain how can deoxygenation of deep waters and spread of hypoxic zones be positive for some fisheries. (NORWAY)	This example is no longer included in the table.
1124	58072	TS	98	0	98	0	Coastal systems: no information about Latin America and Caribbean region (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	In the revised version of the regional key risk table, several key risks are now presented for each region, reflecting the assessment of the underlying chapter.
1125	68061	ΤS	99	0	0	0	Table TS.5.: The box for "Asia" under "RISKS: COASTAL & MARINE SYSTEMS" discusses only the Arctic region while the text highlights the impacts of coastal flooding. Therefore, it is suggested that the following risk is added to the table: "By 2100, without adaptation, the majority of people projected to be affected by coastal flooding and displaced due to inundation and erosion will be in East, Southeast, and South Asia [5.4.3.1]." (JAPAN)	In the revised version of the regional key risk table, several key risks are now presented for each region, reflecting the assessment of the underlying chapter. For Asia, a flooding- related key risk is included, reflecting a broadly-based assessment of risk.

FIRST-ORDER DRAFT

#	ID	Ch		From Line			Comment	Response
1126	68062	TS	99		0	0	Table TS.5.: The single Asian Arctic example provided as a regional example of risks for coastal and marine systems is insufficient to represent the vast diversity of the Asian continent. Considering the importance of Asia, in terms of its dominating the global production of food from both capture fisheries and aquaculture, and the highlight on coastal flooding in Chapter 5, more examples should be introduced from Asia. Suggested additions representing the various subregions are: "Sea-level rise is expected to impact both capture fisheries and aquaculture production in river deltas." (Chapter 24 page 27 lines 14-15); "For marine capture fisheries, climate change may lead to a massive redistribution of fisheries catch potential, with large increases in high-latitude regions, including Asian Russia, and large declines in the tropics, particularly Indonesia." (Chapter 24 page 27 lines 15-19); "By 2100, without adaptation, the majority of people projected to be affected by coastal flooding and displaced due to inundation and erosion will be in East, Southeast, and South Asia." (Chapter 5 page 3 lines 23-25) (JAPAN)	In the revised version of the regional key risk table, several key risks are now presented for each region, reflecting the assessment of the underlying chapter. Beyond the flooding- related key risk for Asia, risks for coastal and Ocean systems are reflected in both table 4 and table 5 within the technical summary.
1127	68743	TS	99	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Under Australasia, there is a misinterpretation of text: the original text says evidence is limited about the ability of reefs to respond to CC, but the claim is that a reef's ability to respond is limited. (NETHERLANDS)	The revised wording is correct in reflecting the assessment of the underlying chapter.
1128	68744	TS	99	0	0	0	For Table TS.5: Box CC-OA should be added as the source as well for Australasia point "Significant change" (NETHERLANDS)	The referenced chapter sections present a full traceable account of the assessment supporting this key risk.
1129	76468	TS	99	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Comment - Coastal and Marine Systems. Region: Australasia. Risks from sea level rise very likely continuing beyond 2100 even with temperature stabalization is true globally, not just for this region. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This text is no longer included. Assessed risk levels focus on change throughout the 21st century, although information on sea level rise commitment beyond 2100 is provided elsewhere in the 5th assessment report, especially in the working group 1 contribution.
1130	76469	ΤS	99	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Comment - Coastal and Marine Systems: Asia-Arctic. The statement about sea level rise and coastal erosion is probably true as well for the Arctic coasts of Alaska and Canada (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The revised approach to the regional key risk table features several key risks for each region, not aiming to comprehensively characterize all risks across all regions.
1131	76470	ΤS	99	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Comment - Coastal and Marine Systems: Austalasia. The statement on managed retreat also applies globally. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The revised approach to the regional key risk table features several key risks for each region, not aiming to comprehensively describe all risks across all regions.
1132	66250	TS	99	0	99	0	Table TS.5, first cell. I question the general validity of this statement, even if restricted to Europe: "Climate Change will not entail relocation of fishing fleets (high confidence)". (same statement as on page 40). (Geir Ottersen, Institute of Marine Research)	This example is no longer included.
1133	68060	TS	99	0	99	0	For Asia, "Increases in the magnitudes of severe storm surge anomalies, and increases of extreme wave heights are projected." should be mentioned. (JAPAN)	In the revised approach for the regional key risk table, several key risks are highlighted for each region. The 1st key risk for Asia incorporates this point.
1134	79348	TS	99	0	99	0	Table TS. 5, in the 'Europe' section. I strongly disagree that climate change will not entail "relocation of fishing fleets" as this would be very context specific and in certain parts of Europe we are seeing some changes in fleet behaviour/location to make the most of new opportunities (e.g. in the UK). Perhaps "not necessarily entail relocation" would be better. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This example is no longer included.
1135	68064	TS	100		0	0	Table TS 5.: The box for "Asia" under "RISKS: HUMAN SYSTEMS" should also include the projected impacts on food production as a result of saltwater intrusion, especially in deltas. (JAPAN)	In the revised approach for the regional key risk table, several key risks are highlighted for each region, not aiming to comprehensively describe all risks across all regions. This topic is relevant to but not identical to the 3 key risks highlighted for Asia.
1136	68745	ΤS	100	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: "Climate change will increase problems associated with overheating in domestic housing", no confidence level given (see Ch.23 p.3 line 43) (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1137	68746	TS	100	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: "but decrease cereal yields in Southern Europe", in Ch.23 p.18 line 30 speaks of yield loss in general, not only cereals (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch	From	From Line		To	Comment	Response
1138	68747	TS	100		0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: "Climate change will inhibit thermal power production during summer", word "inhibit" is too strong, should be "decrease", Ch.23 p.15 line 28-30 mentions a "6-19% decrease of the summer average usable capacity of power plants" and "lower figures have also been estimated" (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1139	68748	ΤS	100	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: "Increasing damage of cultural buildings and loss of cultural landscapes across most sub-regions by 2050 (medium emissions)", 2050 and medium emissions not mentioned in section 23.5.4 or Table 23-5 (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1140	68749	ΤS	100	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: Reference to Table 23-5 not correct, should be Table 23-4? (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1141	68750	ΤS	100	0	0	0	Table TS.5 - Risks - Human systems - Europe: " Including buildings, local industries, landscapes, and iconic places such as Venice": Section 23.5.4, page 28 line 35, states that Venice previously was vulnerable to flooding, but that adaptation measures have now been taken and that the frequency of storm surges may decrease, so that now the climate change impact on Venice is estimated to be smaller, suggest to skip the reference to Venice. (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1142	68063	TS	100	0	101	0	Table TS.5.: Asia should preferably been presented in subregions, representing the diverse geographical and climatic features of the vast continent. Suggested additions for risks in human systems to represent the various subregions are: "Climate change is expected to impact water resources, and thus the viability of agricultural livelihoods in the Asian region in a major way. Diminishing Himalayan glaciers would impact the agricultural water supply and food security of more than one billion people in Asia." (Chapter 9 page 9 lines 48 to page10 line 3); "Many Asian countries are major tourist destinations and more studies are needed to understand the impact of climate change on tourism. With respect to beach tourism, large developing countries and small islands states may be among the most vulnerable due to high exposure and low adaptive capacity. A number of Asian countries were found vulnerable in this regard." (Chapter 24 page 31 lines 53, page 32 line 2) (JAPAN)	In the revised approach for the regional key risk table, several key risks are highlighted for each region. The 1st example suggested in this comment is partially reflected in the 3rd example presented for Asia.
1143	63166	ΤS	101	0	0	0	Table TS 5 - Risk - Human Systems Polar Regions section - Is reference being made to thawing permafrost here as well as loss of sea ice? Revise sentence "where sea ice loss and thawing permafrost disrupt transportation" (Sharon Smith, Geological Survey of Canada)	This specific example is no longer included.
1144	68751	ΤS	101	0	0	0	Table TS.5 Australasia row, reference to "food production" seems a little alarmist because we can only find reference to the effects of water availability on "agriculture production" which includes animal and human food production, fibre, biofuel production, etc. (NETHERLANDS)	This specific example is no longer included.
1145	79922	ΤS	101	0	0	0	Table TS.5, 2nd row under "Polar regions" in the first column, 2nd column ("risks"): exchange "hunting" with "ice dependent" to generate " ice dependent marine mammals." since this statement is true for more species than polar bears. (NORWAY)	This specific example is no longer included.
1146	58073	TS	101	0	101	0	Central and South America. The cell with adaptation issues and prospects is empty. Similar general comments as in the other regions can be added, such as adequate watershed management, water management at the household level to diminish the risk of dengue etc (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	In the revised table, content has been provided for all cells.
1147	64149	TS	102	0	0	0	Table TS.6: The caption should state that these are projections. Uncertainty information must be added to each statement, maybe add little stars to the arrows with the number of stars indicating the confidence level. In addition, please improve the caption, explain "medium emissions" in terms of RCP, the second line is incomprehensible (What does "No further planned adaptation" mean, is there any adaptation considered?). The arrows should be explained above the table as part of the caption, and be smaller. Why does this table state that there is "no relevant literature found" for air quality? Maybe you mean that the literature is inconclusive, because there is a wealth of studies on this topic. Please revise. (GERMANY)	This table is no longer included in the technical summary.
1148	76471	ΤS	102	0	0	0	Table TS.6 Comment - This table is too subjective and distracting. Additionally, the footnote explicitly states that "no relevant literature found"(!). It is difficult to understand how something of this nature can be included with such prominence in the report. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This table is no longer included in the technical summary.
1149	68065	ΤS	102	0	104	0		In the revised approach taken for regional key risks, several key risks are presented for each region, based on assessment available in the underlying chapters, thereby addressing this imbalance. See Table TS.5.

	/GII AR5	Tech			,	-		FIRST-ORDER DRA
#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	TO Page		Comment	Response
150	64150	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7: In the current form, this table is not very useful: It looks pretty with all the colors and little pictograms, but there is too much information in this table, and the text is too small. Information on how risk has been assessed and uncertainty MUST be indicated for each statement. The ample-colored bars should become greener towards the bottom of the table, but are not really - there seems to be a conceptual problem. The explanation on the horizontal/thick bars is unclear. It is not really clear why the forth row shows pairs of colors bars. Please use yellow/red colors not rainbow for the risk scale as in the RFC figure. (GERMANY)	Instead, a revised approach for a regional key risk table has been adopted, achieving a substantially clarified presentation
151	68752	ΤS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Top row, last column. Not clear what the evidence is for (lack of) genetic adaptation in corals (NETHERLANDS)	This phrase is no longer used. See Table TS.5.
152	68753	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Top row, last column. TS does not mention options from Chapter 25: translocation, shading, forecasting (NETHERLANDS)	The corresponding key risk in the regional key risk table, which is broader in scope, provides reference to these types of options. See Table TS.5.
153	68754	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Second row, last column. Text makes it sound as if predator control is a stress. Reword to "pests and diseases, predator control and". (NETHERLANDS)	Improved wording has been adopted in the corresponding key risk in the regional key risk table, which is broader in scope. See Table TS.5.
.154	68755	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Third row, last column. Not clear what the evidence is for trade-offs between different (wildfire) management objectives and settlement patterns and goals (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included.
155	68756	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Fourth row, last column. "Unlimited water demand" might be misleading. Suggest rewording to "very high water demand" or similar. (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included.
156	68757	ΤS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Fifth row, last column. Not clear what the evidence is for transport and power infrastructure already being at coping limit in many regions, or that there are significant financial costs from future upgrades. (NETHERLANDS)	This example is no longer included. See Table TS.5.
157	68758	ΤS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. Sixth row, last column. TS states "protection and accommodation of increased risk". Chapter states "re-balancing protection from and accommodation or avoidance of flood risk" (NETHERLANDS)	Wording adopted in the corresponding key risk in the revised regional key risk table is fully supported by the underlying chapter assessment. See Table TS.5.
158	68759	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7 contains text from other areas which have inconsistencies, as noted in other comments (NETHERLANDS)	Full support of examples included in the revised regional key risk table has been ensured. See Table TS.5.
159	68760	ΤS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. This is a very complex figure, particularly the narrow/thick/multiple horizontal bars. (NETHERLANDS)	This table is no longer included. The revised regional key risk table has presentation of information that is substantially clarified to ensure its accessibility for the reader. See Table TS.5.
160	68761	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7. It is possibly confusing to refer to very high risk in fully adapted state. Suggest clearly stating what the hypothetical fully adapted state refers to. It is tempting to interpret it as 'risks reduced to very low'. (NETHERLANDS)	This table is no longer included. But in the revised regional key risk table, improved phrasing is used to describe current versus high adaptation. See Table TS.5.
.161	76472	TS	104	0	0	0	Table TS.7 Comment - (Aus & NZ): Seems repetetive with Table TS.5 (All Regions). Suggest a merger of tables. Is the term "key" here used as it is in Chapter 19 (i.e., caused by an anthropogenic change)? The TS needs to be consistent with the	A single table of regional key risks is now presented. Criteria for key risks included within this table are the criteria presented

28 March - 24 May 2013

Page 80 of 90

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
1165	76473	TS	0	0	0	0	Table TS.8: Seems repetetive with Table TS.5. Some kind of merge. Also, is the term "key" here used as it is in Chapter 19 (i.e., caused by an anthropogenic change)? The TS needs to be consistent with the underlying chapters. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Improved distinction across the key risk tables has been achieved, with this table illustrating the key risks presented in section B-1, drawing through to vulnerabilities and emergent risks as well. Criteria for terminology within this table corresponds exactly to the criteria are presented in chapter 19. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1166	79924	TS	105	0	0	0	Table TS.8, 1st row under "rising air, soil and water temperature", 4th column ("emergent risks"): include "Ecosystem change and loss of ecosystem services". (NORWAY)	The concept of ecosystem services is now more clearly represented within examples in the table. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1167	79925	ΤS	105	0	0	0	Table TS.8: Please consider including examples from Central and South America? (NORWAY)	In the revised table, further integration across regions has been achieved, with presentation of risks and vulnerabilities that span sectors and regions. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1168	63167	TS	106	0	0	0	Table TS 8 - Examples from Asia - It is suggested that the key risk related to permafrost thaw be revised to "infrastructure on ice-rich permafrost". This is important because issues of infrastructure integrity are more important where permafrost is ice-rich as the ground is more likely to settle as it thaws resulting in deformation of foundations etc. (Sharon Smith, Geologica Survey of Canada)	In the revised table, further integration across regions has been achieved, with presentation of risks and vulnerabilities that I span sectors and regions. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1169	58074	ΤS	106	0	106	0	No examples from Latin America and Caribbean region and there are plenty in the literature. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	In the revised table, further integration across regions has been achieved, with presentation of risks and vulnerabilities that span sectors and regions. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1170	59811	TS	106	0	106	0	Strongly support mention of the need to consider cumulative impacts across time, space and governance scales in assessments and actions, e.g. such as text which appears in the rightmost box on Australasian examples in table on page 106. This is important for marine (especially inshore) and coastal systems. (AUSTRALIA)	Aggregate impacts are addressed most comprehensively in the context of the reasons for concern, with linkages between this table and the reasons for concern further clarified as described in the text of section B-1. The relevant table is now Table TS.3.
1171	64152	TS	107	0	0	0	Table TS.9. Please replace "perceived risk to public health" in the upper right box by "real or perceived risk to public health". Your statement is a political one and thus not appropriate within an IPCC report, as currently risk to public health cannot be excluded. (GERMANY)	This table is no longer included in the technical summary.
1172	58075	TS	107	0	107	0	The same comments than for the summary for decision makers in table 6SPM Coasts: a fourth option is not included. This option is to leave the coastal ecosystems as they are and promote their conservation. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	This table is no longer included in the technical summary.
1173	76474	TS	108	0	0	0	Table TS.10 Comment - Suggest simplifying and generalizing to shorten (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Overarching introductory conclusions have been added to each entry. Examples have been further tightened, although additional categories of interactions have been featured in the table. The relevant table is now Table TS.8.
1174	77356	TS	108	0	0	0	There are two projects in Ecuador that are working directly with water management to increase the resilience of communities. (Maria Jose Galarza, Ministerio del Ambiente del Ecuador)	Featured examples are drawn from the most salient examples in the underlying assessment. The relevant table is now Table TS.8.
1175	68763	TS	109	0	0	0	Table TS.10 orange part: PES statement refers to Central and South America. Reference paragraphs 17.5.2 and 17.5.4 refer to	The statement is supported by the references to Chapter 27.
1176	68764	TS	109	0	0	0	developing countries and not specifically to Latin-America. (NETHERLANDS) Table TS.10 orange part: Only the beneficial effects of a PES are summarized in this table while reference paragraph 17.5.4 states that PES approaches in developing countries have met with mixed success. (NETHERLANDS)	The relevant table is now Table TS.8. Challenges are now referenced more explicitly. The relevant table is now Table TS.8.
1177	68765	TS	109	0	0	0	Table TS.10 orange part: Only the beneficial effects of a PES are summarized in this table while reference paragraph 17.5.4 states that PES approaches in developing countries have met with mixed success. (NETHERLANDS)	Challenges are now referenced more explicitly. The relevant table is now Table TS.8.
1178	68766	TS	109	0	0	0	Table TS.10 Bottom row. TS states land cover change can affect catchment yields. Chapter states increased sequestration is projected to reduce catchment yields. (NETHERLANDS)	Harmonization with assessment in the underlying chapter has been checked and ensured. The relevant table is now Table TS.8.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From	n To Page		Comment	Response
1179	70362	ΤS	110		0	0	Box TS.1, Figure 1. Use an equal-area projection to accurately present the world. The current map inaccurately portrays surface areas and the relative areas of land and sea and of various continents with one another. (Patrick Gonzalez, National Park Service)	An improved projection is now used.
1180	76475	ΤS	110	0	0	0	Figure TS-1 - This figure might be better split up into 3 containing A&B, C, and D the three parts together appear to be an urelated group of facts since they all make different points. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	A simplified and better linked presentation of 2 panels has been adopted.
1181	76998	ΤS	110	0	0	0	Box TS.1 Figure 1. Implied ordering of subfigures from top as (b) (a) (c) is confusing. Reorganise. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	A simplified and better linked presentation of 2 panels has been adopted.
1182	76999	тs	110	0	0	0	Box TS.1 Figure 1. Subfigure (b). Map not really necessary - for example subfigure (c) just uses a table. Use of 3 dimensional barplots uneccesary. Use 2 dimensional bars, if absolutely needed. 1981-1990 timeframe appears always close to zero, so does not impart any information. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	A simplified and better linked presentation of 2 panels has been adopted, dropping use of the three-dimensional bar plots.
1183	77000	ΤS	110	0	0	0	Box TS.1 Figure 1. Why does graph show time since 1970, when this is mostly zero, and other parts of the figure use a timeframe from 1981? Suggest using same timeframe for all three subplots (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	This graph is no longer included.
1184	77001	ΤS	110	0	0	0	Box TS.1 Figure 1. Suggest replacing subfigures (b) and (c) with a single graph, a 2 dimensional barplot. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	A simplified and better linked presentation of 2 panels has been adopted, addressing this suggestion.
1185	77263	ΤS	110	0	0	0	Box TS.1: See broad comments in File: IPCC-AR5-NBCCRC-Maclellan-2013.pdf. (NOTE: The comment actually said this was an SPM comment, but the "From Page" had the Box TS.1 callout) (James MacLellan, University of New Brunswick)	The broad comments have been considered.
1186	77302	TS	110	0	0	0	The heading for (c) is wrong (if the caption is right) - papers on e.g. "Central America" or "West Africa" will not have been counted, which may seriously skew the statistics compared to what the heading says given e.g. many comparatively small countries in those 2 regions which might be naturally mentioned together in titles, abstracts & keywords (William Ingram, Met Office)	Extended detail on the search methods adopted is provided in the underlying chapter. The search methods are intended to provide broad indication of trends over time.
1187	58076	ΤS	110	0	110	0	Figure 1. Don't know this paper, so perhaps this comment is not accurate. It could be misleading as a lot of the literature and research that is currently being published a lot of the times add the term "climate change" to make it more appealing for publication and funding. The contrary also occurs, a lot of research that is being done on ecology, geomorphology, geology etc and that might be directly related to climate variability do not add the key words and hence do not appear in this type of searches. (Carmen Lacambra Segura, Grupo La era)	Extended detail on the search methods adopted is provided in the underlying chapter. The search methods are intended to provide broad indication of trends over time.
1188	76476	TS	111	0	0	0	Box TS.3 Figure 1 Comment - Add "low", "medium", "high", etc. on the shaded confidence scale. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Because the relationship between evidence/agreement and confidence is flexible, rather than strictly prescribed, as described in the guidance for authors, specific confidence levels are not given on the shaded confidence scale. The graphic is taken directly from the uncertainties guidance note for authors
1189	77002	TS	111	0	0	0	Box TS.3 Figure 1. Suggest placing labels "High Confidence" and "Low Confidence" directly on confidence scale on the graphic. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	Because the relationship between evidence/agreement and confidence is flexible, rather than strictly prescribed, as described in the guidance for authors, specific confidence levels are not given on the shaded scale. The graphic is taken directly from the uncertainties guidance note for authors.
1190	64153	ΤS	112	0	0	0	Box TS.4 Figure 1: Please see our comments on Box SPM.3 Figure 1. (GERMANY)	These comments have been reviewed and considered.
1191	76477	ΤS	112	0	0	0	Box TS-4, Figure 1 Comment - The key message(s) of this figure are not at all clear. There is no added value to this figure. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The visualization of this conceptual figure has been very substantially improved to clarify its central messages.
1192	77003	ΤS	112	0	0	0	Box TS.4 Figure 1. This diagram is confusing, and could be simplified considerably. For example, It is unclear how the addition of the "solution space" adds any value to the diagram. At the moment, a simple list of the factors which affect vulnerability would summarise the same information. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	The visualization of this conceptual figure has been very substantially improved, addressing these concerns.

#	ID	Ch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1193	64154	TS	113	0	0	0	Figure TS.1: The figure is too complex, too detailed, too small, and the caption is too long and incomprehensible. Please improve this figure, simplify and reduce to main messages. A: left graph: dashed lines? Tpejus? green arrows? text under the x-axis? right graph: blue-red bars? rhombus in the middle, gray shading, arrows? B: what does this figure show? what are "warm-temperate pseudo-oceanic species"? caption notes that long-term changes are shown, but the graph shows time slots instead. C: different colors? numbers? what is the meaning of the character triplets at the upper margin of the graph? D: what is shown on the x-axis? Caption: The caption needs to be comprehensible to non experts, and it is suggested to reduce the amount of information provided. (GERMANY)	The individual panels of this figure have been revised to enhance accessibility, and the number of panels included has been reduced. The improved notations within each panel, figure legends, and caption description clarify specific questions raised here for the panels retained. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.3.
1194	77004	ΤS	113	0	0	0	Figure TS.1 subfigure A. Suggest labelling temperature scale to indicate which colour is "warmer" and which is "cooler". (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	Labeling has been added accordingly. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.3.
1195	77005	TS	113	0	0	0	Figure TS.1 subfigure B. Is the Rainbow palette most appropriate here? Does it hide any information about the data? For examples, see http://www.research.ibm.com/people/I/lloydt/color/color.HTM (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	The adopted color bar effectively communicates the major trends, with substantial further information presented in the underlying chapter sections. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.3.
1196	77006	ΤS	113	0	0	0	Figure TS.1 subfigure C. Suggest labelling "number of observations" (top row of numbers) directly on the graphic. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	Where this subpanel appears elsewhere in the technical summary, improved notations are used. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.3.
1197	79349	TS	113	0	114	0	Fig TS.1 In caption to panel 'B', it doesn't say what sort of organisms are featured "only warm-temperate pseudo-oceanic species" - I presume that the figure is for copepods??? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This point is now clarified within the figure legend. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.3.
1198	76478	TS	115	0	0	0	Figure TS.2 Comment - This figure suggests that socioeconomic pathways are the only development pathways. This is not true. Need to define 'key' and 'emergent'. What is Section C.ii.? This should be listed in the figure caption, not cited elsewhere. If it is elsewhere, perhaps this figure is not needed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Key and emergent are no longer included. A substantially clearer caption for the figure has been developed. Finally, the items listed under development are not intended to be inclusive of all components of this space. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.1.
1199	76479	TS	116	0	0	0	Figure TS.3 Comment - This figure suggests that rates of change and framing of adaptation feed into human resources, and natural resources, respectively which is not necessarily the case. There is no value added by this figure. Suggest deletion. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1200	77007	TS	116	0	0	0	Figure TS.3 This diagram is overcomplicated, and offers no information further than just listing the key adaptation constraints in two lists. Further, the structure of the diagram suggests that a single "constraint affecting the societal context for adaptation" only influences a single "constraint affecting the implementation of adaptation policies and measures" (for example "framing of adaptation" only influences "natural resources"). I don't think that this is the information that the graphics aims to impart. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1201	64155	TS	117	0	0	0	Figure TS.4: It remains unclear why the adaptive space is widening in time (along the adaptation pathway). We think it should shrink. Please insert a dimensionless timebar below the figure to show the time dependency of the process. Ratio: In accordance to Ch 16 P 2 L 43-44 as well as Figures 22-7 and 26-6 the adaptation corridor should shrink in time as adaptation limits are a result of interaction between climate change and biophysical and socioeconomic constraints. If climate change likely aggravates at least during the era of climate responsibility the potential for adaptation to reduce risks will decrease or in other words the adaptive space may narrow. Figures 22-7 and 26-6 illustrate this narrowing by clear adaptation limits in a 4°-world in a lot of sectors. This figure TS.4 is better than Figure SPM.2, because the link between A and B is clearer, and because TS.4 B has a link to time (yellow arrow). Maybe a synthesis of the two would be even better. See also our comments on Figure SPM.2 (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1202	76480	TS	117	0	0	0	Figure TS.4 Comment - This figure provides no compelling information, nor is it supportive of the text. Suggest retaining only the upper section, "the Decision Cycle", including context. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1203	64156	TS	117	0	118	0	Figure TS.4 and TS.5: See our comments on Figure SPM.2. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.

4	GII AK5			n From	,	То	Commont	FIRST-ORDER DRAF
# 1204	ID 68767	Ch TS	Page	Line	Page		Comment	Response
1204	08/0/	15	110	0	0	0	The Governance pillar seems to be separate from the entire process of adaptation planning and implementation. It would have been preferable that it is at the centre of the figure since it is the engine that drives the four phases and determines	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
							whether the regime will adapt or not adapt to the ever changing circumstances. The figure very well addresses shortfalls of	
							previous governance approaches that focused on a single governance unit - mainly the state - to address global collective	
							action problems that are inherently problems involving multiple levels, but very little is mentioned in the report on multi level	
							interactions at the vertical, upper horizontal and lower horizontal and multiple independent decision makers (Ostrom, 2010).	
							This should also be addressed in the diagram where we have the multi-levels. (NETHERLANDS)	
1205	68768	TS	118	0	0	0	UNCLEAR statement Figure TS.5: "adaptation governance underlies capacity" (NETHERLANDS)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1206	68769	TS	118	0	0	0	figure TS.5 reads "efforts in adaptation CAN be, whereas chapter 15 reads "NEED to be" (Chapter15, caption of Figure 15.1, p.52) (NETHERLANDS)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1207	76481	TS	118	0	0	0	Figure TS.5 Comment - This is not a compelling or useful figure. How do changes in governance scales impact adaptive cycles?	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary
1207	70401		110	0	0	Ū	Suggest deletion. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1208	64157	TS	119	0	0	0	Figure TS.6: It is not clear why the circles are concentric, and why personal is not in center. In addition, what do the gray-	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
							shaded triangles mean? What does the term "Systems and Structures" signify? In addition, the TS presents too many	
							conceptual figures, this becomes confusing. (GERMANY)	
1209	68770	TS	119	0	0	0	Note that the idea of steering transformations that take place in these spheres of change (pratical, political, personal) is based	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
							on 1 source (O'Brien and Sygna, forthcoming) according to p. 24 of Chapter 20 and fig 20-2. (NETHERLANDS)	
				-				
1210	76482	TS	119	0	0	0	Figure TS.6 Comment - There is no value added from this figure. Suggest deletion. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1211	77008	TS	119	0	0	0	Figure TS.6 This diagram offers little further information or contextualisation beyond the text. Consider removing, or major	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
							adaptation. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	
1212	79350	TS	119	0	119	0	Fig TS.6 This figure is poorly explained and not easy to understand (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure is no longer included in the technical summary.
1213	60439	TS	120	0	0	0	Box TS.5 Figure 1. There are no white or grey areas so you could shorten the caption. In the caption, say "Colors overlain with	All categories are now more clearly described with an
							white circles" as there are no coloured circles. (David Parker, Met Office Hadley Centre)	embedded legend, and all categories occur within the figure.
								The relevant figure is now Figure TS.5.
1214	79926	TS	120	0	0	0	BOX SPM4 Figure1: Please show a figure with much higher resolution. As is it now, it is impossible to see the "gray" or	All categories should now be visible more clearly. The relevant
							"circles" . (NORWAY)	figure is now Figure TS.5.
1215	64158	TS	120	0	121	0	Box TS.5, Figure 1: The reference period should be pre-industrial for this figure to be useful, in the context of the 2C objective.	Data plotted within the figure draw from working group 1,
							Please explain all abbreviations in the caption (e.g. CRU, CMIP5). See also our comments on Box SUM.4 Figure 1. (GERMANY)	which uses 1986-2005 as the baseline for projections.
								References provided to the locations within the report in which
								full introduction of all detail for the figures can be found. The
								relevant figure is now Figure TS.5.
1216	61906	TS	120	1	0	0	This figure should show results from RCP2.6. This scenario is extremely important for policy making. (European Union DG	This scenario is now included. The relevant figure is now Figure
				_			Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	TS.5.
1217	85200	TS	120	1	129	30	The "observations" do not include the fact that ther has been no change for 15 years Even with the wrong observations the	A time series of change observed and projected is now
							model projections are complelely at odds with the observations (Vincent Gray, Climate Consultant)	included. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.5.
1218	64159	TS	122	0	0	0	Figures TS.7: It is not completely clear what the figure shows, is it ground water recharge or a vulnerability index? If the latter,	This figure is no longer included.
							how is the sensitivity index mentioned in the caption defined ? Where can the information on the SRES scenarios B2 and A2	
							be found? It is suggested to remove the blue shading and just use gray for changes <10 %, this would be less confusing. If two	
							models are shown, their differences should be commented in the text. If not (preferred), please show the median of the two	
1210	76492	TC	177	0	0	0	models. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included
1219	76483	ΤS	122	U	U	0	Figure TS.7 Comment - AR4 and not AR5 results? This should be updated. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
1220	62708	TS	123		0	0	Figure TS.8 is an interesting figure. According to the figure, historical increase rate corresponds nearly to that of RCP6.0. At least, RCP4.5 is lower than the historical increase rate. The comparisons between the historical increase rate and the estimated displacement rate and between the historical increase rate and the rate of RCPs should be also discussed. (Keigo Akimoto, Research Institute of Innovative Technology for the Earth (RITE))	A finding is now included that more clearly draws comparison between rates of change in Earth history versus the present, although the finding is broader than the specific topic of rate of displacement. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1221	64160	TS	123	0	0	0	Figure TS.8: see our comments on Figure SPM.3. Captions of Fig TS.8 and Fig SPM.3 are not the same, please check. Caption of Fig. TS.8: Please explain CRUTEM4 and CMIP5 for laypersons. (GERMANY)	These comments have been considered in revision of the figure. The caption has been further simplified, with extended introduction of analyses provided in the underlying chapter in the context of figure 4-5. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1222	76484	TS	123	0	0	0	Figure TS.8 Comment - Consider putting rate of displacement (km/y) on the y-axis of right hand figure. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This is done in the simplified version of the figure presented within the summary for policymakers, but the approach here is maintained to allow deeper understanding of the relevant factors in the analysis. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1223	77798	TS	123	0	0	0	Fig. TS.8: Left side seems extremely useful. However, it is not very clear at the moment. Consider a) changing background colors not using read, b) minimize distance between inset lines and model runs, c) consider smoothing the time series (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	The panel has been clarified accordingly. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1224	77799	ΤS	123	0	0	0	Fig. TS.8: Move letters A, B, and C to the upper left corner on the same line (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	Improved labeling has been adopted. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1225	77800	TS	123	0	0	0	Fig. TS.8, C: What's the meaning of "human assistance"? Human coontribution to rate of discplacement? Humans manually displacing animals? Humans discplacin animals to help them? I suggest "Human contribution". (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	This phrase is no longer included. The relevant figure is now
1226	79351	ΤS	123	0	123	0	This figure is very crowded and difficult to read. Perhaps the 3 panels (a-c) could be separated a little more. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Flow across the sub panels has been improved to enhance clarity. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.7.
1227	64161	TS	124	0	0	0	Figure TS.9: Please see our comments on Figure SPM.4. (GERMANY)	These comments have been considered in the revision of the figure. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1228	68164	TS	124	0	0	0	Figure TS.9 (B) contains a world map with national borders. It is suggested to use a map without borders to avoid unnecessary disputes. (CHINA)	Borders are no longer included. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1229	70363	TS	124	0	0	0	Figure TS.9. Use an equal-area projection to accurately present the world. The current map inaccurately portrays surface areas and the relative areas of land and sea and of various continents with one another. (Patrick Gonzalez, National Park Service)	Improved projections are now used. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1230	77801	TS	124	0	0	0	Fig. TS.9, B: Correct "catch potential" in the figure (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	This has been fixed. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1231	77802	TS	124	0	0	0	Fig. TS.9, C: Text to color bars at the very bottom are much too small. Text in general very small. (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	This panel is no longer included, although all legends have been improved. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1232	79352	TS	124	0	124	0	Fig TS.9 The figure is ok but the panels are too crowded and laid out in a very ugly and confusing way. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The layout of the figure has been substantially improved in its revision. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.8.
1233	64162	TS	125	0	0	0	TS.10: Are these absolute changes in global crop yields (please specify crops), or relative contribution of climate change? Probably projections are very different for different regions - does it make sense to show global data without distinguishing regions? What climate scenarios are these projections based on? Please add information on the emission scenario / temperature range this information is based on. In addition, it would be extremely useful to show this information for different scenarios. Please expand caption to better describe what is shown in the graph. (GERMANY)	Data are presented across studies for all regions, building from available data using different scenarios of climate change. Further detail can be found in the underlying chapter regarding approach used. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.9.
1234	68771	TS	125	0	0	0	Graph is difficult to understand. First, concensus will lie between 0% and 100% but y-axis has both negative and positive percentages ?? Second, we fail to grasp the idea of the bars with all that coloring. The legend says yield change bins and y axis % of given yield ranges. Is this the same? Do all bins sum up to 100%? The x axis is a projected change. Relative to what? Please make the graph more easy to understand! (NETHERLANDS)	The layout of the figure has been substantially improved to clarify its interpretation. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.9.

Government and Expert Review

Page	86	of	90
I USC	00	01	50

FIRST-ORDER	DRAFT

28 March - 24 May 2013

			Erom	Erom	To	То		
ŧ	ID	Ch	Page	From Line			Comment	Response
1235	64163	TS	126		0	0	TS.11: This figure is unclear to a point of not being useful. According to the caption, it is related to human security (=conflict?), but how? Is it a conceptual figure, or based on observations, as indicated by the word "evidence" in the caption? What are the ellipses supposed to mean, and is there an interpretation to the overlapping areas? Which selection criteria have been applied for the examples? Why are some arrows blue and others white, and some circles white and some black? Why is e.g. migration and mobility limited to the low to medium climate stress area? What kind of intervention is meant by "climate stresses lead to involuntary abandonment of settlements"? Figure and caption need careful revision, or should not be deleted. (GERMANY)	This conceptual figure provides an overview of the different components of human security considered within the assessment. Examples presented are illustrative.
1236	68772	TS	126	0	0	0	Complicated/vague graph. We find it hard to grasp the idea. (NETHERLANDS)	This conceptual figure is intended to provide an overview of th different components of human security considered within the assessment.
1237	76485	TS	126	0	0	0	Figure TS.11 Comment - This figure is subjective. An important message, but not sure if it shows clear path dependencies - or even if the path dependencies are appropriate. Does conflict always go up with high climate stress, for example? (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	this conceptual figure is intended to provide an overview of the different components of human security considered within the assessment. Findings on these different components are presented within the text of the technical summary.
1238	77009	ΤS	126	0	0	0	Figure TS. 11 Arrows appear colour coded, although inconsistent (i.e. furthest arrow left is blue, but should be red, as this appears to indicate an increase in stress. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	Color coding has been corrected for the mislabeled arrow.
1239	68066	ΤS	127	0	0	0	Figure TS.5.: The figure only discusses Africa, Europe and North America and should include Asia as well, as risks are varied among regions. It is also important for policymakers to understand risks estimated for the mid-term, or the period in between the era of climate responsibility (2030-2040) and era of climate options (2080-2100); and therefore, a figure should be included for global average warming of 3 degrees above preindustrial. Furthermore, given the diversity of regional risks and effective adaptation, the risk levels provided relate to different phenomena and adaptation choices and are therefore are difficult to compare; and therefore, the figure should be revised to provide examples of the projected risks and adaptation choices considered in producing the figure and to include comparable numerical values. The ideas represented by the figure may be better presented in the form of a comparable chart. (JAPAN)	This figure is no longer included.
L240	76486	ΤS	127	0	0	0	Figure TS.12 Comment - This figure quite subjective. Does not add value to the text and should be removed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included.
1241	76487	TS	127	0	0	0	Figure TS.12 Comment - What is the significance or basis for the three different colors? They seem somewhat irrelevant and decorative. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included.
1242	79927	TS	127	0	0	0	Figure TS.12: These figures encompass a lot of information and the idea behind is very good. But some of the information do not seem to be explained in the figure text, for instance: Please indicate a year for "present" (the report will live in many year (NORWAY)	This figure is no longer included.
L243	79353	ΤS	127	0	128	0	On figure TS.12 it is unclear why 'ocean systems' are always left blank. (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure is no longer included.
L 2 44	59812	TS	127	0	129	0	An explanation should be given in captions as to why some quadrants of the wheels are completely blank. (AUSTRALIA)	This figure is no longer included.
1245	62709	TS		0	129	0	Figure TS.12 shows only the comparison of impacts and adaptations between 2 and 4 degrees C. However, from the mitigation viewpoints, there are big differences between 2 and 3 degrees C and even between 2 and 2.5 degrees C. The comparison between 2 and 2.5 degrees C or between 2 and 3 degrees C is much more important and useful for policy making. Please add the assessment for 3 degrees C at least (and 2.5 degrees C if possible). (Keigo Akimoto, Research Institute of Innovative Technology for the Earth (RITE))	This figure is no longer included.
1246	64164	TS	127	0	129	0	Figure TS.12: See our comments on Figures SPM.5 A-C. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included.
1247	77010	ΤS	127	0	129	0	Figure TS. 12 Radial graphs appear to offer no advantage, but make it more difficult to compare data across sectors. Consider using standard bar plots for greater clarity. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	This figure is no longer included.
1248	64165	TS	130	0	0	0	Figure TS.13: Useful figure, easy to understand; could it be provided for other regions too? However, as it appears in the section on future climate change, it shows however observations from the past. The figure does not fit in this section, it would be better to show information on the projected changes and associated risks in this context. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included.

#	ID	Ch		From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1250	70364	TS	131			0	Figure TS.14. Use an equal-area projection to accurately present the world. The current map inaccurately portrays surface areas and the relative areas of land and sea and of various continents with one another. (Patrick Gonzalez, National Park Service)	This figure is no longer included.
1251	76488	TS	131	0	0	0	Figure TS14 Comment - this is the same as figure TS9C. Figure TS14 should be removed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included.
1252	79928		131			0	Figure TS 14 should also include the risks and vulnerabilities related to the North Atlantic e.g. acidification, movement of organisms etc. This figure should also be considered for inclusion in the SPM since the ocean is not covered so well in the other (NORWAY)	This figure is no longer included.
1253	79354	ΤS	131	0	131	0	Note that figure TS. 14 is duplicated in it's entirety within TS. 9 (page 124) - is this necessary?? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	This figure is no longer included.
1254	63168	TS	132	0	0	0	Fig TS 15 - The line associated with Canadian North box does not point to northern Canada but rather southern Canadian agricultural region. If this box is meant to be associated with issues in northern Canada and therefore Arctic then it could be combined with Arctic box. If it is supposed to be associated with agricultural region (Prairies) then it should be re-labelled as western Canada. (Sharon Smith, Geological Survey of Canada)	This figure is no longer included.
1255	63169	ΤS	132	0	0	0	Fig. TS 15 - The issues raised for Russian Arctic are also true for Canadian Arctic - i.e. issues of thawing permafrost, ice free season etc. (Sharon Smith, Geological Survey of Canada)	This figure is no longer included.
1256	64167	TS	132	0	0	0	Figure TS.15: This figure seems suitable for the TS, but see our suggestions for improvements on Figures SPM.6. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included.
1257	68165	TS	132	0	0	0	Figure TS.15 contains no examples of significant disaster impacts felt in other Asian regions like East Asia and Central Asia. It is suggested to add examples of Asia taking into account relevant chapters, such as Chapter 24. (CHINA)	This figure is no longer included.
1258	68166	TS	132	0	0	0	Figure TS.15 contains a world map with national borders. It is suggested to use a map without borders to avoid unnecessary disputes. (CHINA)	This figure is no longer included.
1259	70365	TS	132	0	0	0	Figure TS.15. Use an equal-area projection to accurately present the world. The current map inaccurately portrays surface areas and the relative areas of land and sea and of various continents with one another. (Patrick Gonzalez, National Park Service)	This figure is no longer included.
1260	77803	TS	132	0	0	0	Fig. TS.15: Not clear. shade land areas. (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	This figure is no longer included.
1261	79929	TS	132			0	Figure TS.15: Abreviations and acronyms in the figure need to be explained. In addition please consider including more about biological risks. (NORWAY)	This figure is no longer included.
1262	59813	ΤS	132	0	132	0	Figure TS15 - the Great Barrier Reef and associated coast is a highly relevant multiple impact hotspot for Australia (cyclones and other extreme weather, sea level rise, OA, flooding). Could a marine example be added to the list? (AUSTRALIA)	This figure is no longer included.
1263	57567	TS	133	0	0	0	Box TS7 Figure 1: 1) Please clarify "past" means since pre-industrialization or not. 2) Clarify when is present. Is it 2010 or 2014 or some other year? From the Figure, present seems to be different from the time when temperature increase was 0. 3) In lines 48-50 on page 40 of WG2/Ch. 19, there are explanations about the left hand bar of Box. SPM6. Figure 1 descriving a transition to red is located at 1 degree and also a transition to purple is located around 2 degree. This explanation is not consistent with the Figure. Also please add this explanation to Box. SPM6. Figure 1 and in doing so, make it clear the base year from when 1 degree and 2 degree are counted (in reading lines 48-50 of page 40 of Ch. 19, this seems to be from 1990). 4) Does the temperature increase in this Figure mean in 2100 or at the equilibrium? 5) Please make it clear that adaptation is not included in the same way as in Figure SPM 2 of AR4/WG2. 6) Please add the note to this Figure that the risk varies depending on development pathways and this is not reflected in this Figure. (Mitsutsune Yamaguchi, The University of Tokyo)	Time frames have been clarified within the figure. Color transitions have been very carefully calibrated, and they correspond to the text-based descriptions of the reasons for concern. A left-hand panel has additionally been added to help clarify interpretation. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1264	62710	тs	133	0	0	0	Box TS.7 Figure 1: not just wirte "Expert judment" but should write "Expert judment by the lead authors of Chapter 19". (Keigo Akimoto, Research Institute of Innovative Technology for the Earth (RITE))	The underlying chapter (chapter 19) provides an extended description of the approaches used, as the traceable account for this figure. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1265	62711	TS	133	0	0	0	Box TS.7 Figure 1: Purple coloer can be seen from around 1.5 degrees C in the figure; however, the text describes that the purple is from 2 degrees C. The figure should be revised to meet the text. (Keigo Akimoto, Research Institute of Innovative Technology for the Earth (RITE))	Color transitions have been very carefully calibrated, and they correspond to the text-based descriptions. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.

#	ID	Ch		n From	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
1266	64168	тs	Page 133		Page 0	0	Box TS.7 Figure 1: See our comments on Box SPM.6 Figure 1. (GERMANY)	These comments have been considered. The same figure is presented in both summary products. The relevant figure is
1267	68067	TS	133	0	0	0	Box TS7 Figure 1: 1) Please clarify "past" means since pre-industrialization or not. 2) Clarify when is present. Is it 2010 or 2014 or some other year? From the Figure, present seems to be different from the time when temperature increase was 0.3) In lines 48-50 on page 40 of WG2/Ch. 19, there are explanations about the left hand bar of Box. SPM6. Figure 1 describing a transition to red is located at 1 degree and also a transition to purple is located around 2 degree. This explanation is not consistent with the Figure. Also please add this explanation to Box. SPM6. Figure 1 and in doing so, make it clear the base year from when 1 degree and 2 degree are counted (in reading lines 48-50 of page 40 of Ch. 19, this seems to be from 1990). 4) Does the temperature increase in this Figure mean in 2100 or at the equilibrium?5) Please make it clear that adaptation is not included in the same way as in Figure SPM 2 of AR4/WG2.6) Please add the note to this Figure that the risk varies depending on development pathways and this is not reflected in this Figure. (JAPAN)	now Box TS.5 Figure 1. Time frames have been clarified within the figure. Color transitions have been very carefully calibrated, and they correspond to the text-based descriptions of the reasons for concern. A left-hand panel has additionally been added to help clarify interpretation. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1268	76489	TS	133	0	0	0	Box TS.7 Figure 1 Comment - Burning embers. Not sure how purple relates to limited capacity. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	More extended description of the purple color is now presented within the figure caption. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1269	77011	TS	133	0	0	0	Box TS.7 Figure 1 Introduction of purple colour "for the first time" meaningless when colour scale is arbitrary. Brings to mind "turning up to 11" sketch of Spinal Tap fame. Negative connotations of Hyperbole. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	More extended description of the purple color is now presented within the figure caption. Further context on the history of the reasons for concern and background informing their interpretation is additionally provided. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1270	59814	TS	133	0	133	0	Strongly support including the new purple colour and the category 'risks to unique and threatened systems' (AUSTRALIA)	Please note additionally that further introduction of the purple color is now provided. The relevant figure is now Box TS.5 Figure 1.
1271	64169	TS	134	0	0	0	BOX TS.9: This figures shows a lot of incoherent information and the capture is not correct. Please revise or delete.Figure OA- 1 B. shows the pH for RCP 2.6 and RCP 8.5, this figure seems easier than Figure OA-1 C, which is taken up here. Specific comments and suggestions: Fig a: 1) The arrow below the graph seems to refer to uncertainty, but is this referring to the statements above or to their effets on ocean acidification? Is there less uncertainty of ocean acidification caused by increased CO2 than for CO2-increase due to fossil fuel emissions? Please revise or delete. 2) The caption is not consistent with what is shown in the figure. The first states that the figures shows impacts and option, but the latter also shows causes and properties of ocean acidification. Fig b: Caption is insufficient, what is actually shown, what is randon effects meta-analysis (weighted or not?), what do "effect size (LnRR) and negative values mean, what is bootstrapped? Both: Plot A and B are very different, please provide information in the caption why are they linked. (GERMANY)	A few further details have been added to the caption to aid interpretation, while maintaining concise presentation. The top panel is intended to provide an overview of impacts and policy options, bridging assessment across the working groups. The relevant figure is now Box TS.7 Figure 1.
1272	77804	TS	134	0	0	0	Box TS.9 Figure 1: Align letters A and B; make fonts bigger (This Rutishauser, University of Bern)	Clearer fonts are now used. The relevant figure is now Box TS.7 Figure 1.
1273	59815	ΤS	135	0	0	0	Figure TS16 - Inequality appears twice in the list of societal stressors. Support keeping this diagram. (AUSTRALIA)	Specific stressors are no longer listed. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.13.
1274	64170	TS	135	0	0	0	Figure TS.16: This figure very policy relevant, and with improvements it could also convey the AR5-WG2-concept of the eras of climate responsibility and option. The figure should be accompanied by the text Ch1 P 12 L 14-30. The legend should explain the "opportunity space" in this context by inserting after the first sentence: "Rapidly advancing climate science provides an "opportunity space" for policy relevant information to support policy decisions. The pathways identified in this report point to an era of climate responsibility, addressing the interconnectedness of multiple vulnerabilities for unavoidable impacts, and the era of climate options, the opportunity space to transform our actions toward a low risk and high resilient future." (from Ch 1, P 12 and P 10). Specific suggestions: - details are too small, please enlarge figure and reduce detail - Inequality as societal stressors is mentioned twice the horizontal axis should indicate the two eras explain what the sections in the circle show legend of green/red policy decisions should be outside the graph, not on the time axis - explain the red arrows (are these two biophysical stressors?) - what a the link between the sectors indicated in the middle of the left circle and the wedges (planetary systems according Rockström) - is the green arrow (climate change) a process transgressing a planetary boundary? (is climate change not be a biophysical stressor?) (GERMANY)	The figure has been substantially simplified and clarified to illustrate the concept of climate-resilient pathways. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.13.

#	ID	Ch			n To Page		Comment	Response
1275	68773	ΤS	135		0	0	Graph is too complex for me. Just do not understand. (NETHERLANDS)	The figure has been substantially simplified and clarified to illustrate the concept of climate-resilient pathways. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.13.
1276	76490	TS	135	0	0	0	Figure TS.16 Comment - Planetary boundaries are not well quantified or understood, especially the complexity of interacting factors that are not accounted for. Rockstrom et al., 2009 is descriptive and qualitative. This figure is problematic and should be removed from the TS. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The concept of planetary boundaries is no longer included. Presentation has been substantially simplified. The relevant figure is now Figure TS.13.
1277	64171	тs	136	0	0	0	Box TS.10 Figure 1: See our comments on Box SPM.7 Figures 1. (GERMANY)	This figure is no longer included.
1278	76491	TS	136	0	0	0	Box TS.10 Figure 1 Comment - This figure suggests a concave/convex relationship between acceptable and unacceptable risks which is unlikely. There are likely a wide range of shapes that might define this relationship. The terms acceptable, tolerable, intolerable are policy judgments. This figure should be removed. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	This figure is no longer included.
1279	57441	ΤS	138	0	0	0	Figure CR-1: the caption requires substantial editing e.g. line 3; word missing between 'able' and 'shuffle'. Line 4 to end; the meaning of 'three CO2 seeps' is unclear, 2 should be subscript here and in other places. 'high CO2' should really be high concentrations of CO2 (Alison Donnelly, Trinity College Dublin)	The mild editing was done except that we kept "High CO2" which we think is fine in this context and allows to cut one word.
1280	61907	TS	139	1	0	0	The top panel has many land areas shown in red where there are no rivers. E.g. Sahara. Important to note that only one model (HadCM3) was used. Other models could produce different results in some regions. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Reformulated to specify HadCM3 in the text
1281	61908	TS	140	1	0	0	The caption should state what scenario(s) were used to create this figure. It would be useful to know what times the changes shown could occur at - is 40% cover the current day or 2050? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	The caption now provides more information about the data used to create the figure.
1282	76492	TS	141	0	0	0	Figure OA-1 Comment - The ordering of panels in Figure OA-1 should be changed such that panel B becomes A, C becomes B, and A becomes C to reflect the order of reference to the figure materials in CC-OA. See comments on CC-OA in chapter 6 and 30 review comments. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	The panels are now cited in the text (and in the right order)
1283	76493	ΤS	141	0	0	0	Figure OA-1 Comment - This figure is redundant with TS.9, Figure 1 (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Although the cross-chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1284	79355	TS	141	0	141	0	Figure OA-1 (page 141) is almost identical to figure TS.9. (page 134). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	Although the cross-chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1285	61909	ΤS	141	1	0	0	What is meant by "near future"? Are the results shown in Panel C scenario independent? (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	We agree that there was no sense of the change in pH covered. The text has been revised to incorporate this perspective. The following parenthesis was added: "(seawater pH reduction of 0.5 unit reduction or less)"
1286	60440	TS	142	0	0	0	Figure RC-1. Same comment as on Box TS.5 Figure 1. (David Parker, Met Office Hadley Centre)	The figure legend has been revised to correspond with the changes made to the figure in reponse to the SOD review comments. The relevant figure is now Figure RC-2.
1287	69906	TS	142	0	0	0	Figure RC-1: Can the CRU dataset used be stated in the figure caption? The text on page 76 states that it is CRU TS3.10.01. (John Caesar, Met Office Hadley Centre)	The observations panel has been revised to use the values, significance testing, and data sufficiency selection from WGI. This has been clarified in the text of Box CC-RC. The relevant figure is now Figure RC-2.

#	ID	Ch		From Line		To Line	Comment	Response
1288	79356	TS	142		142		Figure RC-1 (page 142) is almost identical to figure TS.5. (page 120). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The relevant figure is now Figure RC-2. Although the cross- chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1289	61910	ΤS	142	1	143	0	Figures RC-1 and RC-2 should also show results from the RCP2.6 scenario. This scenario is very policy relevant. (European Union DG Research, Directorate Environment Climate Change & Environmental Risks Unit)	Results from RCP2.6 have been added.
1290	69907	ΤS	143	0	0	0	Figure RC-2: Can the CRU dataset used be stated in the figure caption? (John Caesar, Met Office Hadley Centre)	The observations panel has been revised to use the values, significance testing, and data sufficiency selection from WGI. This has been clarified in the text of Box CC-RC. The relevant figure is now Figure RC-3.
1291	79357	TS	143	0	143	0	Figure RC-2 (page 143) is almost identical to figure TS.5. (page 120). Is this duplication desirable, or necessary? (UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND)	The relevant figure is now Figure RC-3. Although the cross- chapter boxes were included at the end of the technical summary for purposes of review, they are not actually part of the technical summary. Thus, partial duplication of the figure is to be expectedas occurs for many graphics featured in the summary products (SPM and technical summary).
1292	77012	TS	144	0	0	0	Box TS.9 Figure 1: B) significance star is plotted on the graph, so looks like data. Confusing. Consider moving star to label. (Doug McNeall, Met Office Hadley Centre)	This approach is maintained given that it is a commonly used convention.
1293	76494	TS	145	0	0	0	Figure WE-1 Comment - This is an awkward reconstruction based on limited constraints. Suggest including Skaggs et al., 2012. For proper reference, see comment for page 81, lines 33,34 Figure 2.1 or 2.2. As presented, the figure is not helpful and the information could be presented more coherently. (UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)	Figure has been modified to account for broad input across the WGII chapters.
1294	68167	ΤS	146	0	0	0	Figure VW-1 contains a world map with national borders. It is suggested to use a map without borders to avoid unnecessary disputes. (CHINA)	Borders removed.
1295	70366	ΤS	146	0	0	0	Figure VW-1. Use an equal-area projection to accurately present the world. The current map inaccurately portrays surface areas and the relative areas of land and sea and of various continents with one another. (Patrick Gonzalez, National Park Service)	The Robinson projection is now used as preferred for AR5- WG2.